

# SPECIALIST COURTS FOR SENTENCING ABORIGINAL OFFENDERS

**Paul Bennett**

LLM, LLB, BA (Hons) and GDLP

THE FEDERATION PRESS  
2016

# Contents

<i>Foreword by Justice Jenny Blokland</i>	v
<i>About the Author</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<b>1 Introduction</b>	1
Specialist Courts for Sentencing Aboriginal Offenders	1
Aboriginal Courts in Australia	2
What are Aboriginal Courts?	4
What is Their Significance?	5
Sources	8
Limitations of the Research	9
Terminology	10
<b>2 How Aboriginal Courts Work</b>	12
Introduction	12
The Magistrates Court	12
The Aboriginal Court: Jurisdictional Guidelines	14
Plea Guidelines	14
Locality Guidelines	15
Offence and Jurisdictional Guidelines	15
Eligibility Guidelines	16
Aboriginal Court Models	17
The Nunga Court Model	17
Circle and Conferencing Courts	20
Common Aims and Practices	25
Aboriginal Court Aims	25
Aboriginal Court Practices	28
Conclusion	31
<b>3 The Roles of the Participants</b>	33
Introduction	33
The Elders	33
The Elders and the Aboriginal Community	35
Conflict of Interest	36
The Significance of the Elders	38

Aboriginal Court Officers	38
Prosecution	40
Defence Counsel	41
The Defendant	43
The Defendant's Family	44
Victims	44
Service Providers	45
Conclusion	46
<b>4 The Decision-making Process</b>	<b>47</b>
Introduction	47
The Sentencing Process: Discussion and Decision	47
The Role of the Magistrate in the Sentencing Process	48
The Magistrate/Elders Relationship	49
The Nature of Decision-making in the Aboriginal Court	51
Is a Collaborative Approach 'Power-Sharing'?	52
Sentencing Law and Aboriginality in the Aboriginal Court	54
A Different Sentencing Approach	56
Conclusion	57
<b>5 What Do Aboriginal Courts Achieve?</b>	<b>59</b>
Introduction	59
An Overview of the Studies	59
Limitations of the Research Data	61
Some Aims Achieved	62
Aboriginal Participation and a Culturally Relevant Court	62
Better Sentencing Information	65
Attendance Rates	66
Reducing Recidivism Rates	68
Conclusion	73
<b>6 Theory and Critiques</b>	<b>76</b>
Introduction	76
Defining Features	77
Aboriginal Courts: A Distinct Type of Court	79

## CONTENTS

The Influence of Therapeutic Jurisprudence and Restorative Justice	79
Pragmatic Critiques	81
Criticisms of Guilty Plea Guidelines	81
Criticisms of Venue and Locality Guidelines	83
Aboriginal Courts: Are They a ‘Soft Option’?	84
Research on Aboriginal Court Sentencing	85
Family Violence and the Aboriginal Courts	87
Radical Critiques	92
Criticisms of a Separate Aboriginal Court: The ‘Two Laws’ Critique	92
Self-determination Critiques	94
Conclusion	96
<b>7 Conclusion</b>	<b>98</b>
Theoretical Issues	98
Aboriginal Court Structure: Formal and Informal Factors	99
The Sentencing Dialogue	100
The Decision-making Process	100
Aboriginal Court Models	101
What Do Aboriginal Courts Achieve?	101
The Significance of Aboriginal Court Sentencing	104
Conclusion	106
<i>Glossary</i>	107
<i>Appendix: Table of Aboriginal Courts – 31 July 2015</i>	111
<i>Bibliography</i>	118
<i>Index</i>	129