Brine Migration from a Flooded Salt Mine in the Genesee Valley, Livingston County, New York: Geochemical Modeling and Simulation of Variable-Density Flow

By Richard M. Yager, Paul E. Misut, Christian D. Langevin, and David L. Parkhurst

Prepared in cooperation with the
Office of the New York State Attorney General

Professional Paper 1767

U.S. Department of the Interior
U.S. Geological Survey

Contents

Abstract 1
Introduction 2
Hydrogeologic Setting 6
Mine Flooding and Aftermath 7
Flooding and Formation of Rubble Chimneys 7
Water-Level Recovery and Migration of Brine 10
Interception of Brine and Saline Water 10
Geochemical Modeling 13
Inverse Models 15
Forward Models 19
Discussion of Results from Geochemical Modeling 21
Simulated Migration of Brine and Saline Water During Water-Level Recovery 23
One-Dimensional Flow 24
Three-Dimensional Flow 24
Model Design 26
Model Calibration 29
Model Results 30
Discussion of Results 37
Simulated Pumping of Brine and Saline Water 37
Model Design 37
Model Results 38
Model Sensitivity 42
Discussion of Results 42
Implications for Future Mitigation Efforts 44
Current Conditions in the Collapse Area 44
Considerations for Future Mitigation 46
Summary 46
References Cited 49
Appendix. Wells and Boreholes in and near the Collapse Area above the Flooded Retsof Salt Mine 51

Figures

1. Map showing location of aquifer system and Retsof salt mine in Livingston County, N.Y. 3
2. Stratigraphic section A-A' depicting rubble chimney above collapsed room in salt mine, Livingston County, N.Y. 5
3. Graph showing solubility of anhydrite ($CaSO_4$) at 10°C as a function of halite content (NaCl) in solution 6
4. Topographic map showing location of sinkholes, and pumped and monitoring wells in the collapse area above the flooded salt mine, Livingston County, N.Y. 8
5. Geophysical logs conducted in well Lv309 in April 1994 and March 2004 9

6. Graphs showing drawdown and recovery of *(A)* water level in well Lv368 (lower confined aquifer) near the collapse area, and *(B)* brine level in wells Lv301 and Lv396 (flooded salt mine) 11
7. Stratigraphic section B-B′ showing rubble chimneys and deformation zone in the collapse area above the flooded salt mine and direction of flow during water-level recovery, January 1996 through August 2006 12
8. Graph showing chloride concentrations observed within the collapse area in well Lv309 (elevation 0 m) and well Lv322 (lower confined aquifer) after inundation of the salt mine, January 1996 through August 2006 13
9. Vertical profile of halite saturation with depth measured in wells Lv309 and Lv322 in September 2006, showing stratigraphy and sample depths of final waters used in inverse geochemical models 14
10. Vertical profiles of halite saturation with depth in well Lv309 measured in August 2004 and September, 2006, showing transition zone between brine and saline water in the Bertie Limestone 15
11. Stratigraphic section B-B′ depicting screened intervals of pumped and monitoring wells, and the distribution of halite saturation within the rubble chimneys and deformation zone in September 2006 16
12. Graphs showing relation between halite saturation and *(A)* chloride concentration in samples of saline water and brine near the collapse area above the flooded salt mine, and *(B)* specific gravity of halite brine 20
13. Ternary diagrams showing water-rock reactions for different mixtures of waters in the collapse area without and with ion exchange 22
14. Ternary diagrams showing subsidence rates resulting from water-rock reactions for different mixtures of waters in the collapse area: *(A)* without ion exchange, *(B)* with ion exchange 23
15. Graph showing comparison of vertical profiles of halite saturations observed in wells Lv309 and Lv322 with those simulated in one-dimensional simulations with different layer spacings 25
16. Diagram showing boundaries of three-dimensional model showing extent of flooded salt mine, and locations of rubble chimneys, deformation zone, and wells 27
17. Section C-C′ showing boundary conditions specified in three-dimensional model, and depths and extents of fracture zones 28
18. Graph showing comparison of vertical profiles of halite saturations observed in wells Lv309 and Lv322 with those simulated by one-dimensional simulation and by three-dimensional simulations with models A and B 30
19. Graphs showing changes in water compositions in wells Lv309 (elevation -23 m) and Lv322 from January 1996 through August 2006 in four-solute simulations with: *(A)* model A and *(B)* model B 32
20. Block diagrams along section C-C′ in the collapse area showing simulation results from January 1998 through September 2006 with model A and model B: *(A)* changes in spatial distribution of halite saturation, and *(B)* changing directions of groundwater flow 33
21. Block diagrams along section C-C′ showing changes in the composition of water in the collapse area from January 1996 through September 2006 in simulations with model A 35
22. Block diagrams along section C-C′ showing changes in the composition of water in the collapse area from January 1996 through August 2006 in simulations with model B 36

23. Section D-D' showing changes in halite saturations simulated by models A and B in response to pumping from the collapse area: *(A)* initial conditions, September 2006; *(B)* February 2008; and *(C)* September 2011 39
24. Graphs showing changes in halite saturation in the collapse area during pumping from September 2006 through February 2008, and those simulated by models A and B from September 2006 through September 2011: *(A)* well Lv526, *(B)* well Lv529, *(C)* well Lv527, *(D)* well 530, *(E)* well Lv309, and *(F)* well Lv322 40
25. Graphs showing changes in water levels in the collapse area during pumping from September 2006 through February 2008, and those simulated by models A and B from September 2006 through September 2011: (A) well Lv526, (B) well Lv529, (C) well Lv527, (D) well 530, (E) well Lv309, and (F) well Lv322 41
26. Graphs showing halite saturations simulated by model B at well Lv530 from September 2006 through September 2011 with different values of *(A)* hydraulic conductivity, *(B)* porosity, *(C)* brine-displacement rates, and *(D)* pumping rates 43
27. Diagrams showing simulated halite saturations in 2011 and 2016 following shutdown of brine-mitigation project after 2 years of pumping from September 2006 through August 2008: *(A)* along section C-C' through the collapse area, *(B)* in plan view of fracture zone at Onondaga/Bertie contact (O/B-FZ), and *(C)* in plan view of lower confined aquifer (LCA) 45

Tables

1. Chemical composition of brine and groundwater in November 2005 near collapse area above flooded Retsof mine, Livingston County, N.Y. 17
2. Inverse models of waters in the collapse area showing calculated percentages of initial waters and mole transfers for water-rock reactions 18
3. Saturation indices calculated with the Pitzer aqueous model for sampled waters in the collapse area 21
4. Values of hydraulic and transport properties used in one-dimensional simulations 25
5. Values of hydraulic and transport properties used in three-dimensional simulations of saline water and brine migration during recovery of aquifer system 29
6. Average halite saturation in water pumped by brine-mitigation project in February 2008, and simulated saturation and composition of pumped water with models A and B 38
7. Sensitivity of simulated concentrations in February 2008 and mass of halite produced from September 2006 through February 2008 in models A and B to changes in rates of brine displacement (Q_{brine}) and pumping ($Q_{pumping}$) 44