

SUB Hamburg



A/561750

Contemporary Policy Analysis



MICHAEL MINTROM
University of Auckland

New York Oxford
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

BRIEF CONTENTS



PREFACE xxi

1 Introduction 1

OVERVIEW OF POLICY ANALYSIS 13

2 What Policy Analysts Do 15

3 What Governments Do 27

4 Objectives of Government Policy Actions 43

5 Managing Policy Projects 63

6 Presenting Policy Advice 80

7 Doing Ethical Policy Analysis 95

ANALYTICAL STRATEGIES 109

8 Introduction to the Analytical Strategies 111

9 Analysis of Markets 119

10 Analysis of Market Failure 149

11 Analysis of Government Failure 189

12 Comparative Institutional Analysis 209

13 Cost-Benefit Analysis 225

14 Gender Analysis 246

15 Race Analysis 267

16 Implementation Analysis 285

IMPROVING YOUR PRACTICE 305

17 Developing as a Policy Analyst and Advisor 307

BIBLIOGRAPHY 315

INDEX 331

CONTENTS



PREFACE xxi

- 1 Introduction 1**
 - The Nature of Policy Analysis 2
 - The Rise of Policy Analysis 5
 - The Purpose and Organization of This Book 8
 - Conclusion 9
 - Exercises 10
 - Further Reading 11

OVERVIEW OF POLICY ANALYSIS 13

- 2 What Policy Analysts Do 15**
 - The Social Function of Policy Analysis 16
 - Where Policy Analysts Are Employed 18
 - How Policy Analysts Contribute to Public Decision Making 20
 - Common Competencies and Attributes of Successful Policy Analysts 22
 - Why Being a Policy Analyst Is an Appealing Career Choice 23
 - Conclusion 24
 - Exercises 25
 - Invite a Guest to Class 25
 - Further Reading 25
- 3 What Governments Do 27**
 - The Role of Government in Society 28
 - Achieving Cooperation 29
 - A Review of Government Policy Actions 30
 - Market Making* 30
 - Taxes* 32
 - Subsidies* 32

| | | |
|----------|---|-----------|
| | <i>Regulation</i> | 34 |
| | <i>Direct Service Supply</i> | 35 |
| | <i>Funding and Contracting</i> | 36 |
| | <i>Partnering and Facilitating</i> | 37 |
| | <i>Information and Social Marketing</i> | 38 |
| | <i>Frameworks and Strategies</i> | 39 |
| | <i>Summary</i> | 40 |
| | Increasing Complexity | 41 |
| | Looking Ahead | 41 |
| | Exercises | 42 |
| | Further Reading | 42 |
| 4 | Objectives of Government Policy Actions | 43 |
| | Discussing Government Policy Action | 45 |
| | Promoting Human Flourishing | 47 |
| | Promoting Effective Institutions | 48 |
| | Promoting Efficiency | 50 |
| | Promoting Sustainability | 52 |
| | Advancing Human Rights | 53 |
| | Promoting Social Equity | 54 |
| | Problem Definition and Agenda Setting | 58 |
| | Working with Objectives, Goals, and Public Policies | 59 |
| | Conclusion | 61 |
| | Exercises | 61 |
| | Further Reading | 62 |
| 5 | Managing Policy Projects | 63 |
| | The Discipline of Project Management | 64 |
| | <i>Project Initiation</i> | 65 |
| | <i>Project Planning</i> | 65 |
| | <i>Project Execution and Control</i> | 66 |
| | <i>Project Closure</i> | 66 |
| | Developing a Policy Project Proposal | 66 |
| | <i>A Project Summary</i> | 67 |
| | <i>A List of Project Objectives</i> | 68 |
| | <i>A List of Project Deliverables</i> | 68 |
| | <i>A Project Task List</i> | 68 |
| | <i>A Preliminary Time Budget</i> | 71 |
| | <i>A Project Timeline</i> | 71 |
| | <i>Biographical Statements</i> | 71 |
| | <i>A Project Budget</i> | 72 |
| | <i>A Risk Assessment</i> | 72 |
| | Transitioning to Project Execution and Control | 72 |

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Constructing Progress Reports | 73 |
| Managing Your Time | 74 |
| <i>Make “To Do” Lists</i> | 74 |
| <i>Prioritize Among Activities</i> | 75 |
| <i>Batch Routine Tasks</i> | 75 |
| <i>Think About Opportunity Costs</i> | 75 |
| <i>Think in Marginalist Terms</i> | 75 |
| <i>Take Care of Relations with Others</i> | 75 |
| <i>Manage Your Downtime</i> | 75 |
| Working with Policy Literature | 76 |
| Conclusion | 78 |
| Exercises | 79 |
| The Class Project | 78 |
| Further Reading | 79 |
| 6 Presenting Policy Advice | 80 |
| Clarifying Audience Needs | 81 |
| Structuring a Policy Report | 82 |
| <i>Abstract or Executive Summary</i> | 83 |
| <i>Table of Contents</i> | 83 |
| <i>Introduction</i> | 83 |
| <i>Background</i> | 83 |
| <i>Analytical Strategy</i> | 84 |
| <i>Analysis and Findings</i> | 84 |
| <i>Discussion</i> | 84 |
| <i>Policy Recommendations</i> | 85 |
| <i>Conclusion</i> | 86 |
| <i>Other Items</i> | 87 |
| Effective Presentation of Evidence | 87 |
| Reflecting on the Contribution | 89 |
| The Sign-Off | 90 |
| Developing Presentations and Oral Briefings | 91 |
| The Importance of Creativity | 92 |
| Conclusion | 93 |
| Exercises | 94 |
| Invite a Guest to Class | 94 |
| Further Reading | 94 |
| 7 Doing Ethical Policy Analysis | 95 |
| Policy Analysis and Ethical Practice | 96 |
| Ethical Principles for Policy Analysts | 100 |
| <i>Integrity</i> | 101 |
| <i>Competence</i> | 101 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Responsibility</i> | 102 |
| <i>Respect</i> | 102 |
| <i>Concern</i> | 103 |
| Doing Ethical Policy Analysis | 104 |
| <i>Ethical Problem Definition</i> | 104 |
| <i>Ethical Construction of Alternatives</i> | 105 |
| <i>Ethical Selection of Criteria</i> | 105 |
| <i>Ethical Prediction of Outcomes</i> | 106 |
| <i>Ethical Analysis of Trade-Offs</i> | 106 |
| <i>Ethical Reporting Practices</i> | 107 |
| Conclusion | 107 |
| Exercises | 108 |
| Invite a Guest to Class | 108 |
| Further Reading | 108 |

ANALYTICAL STRATEGIES 109

| | | |
|----------|--|------------|
| 8 | Introduction to the Analytical Strategies | 111 |
| | Policy Analysts in the Policy-Making Process | 112 |
| | The Analytical Strategy Chapters | 113 |
| | <i>Chapter 9: Analysis of Markets</i> | 113 |
| | <i>Chapter 10: Analysis of Market Failure</i> | 114 |
| | <i>Chapter 11: Analysis of Government Failure</i> | 114 |
| | <i>Chapter 12: Comparative Institutional Analysis</i> | 114 |
| | <i>Chapter 13: Cost-Benefit Analysis</i> | 114 |
| | <i>Chapter 14: Gender Analysis</i> | 114 |
| | <i>Chapter 15: Race Analysis</i> | 114 |
| | <i>Chapter 16: Implementation Analysis</i> | 115 |
| | Use of Applied Examples | 115 |
| | The Analytical Strategies and General Steps in Policy Analysis | 116 |
| | When to Apply Each Analytical Strategy | 118 |
| | Conclusion | 118 |
| 9 | Analysis of Markets | 119 |
| | An Introduction to Market Analysis | 121 |
| | <i>Consumer Choice and the Demand Side of the Market</i> | 122 |
| | <i>Firm Behavior and the Supply Side of the Market</i> | 131 |
| | <i>Equilibrium in Markets</i> | 135 |
| | <i>Comparative Static Equilibrium Analysis</i> | 136 |
| | <i>Price Signaling and Interconnected Markets</i> | 137 |
| | <i>Assumptions of the Market Model Revisited</i> | 138 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Using Market Analysis as an Analytical Framework | 140 |
| Steps in Market Analysis | 141 |
| <i>Step 1. Identify the phenomenon of interest.</i> | 142 |
| <i>Step 2. Consider the behavior of consumers and producers.</i> | 142 |
| <i>Step 3. Think in terms of comparative statics equilibrium analysis.</i> | 142 |
| <i>Step 4. Collect and analyze the relevant information.</i> | 142 |
| <i>Step 5. Draw implications for government action.</i> | 142 |
| An Applied Example | 143 |
| <i>Step 1. Identify the phenomenon of interest.</i> | 144 |
| <i>Step 2. Consider the behavior of consumers and producers.</i> | 144 |
| <i>Step 3. Think in terms of comparative statics equilibrium analysis.</i> | 144 |
| <i>Step 4. Collect and analyze the relevant information.</i> | 145 |
| <i>Step 5. Draw implications for government action.</i> | 145 |
| Advice for Analytical Practice | 145 |
| Analysis of Markets and Other Analytical Strategies | 146 |
| Chapter Content Review: A Self-Test | 146 |
| Exercises | 147 |
| The Policy Research Seminar | 147 |
| Further Reading | 148 |
| 10 Analysis of Market Failure | 149 |
| An Overview of Market Failure | 151 |
| Information Asymmetries | 151 |
| Rectifying Information Asymmetries | 157 |
| Positive Externalities | 160 |
| Rectifying Positive Externalities | 162 |
| Negative Externalities | 163 |
| Rectifying Negative Externalities | 165 |
| Public Goods: Common Pool Resources | 167 |
| Rectifying Problems with Common Pool Resources | 169 |
| Pure Public Goods: The Need for Collective Provision | 171 |
| Arranging Collective Provision | 173 |
| Natural Monopolies and How They Can Be Managed | 174 |
| Social Equity Concerns and How They Can Be Addressed | 176 |
| Using Market Failure as an Analytical Framework | 178 |
| Steps in the Analysis of Market Failure | 178 |
| <i>Step 1. Specify the good or service of interest.</i> | 179 |
| <i>Step 2. Identify the consumers and producers and the location of their transactions.</i> | 179 |
| <i>Step 3. Using the tools of market analysis, construct a simple model of how an efficient market would allocate this good or service.</i> | 179 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Step 4. State the market failure that you believe is present in this context. | 179 |
| Step 5. Analyze the actions of consumers and producers and how those actions contribute to market failure. | 179 |
| Step 6. Estimate the financial implications of the market failure, and note any other salient impacts. | 180 |
| Step 7. Identify efforts made by consumers, producers, and any other nongovernmental actors to address the market failure. | 180 |
| Step 8. Suggest how government use of policy instruments could potentially address the market failure. | 180 |
| An Applied Example | 180 |
| Step 1. Specify the good or service of interest. | 182 |
| Step 2. Identify the consumers and producers and the location of their transactions. | 182 |
| Step 3. Using the tools of market analysis, construct a simple model of how an efficient market would allocate this good or service. | 182 |
| Step 4. State the market failure that you believe is present in this context. | 182 |
| Step 5. Analyze the actions of consumers and producers and how those actions contribute to market failure. | 182 |
| Step 6. Estimate the financial implications of the market failure, and note any other salient impacts. | 184 |
| Step 7. Identify efforts made by consumers, producers, and any other non-governmental actors to address the market failure. | 185 |
| Step 8. Suggest how government use of policy instruments could potentially address the market failure. | 185 |
| Advice for Analytical Practice | 185 |
| Market Failure and Other Analytical Strategies | 186 |
| Exercises | 186 |
| The Policy Research Seminar | 187 |
| Further Reading | 187 |

11 Analysis of Government Failure 189

An Overview of Government Failure and Its Analysis 191

| | |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| Government and Coordination Problems | 192 |
| Political Control | 193 |
| Provider Capture | 194 |
| Perverse Incentives | 194 |
| Goal Displacement | 195 |
| Institutional Inertia | 196 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Using Government Failure as an Analytical Framework | 197 |
| Steps in the Analysis of Government Failure | 198 |
| Step 1. Define the area of policy interest. | 198 |
| Step 2. Determine the objectives of government action. | 198 |
| Step 3. Note the nature of information and coordination problems that can arise through reliance on decentralized, private decision making. | 199 |
| Step 4. Contrast the current or favored government actions with possible alternatives. | 199 |
| Step 5. Identify opportunities for undue political interference in program management. | 199 |
| Step 6. Identify opportunities for provider capture. | 200 |
| Step 7. Identify perverse incentives and unintended outcomes. | 200 |
| Step 8. Propose changes in policy design to reduce observed government failure. | 200 |
| Step 9. Consider ways that reliance on government action could be reduced over time. | 201 |
| An Applied Example | 201 |
| Step 1. Define the area of policy interest. | 202 |
| Step 2. Determine the objectives of government action. | 203 |
| Step 3. Note the nature of information and coordination problems that can arise through reliance on decentralized, private decision making. | 203 |
| Step 4. Contrast the current or favored government actions with possible alternatives. | 203 |
| Step 5. Identify opportunities for undue political interference in program management. | 204 |
| Step 6. Identify opportunities for provider capture. | 204 |
| Step 7. Identify perverse incentives and unintended outcomes. | 204 |
| Step 8. Propose changes in policy design to reduce observed government failure. | 205 |
| Step 9. Consider ways that reliance on government action could be reduced over time. | 205 |
| Advice for Analytical Practice | 206 |
| Analysis of Government Failure and Other Analytical Strategies | 206 |
| Exercises | 207 |
| The Policy Research Seminar | 207 |
| Further Reading | 208 |
| 12 Comparative Institutional Analysis | 209 |
| An Overview of Comparative Institutional Analysis | 211 |
| Using Comparative Institutional Analysis as an Analytical Framework | 213 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Steps in Comparative Institutional Analysis | 215 |
| Step 1. <i>Select and refine the analytical questions.</i> | 215 |
| Step 2. <i>Develop a research design, and select cases.</i> | 215 |
| Step 3. <i>Collect and analyze the relevant information.</i> | 215 |
| Step 4. <i>Isolate the relationships between institutional choice and observed outcomes.</i> | 216 |
| Step 5. <i>Present your findings, and make recommendations.</i> | 216 |
| An Applied Example | 217 |
| Step 1. <i>Select and refine the analytical questions.</i> | 217 |
| Step 2. <i>Develop a research design, and select cases.</i> | 218 |
| Step 3. <i>Collect and analyze the relevant information.</i> | 218 |
| Step 4. <i>Isolate the relationships between institutional choice and observed outcomes.</i> | 219 |
| Step 5. <i>Present your findings, and make recommendations.</i> | 219 |
| Advice for Analytical Practice | 220 |
| Comparative Institutional Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies | 220 |
| Exercises | 221 |
| Invite a Guest to Class | 222 |
| The Class Project | 222 |
| The Policy Research Seminar | 223 |
| Further Reading | 224 |
| | |
| 13 Cost-Benefit Analysis | 225 |
| An Overview of Cost-Benefit Analysis | 226 |
| Using Cost-Benefit Analysis as an Analytical Framework | 227 |
| Steps in Cost-Benefit Analysis | 228 |
| Step 1. <i>Define the scope of the study.</i> | 229 |
| Step 2. <i>Identify all negative and positive effects of the policy.</i> | 229 |
| Step 3. <i>Estimate the monetary costs and benefits of the policy.</i> | 230 |
| Step 4. <i>Take account of opportunity costs.</i> | 232 |
| Step 5. <i>Calculate net present value.</i> | 232 |
| Step 6. <i>Reflect on the value of human life and quality-of-life issues.</i> | 233 |
| Step 7. <i>Report study assumptions and limitations.</i> | 234 |
| Step 8. <i>Present results using several scenarios.</i> | 235 |
| An Applied Example | 235 |
| Step 1. <i>Define the scope of the study.</i> | 236 |
| Step 2. <i>Identify all negative and positive effects of the policy.</i> | 237 |
| Step 3. <i>Estimate the monetary costs and benefits of the policy.</i> | 238 |
| Step 4. <i>Take account of opportunity costs.</i> | 239 |
| Step 5. <i>Calculate net present value.</i> | 239 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| | <i>Step 6. Reflect on the value of human life and quality-of-life issues.</i> | 240 |
| | <i>Step 7. Report study assumptions and limitations.</i> | 240 |
| | <i>Step 8. Present results using several scenarios.</i> | 240 |
| | Advice for Analytical Practice | 240 |
| | Cost-Benefit Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies | 241 |
| | Exercises | 242 |
| | The Class Project | 242 |
| | The Policy Research Seminar | 244 |
| | Further Reading | 245 |
| 14 | Gender Analysis | 246 |
| | Gender and Race Analysis | 247 |
| | <i>Policy Motives</i> | 248 |
| | <i>Policy Actions</i> | 249 |
| | An Overview of Gender Analysis | 250 |
| | <i>Analysis of Aggregate Statistics</i> | 251 |
| | <i>Process Tracing</i> | 252 |
| | <i>Tests for Discriminatory Practices</i> | 254 |
| | Using Gender Analysis as an Analytical Framework | 256 |
| | <i>Gender Analysis and Problem Definition</i> | 257 |
| | <i>Gender Analysis and Construction of Alternatives</i> | 257 |
| | <i>Gender Analysis and Selection of Criteria</i> | 257 |
| | <i>Gender Analysis and Prediction of Outcomes</i> | 258 |
| | <i>Reporting Gender Analysis</i> | 258 |
| | Steps in Gender Analysis | 258 |
| | <i>Step 1. Select a specific context in which women appear significantly disadvantaged relative to men.</i> | 259 |
| | <i>Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to illustrate differences in men's and women's experiences in similar contexts.</i> | 259 |
| | <i>Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory.</i> | 259 |
| | <i>Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage women compared with men.</i> | 260 |
| | <i>Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage.</i> | 260 |
| | <i>Step 6. Address the view that gains for women spell losses for men.</i> | 260 |
| | An Applied Example | 261 |
| | <i>Step 1. Select a specific context in which women appear significantly disadvantaged relative to men.</i> | 261 |

Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to illustrate differences in men's and women's experiences in similar contexts. 262

Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory. 262

Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage women compared with men. 262

Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage. 263

Step 6. Address the view that gains for women spell losses for men. 263

Advice for Analytical Practice 263

Gender Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies 264

Exercises 265

The Policy Research Seminar 265

Further Reading 266

15 Race Analysis 267

An Overview of Race Analysis 268

Testing for Statistical Discrimination versus Racial Prejudice 269

Confronting Misattribution Problems 271

Tracing Complex Processes 273

Using Race Analysis as an Analytical Strategy 274

Race Analysis and Problem Definition 275

Race Analysis and Construction of Alternatives 275

Race Analysis and Selection of Criteria 275

Race Analysis and Prediction of Outcomes 275

Reporting Race Analysis 275

Steps in Race Analysis 276

 Step 1. Select a specific context in which significant racial disparities are known or expected to exist. 276

 Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to confirm the existence of racial disparities. 276

 Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory. 276

 Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage specific racial groups. 277

 Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage. 277

 Step 6. Scrutinize the proposed policy actions to avoid unintended negative effects. 277

 Step 7. Estimate the gains for all groups that would result from effective policy change. 277

An Applied Example 278

- Step 1. Select a specific context in which significant racial disparities are known or expected to exist.* 279
- Step 2. Assemble evidence allowing you to confirm the existence of racial disparities.* 279
- Step 3. Develop a process-tracing method to show how specific institutional arrangements, social practices, or decision making are discriminatory.* 280
- Step 4. Highlight discriminatory policies or practices, and show how they disadvantage specific racial groups.* 280
- Step 5. Propose policy actions to rectify the discrimination and disadvantage.* 280
- Step 6. Scrutinize the proposed policy actions to avoid unintended negative effects.* 280
- Step 7. Estimate the gains for all groups that would result from effective policy change.* 281

Advice for Analytical Practice 281

Race Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies 281

Exercises 283

Further Reading 284

16 Implementation Analysis 285

An Overview of Implementation Analysis 286

Envisioning Policy Success 287

Identifying Tasks and Task Dependencies 288

Identifying Threats to Successful Implementation 289

Closing Knowing-Doing Gaps 290

Planning for Evaluation 291

Using Implementation Analysis as an Analytical Framework 292

Steps in Implementation Analysis 293

Step 1. Identify the overall purpose of the new policy, where it will be implemented, and how success has been defined. 293

Step 2. Identify who will be responsible for policy implementation and the behavioral changes that implementation is expected to produce. 293

Step 3. Specify the institutional, organizational, and procedural changes required to support the new policy. 294

Step 4. Treating implementation as a project, note the key tasks required to establish the new policy context. 294

Step 5. Identify any significant threats to successful implementation and how they can be addressed. 294

Step 6. Consider how institutional inertia might hinder change and how it can be overcome. 294

Step 7. Ensure provisions have been made for evaluation of the new policy and associated programs. 294

An Applied Example 295

Step 1. Identify the overall purpose of the new policy, where it will be implemented, and how success has been defined. 295

Step 2. Identify who will be responsible for policy implementation and the behavioral changes that implementation is expected to produce. 296

Step 3. Specify the institutional, organizational, and procedural changes required to support the new policy. 296

Step 4. Treating implementation as a project, note the key tasks required to establish the new policy context. 297

Step 5. Identify any significant threats to successful implementation and how they can be addressed. 297

Step 6. Consider how institutional inertia might hinder change and how it can be overcome. 298

Step 7. Ensure provisions have been made for evaluation of the new policy and associated programs. 298

Advice for Analytical Practice 299

Implementation Analysis and Other Analytical Strategies 299

Exercises 300

Invite a Guest to Class 301

The Class Project 301

The Policy Research Seminar 303

Further Reading 303

IMPROVING YOUR PRACTICE 305

17 **Developing as a Policy Analyst and Advisor** 307

The Power of Positive Thinking 308

Developing Openness and Creativity 309

Skill Building through Deliberate Practice 311

Becoming a Change Leader 312

Further Reading 313

BIBLIOGRAPHY 315

INDEX 331