

WTO Retaliation

Effectiveness and Purposes

Michelle Limenta



• H A R T •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2017

Table of Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>List of Tables and Figures</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii

1. Overview	1
I. Introduction to WTO Dispute Settlement: The Best Vote of Confidence for the Multilateral Trading System	1
A. Consultations	2
B. Adjudication by Panels.....	3
C. The Implementation of Rulings	4
II. Problems Presented: Retaliation, a Flaw in the Successful System?	5
A. First Concern: The (In)effectiveness of WTO Retaliation	6
B. Second Concern: Debates Regarding the Purpose(s) of WTO Retaliation	8
i. Inducing Compliance	8
ii. A Means of Obtaining Some Form of Temporary Compensation	9
iii. Rebalancing	10
iv. 'To Deter Inefficient Breach but to Encourage Efficient Breach'	10
III. WTO Law in Relation to Other Legal Systems.....	11
A. WTO Law in Relation to Public International Law.....	11
i. WTO Remedies and Public International Law Remedies: Inclusive or Exclusive From the System?	12
B. WTO Law in Relation to Contract.....	14
IV. The Objective and Plan of the Book	15
2. Retaliation in the Multilateral Trading System.....	17
Overview	17
I. Temporary Remedies in the DSU	18
A. Compensation in GATT/WTO Dispute Settlement	19
B. What is 'Retaliation' in the Context of the Multilateral Trading System?	22

II.	Law to Retaliate Under GATT and WTO Dispute Settlement.....	23
A.	Retaliation Cases in GATT Dispute Settlement.....	23
B.	Substantive Rules of GATT Retaliation.....	24
C.	Substantive Rules of WTO Retaliation.....	26
i.	The Basic Elements of WTO Retaliation in the Multilateral DSU Framework	26
ii.	Three Principles and Calculation Methods of Retaliation in the DSU.....	31
iii.	Countermeasures Under the SCM Agreement.....	37
III.	Retaliation in Regional Trade Agreements.....	44
	Summary	48
3.	Shortcomings of WTO Retaliation and Reform Proposals.....	49
	Overview	49
I.	The Shortcomings and Problems Inherent in WTO Retaliation.....	50
A.	'Shooting [Oneself] in the Foot'.....	51
B.	Contrary to the Basic Principle of the WTO	52
C.	Imposing an Inappropriate Burden on Innocent Industries.....	53
D.	Lack of Inducement Power for the Measures that Have Strong Domestic Political Support	54
E.	Continued Sanctions	55
F.	Lack of Retaliating Capacity for Small Developing Countries and Least-Developed Countries.....	56
II.	Proposals to Enhance WTO Retaliation and the Criticisms	58
A.	Collective Retaliation	60
B.	Transferrable Retaliatory Rights	63
C.	Financial/Monetary Compensation	64
D.	Compulsory Compensation.....	66
E.	Automatic Application of Cross-Retaliation.....	66
F.	Retroactive Remedies	67
	Summary	68
4.	Purposed-based Approach in Evaluating Effectiveness.....	70
	Overview	70
I.	Compliance, Implementation, Effectiveness and Purpose-based Approach.....	71
A.	The Distinction Between Implementation, Compliance and Effectiveness	71
B.	A Purpose-based Approach to Effectiveness	73
C.	The Importance of Identifying the Purpose of Retaliation and the Uncertainty on the Purpose(s) of WTO Retaliation	75

II. Debates Regarding the Purpose of Retaliation.....	77
A. The Purpose of Retaliation: Inducing Compliance vs Rebalancing.....	78
i. Inducing Compliance.....	78
ii. Rebalancing.....	81
Summary	83
5. Legal Quests in Searching for the Purposes of Retaliation.....	84
Overview	84
I. First Quest: Reference to Remedies Under the ILC Draft Articles on State Responsibility	85
A. Remedies Under the ILC Draft Articles	86
i. Cessation and Non-Repetition.....	86
ii. Reparation.....	87
iii. Restitution.....	88
iv. Compensation	88
v. Satisfaction	89
vi. Countermeasures	89
B. Contracting Out of Remedies Under State Responsibility	90
C. Reference to the ILC Draft Articles in Determining the Purpose of WTO Retaliation in <i>Brazil—Aircraft</i> : Sound or Unsound Approach?	93
II. Second Quest: Reference to Contract Remedies from Law and Economics Perspective	94
A. Property or Liability Rules and Their Relevance in WTO Law.....	95
i. Property Rules	96
ii. Liability Rules	97
B. Evaluating WTO Entitlements from the Perspective of Protection Rules.....	98
i. The Debate over Protection Rules of WTO Entitlements: Property or Liability Rules	99
ii. WTO Law Accommodates Some Amount of Intra-Contractual Flexibility, Yet WTO Entitlements are Protected by a Property Rule	100
iii. WTO Enforcement in the Context of Property Rules Protection	101
III. Third Quest: Article 22.6 Arbitrators' Statements With Regard to the Purpose of Retaliation	103
A. The Purpose of 'Inducing Compliance' with 'Equivalent' Level Requirement.....	103
B. The Purpose of 'Inducing Compliance' with 'Appropriate' Level Requirement	105

C. Inducing Compliance is ‘Not the Only Purpose’ Pursued by Retaliation.....	106
IV. Fourth Quest: Interpretation of Article 22 of the DSU in Accordance with the Customary Rules of Interpretation to Clarify the Purposes of WTO Retaliation.....	107
A. The Customary Rules of Interpretation	108
i. Good Faith	108
ii. Ordinary Meaning.....	109
iii. The Context, and the Object and Purpose of a Treaty	110
iv. Relevant Rules of International Law.....	110
v. Supplementary Means of Interpretation.....	112
B. Interpretation of Article 22 of the DSU in Accordance with the Customary Rules of Interpretation	112
i. Contracted In: The Customary Rules of Interpretation	113
ii. The Multiple Purposes Identified from the Text of Article 22 of the DSU	113
iii. Multiple Purposes Carried Out in the Context of Article 22 of the DSU	114
iv. Multiple Purposes in the Light of the Object and Purpose of WTO Dispute Settlement	118
v. The Assessment of Remedies Provisions Under the ITO Charter, the GATT 1947 and the Uruguay Round Draft Texts as Supplementary Means of Interpretation.....	120
Summary	124
6. Retaliation to Induce an Amicable Settlement as Another Competing Purpose and the Effectiveness of WTO Retaliation.....	126
Overview	126
I. Amicable Settlements in the Multilateral Trading System	127
A. A Brief Historical Context of Amicable Settlements in the GATT Practice	128
B. Amicable Settlement in WTO Dispute Settlement.....	128
i. Notification Obligation of MAS	130
ii. Consistent with Covered Agreement.....	131
C. Amicable Settlements at Non-Implementation Level Induced by Retaliation	132
i. ‘Greater Market Access’ Reached in <i>EC—Hormones</i>	133
ii. ‘Cash Payments’ in <i>US—Upland Cotton</i>	136
iii. ‘GSP Facilitation’ Reached in <i>US—Clove Cigarettes</i>	137

D.	The Purpose of Inducing a Mutually Agreeable Solution (Final Settlement)	139
i.	Retaliation Inducing a Mutually Agreeable Solution: A Defeat for the Winning Party?	141
ii.	Retaliation Inducing a Mutually Agreeable Solution: Systemic Implications and Third Parties' Interests	141
iii.	Solutions Allowing the Continuity of Inconsistent Measures: Legal or Illegal?	145
II.	The Question About the Effectiveness of WTO Retaliation	146
III.	A Way Forward	149
	Summary	151
7.	Concluding Remarks	152
I.	Summary of the Book	152
II.	Final Observations	154
	<i>Bibliography</i>	157
	<i>Index</i>	179