

# FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

From International and Criminal  
to Alternative Forms of Justice

*Edited by*

Martha Albertson FINEMAN  
Estelle ZINSSTAG



intersentia

Cambridge - Antwerp - Portland

# CONTENTS

*Acknowledgments* .....vii

## **Introduction: Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice**

Martha Albertson FINEMAN and Estelle ZINSSTAG ..... 1

### **PART 1**

#### **FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES IN CONTEXTS**

**Introduction** ..... 9

#### **Chapter 1**

##### **International Law and Domestic Gender Justice, or Why Case Studies Matter**

Catherine O'ROURKE ..... 11

1. Introduction ..... 11
2. Feminist critiques of international criminal law ..... 13
  - 2.1. ICL as legally deficient. .... 15
  - 2.2. ICL as sexualising and infantilising women ..... 17
  - 2.3. ICL as silencing individual women and more radical feminist critiques ..... 19
  - 2.4. Feminist engagement with ICL as hegemonic and imperialist. .... 20
3. A 'Boomerang Pattern'? ..... 22
4. International law, local gender justice? The case of Chile ..... 25
  - 4.1. Women, gender and transitional justice in a pacted transition .... 25
  - 4.2. ICL as legally deficient. .... 30
    - 4.2.1. Truth, phase 1, the Chilean National Truth and Reconciliation Commission ..... 30
    - 4.2.2. Truth, phase 2, the National Commission on Political Imprisonment and Torture. .... 32
  - 4.3. ICL as sexualising and infantilising women ..... 33
    - 4.3.1. Sexual violence as women's exclusive experience of conflict and repression, obscuring other harms suffered by women, such as socioeconomic harms or the loss of a family member. .... 33

4.3.2.	Focus on sexual violence establishing exclusionary categories of ‘ideal’ female victimhood that reinforce the restrictive regulation of female sexuality. . . . .	34
4.3.3.	Focus on women’s sexual victimhood marginalising women as agents of political change. . . . .	36
4.4.	ICL as silencing individual women victims and more radical feminist critiques . . . . .	37
4.4.1.	Silencing of individual women victims . . . . .	37
4.4.2.	Engagement with international criminal law as silencing more radical feminist critique . . . . .	38
4.5.	Feminist engagement with ICL as hegemonic and imperialist. . . . .	38
4.5.1.	The hazards of governance feminism . . . . .	38
4.5.2.	Feminism and the imperialist mission of international law . . . . .	40
5.	Conclusion . . . . .	41

## Chapter 2

### Advancing a Feminist Analysis of Transitional Justice

	Fionnuala NÍ AOLÁIN . . . . .	43
1.	A brief history of presence and engagement . . . . .	45
2.	The limits of law. . . . .	53
3.	Conclusion . . . . .	61

## Chapter 3

### Feminist Perspectives on Extraordinary Justice

	David C. GRAY and Benjamin A. LEVIN. . . . .	63
1.	The moral meaning of violence . . . . .	68
2.	Intersectional identity and dynamic stability . . . . .	72
3.	Women and extraordinary justice . . . . .	76
4.	Women at the nexus . . . . .	84
5.	Conclusion . . . . .	87

## Chapter 4

### Intersectionality: A Feminist Theory for Transitional Justice

	Eilish ROONEY. . . . .	89
1.	Introduction . . . . .	90
2.	Travelling modalities. . . . .	95
3.	Awkward absences. . . . .	97
4.	Negotiating presence. . . . .	103
5.	Intersecting transitions. . . . .	108
6.	Conclusion . . . . .	112

## PART 2

## FEMINIST LEGAL STRATEGIES AND THEIR CONSEQUENCES

<b>Introduction</b> .....	117
<b>Chapter 5</b>	
<b>International Law, Crisis and Feminist Time</b>	
Mary H. HANSEL .....	119
1. Introduction .....	120
2. The crisis model of international law and humanitarian intervention .....	121
2.1. The nature of the crisis model .....	122
2.2. The NATO intervention in Kosovo .....	123
2.3. Conclusion .....	124
3. The marginalization of women under the crisis model .....	124
3.1. White male heroism in the crisis model .....	124
3.1.1. The centrality of the hero's rescue .....	125
3.1.2. The presumed benevolence of the hero .....	126
3.2. The crisis model's effects on women in targeted states .....	128
3.2.1. Obscuring the 'international law of everyday life' .....	128
3.2.2. Neglecting hardships endured during crisis .....	129
3.2.3. Failures to consider women in the aftermath .....	129
3.2.4. Conclusion .....	130
4. The crisis model's temporal underpinnings .....	130
4.1. 'Emergency time' governing the crisis model .....	131
4.2. Developing a broader temporal view .....	133
4.3. Conclusion .....	134
5. Feminist temporal approaches to inform international law .....	134
5.1. Predominant strains of feminist temporality and applications to the crisis model .....	135
5.1.1. Time as regression .....	135
5.1.2. Time as redemption .....	137
5.1.3. Time as rupture .....	138
5.1.4. Time as repetition .....	140
5.2. Conclusion .....	142
6. Conclusion .....	142

**Chapter 6**

**Justice as Practised by Victims of Conflict: Post-World War II**

**Movements as Sites of Engagement and Knowledge**

CHEAH Wui Ling .....	145
1. Introduction .....	145
2. The response of international law to conflict-related harms: Evolving approaches .....	148
2.1. International humanitarian law and international criminal law..	148
2.2. International human rights law.....	150
2.3. The 2005 UN Basic Principles .....	151
3. The rise and development of post-World War II movements.....	153
3.1. The Japanese American redress movement.....	154
3.2. The Hibakusha movement and the global anti-nuclear movement .....	157
3.3. The ‘comfort women’ movement.....	160
4. Justice as conceptualised by post-World War II movements: Recognition and atonement.....	163
4.1. Recognising the suffering and rights of victims.....	164
4.2. The atonement of wrongdoers .....	166
5. Conclusion: Learning from victims and justice as practised .....	168

**Chapter 7**

**The Symbolic and Communicative Function of International Criminal  
Tribunals**

Teresa Godwin PHELPS .....	171
1. The early ICTR and ICTY trials .....	175
2. Later ICTY and ICTR trials.....	180
3. The Special Court for Sierra Leone .....	181

**PART 3**

**EMERGING ALTERNATIVES WITHIN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE**

<b>Introduction</b> .....	187
---------------------------	-----

**Chapter 8**

**Sexual Violence Against Women in Armed Conflicts and Restorative  
Justice: An Exploratory Analysis**

Estelle ZINSSTAG.....	189
1. Introduction .....	189
2. Sexual violence against women in armed conflicts .....	191

3.	Restorative justice and sexual violence .....	197
4.	The Sierra Leone Truth Commission: A case study .....	205
5.	Some points of discussion .....	208
6.	Conclusion .....	212

## Chapter 9

### Greensboro and Beyond: Remediating the Structural Sexism in Truth and Reconciliation Processes and Determining the Potential Impact and Benefits of Truth Processes in the United States

	Peggy MAISEL .....	215
1.	Introduction .....	215
2.	Feminist critique of human rights and TRC processes .....	218
3.	The South African TRC .....	223
	3.1. Brief history of the development of the TRC .....	224
	3.2. A 'gender-neutral' TRC .....	225
	3.3. Comparison to other TRC processes .....	232
4.	Greensboro .....	234
	4.1. Establishing the Greensboro TRC .....	236
	4.2. The Greensboro mandate .....	238
	4.3. The Commission process .....	240
	4.4. The final report, recommendations, and impact in Greensboro ..	244
5.	Beyond Greensboro .....	247
6.	Conclusion .....	253

## Chapter 10

### Exclusion of Women in Post-Conflict Peace Processes: Transitional Justice in Northern Uganda

	Joseph WASONGA .....	255
1.	Introduction .....	255
2.	Historical perspective of the conflict in northern Uganda .....	256
3.	Transitional justice initiatives .....	260
4.	Place of women in transitional justice in northern Uganda .....	268
5.	Conclusion .....	273

## Chapter 11

### Shifting Paradigms for State Intervention: Gender-Based Violence in Cuba

	Deborah M. WEISSMAN .....	275
1.	Introduction .....	275
2.	Cuba in the international: Human rights as political opportunity structures .....	276

3.	Objective and subjective elements of gender equality as framework ...	278
4.	Specific approaches to domestic violence. ....	280
4.1.	Definitions and determinants .....	280
4.2.	Cuban responses to domestic violence. ....	281
4.2.1.	Research and policy initiatives. ....	282
4.2.2.	Controlling domestic violence through participatory mechanisms. ....	283
4.3.	Legal responses. ....	284
5.	Conclusion .....	286

PART 4

CASE STUDIES

<b>Introduction</b> .....	291
---------------------------	-----

**Chapter 12**

**Beauty and the Beast: Gender Integration and the Police in Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina**

Lisa R. MUFTIĆ and Azra RAŠIĆ .....	293
-------------------------------------	-----

1.	Introduction .....	293
2.	Police reformation in Bosnia .....	294
3.	Gender integration as part of the police reformation process .....	295
3.1.	Recruitment and training .....	296
3.2.	Promotion .....	296
3.3.	Working conditions. ....	297
3.4.	Maternity leave .....	297
3.5.	Police misconduct .....	298
4.	Research questions. ....	298
5.	Methods. ....	299
6.	Female Bosnian national police officers. ....	300
7.	Conclusion .....	306
8.	Limitations & future studies .....	308

**Chapter 13**

**The Parallel Processes of Law and Social Change: Gender Violence and Work in the United States and South Africa**

Julie GOLDSCHIED. ....	311
------------------------	-----

1.	Introduction .....	311
2.	Context .....	312
2.1.	Prevalence of abuse .....	312
2.2.	Women's labor market participation .....	314

3.	Reform efforts and critiques.....	316
4.	Gender violence and work .....	320
5.	South Africa’s potential for legal responses.....	324
6.	Implications for reform.....	326
6.1.	Limits of litigation and employment law responses.....	326
6.2.	Challenges of implementation, enforcement and training .....	327
6.3.	Gender violence in a socio-political context .....	328
6.4.	Broad-based commitments and difficult conversations .....	329
7.	Conclusion .....	331

**Chapter 14**

**Neoliberalism’s Impact on Women: A Case Study in Creating Supply and Demand for Human Trafficking**

	Dina Francesca HAYNES .....	333
1.	Arizona market in context.....	334
1.1.	Post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina .....	335
1.2.	The first myth: achieving ethnic harmony through market forces .....	336
1.3.	Human trafficking at Arizona market .....	339
1.4.	The second myth: the actors on the ground during war should also be making economic development decisions.....	342
1.5.	Politico-socio-economic engineering: the story of Brčko and its relationship to Arizona market .....	344
2.	The impact of neoliberalism’s market liberalization practices on women .....	348
3.	Conclusion .....	353
	<i>About the Authors</i> .....	357