The Definition of Subsidy and State Aid

WTO and EC Law in Comparative Perspective

LUCA RUBINI
Lecturer in Law and Deputy-Director of the Institute of European Law
Birmingham Law School

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents—Summary

Table of cases xxix
Table of legislation xli
List of abbreviations xlvii

I INTRODUCTION AND FOUNDATIONS
Overview 2
1 Introduction 3
2 Foundations: the purpose of subsidy control 25

II FORMS OF GOVERNMENTAL ACTION
Overview 90
3 Introduction: governmental intervention in the economy and subsidies 91
4 The forms of governmental action covered by WTO subsidy rules 105
5 The forms of governmental action covered by EC State aid rules 149
6 Forms of governmental action: internal and external perspectives 181

III THE ADVANTAGE ANALYSIS
Overview 200
7 The advantage analysis: an introduction 203
8 Economic activity and the advantage analysis 217
9 Non-economic activity and the advantage analysis in the WTO 261
10 Non-economic activity and the advantage analysis in the EC 287
11 Concluding remarks: objectives and the advantage analysis 317

IV BENEFICIARIES
Overview 334
12 The identification of the beneficiaries 335
13 The idea and analysis of specificity 359
I INTRODUCTION AND FOUNDATIONS

Overview 2

1. Introduction 3
   I. The definition of WTO subsidy and EC State aid: the topic
      and its importance 3
   II. Comparing WTO law and EC law 5
       A. Why compare?  5
       B. Can WTO subsidy law and EC State aid law be compared?  7
       C. ‘Context matters’: a case-study on legal interpretation  9
           Legal interpretation in the WTO  9
           Legal interpretation in the EC  13
           Brief parallel between WTO and EC law  15
       D. A matter of importance: ‘inconsistencies’ between
          WTO subsidy law and EC State aid law at the definition level  16
   III. Defining the definition 17
   IV. The definition of subsidy and the interaction between scope
       and justification 19
       A. Scope and justification, equality and distributive justice  20
       B. Scope or justification: does it really matter?  23
   IV. Book outline 24

2. Foundations: the purpose of subsidy control 25
   Prelude: market, trade and competition 25
   I. The objectives of the WTO and the EC 27
       A. An analysis of the WTO  27
       B. A parallel with the EC  31
       C. Conclusions: constitution, community and shared interests  33
          The concept of community: implications for subsidy control  37
II. The goals of subsidy and State aid control in the WTO and EC 37
   A. First perspective: subsidies and market access 38
      The heart of the GATT bargain: the protection of market access 38
      State aids and the EC internal market 40
      Back to the GATT: striking the bargain's right balance 40
   B. Second perspective: subsidies, competition and market failures 41
      Introducing complexity: competition assessment, welfare analysis
      and political judgement 42
      Two case-studies on welfare standards 44
      Case-study 1: export and domestic subsidies 44
      Case-study 2: subsidies and consumer welfare 47
      Giving substance to subsidies' distortion:
      a competition-oriented approach 49
      Addressing market failures: subsidies and
      political judgements 52
      Technical issues 53
      Normative issues 54
   C. Conclusions: goals of subsidy control in the WTO and EC 56
      The goals of subsidy control in the GATT/WTO 56
      The goals of State aid control in the EC 59
      Coda: State aid and subsidy rules as competition regulation 62
      Trade and competition: united in diversity 62
      Conclusion: a matter of practical importance 67

III. The operation of subsidy control in the WTO and EC: overview and critique 68
   A. Summary of WTO and EC rules 68
      The WTO subsidy regime 68
      From GATT to WTO 68
      One subsidy, three categories 70
      The EC State aid regime 74
   B. Critical analysis 80
      Drafting tests and provisions 80
      Type of control and remedies 81
      Supranational and/or unilateral 81
      Transparency and control 82
      Remedies 85

II FORMS OF GOVERNMENTAL ACTION

Overview 90

3. Introduction: governmental intervention in the economy and subsidies 91
   I. Distinguishing financial assistance and regulation 91
      A. Forms of financial assistance 92
      B. Forms of regulation 93
II. Conceptualizing the distinction between financial assistance and regulation
   A. The complexity of the action 94
   B. The complexity of the financial dimension 96
   C. The significance of prerogatives 97

III. Techniques to define the legal relevance of the governmental action 97

IV. Legal treatment of regulatory measures 99

V. Forms of governmental action and objectives
   A. Self-defence and permitted remedies in rule-oriented systems: the case of retaliatory subsidies 100
   B. The place of objectives in subsidy legal analysis 102

4. The forms of governmental action covered by WTO subsidy rules 105
   I. Formulations of the definition of subsidy and rules of imputability
      A. GATT era 105
      B. WTO era 107
      SCM Agreement 108
         Article 1.1(a)(1) of the SCM: the financial contribution requirement 108
         Interpretation and function of the financial contribution 108
         The fourth subparagraph of Article 1.1(a)(1) of the SCM: rules of imputability and ‘guarding’ mechanisms 111
         Subparagraph (iv) between restrictiveness and expansiveness 111
         The quest for a balance: the development of the law 112
         The quest for a balance: analysis of the law 113
         Interlude on the other form of indirect action (payments to funding mechanism) 115
         Two provisos consolidating the function of the financial contribution 116
         Conclusions 122
      Article 1.1(a)(2) of the SCM: any income or price support—an additional concept in search of an expansive reading 123
      Agreement on Agriculture (AG) 125
         Introduction: AG and SCM Agreement, definitions and relationships 125
         The forms of governmental action under the AG 126
         The rule of imputability in Article 9.1(c) of the AG 128
         Abstract rules of imputability: the definitions of ‘government agency’ and ‘public body’ 130
Two concluding parallels 132
Comparing Article 9.1(c) of the AG and
Article 1.1(a)(iv) of the SCM 132
Comparing abstract and concrete rules of imputability 134

II. Origin of the resources 135
A. Premise on definitions: costs between economics
and accounting 135
B. GATT era 136
C. WTO era 138
SCM Agreement 139
The financial contribution: uncertain compromise or
creeping victory? 139
Article 1.1(a)(2) of the SCM: forms of income
or price support 141
Clarifying the ambiguity of the financial contribution:
Canada—Aircraft 141
Exercise of interpretation: the financial contribution
and the 'cost to government' 143
Textual and contextual interpretation 143
Interpretation 'in the light of the object and purpose'
of the treaty 145
Effectiveness, preparatory works, restrictive
interpretation 146
Conclusion 148

5. The forms of governmental action covered by EC State
aid rules 149

I. Formulation of the definition of State aid 149
A. Broad language between potentially wide coverage
and prevailing interpretation 149
B. Boundaries 152

II. Rules of imputability under Article 87(1) EC 152
A. No precise rule of imputability 153
B. A brief review of the case-law 154
C. The Stardust Marine test 155
D. The Pearle case: the double role of the concept of
control in a boundary-case 157
E. Analysis of the rule of imputability under
Article 87(1) EC 158
The Stardust's rationalization: towards a flexible and
case-by-case rule 158
Beyond Stardust: imputability and regulatory measures 159

III. Origin of resources 160
A. The case-law on the 'State resources' 160
The first period: fluctuations 161
Contents

The second period: towards stability? 162
The third period: perplexities 165
B. Analysis of the 'State resources' requirement 170
   Extensive interpretation 170
   Restrictive interpretation 172
   Method of financing and legal certainty 173
C. Conclusions 178

6. Forms of governmental action: internal and external perspectives 181
   I. Critical and comparative analysis, internal and external perspectives 181
   II. The regulation of subsidies and of State aids: the 'internal perspective' 181
      A. Recapitulation of the state of the law in the two legal systems 181
         WTO law 182
         EC law 183
      B. Critical and comparative assessment 183
   III. The other rules: the 'external perspective' 188
      A. Sketching the terms of the problem: rules and system 188
      B. Rules interplay and system coherency 189
      C. An application: subsidies in EC and WTO law 190
         Alternative application, exclusion of subsidy rules 190
         Cumulative application, subsidy and other rules 192
         State aid compatibility and other rules 194
      Applicability of different rules: implications 194
      Conclusions 198

III THE ADVANTAGE ANALYSIS

Overview 200

7. The advantage analysis: an introduction 203
   I. Comparison and benchmarks 203
      A. Benchmarks: an insight from economics 204
      B. Economic and non-economic activity, market and normative benchmarks 205
   II. How the analysis works 205
      A. Norm and exception: the derogation test 205
      B. Defining the norm, determining the exception: variations on the theme 207
   III. The context of the advantage analysis: market and public role redefinition 208
      A. Two characters in search of identity: the market and the government 208
B. Economic and non-economic activities:
   a conceptual clarification 210
   Public and private goods 210
   Publicly provided private goods 211
   Two lessons for the advantage analysis 213
C. Public interest between scope and justification 214

8. Economic activity and the advantage analysis 217
I. The market: a complex paradigm 217
   A. The adoption of the principle 217
      From reticence to consolidation 217
      First comments 219
   B. Market benchmarks: complex decisions, difficult reviews 220
      The complexity of business decisions 220
      Normative latitude: ‘standards’ vs ‘rules’ 220
      The review of business decisions 222
      Market benchmarks: examples of complexity 222
         (a) Diversity of investment objectives 222
         (b) Restructuring of companies in difficulties and investment of large sums 224
         (c) Ambivalence of market indicators 225
II. The interaction between public intervention in the economy and market 226
   A. Case-study 1: influence of the public intervention in the economy on market analysis 227
      Regulation: Canada—Dairy (Article 21(5)1) 227
      Economic and other policies: US—Lead and Bismuth II and US—Countervailing Measures on Certain EC Products 228
      Commercial presence: US—Softwood Lumber IV 229
      Comments on the case-study 232
   B. Case-study 2: market logic expansion and redefinition of the public intervention in the economy 233
      The La Poste saga: natural monopoly, network infrastructure and public services 234
      Comments on La Poste 236
         (a) The incomparable and the ineffable: the singularity of natural monopolies and the protean nature of public services 236
         (b) ‘Normal market conditions’ and ‘objective and verifiable elements’ 238
         (c) Access to infrastructures and market benchmarks 239
      Infrastructure and market under State aid rules 240
         (a) The traditional approach 240
         (b) Market logic expansion and multi-layered analysis 241
The regulation of infrastructure under WTO subsidy rules 243
(a) The exclusion of 'general infrastructure' 244
(b) Towards a new approach 245
C. Concluding remarks on the case-studies: the interplay between two forces 245

III. The step forward: from difficulty to criticism 246
A. First criticism: the fallacy of the market paradigm 246
   The criticism and its refutation 246
   A flexible solution 249
   Final gloss: advantage analysis and distortion 251
B. Second criticism: the inconsistency of the market paradigm with the public interest 252
   WTO law 253
   The definition of subsidy in the Tokyo Round Subsidies Code and public policy objectives:
   \textit{US—Lead and Bismuth I} 253
   The benefit requirement in the SCM and public policy objectives 255
   EC law 255
   Conclusions: distinction between market and public interest 259

IV. A word of conclusion: the redemption of the market paradigm 259

9. Non-economic activity and the advantage analysis in the WTO 261
I. Tax measures 261
A. A methodological premise: the advantage analysis between 'financial contribution' and 'benefit' 261
   The fabric and the position of the advantage analysis 262
B. Case study: the \textit{US—FSC} dispute 263
   Introduction 264
   The 'but for' test between simplicity and inadequacy 265
   The Panel: the choice of simplicity 265
   The Appellate Body: the recognition of inadequacy 267
   Preliminary conclusions: the 'but for' test is insufficient 268
   More sophistication: derogation test and comparative test 269
   Panel (Article 21.5 DSU): a derogation test in disguise? 269
   Appellate Body (Article 21.5 DSU): the 'new' comparative test 271
   Comparative and derogation test between norm and exception 272
C. Some implications of the case-study 274
   The share of sovereignty in tax matters: foreign economic processes and local taxation 274
   The taxation of foreign economic processes 274
Contents

Territorial and worldwide taxation: economic and legal considerations 274
Border tax adjustments: a confirmation 277
Local taxation 279
The analogy between international and local taxation under subsidy rules 279
Derogation test and objectives: the core of the 'scope/justification' interplay 279
The role of 'objectives' in subsidy rules and 'aims' in Article III of the GATT 281

II. Regulatory measures 283
III. Public goods 283
IV. 'Derogation' and 'discrimination': a parallel with Article III of the GATT 285

10. Non-economic activity and the advantage analysis in the EC 287

I. Tax measures 287
   A. The derogation test in taxation 287
   B. A conceptual gloss: advantage analysis, derogation test and specificity 289
   C. The operation of the derogation test and the critical role of objectives 290
      What is a general (tax) rule? 291
      What is a derogation (or discrimination)? 295
      The divergence between the objectives of the measure and the general rule 295
      The distinction between objectives 296
      'Navigating between the poles': the risk of conflating scope and justification 297
      An assessment of the case-law 298
         (a) Correct reasoning and correct outcome 299
         (b) Unclear reasoning but correct outcome 300
         (c) Incorrect reasoning and incorrect outcome 302
   D. Some applications 302
      Technical rules 302
      Gil Insurance 303
      The issue of negative aid 304
      Local taxation 306
      Environmental taxes 307

II. Regulatory measures 309
   A. Employment deregulation 310
   B. The regulation of debt 311

III. Public goods 314
11. Concluding remarks: objectives and the advantage analysis

I. Concluding remarks: subsidies between market and objectives
   A. The expansion of market logic: ineluctable process? 317
   B. Derogating? Norm and exception, and the objectives search 318
   C. The attraction of the objectives: scope or justification? 319

II. Exploring the scope-justification interplay: case-study on the financing of public services 319
   A. Public services: their mission, their problem, their relationship with State aid/subsidy rules 320
   B. The financing of public services under EC State aid rules: the Altmark decision 321
      The stakes and the clash 321
      The Ferring and Altmark decisions 321
      The interplay between scope and justification: separation or conflation? 325
   C. The financing of public services under WTO subsidy rules: the GATS 328
      Public services in an international context: between increasing concerns, diversity and official recognition 328
      The current State of the law (and the prospects for the future) 329

IV BENEFICIARIES

Overview 334

12. The identification of the beneficiaries 335

I. Introduction 335

II. Two case-studies 336
   A. ‘Input’ or ‘upstream’ subsidies 337
      The US—Pork dispute 338
      The US—Softwood Lumber III and IV disputes 341
      Input ‘State aids’ and conclusions 343
   B. Sale of companies or assets 344
      The pass-through of the benefit: the position of the buyer between the use of presumptions and the market 344
      Presumption of pass-through of the advantage: against automatism 345
      Presumption of exhaustion of the advantage: the market and the government intervention 346
The distinctions between the company and its owners and between share, business and asset deals 350
WTO law 350
EC law 353

The case of circumvention of the repayment 354
EC law 354
WTO law 356

13. The idea and analysis of specificity 359

I. Introduction 359

II. The justification of the idea of specificity - 359
   A. Economic rationales 360
   B. Non-economic rationales 364
   C. A truly political economy justification 365

III. The application of the specificity test 366
   A. The specificity analysis and its test 366
   B. The specificity test between limitation, flexibility, certainty and expansiveness 368
      The definition of 'certain' (how many is 'certain'? ) 368
      The examples of export and regional aid 369
      Specificity, objective requirements and discretionality 371
      De facto specificity 372
      Difficulty of distinguishing between specific and generic measures 373
      How to distinguish then? 374

IV. Conclusions 376

V DISTORTION OF COMPETITION 380

14. The distortion of competition 381

I. Subsidies from market access to distortion of competition 381
   A. How can subsidies distort competition? 381
      The impact of subsidies on competition 382
      Assessment of the impact 385
      Two case-studies on subsidies and locational competition 387
      Case-study 1: Compensation of regional location costs 388
      Case-study 2: Mobile investment and location decisions 389
Contents

II. Critical interpretation of the standards: from trade to competition 392
   A. EC law: 'distortion of competition' and 'effect on trade', revisiting two requirements 392
      Distortion of competition 393
         The traditional interpretation and its critique 393
      Effect on trade 398
         Effect on trade: a jurisdictional and substantive requirement between free movement and State aid 398
   B. WTO law: a bundle of standards, but what rationales? 401
      Prohibited subsidies 401
         Actionable 404
            Injury 406
            Nullification or impairment of benefits 410
            Serious prejudice 412

III. Conclusions 416

Conclusions 419

Bibliography 425

Index 443