The Emergence of EU Criminal Law

Cybercrime and the Regulation of the Information Society

Sarah Summers
Christian Schwarzenegger
Gian Ege
and
Finlay Young

H A R T - PUBLISHING
OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2014
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Abbreviations*  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I EU Criminal Law</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II The Importance of the Information Society</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Criminalisation, Harmonisation, Europeanisation</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>I: The Development of EU Criminal Law</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I Introduction</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Substantive Criminal Law in the Third Pillar</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Criminal Law within an ‘Area of Freedom, Security and Justice’</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B The Legislative Instruments and Processes of the Third Pillar</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Third Pillar Legislative Instruments and their Legal Effect</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Law Making in the Third Pillar (PJCC)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) The Role of the ECJ in the Third Pillar</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Criminal Laws Created to Protect the Interests of the EU</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D ‘Approximation’ of the Criminal Law and its Legal Basis in the EU Treaty</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>III The Criminal Law Competence of the European Community</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Introduction</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B The Legislative Instruments and Law Making Processes of the First Pillar</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Community Laws and their Legal Effect</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) The Community Method: Law Making under the First Pillar</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) The Judicial Role in the First Pillar</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C The Development of EC Criminal Law Competence: The Position Prior to the Environmental Crime Case</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Judicial Developments concerning the Community’s Competence to Establish Penalties Prior to the Judgment in Case C-176/03 <em>Commission v Council</em></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) <em>The Obligation on Member States to Refrain from Imposing Criminal Sanctions</em></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) <em>Obligation to Impose Criminal Sanctions</em></td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Legislative Developments: Penalties Prescribed by Community Legislation</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

D  EC Legislative Competence to Determine that Certain Acts be Construed as Criminal  
   (i)  Defining Offences: The Judgment of the ECJ in the Environmental Crime Case  
   (ii) Community’s Competence to Prescribe Specific Criminal Penalties  

IV  Beyond Environmental Protection: Community Involvement in the Criminal Law  

2: EU Criminal Law after Lisbon  
I  Introduction  
II  Criminal Law Competence according to the Lisbon Treaty  
   A  The Scope of Legislative Competence  
      (i)  Criminalisation of Serious Crime with a Cross-Border Dimension  
      (ii) Criminalisation to Ensure the Effective Implementation of EU Policy  
      (iii) Other Legal Bases for Creating Criminal Law  
   B  Legislative Instruments and the Law-Making Process  
   C  Emergency Brake  
   D  Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice  

III  EU Criminal Offences: Areas of the Substantive Criminal Law Subjected to ‘Approximation’  
   A  Overview  
   B  EU Criminal Legislation within the Scope of Article 83(1) TEFU  
      (i)  Terrorism  
      (ii) Trafficking in Human Beings  
      (iii) Sexual Abuse and Exploitation of Children  
      (iv) Drug Trafficking  
      (v) Money Laundering  
      (vi) Corruption  
      (vii) Counterfeiting  
         (a) Counterfeiting in Connection with the Euro  
         (b) Fraud and Counterfeiting of Non-cash Means of Payment  
      (viii) Attacks on Information Systems  
      (ix) Organised Crime  
   C  EU Criminal Legislation Areas falling within Article 83(2)  
      (i)  Spam  
      (ii) Intellectual Property  
      (iii) Unauthorised Entry, Transit and Residence  
      (iv) Employment of Illegal Migrants  

vi
Table of Contents

(v) Environmental Crime, including Ship-Source Pollution 73
(vi) Racism and Xenophobia 74
(vii) Insider Dealing and Market Manipulation 75
D Criminal Legalisation falling under other Treaty Provisions 76
   (i) Protection of EU’s Financial Interests 76
IV EU Criminal Law and Policy after Lisbon 78

3: EU Legislation in the Field of Information and Communications Technology 85
   I Introduction 85
   II The Development of the EU Legislation concerning ICT 87
      A Improvements in Technology 87
      B Liberalisation as a Legislatively Catalyser 87
         (i) Point of Departure in the Member States 87
             (b) Commission Directive 90/388/EEC 89
         (ii) Reaction of the EU to Technological Advances 89
         (iii) Excursus: Regulation of the Television Industry 91
      C From Liberalisation to Harmonisation 93
   D Specific Areas of Relevance in the Context of the Criminal Law 95
      (i) Data Protection 95
      (ii) Protection of Minors 96
      (iii) Network Security 99
   E Indirect Impact of EU Regulation on European Criminal Law 101
      (i) General Issues 101
      (ii) Jurisdiction and European Criminal Law 101
         (a) General Rules on Jurisdiction 101
         (b) Specific Rules on Jurisdiction in relation to Criminal Offences involving the Internet 103
         (c) The Free Market Paradigm as a Contradictory Approach to Criminal Jurisdiction? 104
III Changes in EU Competence 108
IV Current State of Affairs 109
V Conclusions 112

4: Criminal Law and the Protection of Intellectual Property Rights 113
   I Intellectual Property and Copyright in the Information Society 113
      A Introduction 113
      B The Difficulties of Copyright Protection in the Digital Age 114
      C Criminal Law Enforcement of Copyright 117
   II EU Copyright Protection Measures 119
# Table of Contents

A EU Competence with regard to the Regulation of Copyright Law 120  
B Initial Developments in EU Copyright Law 121  
C Copyright in the Information Society 126  
   (i) The Green Paper on Copyright in the Information Society 126  
   (ii) The Copyright in the Information Society Directive 127  
      (a) The Development of the Directive 127  
      (b) Content of the Directive 127  
      (c) Sanctions in Respect of Infringement 129  
      (d) Implementation of the Directive 130  
D Recent Developments in EU Copyright Law concerning the Criminal Law 130  
   (i) Council Regulation (EC) No 1383/2003 130  
   (ii) Directive on the Enforcement of Intellectual Property 131  
   (iii) Proposal for a Directive on Criminal Measures 134  
   (iv) Further Activities of the Commission 136  
III Extra-European Initiatives 139  
   A The Berne Convention 139  
   B The Universal Copyright Convention 140  
   C The Rome Convention 140  
   D The TRIPS Agreement 141  
   E The WIPO Copyright Treaty (WCT) and the WIPO Performances and Phonograms Treaty (WPPT) 143  
   F The Convention on Cybercrime 144  
IV ACTA 145  
   A The Origins of ACTA 146  
   B Content 147  
   C The Criminal Law Provisions 149  
   D The Ratification Process: Protest and Collapse in the EU 151  
   E The Importance of ACTA in the EU 152  
V Conclusions 154  

5: Content Regulation and the Criminal Law 156  
   I Introduction 156  
   II The Development of Content Regulation and the Role of ICT 158  
   III Distinguishing Criminal from Lawful Content 162  
      A Criminal Content in the EU Policy Documents and Legislation 162  
      B Constitutional Constraints 163  
         (i) Freedom of Expression 163  
         (ii) Internet Freedom, Network Neutrality and Censorship 167  
      C Identifying Illegal Content 168  
   IV EU Provisions Criminalising Content 168
### Table of Contents

**A Terrorist Content**

(i) Terrorist Offences and Offences Linked to Terrorist Activities  
   (a) Terrorist Offences  
   (b) Publicly Provoking the Commission of a Terrorist Offence  
   (c) Recruiting and Training Terrorists  
(ii) Liability of ISPs  
(iii) Jurisdiction  
(iv) Implementation in the Member States

**B Child Pornography**

(i) Introduction and Definitions  
(ii) Child Pornography Offences  
   (a) The Acquisition or Possession of Child Pornography  
   (b) Knowingly Obtaining Access, by Means of Information and Communication Technology, to Child Pornography  
   (c) The Distribution, Dissemination or Transmission of Child Pornography  
   (d) Offering, Supplying or Making available Child Pornography  
   (e) The Production of Child Pornography  
(iii) Grooming and other Criminal Offences in the IT Environment  
   (a) Pornographic Performances  
   (b) Causing or Recruiting a Child to Participate in Pornographic Performances  
   (c) Knowingly Attending Pornographic Performances  
   (d) Grooming  
(iv) Liability of ISPs  
(v) Blocking Websites  
(vi) Jurisdiction  
(vii) Implementation in the Member States

**C Racist and Xenophobic Content**

(i) Introduction and Definitions  
(ii) Racist and Xenophobic Offences  
   (a) Publicly Inciting Violence or Hatred  
   (b) Publicly Inciting Violence or Hatred by Publicly Disseminating Materials  
   (c) Publicly Condoning, Denying or Grossly Trivialising Crimes of Genocide, Crimes against Humanity and War Crimes
Table of Contents

(d) Publicly Condoning, Denying or Grossly Trivialising the Crimes Defined in Article 6 of the Charter of the International Military Tribunal

(iii) Liability of ISPs 194
(iv) Jurisdiction 195
(v) Implementation in the Member States 196

V Conclusions 196

6: Criminal Law and the Safeguarding of Privacy 199

I Introduction 199

A Information Technology and Privacy 199

B The EU and Privacy 200

II Key Issues for Privacy in the Information Age 201

A Cookies 202

(i) Introduction 202
(ii) Different Types of Cookies 203
(iii) EU Regulation of Cookies 203
(iv) Uncertainties in EU Regulation 205
(v) Implementation and Effectiveness 206

B Cyberstalking 207

(i) Introduction 207
(ii) Regulation of Cyberstalking 208
(iii) The Approach of the EU 209

C Spam 210

(i) Introduction 210
(ii) The Two Regulatory Approaches to Spam 212
(iii) European Legal Framework on Spam 213

(a) First Steps 213
(b) Addressing Spam Specifically 214
(c) Other Relevant Regulations 217

(iv) Analysis of the EU’s Approach 217

(a) The Issue of Consent 218
(b) The Existing Relationship Exception 218
(c) The Legal Persons’ Exception 219
(d) Concealing Identity and Unsubscribing 220

(v) Implementation of EU Policy on Spam through the Criminal Law? 220

(a) Post-Lisbon EU Criminal Law 220
(b) What Constitutes a Criminal Measure? 222
(c) The Use of EU Criminal Law in Relation to Spam 223
(d) Ensuring Implementation of the E-Privacy Directive 223
(e) Implementation Without Harmonisation 224
# Table of Contents

(vi) The Effectiveness of EU Regulation in Combating Spam

III Conclusions

7: Cybercrime

I Introduction

II EU Criminal Law and Cybercrime

A Illegal Interference and Accessing of Computer Systems

(i) Introduction

(ii) The EU and ‘Hacking’

(iii) The 2005 Framework Decision on Attacks against Information Systems

(a) Definitions

(b) Offences

(c) Penalties

(d) Liability of Legal Persons

(e) Link with the Convention on Cybercrime

(f) Implementation of the 2005 Framework Decision

(iv) Directive on Attacks against Information Systems

B Fraud and Cybercrime

(i) Introduction

(ii) The EU Approach to Online Fraud

(a) Framework Decision on Combating Fraud

(b) Implementation

(c) Preventive Measures

(iii) Identity Theft

(a) Definition

(b) Methods

(c) Targets

(d) EU Response to Identity Theft?

(e) A Specific Offence of Identity Theft?

C Terrorism

(i) Introduction

(ii) Cyber-terrorism

(iii) The Basic EU Framework on Terrorism

(a) Council Framework Decision on Combating Terrorism

(b) EU Regulations and Cyber-terrorism

(c) Framework Decision 2008/919/JHA on Combating Terrorism

(d) Other Initiatives to Protect Critical Infrastructure

D Money Laundering in the Online Age

(i) Introduction
Table of Contents

(ii) Definition
   (a) Three-Step Process 254
   (b) Effect 255

(iii) The EU and Money Laundering 255
(iv) Cyber-laundering
   (a) How to Prevent Cyber-laundering? 257

III Harmonisation and General Principles of Criminal Law 258
   A Introduction 258
   B The Concept of Harmonisation 259
   D The Effect of Lack of Harmonisation of General Principles 261
      (i) Intention 261
      (ii) Participation 264
      (iii) Attempt 267
   E Implications of Differing Scopes of Criminalisation 269

Conclusions: Criminalisation, Harmonisation, Europeanisation 271

I Criminalisation 271
   A Extent of EU Criminal Law 271
   B The Creation of Criminal Law: Lessons from the Information Society 272

II Harmonisation 275
   A Defining Harmonisation 275
   B Reasons for Harmonisation 276
      (i) Cross-border Cooperation and the Information Society 276
      (ii) Effective Implementation of EU Policy 277
   C The End of Harmonisation? 280

III Europeanisation 283

Annex 285
Bibliography 315
Index 329