Spatial justice and land tenure security. Insights from urban re-development in Kigali, Rwanda

Ernest Uwayezu

Vollständiger Abdruck der von der Ingenieurfakultät Bau Geo Umwelt der Technischen Universität München zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades eines Doktor-Ingenieurs genehmigten Dissertation.

Vorsitzender: Prof. Dr.-Ing. habil. Thomas Wunderlich,

Prüfer der Dissertation:

1. Gutachter: Prof. Dr. ir. Walter Timo de Vries
2. Gutachter: Prof. Dr.-Ing. Winrich Voß
3. Gutachter: Prof. Dr. Jaap Zevenbergen

Table of contents

Table of contents .................................................................i

List of figures ......................................................................vi

List of tables .......................................................................viii

List of appendices ..............................................................ix

List of abbreviations ..........................................................x

Abstract ................................................................................xii

Zusammenfassung ...............................................................xiii

Acknowledgements .............................................................xiv

Chapter 1. General introduction ........................................... 1

1.1. Introduction ................................................................... 1

1.2. Research background: grasping trends of land tenure insecurity within urban (re)development processes ........................................ 2

1.3. Problem statement: trends of spatial injustices and land tenure insecurity amidst the legal formalisation of land rights in Kigali City ...................................................... 3

1.4. Grasping spatial justice claim within the urban (re)development settings 6

1.5. Theoretical and evaluative framework ................................ 7

1.5.1. Research objectives and questions ................................. 10

1.6. Relevance of the study ................................................... 12

1.6.1. Contribution to sustainable urban (re)development ........ 12

1.6.2. Contribution to urban land governance ....................... 13

1.7. Research methodology .................................................. 15

1.8. Research framework ...................................................... 16

Chapter 2: Scoping land tenure security for the poor and low-income dwellers from a spatial justice lens .................................................. 20

Abstract .............................................................................. 20

2.1. Introduction ................................................................... 20

2.2. Methodology ................................................................... 22

2.3. Results and discussion .................................................. 24

2.3.1. The main claim and conceptualisation of spatial justice 24

2.3.2. Main forms of spatial justice ...................................... 25

2.3.3. Defining land tenure security ..................................... 26

2.3.4. The passage of City Statute and the emergence of spatial justice in the city of Recife 27
Chapter 3: Exploring the connection between spatial justice and land tenure security: insights from inclusive urban (re)development schemes in Recife, Brazil

Chapter 4: Indicators for measuring spatial justice and land tenure security for poor and low-income urban dwellers

Chapter 5: Expropriation of real property in Kigali City: scoping the patterns of spatial justice
5.3.1. Study areas and sampling ................................................................. 92
5.3.2. Data collection .............................................................................. 94
  5.3.2.1. Primary data ............................................................................. 94
  5.3.2.2. Secondary data ......................................................................... 94
5.3.3. Data analysis .................................................................................. 95
5.4. Results and discussion ..................................................................... 95
  5.4.1. Patterns of spatial justice in the law and processes of expropriation and compensation ................................................................. 95
    5.4.1.1. Procedural justice and compliance dilemma ...................... 97
    5.4.1.2. Trends of procedural, recognitional and redistributive justice ... 99
  5.4.2. Paucity of redistributive justice ................................................. 107
    5.4.2.1. Access to new properties in the close vicinity ................. 107
    5.4.2.2. Decreased access to basic infrastructure and services .......... 109
5.5. Conclusion and recommendations .................................................. 112

Chapter 6: Can in-kind compensation for expropriated real property promote spatial justice? An analysis of experiments in Kigali City, Rwanda ........................................ 114

Abstract ................................................................................................. 114

6.1. Introduction ...................................................................................... 114

6.2. Referents of spatial justice from the in-kind compensation through the resettlement process ................................................................. 117

6.3. Evaluative framework ....................................................................... 118

6.4. Data sources and methods .................................................................. 123
  6.4.1. Study site .................................................................................... 123
  6.4.2. Sampling .................................................................................... 124
  6.4.3. Data collection method .............................................................. 125
    6.4.3.1. Primary data .......................................................................... 125
    6.4.3.2. Secondary data ....................................................................... 125
  6.4.4. Data analysis and presentation of results ................................. 126

6.5. Results and discussion ..................................................................... 126
  6.5.1. Patterns of spatial justice emerging from the in-kind compensation in Kigali City ................................................................. 126
    6.5.1.1. Trends of spatial justice in the in-kind compensation for the expropriated real property owners in Kangondo and Kibiraro .......... 130
    6.5.1.2. Scanty trends of spatial justice in the implementation processes and outcomes of the in-kind compensation ...................................................... 134
  6.5.2. Options for promoting spatial justice in the implementation of the in-kind compensation in Kigali City ...................................................... 140
    6.5.2.1. The in-cash compensation and self-help incremental housing development: procedural, recognition, and redistributive justice ...... 140
    6.5.2.2. Promotion of the social mix through the in-situ relocation ........ 141
    6.5.2.3. Urban village and diversified dwelling units: reframing recognitional, redistributive and intra-generational justice ......................... 142
    6.5.2.4. Increasing housing size and progressive ownership approach through recognitional and redistributive justice ................................... 143
Chapter 7: Stakes of spatial justice and land tenure security from the resettlement of informal settlements dwellers in Kigali City, Rwanda

Abstract

7.1. Introduction

7.2. Spatial justice claim as a catalyst for changes in Kigali City (re)development processes

7.3. Theoretical foundations of spatial justice and evaluative framework

7.4. Data sources and methods

7.5. Results and discussion

7.5.1. Trends of spatial justice emerging from the resettlement of informal dwellers in Kigali City

7.5.1.1. Limited patterns of procedural justice

7.5.1.2. High trends of recognition and redistributive justice: access to quality housing

7.5.1.3. Protection of informal dwellers' lives through intra- and inter-generational justice

7.5.2. Re-established land tenure security

7.5.3. Alternative approaches for informal settlements management in Kigali City

7.5.3.1. Informal settlement upgrading

7.5.3.2. Development of shared residential apartments

7.6. Conclusion

Chapter 8: Are the so-called affordable houses under-development in Kigali City really affordable?

Abstract

8.1. Introduction

8.2. Access to affordable house as a spatial justice metric

8.3. Evaluative approach for the housing affordability

8.4. Data sources

8.5. Results presentation and discussion

8.5.1. Trends in housing affordability based on households' incomes

8.5.2. Strategies to promote housing affordability in Kigali City

8.5.2.1. Access through private low-cost rental housing

8.5.2.2. Progressive housing ownership through rent-to-own

8.5.2.3. Decreasing housing costs and change in investment strategies

8.5.2.5. Improving the existing houses through informal settlements upgrading

8.5.2.6. Slum conversion into shared residential apartments

8.6. Conclusion

Chapter 9: General conclusion and recommendations

9.1. Introduction

9.2. Main findings
9.3. Relevance of the key findings on scientific knowledge and different aspects of spatial management
............................................................................................................................................ 213
  9.3.1. Connection between spatial justice and tenure security .................................................. 213
  9.3.2. Relevance of the key findings on urban space (re)development and recommendations
 ..................................................................................................................................................... 224
  9.4. Further research ................................................................................................................ 227

10. References ................................................................................................................................ 229

General summary ............................................................................................................................ 263

Appendices ....................................................................................................................................... A