

Mohamed ElFar

**Assessing the Enforcement of the
Egyptian Competition Regime**

LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
TABLE OF LEGISLATION	ix
TABLE OF CASES	xv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xviii
CHAPTER 1	1
INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 General	1
1.2 The Significance and Contribution of the Thesis	3
1.3 Methodology	5
1.4 Structure of the Thesis	6
CHAPTER 2	9
A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE	9
2.1 Introduction	9
2.2 Competition under a <i>Laissez-Faire</i> Approach	10
2.2.1 Factors Affecting Competition Policy	10
I. The Influence of the State on Competition	10
II. The Influence of the Industrial Structure	11
2.2.2 Competition Regulations	14
2.3 Competition under Socialism	14
2.3.1 Factors Affecting the Competition Policy	15
2.3.2 Competition Regulations under Socialism	17
2.4 Competition within an Open Door Policy (<i>Infitah</i>)	18
2.4.1 Competition in a Changing Economic Approach	18
2.4.2 Infitah and Competition Regulations	21
2.5 Economic Reform and Competition	22
2.5.1 Liberalising the Economy	22
2.5.2 The Competitiveness of the Private Sector	24
2.5.3 Informal Economy	26
2.6 Competition Advocacy	26
2.7 Reflections	29
CHAPTER 3	32
THE CURRENT ENFORCEMENT MECHANISMS: DEVELOPMENTS AND TRENDS	32
3.1 Introduction	32
3.2 Background	32
3.2.1 The Modernisation of the Economy	32
I. Economic Reform	33
II. Legal Reform	34
3.2.2 Competing Factors behind the Adoption of the ECL	35
3.3 Features of the Regime	37
3.3.1 Public Enforcement	37
I. Institutional Structure: An Overview	37
A. The Competition Authority	38
1. Powers of Inspection	38
2. Safeguards of Independence	39

3. Decisions of the ECA	41
B. Competent Minister	44
C. The Office of the Public Prosecutor	47
D. The Economic Court	49
E. Reflections	50
II. Enforcement	51
A. The Prohibitions	51
B. Exclusions and Exemptions	54
1. De jure Exclusions and Exemptions	54
2. De facto Exclusions and Exemptions	55
C. Mergers and Acquisitions	58
3.3.2 Private Enforcement	60
3.3.3 Advocacy	61
3.4 Conclusion	63
 CHAPTER 4	 64
PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT	64
 4.1 Introduction	 64
4.1.1 Reasons for Establishing an "Independent" ECA	66
4.1.2 Scope of Achieving an Optimal Structure	69
4.1.3 The Background of the Institutional Structure	72
4.2 Assessing the ECA's Independence	75
4.2.1 Structural Independence of the ECA	75
I. The Controversial Role of the Competent Minister	76
A. Lack of Legal Boundaries for the Powers	76
B. The Effect on ECA's Priorities	80
II. Problematic Role of the Prosecutor's Office	81
4.2.2 Lack of Operational Independence of the ECA	83
I. Limited Powers of the ECA	83
II. Challenges in Decision Making	84
A. Governmental Dominance	84
B. The Effect of the Wide Representation	87
III. Lack of Budgetary Independence	88
4.2.3 The Overall Lack of ECA Independence	89
4.3 The Legal Nature of the ECL's Enforcement Mechanism	91
4.3.1 Maintain the Criminal Nature of the ECL	92
I. Constitutional Inability to Sanction Companies	92
II. Structural Independence of the ECA	93
A. Limiting the Role of the Competent Minister	94
B. Likelihood of Granting the Right to Prosecute to the ECA	95
C. Can the ECA Impose Fines?	99
III. A Restrained Operational Independence	100
A. A Strengthened Role of the Board	101
B. Granting the ECA the Power to Investigate	101
4.3.2 Moving Towards a Purely Administrative Regime	105
I. Constitutionality of Administrative Fines	105
A. Current Constitutional Status Quo	106
B. An International Dimension	106
1. The Irish Constitutional Experience	107
2. The French Resolution to the Challenge	108
C. Revisiting the Egyptian Constitutional Discourse	109
II. Structural Independence of the ECA	111
III. Enhanced Operational Independence	112

A. The Decisive Role of the Board	112
1. Composition	113
2. Conflict of Interests	115
3. Likelihood of Board Members' Removal	116
B. Granting the ECA the Power to Investigate and Impose Fines	117
4.3.3 Favouring a Purely Administrative Regime	118
4.4 Recommendations to Ensure Independence	121
 CHAPTER 5	 125
PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT	125
 5.1 Introduction	 125
5.2 Potential Benefits Arising from Private Enforcement	126
5.2.1 General Benefits	126
5.2.2 Potential Benefits for Egypt	129
I. Overcoming Shortages and Budgetary Limitations	130
II. Facing the Lack of Information and Informal Market Hurdles	132
A. The Importance of Addressing the Challenge	132
B. Significance/Size	133
C. Implications of the Informal Sector	134
III. Enhancing Advocacy and Cultural Awareness	135
IV. Limiting Political Interference	136
V. Interim Measures	137
VI. Achieving other Social Benefits	138
VII. Importance of Private Enforcement in Egypt	139
5.3 Methods of Private Enforcement	140
5.3.1 Private Enforcement via the Civil Courts	141
I. Building a Damages Claim	142
A. Fault	142
B. Harm/Damage	145
C. Causal link	148
II. Procedural Aspects	150
A. Costs	150
B. The Binding Nature of ECA Decisions	152
5.3.2 Private Enforcement via Criminal Courts (Direct Actions)	154
I. Process and Regulations	154
II. Article 345 and the Criminal Infringements under the ECL	157
III. Article 345 and Article 717-2 of the French Penal Code	163
5.3.3 Civil Actions versus Direct Actions	164
5.4 Forms of Representation in Damages Actions	166
5.4.1 Opt-in Actions	168
5.4.2 Representative Actions	170
5.4.3 Opt-out Class Actions	175
I. The US Experience	176
II. Opt-Out Actions in an EU Context	180
5.4.4 Other Methods of Representation	183
5.5 Reasons for Private Enforcement's Underdevelopment	184
5.5.1 General Reasons	184
5.5.2 Egypt's Specific Reasons	187
5.5.3 Disciplinary Retaliations	191
5.6 Aspired Reforms	192
 CHAPTER 6	 197

THE WAY FORWARD	197
6.1 Introduction	197
6.1.1 The 2011 Revolution is Changing Realities	198
6.1.2 The Persistence of Competition Challenges	199
6.1.3 Competition in the Newly Aspired Constitution	200
I. The Anticipated Nature of the Economy	201
II. The Importance of Constitutionalising Competition	203
III. The Power to Impose Fines	207
6.2 Competition Advocacy	208
6.2.1 Competition Advocacy in Egypt	209
I. The ECA's Efforts in Government Advocacy	209
II. ECA's Public Advocacy	211
III. Challenges Facing ECA's Advocacy	212
6.2.2 Distinctive Advocacy Potentials	214
I. Morality in the Egyptian Culture	214
II. Islamic Principles of Competition	217
III. Benefits of Advocating Competition using Morality	218
A. Efficient Dissemination of the Knowledge	218
B. Deterrent Effect	219
C. Shaming	220
IV. The Complementary Nature of Morality	222
6.3 Concluding Remarks and Recommendations	223
6.3.1 Recommendations	225
6.3.2 Importance of the Conclusions	228
6.3.3 Further Research	229
ANNEX 1	230
ANNEX 2	231
ANNEX 3	232
BIBLIOGRAPHY	233