

TRADE, INVESTMENT,
INNOVATION AND THEIR
IMPACT ON ACCESS
TO MEDICINES

An Asian Perspective

LOCKNIE HSU

School of Law, Singapore Management University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i>	xiv
<i>List of tables</i>	xv	
<i>Foreword by Chief Justice Sundaresh Menon</i>	xvii	
<i>Preface</i>	xxi	
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xxiv	
1 Economic integration, Asia and medicines	1	
1.1 Introduction – globalization and Asia	1	
1.2 Aging Asia: healthcare needs	4	
1.3 Diseases in Asia and the Pacific region	6	
1.4 Poverty in Asia	8	
1.5 The growth of National Health Expenditure	9	
1.6 Medicines, R&D and Asia – an overview	16	
1.7 Economic integration activities in Asia and health matters: an overview	22	
1.8 TRIPS-plus requirements and Asia – an introduction	24	
1.9 New legal risks – potential of investor-state claims	26	
1.10 Syncopation between the law, science and social policy	26	
1.11 The role of international organizations	27	
1.12 The global and regional context	29	
1.13 Economic reform and IPRs in Asia	41	
1.14 Conclusion	44	

2	Access to medicines, innovation and the debate at the multilateral level	46
2.1	Globalization, trade and public health dimensions: The context	46
2.2	Government reviews on the pharmaceutical sector and patents	56
2.3	International patent commitments: from Paris to Uruguay and beyond	57
2.4	The promise of TRIPS: flexibilities for members	58
2.5	Regulatory tensions	62
2.6	The place of patents in the debate	66
2.7	A very contentious debate	81
2.8	Other relevant elements of the debate	83
2.9	Conclusion	99
3	Trade, investment and medicines: the existing legal and policy construct	101
3.1	The existing legal and policy construct	101
3.2	ASEAN – the need for greater clarity in the collective legal and policy construct	103
3.3	Key elements	103
3.4	Exhaustion of rights and parallel imports	159
3.5	Conclusion	162
4	Treaties in Asia: embedded risks and lessons from disputes elsewhere	164
4.1	Legal obligations in TRIPS	164
4.2	Examples of TRIPS disputes in the WTO system	165
4.3	TRIPS-like and TRIPS-plus commitments in Asia FTAs	167

4.4 FTAs and legal risks arising from negotiated language	168
4.5 Non-FTA mechanisms with a bearing on national laws	172
4.6 Types of TRIPS-plus FTA provisions	172
4.7 The treaty-based ISDS system – legal risks and concerns	201
4.8 “Counterweight” provisions relevant to the regulation of the pharmaceutical industry	214
4.9 Conclusion	215
5 The importance of exceptions and flexibilities	219
5.1 Introduction	219
5.2 Exception provisions – general considerations	221
5.3 Applicability of GATT 1994 Article XX to WTO Accession Protocol commitments: lessons learnt	224
5.4 Safe harbours: Asian treaties’ general exceptions	225
5.5 TRIPS principles and objectives in FTAs	227
5.6 TRIPS exceptions and flexibilities	228
5.7 Using a non-violation provision to safeguard the use of exceptions and limitations	266
5.8 Investment treaty general exceptions and expropriation exceptions relevant to health	268
5.9 Security exceptions	273
5.10 Interpretational treaty signals	275
5.11 Negotiating space	277
5.12 Conclusion	281
6 Innovation and competition	283
6.1 Innovation, competition: seeking a balance	283

6.2	Patents and competition law – necessary bedfellows	286
6.3	Emerging case law on competition law and pharmaceutical patentees’ practices	289
6.4	The European Union: towards increased competition enforcement in pharmaceuticals sector	294
6.5	Asia’s first pay-for-delay case	297
6.6	Developments in other jurisdictions	298
6.7	Connecting refusals to licence patents and the essential facilities doctrine: the next logical step?	302
6.8	Competition law and the pharmaceutical sector in Asia – an evolving regional landscape	306
6.9	Conclusion	332
7	Setting new directions: the need for innovative legal and policy solutions	334
7.1	The need for new paradigms and strategies	334
7.2	A brief inventory of major initiatives	337
7.3	The evolving role of the state as a provider of incentives	342
7.4	The evolving paradigm in R&D: public-private partnerships to promote public health and innovation	344
7.5	Exploring new funding models	348
7.6	The evolving role of business	352
7.7	Rethinking clinical data protection	353
7.8	Treaty-based approaches	366
7.9	The use of differential or tiered pricing: affordable prices and facilitative aspects in trade and investment treaties	377

7.10	Dispute resolution provisions for public health	387
7.11	Conclusion	388
8	What next?	389
8.1	Advancing access: important questions and trends for Asia to consider	389
8.2	Clarifying critical matters in the multilateral trade system	389
8.3	New incentives – new ways of rewarding conduct that contributes to greater access	404
8.4	Timely evaluations and coherent policy-making in growing areas	405
8.5	Can industry do more?	411
8.6	Can governments do more?	418
8.7	Regional integration and pharmaceutical initiatives	422
8.8	Watch this space: BRICS and health	430
8.9	Encouraging new alliances and collaborations	432
8.10	Preparing for the debate ahead: legal education and capacity-building	435
8.11	Conclusion	436
	<i>Index</i>	439