## Contents

List of Contributors xix  
Regulated Competition in Health Insurance Markets: Foreword by Alain Enthoven xxix  
Acknowledgments xxix

### Part I: Theory

1. Regulated Competition in Health Insurance Markets: Paradigms and Ongoing Issues 3  
   *Thomas G. McGuire and Richard C. van Kleef*
   
   **1.1 Introduction** 3  
   **1.2 Intellectual Roots of Regulated Competition** 4  
   1.2.1 Evolution of the Enthoven Model: Individual-Insurance Markets Managed by a Sponsor-Regulator 4  
   1.2.2 Diamond Model: "First-Stage" Group-Level Competition 6  
   **1.3 Prevalence of Regulated Competition** 7  
   1.3.1 Individual and Group-Level Competition in the United States 8  
   1.3.2 Individual-Level Competition in Europe 9  
   1.3.3 Regulated Competition in Australia, Asia, and Latin America 12  
   **1.4 The Role of Health Plan Payment in Regulated Competition** 12  
   1.4.1 The Broader Menu of Regulatory Tools 14  
   1.4.2 Regulation of Health Plan Payment 16  
   **1.5 The Outline of This Volume** 19  
   Endnote 20

2. Premium Regulation, Risk Equalization, Risk Sharing, and Subsidies: Effects on Affordability and Efficiency 21  
   *Richard C. van Kleef, Frederik T. Schut*  
   *and Wynand P.M.M. van de Ven*
   
   **2.1 Introduction** 21  
   2.1.1 Risk Rating: A Threat to the Affordability of Basic Coverage for High-Risk People 22
2.1.2 Risk Selection: A Threat to Both Affordability and Efficiency 25
2.1.3 The Goal and Outline of This Chapter 26
2.2 Starting Point of Our Analyses 26
2.3 How Risk Rating and Risk Selection Affect Efficiency: A Graphical Framework 28
  2.3.1 Risk Rating: Good for Efficiency 28
  2.3.2 Risk Selection by Consumers: Bad for Efficient Sorting 30
  2.3.3 Risk Selection by Insurers: Bad for Efficiency of Plan Design and Efficiency of Production 32
2.4 Benchmark for Analyzing the Effects of Payment System Interventions 34
2.5 Premium Regulation 35
2.6 Risk Equalization, Risk Sharing, and Subsidies to Insurers 39
  2.6.1 Risk Equalization Without an External Subsidy 39
  2.6.2 Risk Sharing Without an External Subsidy 39
  2.6.3 Effects of Risk Equalization and Risk Sharing Without an External Subsidy 40
  2.6.4 The Effects of an External Subsidy to Insurers 44
  2.6.5 Risk Equalization or Risk Sharing With an External Fixed Subsidy 45
2.7 Subsidies to Consumers 47
  2.7.1 Premium-Based Subsidies to Consumers 47
  2.7.2 Risk-Based Subsidies to Consumers 49
  2.7.3 Income-Based Subsidies to Consumers 51
2.8 Summary and Conclusion 52
Acknowledgments 54

3. Risk Adjustment for Health Plan Payment 55
Randall P. Ellis, Bruno Martins and Sherri Rose

3.1 Introduction 55
3.2 Criteria Guiding the Design of Risk Adjustment Models 57
  3.2.1 Efficiency 57
  3.2.2 Fairness 60
  3.2.3 Feasibility 61
  3.2.4 Ten Principles in Pope et al. (2004) 62
3.3 Choice of Estimation Sample 63
  3.3.1 Sample Exclusions 64
  3.3.2 Separate Formulas for Population Subgroups 65
  3.3.3 Separate Formulas for Different Health Plan Benefits 66
  3.3.4 Separate Formulas for Different Types of Services 67
  3.3.5 Predicting Only Covered Services 67
  3.3.6 Accommodating Partial-Year Eligibles 68
  3.3.7 Normalizations to Create Relative Risk Scores 70
3.4 Information Used for Predicting Spending (Risk Adjusters) 71
  3.4.1 Age and Gender 71
  3.4.2 Diagnoses on Submitted Claims or Encounter Records 71
  3.4.3 Pharmacy Information 74
  3.4.4 Prior-Year Spending Information 75
4.5 Estimation of Risk Adjustment Models in the Presence of Risk Sharing 125
4.6 Conclusion: Risk Sharing as a Component of a Health Plan Payment System 127
Acknowledgments 129
Endnotes 129

5. Evaluating the Performance of Health Plan Payment Systems 133
Timothy J. Layton, Randall P. Ellis, Thomas G. McGuire and Richard C. van Kleef

5.1 Introduction 133
5.1.1 Efficiency Problems in Individual Health Insurance Markets 134
5.1.2 Plan of the Chapter 137
5.2 Measures of Fit and Incentives at the Individual Level 137
5.2.1 Rationale for R-Squared From a Risk Adjustment Regression 137
5.2.2 Generalizing the R-Squared: Payment System Fit 140
5.2.3 Comments on Individual-Level Fit Measures 141
5.3 Measures of Fit and Incentives at the Group (or Action) Level 142
5.3.1 Rationale for Over-/Undercompensation and Predictive Ratio Measures 143
5.3.2 Identifying Potential Actions and Groups of Interest 145
5.3.3 Generalizing Over-/Undercompensation and Predictive Ratios to Include Other Elements of Plan Payment 146
5.3.4 Generalizing Group Fit to the Entire Population 147
5.3.5 Taking Account of Consumer Response 148
5.3.6 Summary Comments About Action/Group-Level Measures of Incentives 150
5.4 Measures of Incentives for Consumers to Choose the Right Plan 150
5.4.1 Efficient Premium Pricing 151
5.4.2 First Source of Deviation From Efficient Pricing: Limited Premium Categories 151
5.4.3 Second Source of Deviation From Efficient Pricing: Adverse Selection 156
5.4.4 Summary Comments on Measures of Incentives for Efficient Sorting 157
5.5 Measures of Incentives for Cost Control 158
5.5.1 Risk Sharing Affects Incentives for Cost Control 159
5.5.2 Diagnosis-Based Risk Adjustment Affects Incentives for Cost Control 159
5.5.3 Defining Incentives for Cost Control: The Power of a Plan Payment System 161
5.5.4 Measuring Power in Plan Payment Systems 162
5.5.5 Final Comments on Measuring Incentives for Cost Control 162

5.6 Summary and Discussion 164
5.6.1 When Does It Matter to Make Use of the Proposed Metrics? 164
5.6.2 Mathematical Properties of the Measures 164

Endnotes 165

References for Part I 169

Part II: Practice

6. Health Plan Payment in Australia 181
Francesco Paolucci, Ana R. Sequeira, Ayman Fouda and Andrew Matthews

6.1 Introduction 181

6.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System 183
6.2.1 Health Plans and Regulatory Bodies 183
6.2.2 Health Plan Market Regulation 184
6.2.3 Health Plan Choice Options for Consumers 187
6.2.4 Link Between Private Health Insurance and Medicare 188
6.2.5 Instruments for Health Plans to Promote Efficiency in the Delivery of Care 188

6.3 Health Plan Payment Design 189
6.3.1 Premium Regulation and Contributions 190
6.3.2 Claims Equalization: A Combination of Risk Equalization and Risk Sharing 190
6.3.3 Implementation and Maintenance 197

6.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment 197
6.4.1 Sustainability of the Private/Public-Mix Services Provision 197
6.4.2 Price and Premium Regulation 198
6.4.3 Instruments for Health Plans to Promote Efficiency in the Delivery of Care 199
6.4.4 Claims Equalization Scheme, Risk Selection, and Adverse Selection 199
6.4.5 Health Plan Choice Options for Consumers 200

6.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms 200
6.5.1 Duplication Between Public and Private Coverage 201
6.5.2 Issues Related to Health Plan Payment 202

6.6 Final Comments 203
Acknowledgments 203
Endnotes 204
References 204
Further Reading 207
7. Risk Adjustment in Belgium: Why and How to Introduce Socioeconomic Variables in Health Plan Payment

Erik Schokkaert, Joeri Guillaume and Carine van de Voorde

7.1 Introduction
7.1.1 The Health Insurance Law of 1963
7.1.2 The Introduction of Financial Accountability in 1995

7.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System
7.2.1 Broad Financing Structure
7.2.2 Choice Options for Consumers in the Insurance Market
7.2.3 Healthcare Provider Markets
7.2.4 Instruments for Insurers

7.3 Health Plan Payment Design
7.3.1 Contributions and Premium Regulation
7.3.2 Risk Adjustment
7.3.3 Risk Sharing
7.3.4 Implementation Issues

7.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payments

7.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms
7.5.1 Important Features of the Belgian Risk-Adjustment System
7.5.2 Risk Selection and the Growth of Total Healthcare Expenditures
7.5.3 The Future Role of Belgian Health Insurers

References

8. Health Plan Payment in Chile

Carolina Velasco, Josefa Henríquez and Francesco Paolucci

8.1 Introduction
8.1.1 Historical Background
8.1.2 Organization of the Current Health Insurance System

8.2 Organization of the Mandatory Health Insurance System
8.2.1 Regulation of and Access to Health Plans
8.2.2 Instruments for Health Plans to Promote Efficiency in the Delivery of Care
8.2.3 Fonasa: The Outside Option

8.3 Health Plan Payment Design
8.3.1 Contributions and Premium Regulation
8.3.2 Risk Equalization
8.3.3 Risk Sharing

8.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment
8.4.1 Risk Selection Incentives and the Risk Equalization Scheme
8.4.2 Risk Selection Actions

References
11.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System 298
11.2.1 Legal Framework 298
11.2.2 The Insured and Their Choice Options 299
11.2.3 Benefit Package 301
11.2.4 Entry and Exit of Sickness Funds 301
11.2.5 Instruments for Insurers in Relation to Providers 302

11.3 Health Plan Payment Design for the Social Health Insurance System 303
11.3.1 Financial Flows in the Social Health Insurance System 303
11.3.2 Regulation of Premiums and Contributions 304
11.3.3 Risk Adjustment 305
11.3.4 Risk Sharing 313
11.3.5 Implementation and Maintenance 314

11.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment 317

11.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms 319
11.5.1 Selection of Diseases 320
11.5.2 Upcoding and Manipulation 321
11.5.3 Region as (Additional) Risk Adjuster Variable 321
11.5.4 Insured with Reduced Earning Capacity 322
11.5.5 Insured Residing Abroad 322
11.5.6 Sick Leave Payments 323
11.5.7 Socioeconomic Factors 323
11.5.8 Drug Prescriptions in Risk Adjustment 323
11.5.9 Outlier Risk Sharing 324

Endnotes 324
References 325

12. Health Plan Payment in Ireland 331

John Armstrong

12.1 Introduction 331
12.1.1 Overview 331
12.1.2 Historical Background 332

12.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System 334
12.2.1 The Role of Health Insurance 334
12.2.2 Health Insurance Legislation 335
12.2.3 Benefits Provided 336
12.2.4 Premium Levels 338
12.2.5 Competition in the Health Insurance Market 339

12.3 Health Plan Payment Design 341
12.3.1 Role of Community Rating as a Form of Premium Regulation 342
12.3.2 Risk Equalization 344
12.3.3 Risk Sharing 351

12.4 Evaluation of Risk Equalization (Health Plan Payment) 352
12.4.1 Evaluation of the Payment System 352
12.4.2 Monitoring of Risk Selection 354
12.5 Ongoing Issues and Reform

12.5.1 Improving the Risk Adjustment Methodology 356
12.5.2 Monitoring Risk Selection 357
12.5.3 Reconsideration of Community Rating 358

Disclaimer 358
Endnotes 358
References 361

13. Regulated Competition and Health Plan Payment Under the National Health Insurance Law in Israel—The Unfinished Story 365

Shuli Brammli-Greenberg, Jacob Glazer and Amir Shmueli

13.1 Introduction 365

13.1.1 Early History of the Israeli Health System 365
13.1.2 The National Health Insurance Law of 1995 366
13.1.3 Voluntary Health Insurance 367
13.1.4 Mental Health Care 368

13.2 Organization of the National Health Insurance System 368

13.2.1 Health Plan Market Regulation and Monitoring 369
13.2.2 Health Plan Choice Options for Consumers 370
13.2.3 Instruments for Health Plans to Manage the Utilization and Costs of Care 371

13.3 Health Plan Payment Design 372

13.3.1 Contributions and Premiums Regulation 372
13.3.2 The Capitation Formula and Risk Adjustment 374
13.3.3 Prospective Payments for "Severe Illnesses" and Other Supplementary Payment Mechanisms 376
13.3.4 Implementation and Maintenance 378
13.3.5 Health Plans' Payments for Their Community-Based Healthcare Providers 379

13.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment 380

13.4.1 An Evaluation of the Israeli Capitation Formula 380

13.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms 385

13.5.1 The Israeli Procedure to Set the Risk-Adjustment Weights 385
13.5.2 The Problem of Weight Calculation Based on Actual Use of Services 385
13.5.3 The Shortcomings of the Major Services Weights Calculation Methodology 386
13.5.4 Expanding the Set of the Risk Adjusters and Improving the Methodology of Setting Their Weights 388
13.5.5 The Use of Compensation Mechanisms to Maximize Outcomes 388
13.5.6 Risk-Sharing as a Supplement to Imperfect Risk Adjustment 389
14. Health Plan Payment in the Netherlands

Richard C. van Kleef, Frank Eijkenaar, René C.J.A. van Vliet and Wynand P.M.M. van de Ven

14.1 Introduction

14.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System
   14.2.1 Health Plan Market Regulation
   14.2.2 Health Plan Choice Options for Consumers
   14.2.3 Instruments for Insurers to Promote Efficiency in the Delivery of Care

14.3 Health Plan Payment Design
   14.3.1 Regulation of Premiums and Contributions
   14.3.2 Risk Equalization
   14.3.3 Risk Sharing
   14.3.4 Implementation and Maintenance

14.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment
   14.4.1 Evaluation of Incentives
   14.4.2 Evaluation of Market Response

14.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms
   14.5.1 Under/Overcompensation Discourages Insurers from Investing in the Quality of Their Plans
   14.5.2 Endogenous Risk Adjustor Variables Discourage Insurers From Improving Efficiency
   14.5.3 Accurate Risk Equalization May Not be Possible for All Types of Care
   14.5.4 Measurement of Risk Selection is Complex
   14.5.5 For Some Types of Spending Variation the Regulator Might Not Want Cross-Subsidies

Acknowledgments
References
Further Reading

15. Health Plan Payment in the Russian Federation

Igor Sheiman

15.1 Introduction

15.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System
   15.2.1 Health Plan Market Regulation
   15.2.2 Health Plan Choice Options for Consumers
15.2.3 Instruments for Health Plans to Promote Efficiency in the Delivery of Care 436

15.3 Health Plan Payment Design 439
15.3.1 Regulation of Premiums and Contributions 440
15.3.2 Risk Equalization 441
15.3.3 Risk Sharing 442
15.3.4 Implementation and Maintenance 444

15.4 Evaluation of the Payment System 444
15.4.1 Stability of Regional Weighted Capitation Rates 445
15.4.2 Subsidization of Insurers 445
15.4.3 The Role of Health Insurers in Purchasing Care 445

15.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms 446
15.5.1 Ongoing Problems in Mandatory Health Insurance Design 446
15.5.2 Developing Trends 447

Acknowledgment 450
Endnotes 450
References 450
Further Reading 451

16. Health Plan Payment in Switzerland 453
Christian P.R. Schmid, Konstantin Beck and Lukas Kauer

16.1 Introduction 453

16.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System 456
16.2.1 Health Plan Market Regulation 456
16.2.2 Health Plan Choice Options for Consumers 459
16.2.3 Instruments for Health Plans to Promote Efficiency 460

16.3 Health Plan Payment Design 464
16.3.1 Premium Regulation 467
16.3.2 Risk Equalization 468
16.3.3 Risk Sharing 471

16.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment 472
16.4.1 Incentives for Risk Selection 473
16.4.2 Risk Selection Actions 474
16.4.3 Evaluation of Managed Care and Demand-Side Controls 478

16.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms 481
16.5.1 Changes in the Risk Equalization Formula and Measuring Selection Incentives 482
16.5.2 Inconsistency of Risk Equalization and Premium Regulation 483
16.5.3 Cantonal Hospital Financing 485

16.6 Concluding Remarks 486
Acknowledgments 486
References 487
17. Health Plan Payment in US Marketplaces: Regulated Competition With a Weak Mandate

Timothy J. Layton, Ellen Montz and Mark Shepard

17.1 Introduction 491
17.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System 494
17.3 Health Plan Payment Design 495
   17.3.1 Premiums 497
   17.3.2 Subsidies 499
   17.3.3 Risk Adjustment 500
   17.3.4 Risk Sharing 505
17.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment 507
   17.4.1 Ex-ante Evaluations 508
   17.4.2 Ex-post Evaluations 510
17.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms 512
   17.5.1 High-Cost Cases 512
   17.5.2 Selection Against the Marketplaces Within the Individual Market 514
   17.5.3 Adverse Selection Into the Individual Market 515
   17.5.4 Transfer Formula 517
   17.5.5 Price-Linked Subsidies 518
Endnotes 519
References 520
Further Reading 521

18. Health Plan Payment in Medicaid Managed Care: A Hybrid Model of Regulated Competition

Timothy J. Layton, Alice Ndikumana and Mark Shepard

18.1 Introduction 523
18.2 Organization of the Health Insurance System 526
   18.2.1 Plan Design Regulations 526
   18.2.2 Procurement and Competition 533
   18.2.3 Plan Choice 537
18.3 Health Plan Payment Design 539
   18.3.1 Rate Development 539
   18.3.2 Risk Adjustment 543
   18.3.3 Risk Sharing 544
18.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment 546
   18.4.1 Statistical Performance of Common Risk Adjustment Models 546
   18.4.2 Indirect Consequences of Inadequate Risk Adjustment 548
18.5 Ongoing Issues and Reforms 549
   18.5.1 Enrollee Premiums 550
   18.5.2 Competitive Procurement 551
19. Medicare Advantage: Regulated Competition in the Shadow of a Public Option

Thomas G. McGuire and Joseph P. Newhouse

19.1 Introduction

19.1.1 Medicare Advantage (Medicare Part C)

19.1.2 In the Shadow of a Public Option

19.2 The Current Medicare Advantage System

19.2.1 Premiums, Coverage, and Benefits

19.2.2 Consumer Choices and Lock-In Provisions

19.2.3 Instruments Plans Can Use to Manage Cost and Affect Selection

19.3 Health Plan Payment

19.3.1 Defining Payments: Benchmarks and Bids

19.3.2 Risk Adjustment Model

19.3.3 Payment Flows

19.4 Evaluation of Health Plan Payment and Performance of the MA Market

19.4.1 RTI Evaluations of the Risk Adjustment Model

19.4.2 MedPAC Reports: Policy Analysis

19.4.3 Research Literature on MA and TM

19.5 Ongoing Issues and Directions for Reform

19.5.1 Choosing Data to Use for MA Risk Adjustment Modeling

19.5.2 Flat-of-the-Curve Research: More/Better Variables and the Risk Adjustment Formula

19.5.3 Setting the Level of the Subsidy to MA

19.5.4 Framing the Beneficiary Premium to Increase Demand Response and Competition

19.5.5 Competition in the MA Plan Market

19.5.6 Ongoing Changes in TM and Effects on MA

Acknowledgments

Endnotes

References

Index