

# The Law of Energy Underground

*Understanding New Developments in Subsurface  
Production, Transmission, and Storage*

Edited by  
DONALD N. ZILLMAN,  
AILEEN McHARG,  
LILA BARRERA-HERNÁNDEZ,  
and  
ADRIAN BRADBROOK

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xxiii

1. Introduction	1
<i>Donald N. Zillman, Aileen McHarg, Lila K. Barrera-Hernández, and Adrian Bradbrook</i>	
I. Introduction	1
II. The emergence of energy underground	1
III. The challenges of the carbon economy	3
IV. Energy in the twenty-first century	4
V. Restraints on energy projects	7
VI. Predictions for the coming decades	8
VII. New developments underground	9
VIII. Unconventional oil and gas development	10
IX. Carbon capture and storage	13
X. The law of underground energy	14
XI. The internationalization of underground energy law	16
XII. The organization of this book	17

## PART I: PROPERTY RIGHTS IN UNDERGROUND RESOURCES

2. The Common Law of Subsurface Activity: General Principle and Current Problems	21
<i>Barry Barton</i>	
I. Introduction	21
II. Rights of ownership of land extend downwards	22
III. Doubt about the general principle	24
IV. Subsurface activity as trespass: <i>Bocardo v Star Energy</i>	25
V. Property rights in minerals	27
VI. Mine workings and pore space	30
VII. The reservation of minerals to the state in common law countries	34
VIII. Conclusion	36
3. The Common Law of Underground Energy Resources in the United States	37
<i>Terence Daintith</i>	
I. Introduction	37
II. Private mineral ownership: the accession principle	39

III. Severance of the mineral estate	42
IV. The rule of capture and the special problem of oil and gas ownership	45
V. How new (and newish) technology challenges the common law	49
VI. Conclusion	57
4. Civil Law Treatment of the Subsurface in Latin American Countries <i>José Juan González</i>	59
I. Introduction	59
II. Civil law legal tradition	59
III. Subsurface property in civil law	61
IV. Current Latin American law on subsurface rights	69
V. The <i>cujus est solum</i> maxim and unconventional uses of the subsurface in Latin American legal regimes	72
VI. Conclusion	74
5. Roman-Dutch Law, Custodianship, and the African Subsurface: The South African and Namibian Experiences <i>Hanri Mostert and Meyer van den Berg</i>	75
I. Introduction	75
II. Historical context	76
III. The different faces of resource regulation in South Africa and Namibia	83
IV. Implications of the divergence and convergence of subsurface regulation in South Africa and Namibia	91
V. Conclusion	97
PART II: THE INTERNATIONAL LAW TREATMENT OF SUBSURFACE RESOURCES	
6. Energy Underground: What's International Law Got to Do With It? <i>Catherine Redgwell and Lavanya Rajamani</i>	101
I. Introduction	101
II. Distinctive international law features of (new) energy underground	102
III. Conclusion	122
PART III: GOVERNING UNCONVENTIONAL OIL AND GAS EXTRACTION	
7. Regulating Multistage Hydraulic Fracturing: Challenges in a Mature Oil and Gas Jurisdiction <i>Alastair R. Lucas, Theresa Watson, and Eric Kimmel</i>	127
I. Introduction	127
II. Hydraulic fracturing technology	128
III. Alberta's early experience regulating unconventional resources	131

IV. The societal role of the regulator; risk and intervention strategies	132
V. Regulatory interventions for unconventional resource development	134
VI. Public engagement and change	142
VII. Conclusion	145
8. Emerging Regulatory Frameworks for Hydraulic Fracturing and Shale Gas Development in the United States	147
<i>LeRoy C. Paddock and Jessica Anne Wentz</i>	
I. Introduction	147
II. Shale gas development in the United States	148
III. Federal regulation of hydraulic fracturing	154
IV. State regulation of hydraulic fracturing	161
V. Analysis of differing approaches to critical regulatory issues	165
VI. Conclusion	180
9. Sleeping with the Enemy: The Legal Landscape of Unconventional Gas Development in Argentina	183
<i>Lila K. Barrera-Hernández</i>	
I. Introduction	183
II. Energy is politics	183
III. The money trail: nationalization of Yacimientos Petrolíferos Fiscales	185
IV. A spanner in the works: Decree 1,277 and Law 20,680 on domestic supply of goods and services	187
V. Federalism, environment, water, and the public	191
VI. More disquieting news	198
VII. Conclusions	198
10. Japan's Undersea Mineral Resources and Its New Mining Act	201
<i>Kazuhiro Nakatani</i>	
I. Introduction	201
II. Japan's rich undersea mineral resources	201
III. Japan's Mining Act of 1950	204
IV. Japan's New Mining Act of 2011	204
V. Some observations on the New Act	207
VI. Japan's future energy and mineral policies and the importance of undersea mineral resources	209
11. Evolution of Algeria's Legal and Regulatory Framework for Unconventional (Shale) Hydrocarbon Development with Emphasis on Environmental Aspects	211
<i>Mohammed Abdelwahab Bekhechi</i>	
I. Introduction	211
II. Algeria's legal and regulatory framework for the hydrocarbon sector: an overview	213

III. Unconventional hydrocarbon exploration and production in Algeria	217
IV. Algeria's environmental law and hydrocarbon sector development	219
V. Concluding remarks	229
12. Regulation of Unconventional Reservoirs in Colombia <i>Milton Fernando Montoya Pardo</i>	231
I. Introduction	231
II. Importance of the hydrocarbon industry	231
III. Institutional and legal framework	233
IV. Unconventional hydrocarbon potential in Colombia	239
V. Ongoing projects	240
VI. Environmental concerns	243
VII. Conclusion	244
 PART IV: ADDRESSING ENVIRONMENTAL AND SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES UNDERGROUND 	
13. Risk, Regulation, and Carbon Capture and Storage: The United Kingdom Experience <i>Aileen McHarg and Mark Poustie</i>	249
I. Introduction	249
II. CCS and UK energy policy	251
III. Risk, regulation, and CCS	253
IV. The United Kingdom regulatory framework: regulating for CCS	258
V. The United Kingdom regulatory framework: regulation of CCS	266
VI. Evaluation and conclusions	273
14. Carbon Capture and Storage Development in China <i>Wang Mingyuan and Jin Feng</i>	275
I. Introduction	275
II. The significance of CCS development in China	275
III. Present CCS development in China	279
IV. Difficulties and issues	284
V. The National Five-Year Specific Plan	287
VI. Essential steps for the next stage of CCS in China	289
15. Dynamic Regulation and Technological Competition: A New Legal Approach to Carbon Capture and Storage <i>Lital Helman, Gideon Parchomovsky, and Endre Stavang</i>	295
I. Introduction	295
II. Theoretical foundations	296
III. Framework applications	299
IV. Conclusion	307

16. New Advances in Geothermal Energy Law: A Comparative Analysis <i>Adrian Bradbrook and Anita Rønne</i>	309
I. Introduction and overview	309
II. New legal responses in common law countries to developing geothermal energy	311
III. New European responses to developing geothermal energy	318
IV. Conclusion	329
17. Siting Nuclear Waste Repositories <i>Donald N. Zillman</i>	333
I. Introduction	333
II. The nuclear risks	335
III. Nuclear law	338
IV. Locating permanent nuclear waste repositories	339
V. Future directions	357
18. Electricity Undergrounding in Russia: The Case for Underground Substations <i>Sergey Seliverstov</i>	361
I. Introduction	361
II. Economic and technical background	362
III. Electricity sector development and investment programmes	362
IV. The law on Skolkovo: exemptions from land and urban planning regulations	365
V. The line between land law and subsoil regulations	367
VI. Financing of the development projects	369
VII. Conclusion	369

PART V: RESOLVING UNDERGROUND RESOURCE  
CONFLICTS AROUND THE WORLD

19. New Uses of the Underground in the Netherlands: How to Manage a Crowded Subsoil? <i>Martha Roggenkamp and Danielle Hanema</i>	373
I. Introduction	373
II. The law regulating the use of the subsoil: Mining Acts	374
III. Subsoil storage	376
IV. Geothermal heat	384
V. Shale gas	388
VI. Subsoil planning	393
VII. Conclusion	396

20. German Legal Responses to New Subsurface Technologies	399
<i>Gunther Kühne</i>	
I. The German 'Energiewende' (energy switch) and underground technologies	399
II. Subsurface technologies from energy and environmental perspectives	399
III. Conceptual basis for implementing new subsurface technologies under German private and public law	402
IV. Unconventional gas and hydraulic fracturing ('fracking')	404
V. Geothermal energy	408
VI. Carbon capture and storage (CCS)	411
VII. Conflicts between subsurface uses	413
VIII. Conclusions	415
21. Australian Responses to Subsurface Conflicts: Greenhouse Gas Storage v Petroleum	419
<i>Michael Crommelin</i>	
I. Introduction	419
II. The historical context	419
III. The constitutional context	424
IV. Multiple resource regimes	426
V. Petroleum regimes	427
VI. Greenhouse gas storage regimes	429
VII. Competition, choice, and coordination	430
VIII. Conclusion	432
22. Disputes Between the Owners of Different Subsurface Resources	433
<i>Nigel Bankes</i>	
I. Introduction	433
II. Types of disputes that may arise	435
III. Some strategies to lessen or resolve disputes between different owners	441
IV. Conclusions	450
23. Spain's Approach to New Technologies: From Underground Structures to Carbon Dioxide Storage	451
<i>Íñigo del Guayo and José Alenza</i>	
I. Introduction	451
II. Public Domain and <i>dominio público</i>	453
III. Constitutional provisions relating to the Public Domain and its application to underground structures for the storage of CO <sub>2</sub>	454
IV. Spanish mining law	456
V. The storage of CO <sub>2</sub> and Public Domain	457
VI. Authorizations and concessions	460
VII. Authorizations for the use of underground storage in accordance with the Mining Act 1973	461

VIII. Concession for the storage of natural gas in an underground storage	461
IX. Research permits and concessions for the underground storage of CO <sub>2</sub>	463
X. Concluding remarks	464
24. Energy Underground and Water Sustainability: African Strategies for a Changing Environment <i>Yinka Omorogbe</i>	469
I. Introduction	469
II. Energy in Africa	470
III. Underground energy	473
IV. Water resources in the developing world	477
V. Water vs energy: reconciling tensions	483
VI. Legal frameworks for the regulation of water resources	484
VII. Needed: a strategic approach	487
25. Conclusion <i>Donald N. Zillman, Aileen McHarg, Lila K. Barrera-Hernández, and Adrian Bradbrook</i>	491
I. Introduction	491
II. Property rights in underground resources	492
III. The international law treatment of subsurface resources	495
IV. Unconventional oil and gas extraction	496
V. Renewable and sustainable underground uses	500
VI. What happens next?	503
VII. The role of law	505
<i>Index</i>	511