

Climate Change Litigation

A Handbook

edited by

Wolfgang Kahl
Marc-Philippe Weller

2021



Table of Content

Foreword from the Editors.....	V
List of Abbreviations.....	XVII
List of Authors.....	XXIX

INTRODUCTION

CLIMATE CHANGE AS A CHALLENGE FOR GLOBAL GOVERNANCE, COURTS AND HUMAN RIGHTS (*Voigt*)

I Introduction: climate change – a global threat	2
II Challenges (and possibilities) for global governance and international law.....	3
III. The role of courts.....	7
1. Addressing the causes of climate change	7
2. Addressing the consequences of climate change.....	12
3. Response measures to climate change	13
IV. Major legal issues	14
V. Potential role for litigation in national courts.....	17

PART I

FUNDAMENTAL QUESTIONS

A. Liability for climate damages, sustainability and environmental justice (<i>Kloepfer/Neugärtner</i>).....	21
I. Introduction: global warming's spatiotemporal strangeness – “tricky” to imagine.....	23
II. Random sampling: <i>Lliuya v. RWE</i> – approaching liabilities for climate damages inductively.....	23
1. The case <i>Lliuya v. RWE</i>	23
2. Three exemplary issues: statute of limitations, rivalling <i>Rechtsregime</i> , adequate causation	24
3. Trying to imagine “strange” ‘spaces’, ‘times’ and ‘agents’	26
III. Key frameworks: ‘sustainability’, ‘environmental justice’ – and ‘ecological justice’.....	26
1. Integrative frameworks for “evaluating environmental decisions”.....	26
2. First encounters, some basic definitions, some common(?) ground.....	27
3. Some traps: ‘lucid dreams’ of harmony, ‘greenwashing’ and anthropocentrist blind spots	30
4. ‘Ecological justice’ – ‘space’, ‘time’ and ‘agency’ in the Anthropocene.....	31
IV. Times, spaces (and agents) of global warming.....	33
1. Times of global warming	33
2. Spaces of global warming.....	37
V. Coda: “more time tunnels of different sizes”.....	43
B. Climate damages and the ‘Polluter Pays’ Principle (<i>Rehbinder</i>).....	45
I. Introduction.....	46
II. Historical development and state of recognition	46
1. Historical development.....	46
2. State of recognition.....	47
III. Legal nature	48
1. Principle or rule?.....	48
2. Legal effects	49
IV. Functions	51
1. Diversity of functions.....	51
2. Internalisation vs. instrumental orientation	52
3. Redistribution of costs vs. material responsibility.....	53

Table of Content

V. Contents and limits.....	54
1. Generalities.....	54
2. Protected assets.....	54
3. Identification of the polluter (originator).....	55
4. Causation and accountability.....	56
5. Delimitation from the common burden principle.....	57
VI. Instruments.....	58
1. Generalities.....	58
2. Liability in particular.....	59
VII. Conclusion.....	60
C. The role of courts in climate protection and the separation of powers (<i>Payandeh</i>).....	62
I. Introduction: the judicialization of climate change governance.....	64
II. Analysis: structures of judicial involvement in climate protection.....	66
1. Venues.....	66
2. Protagonists.....	69
3. Goals.....	70
III. Contextualization: factors influencing the role of courts.....	72
1. Procedural rules and the competences of courts.....	72
2. Substantive law and the legal order in general.....	73
3. Political and social environment.....	75
IV. Evaluation: the legitimate functions of courts in climate protection.....	76
1. Climate change litigation between law and politics.....	76
2. The suitability of judicial engagement with climate change.....	78
3. The effectiveness of climate change litigation.....	79
V. Conclusion: potential and limitations of judicial climate protection.....	80
D. Climate change and duties to protect with regard to fundamental rights (<i>Gross</i>).....	81
I. Introduction.....	82
II. Constitutional foundations.....	83
1. Protection of the environment.....	83
2. Protection of human rights.....	84
III. The Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights.....	85
1. The protection against dangerous activities.....	85
2. The protection against natural disasters.....	87
3. Open questions.....	87
IV. The legal problems of positive obligations.....	88
1. Individual rights.....	88
2. Access to courts.....	90
3. Causation.....	91
4. Scope of obligations.....	92
5. Separation of powers.....	94
V. Conclusion.....	95

PART 2
PROCEDURAL ISSUES AND CONFLICT OF LAWS

E. Arbitration proceedings (<i>Lennarz</i>).....	97
I. Introduction.....	98
II. Climate change disputes.....	99
1. Disputes resulting from material damages.....	99
2. Disputes over natural resources.....	99
3. Disputes resulting from international climate treaties.....	99
4. Disputes resulting from transformation of the economy.....	99
5. Climate finance disputes.....	100
6. Corporate disputes.....	100
III. Arbitration proceedings.....	100
1. Arbitration law.....	101
2. Enforceability.....	101

Table of Content

3. Arbitration agreement.....	102
4. Confidentiality	102
5. Flexibility of proceedings	103
6. Selection of arbitrators.....	104
7. Involvement of third parties.....	104
8. Involvement of states	104
9. Applicable law.....	105
10. Claims based on tort	105
IV. Suitability of arbitration proceedings for climate change disputes.....	105
1. Political and public law claims	105
2. Claims for damages and for specific performance against companies.....	106
3. Disputes over natural resources.....	106
4. Disputes arising from international climate protection treaties.....	107
5. Disputes resulting from the implementation of international climate treaties.....	108
6. Disputes due to transformation towards Green economy	110
7. Disputes arising from climate finance	111
8. Corporate disputes.....	113
V. Arbitral institutions and climate change.....	114
1. Permanent Court of Arbitration, The Hague.....	114
2. International Court of Arbitration of the ICC, Paris	115
VI. Summary	118
F. Conflicts of jurisdiction and the applicable law in domestic courts' proceedings (<i>Kieninger</i>).....	119
I. Introduction.....	120
1. Road map.....	120
2. Cross-border elements giving rise to questions of private international law.....	121
3. No universal rules with respect to jurisdiction and Choice of Law	122
II. State immunity and “political question doctrine”	123
1. State immunity	123
2. “Political question doctrine” as a limitation to cross-border proceedings	125
III. Jurisdiction	125
1. Introduction	125
2. Brussels Ibis Regulation and Lugano Convention.....	127
3. EU Member States' autonomous rules on jurisdiction	132
4. United States: Personal jurisdiction of state and federal courts.....	133
IV. Choice of Law.....	138
1. Introduction	138
2. EU: Liability in tort (delict) according to the Rome II Regulation	139
3. Autonomous PIL: Property law.....	146
4. US conflict of laws.....	146

PART 3

STATE LIABILITY UNDER INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN LAW

G. Environmental liability in international law (<i>Wolfrum</i>).....	149
I. Introduction.....	150
II. Notion – environmental liability – what does it mean and what is the purpose in the context of a liability regime?.....	151
III. Development of a regime on environmental liability: From liability for transboundary harm to genuine international environmental liability	152
1. Introduction – first jurisprudence.....	152
2. Development of the treaty law on civil liability.....	153
3. International treaties on the protection of the environment of international common spaces: A paradigmatic shift?.....	156
4. Customary international law: Does there exist an international regime on environmental liability?	160
IV. Concluding observations: Necessary features of a regime on international environmental liability.....	161

Table of Content

1. Introduction	161
2. Liability for lawful or only illegal activities.....	161
3. Intensity of harm	163
4. Liability for not establishing precautionary measures or an adequate response system	163
5. The matter of causality.....	164
6. Fault based or strict liability.....	164
7. Calculating the amount of compensation to be paid and limits	165
8. The potential claimant.....	165
H. The international law and policy implications of climate change litigation: sustainable developments in international investment law and policy related to renewable energy, climate change mitigation and adaptation (Cordonier Segger/Arvan/Byron/Srinivas).....	166
I. Introduction.....	168
II. International policy & treaty commitments to climate justice & investment in carbon neutral/negative sustainable development	169
III. Climate change litigation guiding investment risk assessment & decision-making	173
IV. Innovations in investment law & policy related to clean energy, climate change and sustainable development.....	182
1. Treaty & policy developments	183
2. Investment treaty disputes.....	188
V. Conclusions.....	196
I. The Paris Climate Agreement and liability issues (Franzius/Kling).....	197
I. Introduction.....	199
II. The Paris Agreement and the legal nature of its provisions.....	200
1. The Paris Agreement – binding or not binding?	200
2. Obligations in the main action areas.....	201
3. Compliance and enforcement	207
III. The Paris Agreement in the courtroom.....	208
1. Interplay between the international and national level.....	208
2. The Paris Agreement in domestic litigation.....	209
3. Rights-based litigation.....	210
4. Adjudication in planning decisions	212
5. Some general remarks: the importance of considering the national context.....	214
IV. Conclusion and outlook.....	215
J. Liability of EU Member States under EU law (Purnhagen/Saurer).....	217
I. Introduction.....	218
II. Greenhouse gas reduction obligations of EU Member States under EU law.....	219
III. EU Member State liability within the non-ETS sector: the obligation to purchase surplus allocations from other Member States as financial sanction.....	221
IV. Financial sanctions within the infringement procedure as liability mechanism	223
V. Liability of EU Member States under <i>Francovich</i> doctrine?.....	224
1. The origins, function and reasoning and doctrinal embedding of non-contractual Member State liability as developed by the Court	225
2. The <i>Francovich</i> criteria for state liability and climate law cases.....	226
3. Does the nature of the breach of Union law require a different yardstick in climate law cases?	235
VI. Conclusion.....	236

**PART 4
CLIMATE CHANGE LITIGATION – NATIONAL REPORTS**

K. Climate change litigation in the United States (Farber)	237
I. Introduction.....	237
II. Jurisdictional issues.....	238
1. Standing.....	239
2. Personal jurisdiction.....	241
3. Subject matter jurisdiction.....	242
III. Public law litigation	244

Table of Content

1. Litigation under the Clean Air Act.....	244
2. Litigation over disclosure of climate impacts.....	247
3. Adaptation issues.....	247
4. Non-statutory claims.....	249
IV. Tort liability.....	250
1. Nuisance law and climate change.....	250
2. Causation issues.....	251
3. Litigation prospects.....	252
V. Conclusion.....	252
L. Climate change litigation in Canada (<i>Jodoin/McGinn</i>).....	253
I. Introduction.....	254
II. Climate law and governance in Canada.....	255
III. Litigation relating to the authority of the federal government to address climate change.....	258
1. Syncrude Canada Ltd. v. The Attorney General of Canada.....	258
2. The GHG pollution pricing reference cases.....	259
IV. Litigation relating to the obligation of governments and public bodies to address climate change.....	262
1. Cases involving a failure of public bodies to adequately consider GHG emissions.....	262
2. Litigation relating to the Kyoto Protocol.....	264
3. Rights-based climate lawsuits.....	266
V. Conclusion.....	269
M. Climate change litigation in Brazil (<i>Wedy</i>).....	271
I. Introduction.....	272
II. Climate change law and litigation in Brazil.....	274
III. Legal remedies which may be used in climate litigation in Brazil.....	279
IV. Climate litigation in Brazil: analyses of cases.....	281
1. Precedent of the Supreme Federal Court.....	281
2. Precedents by the Brazilian Superior Court of Justice.....	283
V. Conclusion.....	286
N. Climate change litigation in Australia (<i>Bell-James</i>).....	288
I. Introduction.....	289
II. Climate change through the environmental impact assessment process.....	290
1. Early cases.....	291
2. The Queensland coal mine cases.....	292
3. Adani before the Federal Court.....	296
4. New development – Rocky Hill decision.....	297
5. Future directions and negative regulatory responses.....	298
III. Emerging avenues for climate change litigation.....	299
1. Corporate law.....	299
2. Human rights law.....	301
3. Operators of emissions-intensive industries.....	302
IV. Conclusion.....	303
O. Climate change litigation in the United Kingdom (<i>Ohdedar/McNab</i>).....	304
I. Introduction.....	306
1. Background to climate change litigation in the UK.....	307
2. Early history of climate litigation in the UK: 1990s to the mid-2000s.....	307
II. Litigating climate targets: holding the government to account.....	308
1. Plan B takes on the UK climate mitigation target.....	308
2. Human rights and climate change in the courts.....	309
3. The path to net zero: winning the political battle, losing the legal battle.....	310
III. Litigating the transition to a low carbon society: clean energy, airports, and fracking.....	311
1. Litigation on wind and solar projects.....	311
2. Anti-fracking cases.....	315
3. Litigation against airport expansion.....	316
IV. Criminal prosecution of climate activism: an emerging area of climate litigation.....	319
V. Conclusions and the future climate litigation in the UK.....	322

Table of Content

P. Climate change litigation in Italy (Butti)	324
I. Introduction.....	324
II. Regulatory and planning framework on climate change in Italy.....	325
1. Mitigation measures.....	325
2. Adaptation measures.....	328
III. “Giudizio universale” (the last judgment): a high-profile case to be litigated by the first months of 2020.....	329
IV. Local court cases that are relevant to climate change litigation in Italy.....	333
V. Conclusion.....	335
Q. Climate change litigation in France (Epstein/Deckert)	336
I. Introduction.....	337
II. Climate change litigation in public law.....	338
1. Available remedies.....	338
2. Injury.....	340
3. Illegal act or conduct.....	341
4. The causal link between the damage and the misconduct.....	345
III. Climate change litigation in private law.....	346
1. Making French companies eco-friendly through business law.....	348
2. Conditions and limits to the engagement of climate change civil liability: analysis of the difficulties and solutions to overcome them.....	356
R. Climate change litigation in the Netherlands – the Urgenda case and beyond (Van der Veen/De Graaf)	363
I. Introduction.....	363
II. The Urgenda case.....	365
1. The District Court judgment.....	365
2. The Court of Appeal ruling.....	366
3. The Supreme Court decision.....	367
4. Analysis and critique.....	369
III. Other developments in the Netherlands.....	372
1. Friends of the Earth versus Shell.....	372
2. The Climate Act.....	373
3. The Climate Agreement.....	375
IV. Conclusions.....	377
S. Climate change litigation in Germany (Weller/Nasse/Nasse)	378
I. Introduction.....	380
II. The scientific bases of climate change.....	382
1. The climate system.....	382
2. Greenhouse effect and greenhouse gases.....	383
3. Detection and attribution of climate change.....	385
III. Climate change litigation and private international law.....	386
IV. International jurisdiction of national courts.....	387
1. General forum, Art. 4 of Regulation No. 1215/2012.....	387
2. Special forum of the tort, Art. 7 No. 2 of Regulation No. 1215/2012.....	388
3. Special forum of the joinder of parties, Art. 8 No. 1 of Regulation No. 1215/2012.....	391
V. Applicable law.....	392
1. Scope of the tort statute.....	392
2. Choice of law, Art. 14 Rome II.....	392
3. Environmental tort statute, Art. 7 Rome II.....	392
4. Interim result.....	398
VI. Liability under German law.....	398
1. Compensation for already occurred damages.....	398
2. Protection from future impairments.....	401
3. Proof of causality as central hurdle of private climate actions.....	402
VII. Summary.....	403

Table of Content

PART 5

LIABILITY FOR CLIMATE DAMAGES – GERMANY AS AN INTERNATIONAL PIONEER?

T. Liability for climate damages under the German law of torts (<i>Wagner/Arntz</i>)	405
I. The German law of non-contractual liability: an overview	407
1. Overview	407
2. The law of delict	407
3. Nuisance law	408
4. Strict liability	409
II. A prominent case in German courts: Saúl Ananías Luciano Lliuya vs. RWE AG	410
III. The law of delict	412
1. Negligence liability, Section 823 (1) BGB	412
2. Breach of statutory duty, Section 823 (2) BGB	422
3. <i>Actio doli</i> , Section 826 BGB	423
IV. Strict liability	423
V. Law of nuisance	423
1. <i>Actio negatoria</i> , Section 1004 BGB	423
2. Section 906 (2) cl. 2 BGB and Section 14 cl. 2 BImSchG	426
VI. Conclusion	427
U. Liability for climate change damages under the German Environmental Liability Act (<i>Nitsch</i>)	429
I. Introduction	430
II. Basic principles of the UmweltHG	431
III. Nature of liability	433
IV. Facilities subject to the UmweltHG	434
1. Basic principles	434
2. Annex 1 catalogue	434
V. Damages subject to the UmweltHG	435
1. Basic principles	435
2. Climate change damages subject to the UmweltHG?	436
VI. Environmental impact	437
1. Basic principles	437
2. Environmental impact in the form of climate change	438
VII. Causation	439
1. Basic principles	439
2. Presumption of causation	442
3. Causation in cases of climate change damages	442
VIII. Temporal scope of application	445
IX. Conclusion	446
V. Climate protection and compliance in German corporate law (<i>Habersack/Ehrl</i>)	447
I. Introduction	450
1. Climate protection in current accounting and stock corporation law	450
2. The company's external and internal relationships	451
3. Delimiting the object of study	452
II. The perspective of economic analysis and legal functionalism	452
1. The internalization of negative externalities as a guidance objective	452
2. Efficiency of lawfulness and compliance duties for legal enforcement	453
III. Climate protection and current corporate law	455
1. Corporate management and the objectives of stock corporation law	455
2. Duty of lawfulness and compliance responsibility (under stock corporation law), §§ 91 (2), 93, 116 p. 1 AktG	456
3. CSR reporting duties	459
4. CSR and corporate interest	461
IV. Conclusion and prospects	464

Table of Content

W. Investor-led action for climate and business sustainability (Duve/Hamama)	466
I. Introduction.....	469
II. Climate change arrived in the investment community	470
III. Why is investor-led action needed?	471
1. Insufficient political measures.....	471
2. Changing regulatory frameworks.....	473
3. Need for more sustainable investments.....	474
4. Business dimension of the investor's-led action for climate.....	474
IV. Time for investor-led action	475
1. Invest responsibly.....	475
2. Divest from non-sustainable businesses	476
3. Stay invested and take action	477
V. What can investor-led action achieve?.....	477
1. Investor's dialogue with management.....	478
2. Corporate decisions and the public arena.....	479
3. Adopting climate change shareholder resolutions	480
4. Insisting on disclosure and climate change reporting.....	481
5. Acting as thought leaders.....	483
6. Taking a seat and action	484
7. Litigating as last resort.....	485
VI. Conclusion	486
X. Liability for climate damages under the Environmental Damage Act (Kahl/Stürmlinger) ..	487
I. Introduction.....	488
II. The concept of environmental damage.....	489
1. Damage to species and natural habitats	489
2. Water damage.....	490
3. Land damage.....	491
4. Restriction of the concept of environmental damage.....	491
5. Climate damages as environmental damages within the meaning of the EDA	492
III. Responsible party	496
1. Category of persons concerned.....	496
2. Direct causation.....	497
3. Responsible party for climate damages within the scope of the EDA	499
IV. Legal effects.....	502
1. Obligations of the responsible party.....	502
2. Powers of the authorities.....	503
3. Selection of disturbers.....	504
4. Bearing of costs	504
V. Conclusion	505
Y. The role of non-governmental organizations for climate change litigation	
(<i>Verheyen/Pabsch</i>).....	507
I. Introduction.....	509
1. NGO's as representatives of the environment	509
2. NGO's and climate litigation in practice.....	510
3. Climate litigation in Germany by defendants	512
II. NGO independent access to court as exception to the rule – the German standing rules in a nutshell	513
III. Formal role of NGO's in climate litigation against the state	516
1. Standing in project related actions	516
2. Compliance with climate protection targets or other rules of climate law	516
3. Climate litigation against the state: Climate legislation	523
IV. Passive legal status of NGO's	525
1. Intervention.....	525
2. Amicus Curiae – “friend of the court”	525
V. Perspective climate litigation to enforce climate law.....	525
1. Obligations under the EU Governance Regulation.....	526
2. The EU Climate Change Regulation	527

Table of Content

3. National climate protection law 528
4. Actions for adjustment and compensation 530
VI. Conclusion 530

PART 6
CONCLUSIONS
LIABILITY FOR CLIMATE DAMAGES –
SYNTHESIS AND FUTURE PROSPECTS (Kahl/Weller)

I. Introduction 535
II. Fundamental questions 537
 1. Sustainability and environmental justice 537
 2. Polluter-pays principle 538
 3. The role of the legislature and the judiciary 538
 4. Duties of protection 539
III. Procedural issues and Conflict of Laws 540
 1. Procedures before civil courts 540
 2. Applicable law 541
 3. Arbitration proceedings 541
IV. State liability under international and European law 541
V. Climate change litigation: country reports 543
 1. USA 543
 2. Canada 544
 3. Brazil 544
 4. Australia 544
 5. United Kingdom 545
 6. Italy 546
 7. France 546
 8. Netherlands 548
VI. Liability for climate damages – Germany as an international pioneer? 549
 1. Environmental Damage Act 549
 2. Role of the NGOs 550
 3. Corporate climate responsibility 550
 4. Delictual climate change liability 551
VII. Tendencies and prospects 551
 1. Primacy of the legislature, supplemental function of the courts 551
 2. Basic right or state objective: climate protection in the national constitutions? 552
 3. Emission reduction objectives in the constitution? 553
 4. Private enforcement 554
 5. Conclusion 558
Index 561