

Nicolas Grégoire

# Evidentiary Privileges in International Arbitration

A Comparative Analysis under  
English, American, Swiss and French Law



UNIVERSITÉ  
DE GENÈVE

FACULTÉ DE DROIT

LGDJ

extenso éditions

Schulthess  
ÉDITIONS ROMANDES

§ 2016

---

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgments .....	VII
Table of Contents .....	IX
Abbreviations .....	XV
Terminology .....	XXI
INTRODUCTION .....	1
I.                The Issue .....	1
II.               Purpose and Structure of this Work .....	4
CHAPTER 1 - EVIDENCE IN INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION .....	7
1.1               Introduction .....	7
1.2               An Introduction to Privileges .....	7
1.2.1          Nature and rationale of privileges .....	7
1.2.1.1    Confidentiality and privilege .....	8
1.2.1.2    Categories of privileges .....	8
1.2.1.3    Rationales and public policy .....	10
1.2.2         Origins .....	13
1.2.2.1    In common law .....	13
1.2.2.2    In civil law .....	15
1.2.3         Forms of objections .....	16
1.3               The Taking of Evidence in Arbitration: Laws and Rules .....	17
1.3.1         Arbitration laws .....	17
1.3.1.1    Model Law .....	17
1.3.1.2    English law .....	18
1.3.1.3    American law .....	18
1.3.1.4    French law .....	19
1.3.1.5    Swiss law .....	20
1.3.2         Arbitration rules .....	21
1.3.2.1    ICC Rules .....	23
1.3.2.2    LCIA Rules .....	23

1.3.2.3	ICDR Rules .....	24
1.3.2.4.	Swiss Rules .....	24
1.3.2.5	UNCITRAL Rules .....	25
1.3.2.6	IBA Rules .....	26
1.3.3	The lack of guidance on privileges in arbitration laws and rules .....	27
1.3.4	Is the arbitration agreement an implicit waiver of privilege? .....	31
1.4	Public Policy Considerations .....	33
1.4.1	The rules determined by the parties .....	33
1.4.2	The right to be heard .....	33
1.4.2.1	Sword and shield .....	36
1.4.3	Equal treatment of the parties .....	37
1.4.4	Production of privileged materials in violation of rules of professional ethics .....	39
1.4.5	Production of privileged materials in violation of criminal law .....	41
1.5	Conclusion .....	42
<b>CHAPTER 2 - PRIVILEGES UNDER ENGLISH, AMERICAN, SWISS AND FRENCH LAW</b>	.....	<b>43</b>
2.1	Introduction .....	43
2.2	Legal Framework .....	43
2.2.1	England .....	43
2.2.2	United States .....	44
2.2.3	France .....	45
2.2.4	Switzerland .....	47
2.3	Attorney-Client Privilege .....	47
2.3.1	England .....	48
2.3.2	United States .....	54
2.3.3	France .....	61
2.3.4	Switzerland .....	63
2.4	Work Product Doctrine .....	66
2.4.1	England .....	67
2.4.2	United States .....	69
2.4.3	France .....	72
2.4.4	Switzerland .....	72
2.5	Joint and Common Interest Privilege .....	73

---

2.5.1	England .....	73
2.5.2	United States .....	75
2.6	Without Prejudice Privilege .....	77
2.6.1	England .....	78
2.6.2	United States .....	83
2.6.3	France .....	86
2.6.4	Switzerland .....	87
2.7	Mediation Privilege .....	87
2.7.1	England .....	88
2.7.2	United States .....	88
2.7.3	France .....	90
2.7.4	Switzerland .....	91
2.8	Self-Critical Analysis Privilege .....	92
2.8.1	United States .....	92
2.9	Trade Secrets Privilege .....	97
2.9.1	England .....	97
2.9.2	United States .....	97
2.9.3	France .....	99
2.9.4	Switzerland .....	99
2.10	Privilege Against Self-Incrimination in Civil Proceedings ..	100
2.10.1	England .....	101
2.10.2	United States .....	101
2.10.3	France .....	103
2.10.4	Switzerland .....	103
2.11	State Secrets .....	104
2.11.1	England .....	104
2.11.2	United States .....	107
2.11.3	France .....	110
2.11.4	Switzerland .....	112
2.12	Patent Agent Privilege .....	113
2.12.1	England .....	113
2.12.2	United States .....	113
2.12.3	France .....	113
2.12.4	Switzerland .....	114
2.13	Accountant Privilege .....	115
2.13.1	England .....	115
2.13.2	United States .....	116

2.13.3	France .....	116
2.13.4	Switzerland .....	116
2.14	Conclusion .....	117

## **CHAPTER 3 – CHARACTERIZATION AND APPLICABLE LAW FOR PRIVILEGES IN INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION .... 119**

3.1	Introduction .....	119
3.2	Are Privileges Substantive or Procedural in Nature in Arbitration?.....	120
3.2.1	Procedural characterization .....	121
3.2.2	Substantive characterization .....	122
3.2.3	Conclusion .....	122
3.3	Privileges Characterized as Procedural in Nature .....	123
3.3.1	The rules of privilege of the seat .....	124
3.3.2	The rules of privilege of the jurisdiction of the law governing the merits .....	125
3.4	Privileges Characterized as Substantive in Nature .....	126
3.4.1	The law chosen by the parties to govern the merits .....	126
3.4.1.1	<i>Dépeçage</i> .....	127
3.4.2	The law determined by the tribunal .....	128
3.4.2.1	The law applicable to the merits as determined by the tribunal .....	129
3.4.2.2	Choice of law rules or substantive law of the seat .....	129
3.4.2.3	Cumulative approach .....	130
3.5	Privileges under Both Characterizations .....	131
3.5.1	Conflict of laws approaches which have been considered in litigation .....	131
3.5.1.1	The interest analysis .....	131
3.5.1.2	The public policy of the forum approach .....	134
3.5.2	The closest connection test .....	135
3.5.2.1	<i>Dépeçage</i> and closest connection test .....	137
3.5.2.2	The connecting factors .....	137
3.5.2.3	Predictability .....	143
3.5.3	Direct application of the rules determined by the tribunal without conflicts analysis .....	145
3.5.3.1	Transnational rules .....	146

3.5.3.2	International law .....	147
3.5.4	Common principles to the different jurisdictions connected to the dispute ( <i>tronc-commun</i> ) .....	148
3.5.5	The "most favorable" privilege rule .....	150
3.5.5.1	In existing conventions and rules .....	151
3.5.5.2	Legitimate expectations and equal treatment .....	152
3.5.5.3	Limitations .....	152
3.5.5.4	Practical considerations .....	153
3.5.6	The "least favorable" privilege rule .....	153
3.5.7	Presumed intention of the parties and the law upon which the party to the communication relies on .....	154
3.5.8	Scope of privilege proportional to the scope of disclosure ..	155
3.6	Conclusion .....	156
<b>CHAPTER 4 - TRANSNATIONAL RULES, PRACTICAL CONSIDERATIONS AND PROPOSALS .....</b>		<b>157</b>
4.1	Introduction .....	157
4.2	Definition and Formation of Transnational Rules in Arbitration .....	157
4.2.1	Sources of transnational rules .....	160
4.2.2	Comparative law approach .....	163
4.3	Is the Development of Transnational Rules of Privilege Desirable in Arbitration? .....	165
4.3.1	Legitimate expectations .....	165
4.3.2	Predictability and certainty .....	165
4.3.3	Flexibility .....	167
4.3.4	Cultural aspects .....	168
4.3.5	Structured character of national legislations and rules of professional conduct .....	169
4.3.6	Equal treatment of the parties .....	169
4.3.7	Whether a tribunal will apply transnational rules .....	170
4.4	Do Transnational Rules of Privilege Currently Exist in Arbitration? .....	170
4.4.1	The attorney-client privilege and work product doctrine ....	170
4.4.1.1	National laws .....	171
4.4.1.2	International rules .....	172
4.4.1.3	International cases .....	173
4.4.1.4	The transnational rule .....	177

4.4.2	The without prejudice privilege and mediation privilege ...	180
4.4.2.1	National laws .....	180
4.4.2.2	International rules .....	181
4.4.2.3	International cases .....	184
4.4.2.4	The transnational rule .....	186
4.4.3	State secrets privilege .....	186
4.4.3.1	National laws .....	187
4.4.3.2	International rules .....	188
4.4.3.3	International cases .....	188
4.4.3.4	The transnational rule .....	191
4.5	How to Protect Allegedly Privileged Materials and Other Considerations .....	191
4.5.1	Agreement of the parties on privileges .....	191
4.5.2	<i>In camera</i> review .....	194
4.5.3	Review by a neutral third party .....	195
4.5.4	Redaction of privileged information .....	199
4.5.5	Protective orders and confidentiality undertakings .....	200
4.5.6	Adverse inferences .....	203
4.6	Conclusion .....	205
<b>CONCLUSION .....</b>		<b>207</b>
<b>Bibliography .....</b>		<b>211</b>
<b>Table of Cases .....</b>		<b>225</b>