

# **Resource Efficient Product Provision - Closing the resources loop for waste mobile phones and smartphones**

To the Faculty of Business Administration and the International Resource Industry of the  
Technische Universität Bergakademie Freiberg

approved

**THESIS**

to attain the academic degree of

Doctor rerum politicarum

Dr. rer. pol.

submitted

By MBA, Reinhardt (born Gurita), Nicoleta

born on the 19 February 1986 in Medgidia, Romania

Reviewers: Prof. Dr. Bongaerts, Jan C, Freiberg

Prof. Dr. Fröhling, Magnus, München (Straubing)

Freiberg, 07 February 2020

# Contents

Abstract .....	I
Contents.....	III
List of Figures .....	VIII
List of Tables.....	XI
Abbreviations.....	XV
Symbols .....	XIX
<b>1 Introduction .....</b>	<b>I</b>
1.1 Statement of Problem .....	3
1.2 Research Aim and Objectives .....	6
1.3 Structure of the Dissertation.....	7
<b>2 Basics on Raw Material Criticality and WEEE Management in Europe and Germany .....</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1 Defining Criticality.....	9
2.1.1 Critical versus Strategic .....	11
2.1.2 Methodologies to Define the Critical Metals.....	11
2.2 Criticality for Europe.....	16
2.3 Criticality for Germany .....	18
2.4 The European WEEE Management System.....	22
2.5 The German WEEE Management System .....	27
2.5.1 Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR).....	29
2.5.2 Identifying Current Inefficiencies of the German WEEE Management System .....	30
2.5.2.1 Disincentives for Individual Producer Responsibility (IPR) .....	30
2.5.2.2 Lack of Incentives for Ecodesign.....	32
2.5.2.3 Recycling Step-backs.....	33
2.5.2.4 Inefficiencies of Extended Producer Responsibility with Regard to Circular Economy	36
<b>3 Determining Potentials for Small WEEE End-of-Life Management in Germany .....</b>	<b>38</b>
3.1 Methodology .....	38
3.1.1 Model to Estimate the Potential Contribution of Mobile and Smartphones to a Secondary Supply of Critical and Precious Metals .....	39
3.1.2 Data Collection and Calculation.....	41

3.1.3	Scenario Analysis .....	51
3.1.3.1	Base Scenario.....	51
3.1.3.2	Scenario I .....	54
3.1.3.3	Scenario II.....	54
3.1.3.4	Scenario III.....	55
3.1.4	Results .....	55
3.2	Cost-benefit Analysis of the German WEEE Management .....	57
3.3	Discussion and Conclusion .....	60
<b>4</b>	<b>A Holistic Investigation of Circular Economy Implementation Challenges and Opportunities for Critical Metals.....</b>	<b>61</b>
4.1	Circular Economy and its Implementation in Electrical and Electronic Equipment.....	62
4.2	Approach to Determine Promising Strategies that can Facilitate the Implementation of Circular Economy in Small Electronics .....	64
4.3	Overview of Constrictments of Circular Economy Implementation in Small Electronics .....	70
4.3.1	Economic Barriers .....	73
4.3.2	Political/Legislative/Policy barriers.....	74
4.3.3	Cultural .....	75
4.3.4	Technological .....	76
4.3.5	Stakeholders Involvement / Management Related Barriers .....	77
4.4	Value Creation Strategies for Circular Economy Business Models.....	78
4.4.1	Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR).....	78
4.4.1.1	Challenges of Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) .....	78
4.4.1.2	Opportunities Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) .....	80
4.4.2	Product Life Extension (PLE) .....	81
4.4.2.1	Challenges of Product Life Extension (PLE).....	81
4.4.2.2	Opportunities for Product Life Extension (PLE) .....	82
4.4.3	Product Service System (PSS).....	82
4.4.3.1	Challenges of Product Service Systems (PSS) .....	83
4.4.3.2	Opportunities for Product Service Systems (PSS).....	84
4.5	Analytical Hierarchy Process Method to Prioritize Barriers and Strategies for Circular Economy Implementation .....	86
4.6	Technique for Order of Preference by Similarity to Ideal Solution (TOPSIS) Method to Prioritize the Strategies for Circular Economy Implementation .....	95

4.7	Conclusion.....	97
<b>5</b>	<b>Analysis of the Mobile and Smartphone Value Chain .....</b>	<b>100</b>
5.1	Defining Value Chain.....	100
5.2	Methodology for Mobile and Smartphones Value Chain Analysis.....	103
5.3	Mobile and Smartphone Value Chain Actors and their Lifecycle Impacts.....	104
5.4	Mobile and Smartphone Value Chain Structure.....	113
5.4.1	The Value Chain of Mobile and Smartphone Components .....	116
5.4.2	Analysis of the Value Chain Activities Along the Supply Chain of Mobile and Smartphone.....	117
5.4.2.1	Manufacturing.....	117
5.4.2.2	Servicing.....	119
5.4.3	Value Chain Geography .....	121
5.4.4	Summarizing Value Adding Activities and Actors Along the Supply Chain of Mobile and Smartphone.....	122
5.5	Supply and Demand Patterns for Mobile and Smartphones.....	124
5.5.1	Telecom Actors at Global Level.....	124
5.5.2	Telecom Actors in Germany.....	128
5.6	Determining the Economic Value Chain Impacts of the Mobile and Smartphone .....	131
5.6.1	Economic Impacts from Mining.....	131
5.6.2	Impact of Telecommunications on Economic Development.....	132
5.6.3	Economic Impacts from End-of-life Management .....	135
5.7	Determining the Social Value Chain Impacts of the Mobile and Smartphone .....	135
5.7.1	Social Impacts from Mining.....	135
5.7.2	Social Impacts from Production .....	136
5.7.3	Social Impacts from the Use Time .....	138
5.7.4	Social Impacts from End-of-life Management .....	138
5.7.5	Social Benefits.....	139
5.8	Determining the Environmental Value Chain Impacts of the Mobile and Smartphone.....	140
5.8.1	Environmental Impacts from Mining .....	141
5.8.2	Environmental Impacts from Production.....	143
5.8.3	Environmental Impacts from the Use Phase.....	144
5.8.4	Environmental Impacts from Recycling.....	144

5.8.5	Development of Environmental Value Propositions for the Value Chain of Mobile and Smartphones .....	147
5.8.6	Overview of the Policy Framework along the Value Chain .....	149
5.9	Discussion & Conclusion .....	150
<b>6</b>	<b>Developing a Product Service System Model for Mobile and Smartphones .....</b>	<b>152</b>
6.1	Defining Services and Product Service Systems .....	153
6.2	Product Service System Business Model .....	155
6.2.1	Economic Value .....	160
6.2.2	Functional Value.....	161
6.2.3	Emotional Value .....	162
6.2.4	Complexity and Challenges of PSS Implementation as a Contribution to Circular Economy.....	164
6.2.5	Benefits of PSS Implementation.....	167
6.3	Value Creation through PSS.....	168
6.3.1	Consumer Value .....	168
6.3.2	Provider Value.....	170
6.4	General Approach for Product Service System Development .....	177
6.4.1	Product Service System in the Telecommunication Industry .....	178
6.4.2	Upgradability as a Strategy for PSS .....	186
6.4.3	Strategies for Product Life Extension.....	192
6.5	Development of a Product Service System Concept for Mobile and Smartphones .....	193
6.5.1	PSS Prototype Concept for Smartphones .....	197
6.5.2	Rebound Effects .....	202
6.6	Product Service System Concept Assessment.....	203
6.6.1	Methodology for Assessment .....	203
6.6.1.1	Mathematical Model Development for the Product Service System .....	207
6.6.1.2	Product Service System Assessment.....	211
6.6.1.3	Results.....	212
6.6.1.4	Sensitivity Analysis .....	222
6.6.2	Discussion.....	223
6.7	Limitations of the Current Research .....	225
6.8	Conclusion.....	226
<b>7</b>	<b>Summary and Conclusion.....</b>	<b>228</b>

7.1 Applied Methods and Summary of Main Findings .....	229
7.2 Major Achievements and Conclusion .....	234
7.3 Future research opportunities .....	236
<b>References .....</b>	<b>238</b>
<b>Appendix .....</b>	<b>278</b>
<b>Appendix I: UNEP recycling Rates.....</b>	<b>278</b>
<b>Appendix II: AHP deriving the relative priorities of the alternatives with respect to each comparison criteria.....</b>	<b>278</b>
<b>Appendix III: Global Warming Potential (GWP) 100 years .....</b>	<b>282</b>
<b>Appendix IV: Eco-Costs .....</b>	<b>282</b>
<b>Appendix V: Results of the Sensitivity Analysis of the PSS Assessment .....</b>	<b>284</b>
<b>Table Appendix. 2: Results of the Sensitivity Analysis of the PSS Assessment .....</b>	<b>284</b>
<b>Appendix VI: Publications .....</b>	<b>285</b>