

**CRIMINAL JUSTICE REFORM IN RUSSIA,
UKRAINE, AND THE FORMER REPUBLICS
OF THE SOVIET UNION**

Trial by Jury and Mixed Courts

Nikolai Kovalev

With a Preface by
Stephen C. Thaman

The Edwin Mellen Press
Lewiston•Queenston•Lampeter

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE BY STEPHEN C. THAMAN	X
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	XV
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS.....	XVI
INTRODUCTION.....	1
PART ONE: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE STUDY OF LAY ADJUDICATION IN POST-SOVIET STATES	13
CHAPTER 1: METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH.....	15
1.1. INTRODUCTION	15
1.2. PREVIOUS COMPARATIVE RESEARCH ON LAY ADJUDICATION SYSTEMS.....	15
1.3. METHODS OF RESEARCH	20
1.3.1. <i>Selecting the Research Design</i>	20
1.3.2. <i>Comparative Legal Method</i>	22
1.3.3. <i>Questionnaire Surveys</i>	26
A. The Belarusian and Uzbekistani Survey.....	28
B. The Russian Survey	30
C. The Kazakhstani Survey.....	36
1.3.4. <i>Review of Court Transcripts at the Moscow City Court</i>	36
1.4. CONCLUSION	38
CHAPTER 2: MODELS OF LAY ADJUDICATION.....	39
2.1. INTRODUCTION	39
2.2. TYPOLOGIES OF LAY ADJUDICATION SYSTEMS	40
2.3. THE JURY MODEL.....	47
2.3.1. <i>Differences between Common Law and Civil Law Juries</i>	54
2.4. THE COLLABORATIVE OR MIXED COURT MODEL.....	57
2.4.1. <i>The Classical Collaborative or Mixed Court</i>	59
2.4.2. <i>The Advanced Mixed or Collaborative Court</i>	65
2.4.3. <i>The Professional Court with the Involvement of Lay Assessors</i>	67
2.5. THE JUSTICE OF THE PEACE OR LAY MAGISTRATE MODEL	69
2.6. CONCLUSION	72

CHAPTER 3: THE HISTORY OF LAY ADJUDICATION IN POST-SOVIET STATES.....	75
3.1. INTRODUCTION.....	75
3.2. LAY ADJUDICATION IN CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEMS OF THE POST-SOVIET STATES BEFORE THE 1860S.....	78
3.2.1. <i>Russian Princedoms in the 10th-13th centuries</i>	78
3.2.2. <i>Lay Participation in the Grand Duchy of Moscow</i>	80
3.2.3. <i>Lay Participation in the Russian Empire on the Eve of the Great Reforms of the 1860s</i>	82
3.2.4. <i>Ukraine</i>	84
3.2.5. <i>Moldova</i>	84
3.2.6. <i>Georgia and Armenia</i>	85
3.2.7. <i>North Caucasus</i>	86
3.2.8. <i>Central Asia</i>	87
3.3. JUDICIAL REFORMS OF THE 1860S.....	88
3.3.1. <i>The Great Liberation and Judicial Reform</i>	88
3.3.2. <i>The Fundamental Principles of the Judicial Reform of the 1860s</i>	90
3.3.3. <i>Separation of Judicial Power</i>	91
3.3.4. <i>The Principle of Oral Proceedings</i>	91
3.3.5. <i>The Justices of the Peace</i>	93
3.3.6. <i>The Bar or "Sworn Attorneys"</i>	95
3.3.7. <i>The Trial by Jury (sud prisiazhnykh)</i>	97
A. Selection Procedure and Qualifications of Jurors.....	100
B. Jurisdiction of the Jury.....	101
C. Criminal Procedure in Trials by Jury.....	101
3.3.8. <i>Class Representatives</i>	104
3.3.9. <i>Other Forms of Lay Participation in the Russian Empire</i>	106
3.4. ROLE OF LAY ADJUDICATION IN VIEWS OF RUSSIAN POLITICAL PARTIES IN THE BEGINNING OF THE 20 TH CENTURY.....	107
3.5. LAY ADJUDICATION REFORMS OF THE PROVISIONAL GOVERNMENT IN 1917 AND NATIONAL GOVERNMENTS BETWEEN 1917 AND EARLY 1920S.....	111
3.5.1. <i>The Judicial Reform of the Provisional Government</i>	111
A. Reorganisation of the Local Courts with Justices of the Peace.....	112
B. Restoration of the Jury System.....	113
C. Reform of Military Courts.....	114
3.5.2. <i>Judicial Reforms of the National Governments</i>	116
3.6. THE SOVIET MODEL OF LAY ADJUDICATION.....	118
3.6.1. <i>The Development of the Soviet Criminal Justice System</i>	118
3.6.2. <i>The Soviet Model of Lay Adjudication</i>	121
3.6.3. <i>Proposals for lay adjudication reform</i>	127

3.7.	CONCLUSION	130
CHAPTER 4: DEFECTS OF THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEMS IN THE POST-SOVIET STATES AND THE POTENTIAL ROLE OF LAY ADJUDICATION IN RE-SHAPING CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEMS		133
4.1.	INTRODUCTION	133
4.2.	COMMON DEFECTS OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEMS IN THE POST-SOVIET STATES	134
4.2.1.	<i>Lack of Judicial Independence</i>	134
4.2.2.	<i>Accusatorial Bias and Violation of the Principle of Equality of Arms</i>	145
4.2.3.	<i>Widespread Corruption</i>	152
4.2.4.	<i>Low Quality of the Pre-trial Investigation, Ill-treatment by the Police and Fabrication of Evidence</i>	154
4.2.5.	<i>Lack of Public Confidence in Courts and Law Enforcement Agencies</i>	158
4.3.	POTENTIAL ROLE OF LAY ADJUDICATION IN RE-SHAPING THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEMS OF THE POST-SOVIET COUNTRIES	160
4.3.1.	<i>Lay Adjudication Can Ensure the Independence of the Tribunal</i>	161
4.3.2.	<i>Lay Adjudication Can Help to Ensure Principles of Adversary Procedure, Impartiality of the Tribunal and Presumption of Innocence</i>	170
4.3.3.	<i>Lay Adjudication Can Halt the Spread of Corruption in the Judicial System</i>	177
4.3.4.	<i>Lay Adjudication Can Improve the Quality of Pre-trial Investigation and Prosecution</i>	179
4.3.5.	<i>Lay Adjudication Can Help to Develop Public Confidence in the Courts and the Legal System</i>	182
4.4.	CONCLUSION	186
CHAPTER 5: CONDITIONS FOR EFFECTIVE LAY ADJUDICATION REFORMS IN POST-SOVIET STATES		189
5.1.	INTRODUCTION	189
5.2.	HOMOGENEITY OF SOCIETY	190
5.3.	INTRINSIC QUALITIES OF SOCIETY	204
5.4.	AGREEMENT OF LAY ADJUDICATORS WITH BASIC LAWS	207
5.5.	SUPPORT BY SOCIETY	212
5.6.	ABILITY TO AFFORD THE COSTS OF LAY ADJUDICATION	217
5.7.	SUPPORT BY THE LEGAL COMMUNITY	222
5.8.	WILL OF GOVERNMENT	242
A.	Armenia	244

B.	Azerbaijan.....	24 ¹
C.	Belarus.....	24 ¹
D.	Georgia.....	24 ¹
E.	Kazakhstan.....	24 ¹
F.	Kyrgyzstan.....	24 ¹
G.	Russia.....	25 ¹
H.	Ukraine.....	25 ¹
5.9.	ROLE OF INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS.....	25 ¹
5.10.	CONCLUSION.....	26 ¹
PART TWO: PRACTICAL ASPECTS OF LAY ADJUDICATION REFORMS IN POST-SOVIET STATES.....		26 ¹
CHAPTER 6: THE SCOPE OF LAY ADJUDICATION.....		26 ¹
6.1.	INTRODUCTION.....	26 ¹
6.2.	THE PURPOSE OF LAY ADJUDICATORS IN THE POST-SOVIET COUNTRIES: THE PARTICIPATORY RIGHT OF PEOPLE OR RIGHT OF THE DEFENDANT.....	26 ¹
6.3.	PROCEDURE FOR APPLICATION FOR TRIAL WITH THE PARTICIPATION OF LAY ADJUDICATORS.....	27 ¹
6.4.	SUBJECT JURISDICTION OF THE COURT WITH PARTICIPATION OF THE LAY ADJUDICATORS.....	28 ¹
6.5.	THE TERRITORIAL JURISDICTION OF COURTS WITH THE PARTICIPATION OF LAY ADJUDICATORS.....	28 ¹
6.6.	CONCLUSION.....	29 ¹
CHAPTER 7: SELECTION OF LAY ADJUDICATORS.....		29 ¹
7.1.	INTRODUCTION.....	29 ¹
7.2.	ELIGIBILITY FOR LAY ADJUDICATION SERVICE.....	29 ¹
7.2.1.	<i>Minimum Age</i>	29 ¹
7.2.2.	<i>Criminal Record as a Ground for Disqualification</i>	29 ¹
7.2.3.	<i>Knowledge of the Official Language</i>	29 ¹
7.2.4.	<i>Disqualification and Exclusion of Judges, Prosecutors and Other Officials Involved in the Administration of Criminal Justice</i>	30 ¹
7.2.5.	<i>Educational, Income and Other Qualifications</i>	30 ¹
7.2.6.	<i>Repeated Participation in Lay Adjudication</i>	30 ¹
7.3.	PRE-TRIAL SELECTION OF CANDIDATES FOR LAY ADJUDICATION SERVICE.....	31 ¹
7.3.4.	<i>Methods of Selection</i>	31 ¹
7.3.5.	<i>Publicity of the Selection Procedure</i>	31 ¹
7.3.6.	<i>Accountability of the Selection Body</i>	31 ¹

7.4.	SELECTION OF JURORS AND LAY ASSESSORS IN COURT	318
7.4.1.	<i>Summoning for Jury and Lay Assessors Service</i>	319
7.4.2.	<i>Excusals from Jury or Lay Assessor's Service</i>	321
7.4.3.	<i>Voir Dire Procedure</i>	326
7.4.4.	<i>Peremptory Challenges</i>	329
7.4.5.	<i>Challenge to the Entire Jury</i>	344
7.5.	SELECTION OF RACIALLY, ETHNICALLY AND LINGUISTICALLY MIXED LAY ADJUDICATORS	349
7.6.	CONCLUSION	352
CHAPTER 8: TRIAL PROCEDURE IN COURTS WITH LAY ADJUDICATION.....		355
8.1.	INTRODUCTION.....	355
8.2.	PRINCIPLES OF ADVERSARY PROCEDURE AND EQUALITY OF ARMS IN TRIALS WITH LAY ADJUDICATION	357
8.2.1.	<i>Right of the Opening Speech</i>	358
8.2.2.	<i>Alternative Expert Evidence</i>	360
8.2.3.	<i>The Right of the Defence to Cross-examine Witnesses for the Prosecution and Present Depositions of Witnesses for the Defence</i>	363
8.2.4.	<i>Domination and Judicial Prejudice During Examination of Witnesses</i>	366
8.3.	RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF LAY ADJUDICATORS DURING THE TRIAL.....	369
8.3.1.	<i>Powers of Judges and Lay Adjudicators During the Trial</i>	369
8.3.2.	<i>Questioning of Witnesses by Lay Adjudicators</i>	372
8.4.	EVIDENTIAL RULES	378
8.4.1.	<i>Admissibility of Evidence</i>	378
A.	Confessions.....	382
B.	Evidence of Character	386
C.	Hearsay Evidence	393
8.4.2.	<i>Standard of Proof</i>	397
8.5.	INSTRUCTIONS TO THE JURY OR LAY ASSESSORS	407
8.5.1.	<i>Instructions in the Open Court or in the Deliberation Room</i>	407
8.5.2.	<i>Content of Judicial Instructions</i>	412
A.	Direction on Criminal Charges and Applicable Criminal Law	413
B.	Recapitulation of Evidence and Positions of Parties	417
C.	Direction on Rules of Evidence and Model Instructions.....	421
8.6.	CONCLUSION	422
CHAPTER 9: DELIBERATIONS, THE VERDICT AND APPELLATE REVIEW.....		425
9.1.	INTRODUCTION	425

9.2.	DELIBERATIONS OF THE COURT	4
9.2.1.	<i>Chairmanship in Deliberations: the Foreperson Versus the Presiding Judge</i>	4
9.2.2.	<i>Principles of the Deliberative Process</i>	4
A.	Duty and Capacity to Deliberate	4
B.	Privacy and Confidentiality of the Deliberation Room	4
C.	Sobriety of Adjudicators During Deliberations	4
D.	Length of Deliberation	4
9.3.	THE VERDICT	4
9.3.1.	<i>Forms of Verdict: General Versus Special Verdict</i>	4
9.3.2.	<i>Unanimity Versus Majority Rule</i>	4
9.3.3.	<i>Voting Procedure: Open Ballot Versus Secret Ballot</i>	4
9.4.	PARTICIPATION OF LAY ADJUDICATORS IN SENTENCING	4
9.5.	APPELLATE REVIEW OF CRIMINAL CASES DECIDED WITH PARTICIPATION OF LAY ADJUDICATORS	5
9.5.1.	<i>Right to Appeal</i>	5
9.5.2.	<i>Grounds for Appeal and Quashing the Verdict</i>	5
9.6.	CONCLUSION	5
	CONCLUSION	5
	APPENDICES	5
	APPENDIX 1. DATA RETURN FORM FOR THE PROJECT "LAY ADJUDICATION IN CRIMINAL PROCEDURE OF COUNCIL OF EUROPE MEMBERS"	5
	APPENDIX 2. QUESTIONNAIRE FOR BELARUSSIAN AND UZBEKISTANI ADVOCATES	5
	APPENDIX 3. RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF BELARUSSIAN AND UZBEKISTANI ADVOCATES	5
	APPENDIX 4: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR RUSSIAN JUDGES	5
	APPENDIX 5: RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF RUSSIAN JUDGES	5
	APPENDIX 6. QUESTIONNAIRE FOR RUSSIAN ADVOCATES	5
	APPENDIX 7: RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF RUSSIAN ADVOCATES	5
	APPENDIX 8. QUESTIONNAIRE FOR RUSSIAN PROSECUTORS	5

APPENDIX 9: RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF RUSSIAN PROSECUTORS.....	558
APPENDIX 10: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR KAZAKHSTANI ADVOCATES	561
APPENDIX 11. SUMMARY OF JURY TRIAL TRANSCRIPTS REVIEWED IN MOSCOW CITY COURT IN 2004.....	565
BIBLIOGRAPHY	569
TABLE OF CASES.....	618
TABLE OF LEGISLATION.....	624
TABLE OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS DOCUMENTS	636
INDEX.....	637