

Regulating Corporate Crimes:

Comparative appraisal of the legal framework on
environmental crimes by mining companies
in Tanzania and Germany

Inauguraldissertation

zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades eines
Doktors der Rechte

(Dr. iur.) der Fakultät für Wirtschaftswissenschaften an der
Technischen Universität Chemnitz

vorgelegt von:

Hanifa Twaha Massawe

Table of Contents

Acknowledgement	XVII
Declaration	XIX
Abstract	XXI
List of Figures	XXIII
Abbreviations and Acronyms	XXIII
Bibliography	XXVIII
PART I: INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 1: Introduction and Background of the Problem	2
1.1 Introduction	2
1.1.1 General Remarks	2
1.1.2 Background of the Research Problem	7
1.2 Statement of the Problem	15
1.3 Objectives of the Research	19
1.3.1 General Objective	19
1.3.2 Specific Objectives	19
1.3.3 Research Questions	20
1.3.4 Significance of the Research	20
1.3.5 Justification of the Research	21
1.4 Literature Review	22
1.4.1 Review of Theoretical Literature	22
1.4.1.1 Rational choice theory	22
1.4.1.2 Command and Control	24
1.4.1.3 Market based environmental regulation	27
1.4.1.4 Self-regulation	29
1.4.1.5 Hybrid environmental regulatory model	31
1.4.2 Choice of theory and justification	31
1.4.3 Empirical Literature Review	32
1.4.4 Research Gap	55
1.5 Research Methodology	57
1.5.1 Qualitative Research	57
1.5.2 Research Approaches	58

Table of Contents

1.5.3 Comparative Research Method	60
1.5.4 Multiple Case Study	63
1.5.5 Research Areas	64
1.5.6 Sampling technique, sample frame and sample size.....	65
1.5.7 Types and Sources of Data.....	66
1.5.8 Data Collection Methods.....	67
1.5.8.1 Interview.....	67
1.5.8.2 Documentary Review	67
1.5.8.3 Observation	68
1.5.9 Data Analysis.....	69
1.5.10 Reliability and Validity	69
1.5.11 Ethical considerations	70
1.6 Organization of the Thesis	71
1.7 Interim Summary	72
PART II: CONCEPTUALIZATION	75
CHAPTER 2: Theoretical Foundations on Corporate criminal liability and regulatory modes to corporate environmental crimes	76
2.1 Introduction.....	76
2.2 Evolution of corporate criminal liability	76
2.2.1 General Remarks.....	76
2.2.2 Rationale of corporate criminal liability.....	79
2.2.3 Convergent and divergent views on corporate criminal liability ..	81
2.3 Reception or rejection of corporate criminal liability? Countries overview.....	85
2.3.1 General Remarks	85
2.3.2 German and Tanzanian Perspectives on Corporate Criminal Liability	88
2.3.2.1 German Perspective	88
2.3.2.2 Tanzanian Perspective	92
2.4 Evolution of corporate environmental crimes and regulation aspects .	94
2.4.1. Definition of environmental crimes	94
2.4.2 Regulation of corporate environmental crimes	96
2.4.3 Administrative, civil or criminal Sanctions for regulation of	

corporate environmental crimes?	102
2.4.3.1 General Remarks	102
2.4.3.2 Criminal Law in regulation of corporate environmental crimes: Countries' perspectives	107
2.5 Interim Summary	114
CHAPTER 3: Conceptual Framework of the study and Hypothesis	115
3.1 Introduction	115
3.2 Determinants of effective regulation for corporate environmental crimes.....	117
3.2.1 Effective laws	117
3.2.2 Effective Regulatory Machineries	121
3.2.3 Compliant corporate entities	126
3.3 Research Hypotheses.....	129
3.4 Interim Summary	129
CHAPTER 4: Economic significance of mining in comparable regimes and related environmental impacts.....	130
4.1 Introduction.....	130
4.2 The political and socio-economic profile of the United Republic of Tanzania.....	130
4.2.1 The Political and Social profile of Tanzania	130
4.2.2 The Economic Profile of Tanzania	131
4.3 The political and socio-economic profile of Germany	134
4.3.1 The Political and social profile of Germany	134
4.3.2 The Economic Profile of Germany.....	134
4.4 Practical Mining Aspects and Significant Environmental Impacts	138
4.4.1 General Remarks.....	138
4.4.2 Mining Process.....	139
4.4.2.1 Exploration	139
4.4.2.2 Extraction	139
4.4.2.3 Formation of Waste Rock Piles.....	141
4.4.2.4 Transportation of extracted ore	141
4.4.2.5 Beneficiation process	141
4.4.2.6 Tailings Disposal.....	144

Table of Contents

4.4.2.7 Site reclamation and Mine Closure	145
4.5 Negative environmental impacts from mining: General overview	146
4.5.1 Water Pollution	146
4.5.1.1 Acid Mine Drainage	146
4.5.1.2 Mine Dewatering	148
4.5.1.3 Tailings Storage Facility Seepage and Water Pollution.....	149
4.5.2 Soil Pollution	150
4.5.3 Air Pollution	152
4.5.4 Other Emissions (Noise and Vibration).....	153
4.5.5 Impact on Public Health	153
4.6 Correlation between environmental impacts, environmental crimes and corporate behavior	154
4.7 Interim Summary	156
PART III: EVALUATION	157
CHAPTER 5: Legal Framework for Regulation of Corporate Environmen- tal Criminal Behavior	158
5.1 Introduction	158
5.2 Relevant Laws for Regulation of Corporate Environmental Crimes	160
5.2.1 International Environmental Laws.....	160
5.2.1.1 Customary International Law	161
5.2.1.2 Ratified International Environmental Treaties: Reflection of International Environmental Principles	162
5.2.2 Implementation of International environmental Law: States Level	174
5.2.2.1 General Remarks	174
5.2.2.2 Legislative implementation	175
5.2.2.3 Administrative implementation.....	176
5.2.2.4 Judicial enforcement.....	177
5.3 Regional Laws on environmental regulation	178
5.3.1. General Remarks	178
5.3.2. European Union Law	178
5.3.2.1 General Remarks	178
5.3.2.2. EC Directives and their relevance for Environmental Regulation	180

5.3.3 The East African Community's Environmental Regulation Policy: Impact on Tanzanian Environmental Regulation Process	182
5.4 Domestic Laws relating to regulation of Corporate Environmental Criminal Behavior	184
5.4.1 General Remarks	184
5.4.2 Constitution and environmental regulation: Tanzanian and German Perspectives	185
5.4.2.1. Tanzanian Perspective	185
5.4.2.2. German Perspective	186
5.4.3 Penal Code	190
5.4.3.1 Tanzanian Perspective	190
5.4.3.2 German Perspective: Partial merger between the German Criminal Code Act and Federal Administrative Offences Act (OWiG)	191
5.4.4 Company Laws	195
5.4.5 Mining Laws	196
5.4.5.1 General Remarks	196
5.4.5.2 Tanzanian Perspective	197
5.4.5.3 German Perspective	200
5.4.6 Environmental laws, regulatory machineries and regulation aspects	204
5.4.6.1 Tanzanian Perspective	205
5.4.6.2 German Perspective	215
5.5 Other Regulatory Institutions and Actors	229
5.5.1. General Remarks	229
5.5.2 Tanzanian Perspective	231
5.5.3 German Perspective	233
5.6 Interim Summary	233
CHAPTER 6: Manifestation of environmental crimes and effectiveness of relevant laws in regulating corporate environmental behavior.....	235
6.1 Introduction	235
6.2 Manifestation of environmental crimes in research areas	235
6.2.1 General Remarks	235
6.2.2 Manifestation of air pollution	237

Table of Contents

6.2.3 Manifestation of Water Pollution	241
6.2.4 Manifestation of Soil Pollution	244
6.2.5 Health related impacts.....	245
6.2.6 Mining plants' proximity to local communities	245
6.3 General Remarks.....	247
6.4 Effectiveness of Relevant Laws	248
6.4.1 Legal Taxonomical Challenges.....	248
6.4.1.1 Constitutional environmental consideration	248
6.4.1.2 Definition of environmental crimes	251
6.4.1.3 Definition of environmental harm	255
6.4.1.4.Overlap between administrative regulation and criminal law	257
6.4.1.5 Corporate criminology and environmental regulation	258
6.4.1.6 Company laws and corporate environmental regulation ..	266
6.4.1.7 Vague corporate environmental reporting standards	267
6.4.1.8 The right to institute environmental proceedings	269
6.4.1.9 Criminal sanctions and anticipated effects	272
6.4.1.10 Defenses to Corporate environmental crimes	276
6.4.1.11 Compounding of environmental offences	278
6.4.1.12 Want of environmental regulations	279
6.4.2 Non Legal Taxonomical Challenges	281
6.4.2.1 Corporate environmental compliance measures	281
6.5 Interim Summary	284
CHAPTER 7: Effectiveness of regulatory machineries in regulation of environmental crimes by mining companies	286
7.1 Introduction.....	286
7.2 EIA requirement and performance challenges.....	287
7.2.1 Incorporation of EIA in relevant laws.....	287
7.2.2 Low public participation in EIA	289
7.2.3 Choice of experts in EIA's	290
7.2.4 Expenses and bureaucracy in EIA	291
7.2.5 Legal limitations of EIA.....	291
7.2.6 Involvement of local government authorities in EIA.....	293

7.3 Preference of administrative over criminal environmental regulation .	295
7.3.1 General Remarks	295
7.3.2 Administrative environmental regulation.....	295
7.4 Involvement of criminal enforcement machinery in environmental regulation.....	299
7.4.1 The police in environmental regulation	300
7.4.2 Prosecutorial discretion in environmental crimes	302
7.4.3 Prosecutorial technicalities for corporate environmental crimes	303
7.4.4 Judicial challenges for environmental crimes	304
7.4.4.1 General Remarks	304
7.4.4.2 Low legal familiarity in environmental criminology	306
7.4.4.3 Low judicial attention to environmental prosecution.....	307
7.4.4.4 Sentencing guidelines for corporate environmental crimes	308
7.5 Other external regulatory challenges	311
7.5.1 Autonomy by regulatory machineries	311
7.5.2 Financial constraints by regulatory machineries	313
7.5.3 Inadequate human resources	313
7.5.4 Regularity of monitoring process	314
7.5.5 Notice requirements in inspection.....	316
7.5.6 Divergence of regulatory machineries	317
7.5.7 Derailed access to environmental information	318
7.5.8 Low public environmental awareness	320
7.5.9 Conflict between economic development and environmental regulation	322
7.5.10 Low political environmental priority.....	323
7.5.11 Role of NGO's in environmental regulation	325
7.6 Interim Summary	327
PART IV: Synthesis, Conclusion and Further Research Agenda	329
CHAPTER 8: Synthesis, Theoretical Contributions and Recommendations	330
8.1 Introduction	330
8.2 Synthesis of the Findings	330

Table of Contents

8.2.1	Manifestation of environmental crimes in research areas	331
8.2.2	Effectiveness of relevant laws	332
8.2.2.1	General Remarks	332
8.2.2.2	Constitutional environmental consideration	333
8.2.2.3	Company laws and corporate environmental regulation ..	335
8.2.2.4	Corporate criminology in environmental regulation	336
8.2.2.5	Definition of environmental crimes and environmental harm	338
8.2.2.6	Overlap between administrative regulation and criminal law	338
8.2.2.7	Compounding of environmental offences	339
8.2.2.8	Want of environmental regulations under EMA	340
8.2.2.9	Corporate environmental compliance measures	340
8.2.2.10	Criminal sanctions and anticipated effects	341
8.2.2.11	Corporate environmental defenses	342
8.2.2.12	Local government by-laws and environmental regula tion	343
8.2.3	Effectiveness of regulatory machineries	343
8.2.3.1	EIA requirement for mining companies	344
8.2.3.2	Autonomy of regulatory machineries	345
8.2.3.3	Financial constraints and environmental regulation	346
8.2.3.4	Notice requirements in environmental regulation	346
8.2.3.5	Divergence of regulatory machineries	347
8.2.3.6	Preference of administrative than criminal environ mental regulation	347
8.2.3.7	Involvement of criminal enforcement machinery in environmental regulation	348
8.2.3.8	Technicalities in prosecution of corporate environmental crimes	349
8.2.3.9	Judicial challenges for environmental crimes	350
8.2.3.10	Derailed access to environmental information	351
8.2.3.11	Low public environmental awareness	352
8.2.3.12	Conflict between economic development and environ mental regulation	352

8.2.3.13 Role of NGO's in environmental regulation	353
8.3 Discussion of the Hypotheses	354
8.3.1 First hypothesis.....	354
8.3.2 Second hypothesis	355
8.4 Theoretical implications and contribution	355
8.5 Recommendations	356
8.5.1 General Remarks	356
8.5.2 Recommendations for legal challenges.....	357
8.5.2.1 Fair compensation to displaced mining communities	357
8.5.2.2 Enhancement of constitutional environmental consideration	357
8.5.2.3 Enhancement of environmental consideration under the corporate laws.....	358
8.5.2.4 Proper statutory recognition of corporate criminal liability	359
8.5.2.5 Proper definition of environmental crimes	360
8.5.2.6 Enactment of regulations for administrative or criminal regulations	361
8.5.2.7 Enactment of regulations for compounding of environmental offences.....	362
8.5.2.8 Enhancement of environmental criminal regulation.....	362
8.5.2.9 Improvement of deterrent effect for criminal sanctions ..	363
8.5.2.10 Improvement of corporate environmental compliance measures	366
8.5.2.11 Enactment of strong environmental by-laws	366
8.5.3 Recommendations for minimization of challenges by regulatory machineries.....	367
8.5.3.1 Capacity building for regulatory machineries.....	367
8.5.3.2 Improvement and processing of quality EIA	368
8.5.3.3 Limitation of environmental regulatory powers for sector ministries.....	369
8.5.3.4 Improvement of access to environmental information ...	370
8.5.3.5 Involvement of criminal justice machineries in environmental regulation	370
8.5.3.6 Improvement of the role of Environmental Inspectors ...	373

Table of Contents

8.5.3.7 Balance between economic development and environmental regulation	374
8.5.3.8 Enhancement of corporate adherence to environmental laws	375
8.5.3.9 Improvement of the role of NGO's in environmental regulation.....	375
8.6 Interim Summary	376
CHAPTER 9: Conclusion, limitations and future research agenda	377
9.1 Conclusion.....	377
9.2 Limitations of the study and future research agenda	379
Appendices	382