Reforming Severance Pay

AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE

Robert Holzmann and Milan Vodopivec
Editors

THE WORLD BANK
Washington, D.C.
Contents

Preface xxi
Acknowledgments xiii
Abbreviations xv

1. Severance Pay under Review: Key Issues, Policy Conclusions, and Research Agenda 1
   Robert Holzmann and Milan Vodopivec
   Introduction 1
   Issues with Severance Pay 2
   Chapter Overview 5
   Conclusions and Proposed Reform Directions 8
   Research Agenda: Next Steps 11
   Notes 13
   References and Other Resources 13

2. Severance Pay Programs around the World: History, Rationale, Status, and Reforms 17
   Robert Holzmann, Yann Pouget, Milan Vodopivec, and Michael Weber
   Introduction: Objectives, Methods, and Structure 17
   The Origins of Severance Pay 18
   Mandated Severance Pay Programs: Modalities, Overview, Reforms 23
   The Motivation behind Severance Pay: Reviewing Hypotheses and Evidence 43
   Conclusions 64
   Notes 66
   Annex A. Historic Perspectives across Countries and Regions 68
   Severance Pay in the United States 68
   Severance Pay in the United Kingdom 69
   Severance Pay in Japan 70
   Origins of Severance Pay in Developing and Transitional Countries 70
   Annex B. Inventory of Severance Pay across the World 75
   Annex C. Note on Econometric Estimation 111
   Why Robust Regression? 111
   Summary of Critical Aspects 111
   References and Other Resources 113
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Severance Pay Reform in the Republic of Korea</td>
<td>Jungyoll Yun and Jai-Joon Hur</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Corporate Pension System</td>
<td></td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theoretical Framework</td>
<td></td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Policy Implications</td>
<td></td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Annex A</td>
<td></td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Unemployment Insurance Savings Accounts in Latin America: Overview and Assessment</td>
<td>Ana M. Ferrer and W. Craig Riddell</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Potential Advantages of UISAs</td>
<td></td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UISAs in Latin America</td>
<td></td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Outcomes of UISAs</td>
<td></td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References and Other Resources</td>
<td></td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>The Welfare Consequences of Alternative Designs of Unemployment Insurance Savings Accounts</td>
<td>Hugo Hopenhayn and Juan Carlos Hatchondo</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Environment</td>
<td></td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Life-Cycle Model</td>
<td></td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Calibration</td>
<td></td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Benchmark and Other Mechanisms</td>
<td></td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployment Insurance Savings Accounts</td>
<td></td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td></td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Annex A</td>
<td></td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Description of the System</td>
<td></td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Design Considerations and Reemployment Incentives</td>
<td></td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td></td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

2.16 Severance Pay Generosity and Union Density ........................................... 58
3.1 Mandated Severance Pay for Redundancy by Occupation .......................... 126
3.2 Regulating Employment and Business Practices ...................................... 130
3.3 Percentage of Employers with Growth in Employment ............................ 148
4.1 Eligibility Conditions for Severance Pay, Total and by Organization Size .......................................................... 167
5.1 Proportion of Employees Covered by the 2003 Severance Pay Law ............. 180
5.2 Contributions to Austria’s Severance Pay Scheme ..................................... 181
5.3 Performance of Severance Pay Funds ...................................................... 182
5.4 Withdrawals from Employee Benefit Funds ............................................. 183
5.5 Job Duration Estimates, Female and Male ................................................ 191
7.1 Liquidity of FGTS ................................................................................... 220
7.2 Financing the Chilean Unemployment System ........................................... 221
7.3 Colombian Severance Pay Fund Portfolio ............................................... 225
7.4 Rate of Return for Panama’s Unemployment Funds .................................. 228
8.1 Pareto Set, low salary, baseline case ...................................................... 251
8.2 Pareto Set, medium salary, baseline case ............................................... 251
8.3 Pareto Set, high salary, baseline case ..................................................... 252
8.4 Pareto Set, low salary ............................................................................. 253
8.5 Pareto Set, medium salary ...................................................................... 253
8.6 Pareto Set, high salary ........................................................................... 254
9.1 Unemployment Insurance Coverage ....................................................... 262
9.2 Unemployment Insurance Program: Workers with Open-Ended Contracts ................................................................. 263
9.3 Unemployment Insurance Program: Workers with Fixed-Term Contracts .................................................. 263
9.4 Contributors by Type of Contract and Wage Earners in the Private Sector, 2002–09 (number of contributors and number of workers) ................................................................. 268
9.5 Beneficiaries’ Replacement Rates, 2002–June 2009 ................................. 269
9.6 Unemployment Funds, Net Worth, 2002–June 2009 ................................ 270
9.7 Estimated Median Benefit from the UI System, by Education and Age ........ 271
9.8 Hazard Rates from Not Contributing, by Type of Benefit Received .......... 273
10.1 Exit Rates and Survival Rates, Prime-Age Males .................................. 290
10.2 Exit Rates and Survival Rates, Prime-Age Female .................................. 291

Tables
2.1 Drivers of Generosity of Severance Pay: Results for Basic Model .................. 60
3.1 Expected Cost of Alternative Labor Market Mandates ............................... 133
3.2 Estimated Impacts of Alternative Labor Market Mandates on Employment Levels ................................................................. 133
4.1 Severance Benefit Generosity by Occupation, Organizations with Plan Based on Service Only ................................................................. 164
4.2 Basis of Severance Calculations by Occupation, Organizations with Plan Not Based on Service Only ........................................... 165
5.1 Simulations of the Severance Pay Funds ........................................ 184
5.2 Job Tenure .................................................................................. 185
5.3 Probability of Job Termination in Year 3 and Year 4 ....................... 186
5.4 Probability of Job Termination by Gender in Year 3 and Year 4 ....... 187
5.5 Probability of Direct Job Change in Year 3 and Year 4 ................. 187
5.6 Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Job Termination ............................................................................. 188
5.7 Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Job Termination by Gender .............................................................. 189
5.8 Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Direct Job Change ............................................................................... 189
5.9 Probit Difference-in-Differences: Dependent Variable, Direct Job Change by Gender .......................................................... 190
5.10 Effect of Reform ......................................................................... 191
6.1 Severance Pay System versus Corporate Pension System .............. 198
6.2 Number of Workers under Corporate Pension System as of November 2010 ................................................................. 205
7.1 UISA Characteristics .................................................................... 216
7.2 FGTS, Number and Value of Accounts .......................................... 219
7.3 Payments of Chilean Unemployment Insurance ............................. 222
7.4 Chilean Unemployment Fund ........................................................ 223
7.5 Evolution of the Colombian Fund ................................................ 226
7.6 Severance Payments in Panama .................................................... 227
7.7 Composition of Panama's Unemployment Fund ............................ 228
7.8 Analysis of Funds ......................................................................... 230
8.1 Mean of Variables for Transitions from Employment to Unemployment and Vice Versa ......................................................... 245
8.2 Maximum Likelihood Estimates of Logistic Regressions ................ 245
8.3 Cost of Insurance Mechanisms for Different Transfer Schemes and Different Costs of Exerting Effort ............................................. 247
8.4 Cost of Effort ............................................................................... 249
8.5 Marginal Cost of Effort in the Baseline Case .................................... 250
8.6 Marginal Cost of Effort for Alternative Designs .............................. 255
9.1 Valuation of Unemployment Insurance by Education Level .......... 272
10.1 Eligibility and Use of the Solidarity Fund by Number of Potential Withdrawals from the Individual Account .............................. 289