Fundamentals of Legal Argumentation

A Survey of Theories on the Justification of Judicial Decisions

Second Edition

Springer
Contents

1 Legal Argumentation and Legal Interpretation ........................................ 1
  1.1 Introduction ...................................................................................... 1
  1.2 Central Problems in the Application and Interpretation of Legal Rules ......................................................... 2
    1.2.1 Clear Cases and Hard Cases ......................................................... 3
    1.2.2 Exceptions to Legal Rules: Defeasibility and Exclusionary Reasons ....................................................... 5
    1.2.3 The Distinction Between Legal Rules and Legal Principles ................................................................. 6
    1.2.4 The Solution of Conflicts Between Norms: Conflict Rules, Weighing and Balancing .................................. 7
    1.2.5 The Status of Legal Rules, Principles and Precedents as Arguments in Legal Justification ....................... 8
  1.3 Interpretation Methods, Types of Legal Reasoning and the Justification of Legal Decisions ................................. 9
    1.3.1 Methods of Legal Interpretation and Types of Legal Reasoning .......................................................... 9
    1.3.2 Interpretation Strategies and Argumentative Patterns in Legal Justification ........................................... 12
  1.4 Legal Interpretation and Argumentation in the Context of EU Law and International Law .................................. 14
  1.5 Legal Interpretation and Legal Justification: The Law as Argumentative Activity .............................................. 18
  References ............................................................................................... 19

2 The Logical Approach of Legal Argumentation ........................................ 23
  2.1 Introduction ...................................................................................... 23
  2.2 Logical Validity and Acceptability of Legal Argumentation ................ 24
  2.3 Various Logical Theories ................................................................... 25
  2.4 Logical Analysis of Legal Argumentation ......................................... 28
5.3 The Complementary Relation Between Legal Discourse and Communicative Idealizations .................................................. 85
  5.3.1 Law, Morality, and the Relation Between Legal Discourse and Moral Discourse .................................................. 85
  5.3.2 Law as an Institutionalization of Rational Discourse ....... 87
  5.3.3 The Ideal of Rational Discourse as a Standard for the Rationality of Legal Discourse ........................................ 88

5.4 Conclusion ............................................................................... 90
References .................................................................................. 92

6 MacCormick’s Theory of the Justification of Legal Decisions ...... 95
  6.1 Introduction ........................................................................... 95
  6.2 An Institutional Approach of Law and Legal Justification .... 97
  6.3 Universalizability and Deductive Justification .................. 99
  6.4 Second-Order Justification .................................................. 103
  6.5 Consequentialist Arguments ............................................... 107
  6.6 Arguments of Coherence ..................................................... 109
  6.7 Arguments of Consistency ................................................... 111
  6.8 Conclusion ........................................................................... 112
References .................................................................................. 115

7 Alexy’s Procedural Theory of Legal Argumentation ................. 117
  7.1 Introduction ........................................................................... 117
  7.2 The Theory of General Practical Discourse ......................... 119
    7.2.1 The Rules of General Practical Discourse ....................... 120
    7.2.2 The Principles of Practical Rationality .......................... 126
    7.2.3 The Justification of Rules of Discourse ......................... 127
  7.3 The Theory of Legal Argumentation ................................. 128
    7.3.1 The Rules of the Internal Justification ......................... 129
    7.3.2 The Rules of the External Justification ......................... 132
  7.4 Legal and General Practical Discourse: The Special Case Thesis ................................................................. 139
  7.5 Weighing and Balancing as a Method for Rational Legal Justification ................................................................. 143
    7.5.1 Alexy’s Theory of Balancing ........................................ 143
    7.5.2 Further Developments of the Theory of Balancing .......... 148
  7.6 Conclusion ........................................................................... 150
References .................................................................................. 152

8 Aarnio’s Theory of the Justification of Legal Interpretations ..... 155
  8.1 Introduction ........................................................................... 155
  8.2 The Interpretation of Legal Norms ....................................... 157
  8.3 The Justification of an Interpretation Standpoint ................. 158
    8.3.1 The Structure of the Justification ................................ 158
    8.3.2 Internal and External Justification .............................. 161
10.4.2 Institutional Constraints for Critical Discussion in a Legal Context: Procedures and Rules for Dispute Resolution in the Law

10.5 The Role of the Judge in Resolving the Difference of Opinion in a Legal Context

10.5.1 The Dialectical Position of the Judge in Differences of Opinion

10.5.2 The Dialectical Role of the Judge in Achieving the Results of the Discussion Stages

10.6 Prototypical Argumentative Patterns in Legal Justification

10.6.1 Prototypical Patterns in Clear Cases and Hard Cases

10.6.2 Prototypical Patterns in a Hard Case in Which the Applicability of the Legal Rule is Disputed

10.7 The Development of Prototypical Argumentative Patterns Based on Different Interpretation Methods

10.7.1 Prototypical Patterns Based on Analogy Argumentation

10.7.2 Prototypical Patterns Based on Teleological-Evaluative Argumentation

10.8 Prototypical Argumentative Patterns Based on Weighing and Balancing

10.8.1 General Prototypical Argumentative Patterns Based on Weighing and Balancing

10.8.2 Substantiation of the Prototypical Argumentative Patterns of Weighing and Balancing for Teleological-Evaluative Argumentation

10.9 Conclusion

References

11 A Survey of Approaches and Studies of Legal Argumentation in the Context of Legal Justification in Different Legal Systems and Countries

11.1 Introduction

11.2 Research of Legal Argumentation in Different Research Traditions

11.3 Studies of Legal Argumentation in the Civil Law Tradition: Europe and Latin America

11.3.1 Studies of Legal Argumentation in Northern Europe

11.3.2 Studies of Legal Argumentation in Eastern Europe

11.3.3 Studies of Legal Argumentation in Southern Europe

11.3.4 Studies of Legal Argumentation in Latin America

11.4 Studies of Legal Argumentation in the Anglo-Saxon Law System

11.4.1 Studies of Legal Argumentation in the United Kingdom
11.4.2 Studies of Legal Argumentation in the United States of America ............................................................... 291
11.4.3 Studies of Legal Argumentation in Canada .............................................................. 299
11.5 Studies of Legal Argumentation in Asia ........................................................................ 300
11.5.1 Studies of Legal Argumentation in China .............................................................. 300
11.5.2 Studies of Legal Argumentation in Japan .............................................................. 302
References ................................................................................................................................. 303

12 Epilogue: Main Trends in Research of Legal Argumentation .............................................. 339
12.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 339
12.2 Research of Legal Argumentation as an Independent Field of Study with an Interdisciplinary and International Character ................................................................................. 340
12.3 Legal Discussions as Institutionalized Form of Rational Practical Discussions .................................................................................................................. 341
12.3.1 Legal Argumentation as Communicative and Social Activity ........................................ 342
12.3.2 Legal Justification as Institutionalized Form of Rational Practical Discussion .......... 342
12.3.3 The Ideal of Practical Rationality and Rules for Legal Discussions ......................... 343
12.4 Different Kinds of Rules for Legal Discussions ............................................................. 345
12.4.1 Rules Concerning Procedural Rights and Duties ...................................................... 345
12.4.2 Rules Concerning Common Starting Points ............................................................ 346
12.4.3 Rules Concerning Argument Schemes and Argumentative Patterns ...................... 347
12.4.4 Rules Concerning the Result of the Discussion ...................................................... 348
12.5 Models for the Rational Reconstruction of Legal Argumentation .................................. 349
12.5.1 Different Levels of Argumentation ......................................................................... 349
12.5.2 Argumentative Patterns ......................................................................................... 350
12.6 Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 351

Index ........................................................................................................................................ 355