

# ECONOMIC CRITERIA FOR CRIMINALIZATION

Optimizing Enforcement in Case of  
Environmental Violations

Katarina SVATIKOVA



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i> .....	v
<i>Executive Summary</i> .....	xi
Chapter 1.	
Introduction .....	1
1.1. Introduction .....	1
1.2. Relevance .....	4
1.3. Research Question(s) and Purpose .....	6
1.4. Methodology .....	7
1.5. Scope of Research .....	8
1.6. Structure .....	10
Chapter 2.	
Criminal Legal Theory: Why Criminal Law? .....	13
2.1. Introduction .....	13
2.2. What is Crime: Distinguishing Characteristics of a Criminal Act .....	14
2.2.1. Harm .....	14
2.2.2. Intent/Guilty Mind ( <i>mens rea</i> ) .....	15
2.2.3. Punishment .....	17
2.2.4. Standard of Proof .....	17
2.3. When is a Crime Crime: The Principle of Legality .....	18
2.4. Functions and Goals of Criminal Law .....	19
2.4.1. Deterrence .....	20
2.4.2. Prevention .....	20
2.4.3. Incapacitation .....	21
2.4.4. Rehabilitation .....	21
2.4.5. Restoration and Reparation .....	21
2.4.6. Punishment .....	22
2.5. Why Criminalize: Legal Criteria for Criminalization .....	23
2.5.1. The Principle of Individual Autonomy .....	25
2.5.2. The Principle of Welfare .....	27
2.5.3. The Principle of Harm .....	27
2.5.4. The Principle of Morality .....	30

2.6. The Development of Administrative Law . . . . .	33
2.6.1. Enforcement Deficit under Criminal Law . . . . .	33
2.6.2. Corporate Criminal Liability . . . . .	35
2.7. Limitations of the Legal Approach to Criminalization . . . . .	38
2.8. Conclusion . . . . .	40
Chapter 3.	
Criminological Perspectives on Criminalization . . . . .	43
3.1. Introduction . . . . .	43
3.2. Labeling Perspective . . . . .	45
3.3. Conflict and Radical Theories . . . . .	47
3.3.1. Conflict Criminology . . . . .	47
3.3.2. Radical Criminology . . . . .	48
3.4. Critical Theory . . . . .	49
3.5. Corporate Actors and Enforcement of Environmental Law . . . . .	51
3.6. Limitations of this Approach . . . . .	53
3.7. Conclusions . . . . .	53
Chapter 4.	
Economic Criteria for Criminalization . . . . .	55
4.1. Introduction . . . . .	55
4.2. Why Do We Need Law? Harmful Conducts in Economics . . . . .	57
4.3. Criteria for Public vs. Private Law Enforcement . . . . .	59
4.3.1. Intent . . . . .	60
4.3.2. Imperfect Detection and Enforcement by Private Law Parties . . . . .	61
4.3.3. The Level of Harm . . . . .	62
4.3.4. Low Probability of Detection and Sanctioning of Harms . . . . .	63
4.3.5. Aim of Law: Compensatory vs. Punitive . . . . .	67
4.3.6. Administrative Costs of Enforcement (Enforcement Costs) . . . . .	68
4.3.7. Conclusion . . . . .	69
4.4. Criteria for Criminal vs. Administrative Law . . . . .	70
4.4.1. Imprisonment . . . . .	71
4.4.2. Stigma . . . . .	73
4.4.3. Aim of Law: Deterrence vs. Compliance Strategies . . . . .	75
4.4.4. Enforcement Costs . . . . .	77
4.5. Economic Criteria for Criminalization . . . . .	79
4.5.1. Harm . . . . .	80
4.5.2. Stigma . . . . .	81
4.5.3. Low Detection Rate . . . . .	83
4.5.4. Enforcement Costs . . . . .	83
4.6. Conclusion . . . . .	84

Chapter 5.	
Criminal or Administrative Law to Protect the Environment? Evidence from Western Europe .....	87
5.1. Introduction .....	87
5.2. Theoretical Framework Applied to Environmental Law .....	89
5.3. Experiences in Four Legal Systems .....	91
5.3.1. Flemish Region .....	91
5.3.2. United Kingdom .....	99
5.3.3. The Netherlands .....	105
5.3.4. Germany .....	109
5.4. Critical Comparative Analysis and Implications .....	113
5.4.1. A Brief Comparison .....	114
5.4.2. Sufficiently High Probability of Being Sanctioned? .....	116
5.4.3. Implications for the Actual and Expected Sanctions .....	117
5.5. Concluding Remarks .....	119
Chapter 6.	
Complementary Use of Administrative and Criminal Fines in Enforcing Environmental Regulations .....	121
6.1. Introduction .....	121
6.2. The Model .....	124
6.2.1. Basic Setup .....	124
6.2.2. Assumptions .....	127
6.3. Basic Model with Criminal Fines .....	132
6.4. Model with Administrative and Criminal Fines .....	135
6.5. Impacts of the Criminal Fine and Administrative-criminal Fine Models on Social Welfare and their Comparison .....	138
6.5.1. Case 1 .....	138
6.5.2. Case 2 .....	140
6.5.3. General Remarks .....	142
6.6. Conclusion .....	143
Appendix .....	144
Chapter 7.	
Conclusions .....	147
7.1. Introduction .....	147
7.2. Major Findings .....	148
7.2.1. Criminal Legal Theory, Criminology and Economic Analysis: Comparative Analysis .....	148

7.2.2. Economic Criteria for Criminalization Summarized..... 150  
7.2.3. The Role of Administrative Sanctions..... 152  
7.3. Implications of the Analysis..... 155  
7.4. Limitations and Suggestions for Further Research..... 157  
*References*..... 159