Economics, Game Theory and International Environmental Agreements
The Ca’ Foscari Lectures

Henry Tulkens
Center for Operations Research and Econometrics (CORE), Université catholique de Louvain, Belgium
Visiting Professor, Università Ca’ Foscari Venezia
Contents

Foreword v
Preface ix
About the Author xv

Lecture 1  Two Introductory Notions 1

The purpose and the message 2
1.1 The environment: An economic good? 3
Environment and social sciences 3
Environment and pollution 4
Environment and externalities 5
Externalities as two-dimensional commodities 6
Directional vs. diffuse externalities 7
Unilateral vs. reciprocal and multilateral externalities 8
Local, transboundary and global externalities 8
Externalities and time: Stock and intergenerational externalities 9
1.2 Ecological transfer functions 10
Transfer functions 10
Directional vs. diffuse externalities resulting from alternative
transfer functions 12
Flow vs. stock models 13
A directional flow pollutant model: RAINS 14
A diffuse stock pollutant model: The climate module
of the RICE model 16
1.3 Conclusion 20

Lecture 2  The Economic-Ecological Reference
Model 21

The purpose and the message 22
2.1 Components of the reference model (flow version) 23
Countries and commodities 23
Contents

Preferences .......................................................... 24
Production and emissions ........................................ 27
The externality and the transfer function ...................... 28

2.2 States of the system ............................................ 31
Feasible states ...................................................... 31
Institutions .......................................................... 32

2.3 A compact form of the reference model ..................... 33

2.4 Adaptation and protection ................................... 35

2.5 Two apologetic warnings ..................................... 39
On uncertainty ...................................................... 39
On ecological economics .......................................... 40

2.6 Conclusion ...................................................... 41

Lecture 3  Economic Theory Concepts .......................... 43

The purpose and the message .................................... 44

3.1 Equilibria ....................................................... 45
Alternative individual country behaviors ....................... 45
"Business as usual" (BAU) behavior .............................. 46
Individual environmentally nationalistic behavior .......... 47
Standard economic properties of an individual environmentally nationalistic equilibrium ...................... 48
Other general properties of an individual environmentally nationalistic equilibrium ......................... 50
International equilibria ........................................... 52
The "Business as usual" international equilibrium .......... 52
The international environmentally nationalistic equilibrium ......................................................... 53
Standard economic properties of an international environmentally nationalistic equilibrium .................. 53
Other general properties of an environmentally nationalistic international equilibrium ....................... 54
Equilibria and the right to pollute .............................. 56

3.2 Efficiency ....................................................... 57
International efficiency .......................................... 57
Economic properties of an efficient state ..................... 59
Other general properties of an efficient state ............... 61
Multiple efficient states .......................................... 63
Efficiency and the right to pollute ............................. 66
The issue of equity ................................................ 67

3.3 The rationale for cooperation ................................. 68
Inefficiency and environmental abuse of equilibria with externalities ........................................ 68
The ecological surplus to be shared ................................. 72

3.4 Modalities of cooperation ........................................ 77
Who owns the right to pollute internationally? ..................... 77
   The assignment of rights issue .................................. 77
Rights are wealth ..................................................... 81
Rights vs. responsibility ............................................ 82
Treaties as contracts .................................................. 84
The likely outcome .................................................... 84
The process ............................................................ 85

3.5 Obstacles to cooperation .......................................... 87
The informational problems .......................................... 87
   The value of “environmental” goods .............................. 87
   The extreme difficulty of measurement ......................... 88
Willingness to pay .................................................... 89
WTP for what? .......................................................... 91
   Informational free riding ......................................... 92
   Non-participatory free riding .................................... 94

3.6 Concluding summary and problems left open ................... 95
Annex: Analytical formulation of the one polluter (r)-one pollutee (e) reference model ............................................. 97

Lecture 4  Game Theory Concepts ........................................ 99
The purpose and the message ......................................... 100

4.1 Strategic games in general ......................................... 101

4.2 Equilibrium concepts in strategic games ......................... 105
Nash equilibrium ....................................................... 105
   Dominant strategy equilibrium .................................. 107
Coalitions and transferable utility .................................. 108
   Coalitions .......................................................... 108
   Transferable vs. non-transferable utility ....................... 110
Partially cooperative Nash equilibrium relative to a coalition . 111

4.3 Coalitional functions and the cooperative game form ........... 113
Coalitional functions in general ...................................... 113
The γ-coalitional function ........................................... 115

4.4 Cores and other solution concepts for cooperative games 115
with externalities ....................................................... 115
Imputations ............................................................ 116
The γ-core solution .................................................... 117
Alternative coalitional functions and cores .......................... 122
Alternative solution concepts .......................................... 124
Lecture 5  The Global Externality Game I: Its γ-core

The purpose and the message ............................. 130

5.1 Introducing the global externality game ................. 131
Associating games with economic models ................. 131
Formulation of the global externality game (GEG) ........ 132
Antecedents: Select literature on games with environmental
externalities prior to 2001 ............................. 135

5.2 Equilibrium concepts in the GEG ......................... 141
Non-cooperative Nash equilibrium (NCNE) ................. 141
Behavioral economic and environmental
characteristics ............................................. 142
Mathematical properties and their significance ........... 143
(a) Existence ............................................. 143
(b) Uniqueness .......................................... 144
Dominant strategy equilibrium .............................. 145
Coalitions and Utilities ................................... 145
Coalitions .................................................. 145
Transferable vs. non-transferable utility .................. 147
Partially cooperative Nash equilibria (PCNE) ............... 147
Mathematical properties ................................... 148
(a) Existence ............................................. 148
(b) Uniqueness .......................................... 149
Environmental properties: Characteristics of the emissions ... 149

5.3 The efficient outcomes of the GEG ......................... 153
The γ-coalitional function ................................ 153
The Pareto efficient outcome ............................... 154
The imputations set and alternative cooperative outcomes ... 154

5.4 The γ-core of the GEG: Definition and existence
in a qualitative sense ..................................... 155
Helm’s balancedness result ................................ 156
Non-uniqueness and extensions ............................. 164

Annexes to Lecture 5 ........................................ 166
Annex 1: The “lake game” of Shapley and Shubik as a
“global externality game” ................................ 166
Annex 2: The “prisoners’ dilemma” game and
international environmental externalities ................ 177
Annex 3: The $\gamma$-coalitional function of the GEG is not superadditive: An example .......... 181
Annex 4: A crucial step in Helm's balancedness proof . 183

Lecture 6  The Global Externality Game II:
Its CT Solution 187

The purpose and the message .................. 188

6.1 The CT solution: A computable strategy and imputation
  in the $\gamma$-core of the GEG .............. 189
  The linear case .................................. 189
  A nonlinear case .................................. 195
  Identical players .................................. 201

6.2 Environmental and general economic characteristics .. 203
  The $\gamma$-core and the optimal level of pollution .... 203
  The $\gamma$-core and economic theory ............ 204
  Externalities vs. public goods ................. 204
  Which optimum among the many? ............... 205
  An amendment to the Coase theorem in the case of international externalities .... 206

6.3 Specific properties of the CT solution ................ 208
  Exhibiting the transfers implicit in the solution .... 208
  The CT transfers formula ....................... 208
  The economic significance ..................... 209
  How is the ecological surplus being shared at the CT solution? ... 212
    The respective positions of polluters vs. pollutees
      at the CT solution: Graphical illustration .... 213
    The game with 1 polluter and 2 pollutees ......... 213
    The game with 2 polluters and 1 pollutee .......... 215
  Do polluters pay at the CT solution? ............ 215
  The CT solution and the benefit principle of public finance ... 217
  On free riding and $\gamma$-core stability .......... 218
    (a) Free riding vs. blocking .................. 218
    (b) The $\gamma$-assumption and coalition formation .. 219
    (c) Preference revelation free riding and the CT solution ... 220

6.4 Whither the $\gamma$-core solution for the GEG? .......... 221
  On the nature of the game: A negotiation on a diffuse externality . 221
  The $\gamma$-partition .............................. 222
    The $\gamma$-strategies of the non-members ......... 223
  The PCNE and the $\gamma$-coalitional function .......... 223
  The $\gamma$-core is self-enforcing .................. 224
Lecture 7  The Dynamic Global Externality Game  227

The purpose and the message ........................................... 228

7.1 The dynamic economic-ecological reference model  .......... 229

Components of the system ............................................. 229

Time and commodities ................................................ 229
Production ...................................................................... 230
Utilities and discounting ................................................. 230
Disutility of a stock or of a flow? ................................. 232
Feasible paths .............................................................. 232
Steady states ............................................................... 233

Intertemporal equilibria ............................................... 233
Individual behavior of a country over time ....................... 233
First-order conditions .................................................. 235

Standard economic properties of an individual

equilibrium over time ................................................... 236

Other general properties of an individual

equilibrium over time .................................................. 237

Time profile of the emissions along individual

equilibrium path ....................................................... 238

International equilibrium over time .............................. 239

Standard economic properties of the international equilibrium

over time ...................................................................... 239

Other general properties of the international equilibrium

over time ...................................................................... 240

Time profile of the stock along the international equilibrium

path ............................................................................. 240

Intertemporal international efficiency .............................. 241
First-order conditions .................................................... 243

Standard economic properties of an efficient path ............. 244

Other general properties of an efficient state .................... 246
Multiple efficient outcomes .......................................... 246

Time profiles of the emissions and the stock along the efficient

path ............................................................................. 248

The rationale for cooperation in the dynamic setting ........... 249

7.2 The associated dynamic global externality game .......... 251

Formulation of the dynamic global externality game (DGEG) . 251
Antecedents and alternative categories of dynamic games .... 252

7.3 Equilibrium concepts in the DGEG ......................... 254

Non-cooperative Nash equilibrium paths ....................... 254
Existence and uniqueness ............................................. 255
Other properties of the non-cooperative Nash equilibrium path . 257
Linear damage functions: Equilibrium in dominant strategies . 258
Coalitions and utilities .................................................. 259
Coalitions ................................................................. 259
Contents

Transferability of utilities .......................... 259
Paths of partially cooperative Nash equilibria .......... 259
Existence and uniqueness .................................. 260
Behavioral economic and environmental characteristics ... 261

7.4 Coalitional functions, efficient and alternative cooperative paths ................ 261
The $\gamma$-coalitional function, the efficient path, and the imputations set ........ 261
Alternative cooperative paths .......................... 263

7.5 The $\gamma$-core stable path of the DGEG: Optimal control formulation ........ 264
The optimal control approach ...................................... 264
Critical evaluation ........................................ 265
Economic considerations .................................. 265
Game theoretic considerations .................................. 266

7.6 The $\gamma$-core stable path as a sequence of negotiations: Dynamic programming formulation ...... 267
The GTTZ alternative approach .................................. 267
The issue of cooperation vs. non-cooperation in an intertemporal context ........ 267
State variables and value functions: dynamic programming in lieu of optimal control .................................. 268
The fallback position and the the Houba-de Zeeuw assumption on expectations .................................. 271
Rational expectations games: introducing the concept .................................. 272
The argument in general terms and existence ..... 274
The cooperative solution of the dynamic global environmental game 275
Definition and existence .................................. 275
Computing the solution by backward induction — Linear damage functions .................................. 276
The infinite horizon case .................................. 280

7.7 Concluding considerations .................................. 285

Lecture 8 The Dynamic Global Externality Game in Numbers: The CWS Model 289

The purpose and the message .................................. 290

8.1 The ClimNeg World Simulation (CWS) model .................................. 291
Informal description of purpose, vocabulary and origin .................................. 291
Components of the model .................................. 293
The CWS game .................................. 297
Reducing the economic-ecological model to its decision
variables .............................................. 298
Specifying the dynamic game .............................................. 299
The “scenarios” .............................................. 301
Description of the BAUE, NCNE, PCNE’s, PESP and
CS scenarios .............................................. 302
The optimization problems and their solutions .............................................. 304

8.2 Key numerical results .............................................. 306
8.3 Cooperation beyond efficiency in the CWS model .............................................. 309
Efficient utility levels at the time horizon and the ecological
surplus .............................................. 309
Individual and coalitional blockings of the Pareto efficient
scenario .............................................. 310
Transfers inducing cooperation .............................................. 311
Individual rationality .............................................. 314
Coalitional rationality .............................................. 315
Transfers in the CWS game vs. in the DNEG .............................................. 316
A provisional stocktake .............................................. 319
On the ecological surplus .............................................. 319
The overall picture .............................................. 319
Pre-transfer surplus sharing .............................................. 320
Cooperation-enhancing surplus sharing .............................................. 321
CT transfers in CWS and time: The feasibility issue .............................................. 321
On distributional equity and responsibility in the CT solution .............................................. 323
The CT solution and the ability to pay principle
of public finance .............................................. 324
The computational nature of the CT solution .............................................. 324

8.4 An example of policy use of CWS and its
associated game .............................................. 325
8.5 Concluding consideration .............................................. 327

Lecture 9 Internal Coalitional Stability
and the Global Externality Game .............................................. 329
The purpose and the message .............................................. 330
9.1 An alternative theory of coalitional stability .............................................. 331
9.2 The “internal and external” stability concepts: An
informal presentation .............................................. 332
9.3 Internal coalitional stability in the GEG .............................................. 333
Coalitional externality and coalitional free riding .............................................. 333
The equilibrium size of the coalitional externality .............................................. 335
"Outside option payoff" and possible outcomes
of negotiations ........................................... 339
Properties of an equilibrium with one free riding player .... 340
Equilibria with multiple free riding players: Problems ...... 342
An existence issue ........................................ 342
A chain of contradictory expectations ........................ 345
Analytical exploration of more general cases ............... 346
Numerical experiments with CWS .......................... 351

9.4 Concluding considerations .............................. 352
On the scope of the internal coalitional stability concept .... 352
On achieving cooperation: By surplus grabbing
vs. surplus sharing? ........................................ 353
On internal vs. γ-core stability and efficiency ............... 353

Lecture 10  The UNFCCC Process: An Economic
and Game Theoretic Interpretation  355

The purpose and the message ................................ 356
Introduction .................................................. 357
From science to policy and diplomacy ........................ 357

10.1 The United Nations framework convention on climate
change, Rio 1992 ............................................ 358

10.2 The Kyoto Protocol, 1997 .............................. 360
Main features of the Protocol ................................ 361
Economic and game theoretic ideas supporting the Protocol .. 362
The cap and trade scheme in the reference model .......... 362
Efficiency and coalitional stability: A reminder on the role
of transfers .................................................. 363
Competitive emissions trading in lieu of transfers .......... 365
Agreeing on reference emissions ................................ 369
Showing the efficiency and coalitional stability
of the trading equilibrium .................................... 370
Desirability of free trade in emissions ....................... 372
JI and CDM as alternative forms of emissions trading .... 374

10.3 Appraising the first commitment period: 2005–2012 .... 375
Game theoretic interpretation of the post-ratification situation .. 375
The appropriate solution concept ........................... 376
On efficiency and coalitional stability of the prevailing situation . 377
On caps and trades .......................................... 379
Reflections in the wake of Kyoto, as of 2012 .............. 379
The sequence of time intervals ................................ 380
The players .................................................... 380
The nature of strategies ...................................... 381
Contents

Emissions abatement vs. temperature change .......................... 382
A fragmented vs. global world climate regime? ..................... 383
The participation of developing countries ............................. 384
Concluding consideration on the Kyoto Protocol .................... 387

10.4 The Durban ADP, the Doha amendment and the second
     commitment period: 2013–2020 ..................................... 388

10.5 The Paris agreement of December 2015 (COP 21) .............. 389
     The grand coalition in sight? ..................................... 390
     On strategies ......................................................... 391
     Stretching the nature of strategies? ............................ 391
     Changing the source of strategies .............................. 393
     Implementing strategies: Stocktake, naming and shaming .... 394
     On outcomes ......................................................... 395
     Equilibrium with subscription .................................... 395
     PCNEs, climate clubs and little creeks ......................... 397
     On dynamics ......................................................... 399
     On mitigation, adaptation, loss and damage, and transfers . 401
     On carbon pricing as an instrument relegated to “voluntary
     cooperation” ......................................................... 402
     Concluding consideration on the Paris Agreement .............. 404

A conclusion for the course .............................................. 404

References ........................................................................ 407

Author Index ........................................................................ 421

Subject Index ....................................................................... 425