The Community of Advantage

A Behavioural Economist’s Defence of the Market

Robert Sugden
Contents

List of Figures xix
Sources of Material xx

1. The Liberal Tradition and the Challenge from Behavioural Economics 1
   1.1 Mill and the Community of Advantage 1
   1.2 Neoclassical Welfare Economics 4
   1.3 The Challenge from Behavioural Economics 7
   1.4 Reconciling Normative and Behavioural Economics 13

2. The View from Nowhere 17
   2.1 The Impartial Spectator 17
   2.2 The Benevolent Autocrat 19
   2.3 Public Reasoning 24

3. The Contractarian Perspective 29
   3.1 Hobbes’s Contractarianism 30
   3.2 Hume’s Contractarianism 33
   3.3 The Contractarian Perspective 37
   3.4 Why a Contractarian Cannot be a Paternalist 42
   3.5 The Four Alls 50

4. The Inner Rational Agent 53
   4.1 Behavioural Welfare Economics: The New Consensus 53
   4.2 Autonomy and the Model of the Inner Rational Agent 63
   4.3 System 1 and System 2 67
   4.4 Does the Concept of Latent Preference Have Empirical Content? 68
   4.5 SuperReasoner in the Cafeteria 72
   4.6 Savage and Allais 75
   4.7 Purifying Allais Paradox Preferences 77
   4.8 Akrasia 79
   4.9 Summing up 82
## Contents

5. Opportunity  83
   5.1 The Individual Opportunity Criterion  83
   5.2 Preference-satisfaction  85
   5.3 'Mere' Preferences?  88
   5.4 Opportunity when Preferences are Liable to Change  96
   5.5 The Continuing Person  100
   5.6 Responsibility  106

6. The Invisible Hand  107
   6.1 The Basic Idea  110
   6.2 Exchange Economies  112
   6.3 The Interactive Opportunity Criterion  115
   6.4 The Strong Interactive Opportunity Criterion  117
   6.5 Competitive Equilibrium  119
   6.6 The Strong Market Opportunity Theorem  122
   6.7 Production  124
   6.8 Storage Economies  126
   6.9 The Wine Economy and the Responsible Agent  133
   6.10 How the Invisible Hand Works  137

7. Regulation  140
   7.1 Neoclassical Arguments for Regulation  141
   7.2 Choice Overload  143
   7.3 Self-constraint  148
   7.4 Obfuscation  156
   7.5 Fixed Costs and Price Discrimination  160
   7.6 Public Goods  164
   7.7 Otto per Mille  168

8. Psychological Stability  174
   8.1 Equality of Opportunity  175
   8.2 The Division of Knowledge  180
   8.3 The Other Invisible Hand  185
   8.4 Why Markets Cannot Be Fair  190
   8.5 Looking Forward  193
   8.6 Can Everyone Expect to Benefit from the Market?  197
   8.7 Underwriting Expectations of Mutual Benefit  201

9. Intrinsic Motivation, Kindness, and Reciprocity  205
   9.1 The Virtue-ethical Critique of the Market  208
   9.2 Intrinsic Motivation and Crowding-out  211
   9.3 Reciprocity: The Experimental Evidence  214
   9.4 Reciprocity and Social Preferences  220

xvi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Reciprocity and Social Norms</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6 Escaping from the Paradox of Trust</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Cooperative Intentions</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Team Reasoning</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Practices</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Voluntariness in a Simple Model</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 Voluntariness Generalized</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5 Intending Mutual Benefit</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6 Four Examples</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The Principle of Mutual Benefit</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1 Morality and Norms</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2 A Contractarian Perspective on Morality</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 The Principle of Mutual Benefit</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4 How the Principle of Mutual Benefit can be</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-sustaining</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5 A Question too Far</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6 Correspondence of Sentiments</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.7 The Community of Advantage</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Endnotes</strong></td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>References</strong></td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Index</strong></td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>