

COLLECTIVE VIOLENCE  
AND INTERNATIONAL  
CRIMINAL JUSTICE

An interdisciplinary approach

*Edited by*

Alette SMEULERS



intersentia

Antwerp – Oxford – Portland

# CONTENTS

*Acknowledgements* . . . . . v

## INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1. Collective violence and international criminal justice –  
towards an interdisciplinary approach  
    Alette SMEULERS . . . . . 3

1. Introduction . . . . . 3  
2. A brief history of the international criminal justice system . . . . . 3  
3. New areas of expertise . . . . . 6  
4. Outline of the book . . . . . 8  
References . . . . . 13

## PART I.

### PERPETRATORS OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMES

Chapter 2. The ordinariness of extraordinary evil: the making of  
perpetrators of collective violence  
    James E. WALLER . . . . . 19

1. Introduction . . . . . 19  
2. Ordinary origins of extraordinary human evil . . . . . 22  
3. Cultural construction of worldview . . . . . 26  
4. Psychological construction of the “other” . . . . . 28  
5. Social construction of cruelty . . . . . 31  
6. Conclusion . . . . . 36  
References . . . . . 37

Chapter 3. Rethinking the subjectivity of perpetrators of political violence  
    Don FOSTER . . . . . 39

1. Introduction . . . . . 39  
2. Dominant accounts of perpetrators . . . . . 40  
3. Criticism of the dominant accounts . . . . . 42  
4. An alternative approach . . . . . 44

5. Two case studies . . . . .	48
5.1. The Eichmann case . . . . .	48
5.2. The case of John Deegan . . . . .	54
6. Implications and concluding remarks . . . . .	58
References . . . . .	60

PART II.

COLLECTIVE CRIMES – INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITY

Chapter 4. Discourses on international criminality

Athanasios CHOULIARAS . . . . .	65
1. Introduction . . . . .	65
2. The collective nature of core crimes as the common ground of different fields of knowledge . . . . .	67
3. Criminology: state and state-corporate crime as instances of organizational deviance . . . . .	70
4. International criminal law: looking for the individual criminal, losing the delinquent state . . . . .	77
4.1. Contextual elements and admissibility criteria: ‘Walks like a duck, swims like a duck, and quacks like a duck’... Ain’t a duck! . . . .	78
4.2. Modes of individual criminal liability: in search of the organizational role . . . . .	84
5. The rationale for the international criminal justice system . . . . .	89
6. Discussion . . . . .	92
References . . . . .	94

Chapter 5. Ascribing individual liability within a bureaucracy of murder

Mark OSIEL . . . . .	105
1. Introduction . . . . .	105
2. Easing superior responsibility: a new concept of effective control . . . . .	106
2.1. Roxin’s theory of “domination over an organizational apparatus” . .	107
3. Difficulties with Roxin’s approach: a post-Weberian update . . . . .	110
3.1. The fungibility of subordinates . . . . .	114
3.2. Discretion enjoyed by subordinates . . . . .	114
3.3. Non-western military organization . . . . .	116
3.4. Shifting the evidentiary onus . . . . .	119
3.5. The sociology of mass atrocity . . . . .	122
3.6. The mental element . . . . .	124
4. Conclusion . . . . .	125
References . . . . .	127

Chapter 6. Seizing the “Grotian Moment”: application of joint criminal enterprise liability to the proceedings of the Cambodia genocide tribunal Michael P. SCHARF. ....	131
1. Introduction .....	131
2. Did the Nuremberg precedent establish JCE as customary international law? .....	134
2.1. Application of JCE at Nuremberg. ....	134
2.2. Nuremberg as a “Grotian Moment” .....	143
2.3. The Concept of “Grotian Moment” .....	146
3. Conclusion .....	148
References .....	151
 Chapter 7. Criminologically explained reality of genocide, structure of the offence and the ‘intent to destroy’ requirement Kai AMBOS .....	 153
1. Introduction .....	153
2. Typologies in criminology .....	154
3. The significance of the criminological typology of perpetrators for the offence of genocide .....	159
4. Correspondence of categories of international criminal law with criminological typologies of perpetrators .....	163
4.1. Regarding top-level perpetrators “intent to destroy” means knowledge and purpose .....	166
4.2. As to mid-level perpetrators the knowledge-based approach is applicable .....	166
4.3. Regarding the low-level perpetrators it is necessary to distinguish between state agents and private actors. While the former are normally informed about the genocidal (state) plan, the latter are not .....	168
5. Conclusion: the structure of the genocide offence in light of the criminological findings .....	170
References .....	171
 Chapter 8. ICTY and the culpability of different types of perpetrators of international crimes Alette SMEULERS and Barbora HOLÁ .....	 175
1. Introduction .....	175
2. Culpability of different types of perpetrators .....	179
2.1. Highest level of blameworthiness: criminal masterminds .....	180
2.2. High level of blameworthiness: careerists and fanatics .....	181

2.3. Medium level of blameworthiness: devoted warriors . . . . .	183
2.4. Low level of blameworthiness: “criminals and sadists” and the otherwise law abiding citizens . . . . .	185
2.5. Lowest level of blameworthiness: compromised perpetrator . . . . .	188
3. ICTY sentencing case law. . . . .	188
4. Empirical findings . . . . .	190
4.1. Methodology . . . . .	190
4.1.1. Data Collection . . . . .	190
4.1.2. Method. . . . .	193
4.2. Results. . . . .	194
4.3. Discussion . . . . .	200
5. Conclusions . . . . .	203
References . . . . .	204

Chapter 9. Child soldiers: agency, enlistment, and the collectivization of  
innocence

Mark A. DRUMBL. . . . .	207
1. Introduction . . . . .	207
2. Criminally punishing adults for the conscription, enlistment, or use of child soldiers in hostilities . . . . .	210
2.1. Special Court for Sierra Leone . . . . .	210
2.2. International Criminal Court. . . . .	213
2.3. The agency of child soldiers: assumptions, narratives, and strategies. . . . .	215
2.4. Conclusion . . . . .	218
3. How do children end up in fighting forces? . . . . .	218
3.1. Forced conscription . . . . .	219
3.2. Voluntary enlistment . . . . .	222
3.3. Summary . . . . .	226
4. Conclusion . . . . .	227
References . . . . .	229

PART III.  
REFLECTIONS ON INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE AND  
THE ICC

Chapter 10. The rough edges of the delicate mosaic: complexity theory  
and the early practice of the International Criminal Court

Salim A. NAKHJAVANI. . . . .	235
1. Introduction . . . . .	235
2. Some characteristics of complex adaptive systems . . . . .	237

3. Lens, metaphor, analogy, model ... or nothing at all? .....	239
4. Seeking complexity in international criminal justice .....	243
4.1. The entry-into-force of the Rome Statute sets in motion a nonlinear, dynamic system .....	243
4.2. Outcomes of decisions of the Court may be sensitively dependent on initial conditions and path-dependent .....	245
4.3. The Rome Statute may co-evolve with 'neighboring' treaties .....	246
5. Novel insights or repackaged goods? .....	250
References .....	251

#### Chapter 11. The law and politics of self-referrals

Sarah NOUWEN and Wouter WERNER .....	255
1. Introduction .....	255
2. Self-referrals and complementarity .....	257
2.1. Inaction as a ground for admissibility. ....	260
2.2. Narrowing down the definition of a 'case' .....	264
2.3. Broadening the concept of unwillingness. ....	265
2.4. Conclusion: legal aspects of self-referrals .....	267
3. The politics of self-referrals .....	267
3.1. ICC politics .....	267
3.2. National politics .....	268
3.3. Conclusion: politics of self-referrals .....	269
References .....	270

#### PART IV.

#### FROM FACTS TO FIGURES

#### Chapter 12. On research methods for international crimes – methodological issues in the empirical study of international crimes

Catrien BIJLEVELD .....	275
1. Introduction .....	275
2. Criminological areas of study .....	276
3. Methodological backdrop to social science research. ....	278
3.1. Working with samples .....	278
3.2. Causality .....	280
3.3. The role of assumptions .....	282
4. Research on international crimes .....	283
4.1. Studying prevalence .....	283
4.2. Etiology .....	288
4.3. (Legal) reaction .....	291
4.4. Victim studies .....	292

5. Conclusion and some ways forward . . . . . 294  
 References . . . . . 295

Chapter 13. Sexual violence during war: variation and accountability

Elisabeth Jean WOOD . . . . . 297

1. Introduction . . . . . 297  
 2. Key concepts . . . . . 299  
 3. Incomplete explanations. . . . . 303  
   3.1. Type of conflict . . . . . 303  
   3.2. Opportunity. . . . . 303  
   3.3. Incentives . . . . . 305  
   3.4. Rape as a substitution for consensual sex . . . . . 306  
   3.5. Female combatants . . . . . 307  
   3.6. Sexual violence as instrumental for the group . . . . . 307  
 4. Theoretical framework . . . . . 309  
   4.1. Individual combatants . . . . . 309  
   4.2. Leadership strategy. . . . . 310  
   4.3. Institutions for combatant socialization . . . . . 310  
   4.4. Wartime dynamics . . . . . 312  
   4.5. Military hierarchy . . . . . 313  
 5. When is wartime rape a strategy of war? When is it rare? Top-down  
 and bottom-across logics . . . . . 314  
   5.1. Explaining the absence of sexual violence: two logics . . . . . 315  
     5.1.1. The top-down logic . . . . . 315  
     5.1.2. The bottom-across logic . . . . . 317  
   5.2. Explaining rape as a strategy (or tactic) of war: two logics . . . . . 318  
     5.2.1. Top-down logic: rape as a strategy of war . . . . . 318  
     5.2.2. Bottom-across logic: rape as a tactic of war . . . . . 318  
 6. Conclusion . . . . . 319  
 References . . . . . 322

Chapter 14. Learning the hard way at the ICTY: statistical evidence of  
 human rights violations in an adversarial information environment

Amelia HOOVER GREEN . . . . . 325

1. Introduction . . . . . 325  
 2. The prosecution’s analysis . . . . . 327  
   2.1. Descriptive analysis . . . . . 327  
   2.2. Causal analysis . . . . . 330  
 3. Defense challenges. . . . . 333  
   3.1. Defining “statistics” and “the scientific method” . . . . . 334  
   3.2. “Fundamental flaws” . . . . . 336

4. The judgment .....	337
5. Lessons learned .....	343
6. Conclusions .....	349
References .....	350

**PART V.  
FROM FIGURES TO FACTS**

**Chapter 15. Methodology for the criminal investigation of international crimes**

Xabier AGIRRE ARANBURU .....	355
1. Introduction .....	355
2. Seize the opportunity structure .....	356
3. Beware of the inquisitorial temptation .....	358
4. Take a multi-disciplinary approach .....	361
5. Disregard simplistic explanations .....	364
6. Analysis first .....	365
7. Focus on specific and contextual elements .....	367
8. Prioritize documentary evidence .....	369
9. Look at the evidence as sample .....	375
10. Prioritize insider and international witnesses .....	376
11. Anticipate security needs .....	379
References .....	380

**Chapter 16. Closing the gap in truth finding: from the facts of the field to the judge's chambers**

Martin WITTEVEEN .....	383
1. Introduction .....	383
2. The facts .....	384
3. The investigation .....	386
3.1. Time lapse .....	386
3.2. Consequences of time lapse .....	388
3.3. Lack of documentation .....	388
4. Issues of witnesses' memory .....	389
4.1. Encoding phase .....	390
4.2. Retention phase .....	392
4.3. Retrieval phase .....	393
5. Witnesses' recount of the facts – unprecedented challenges in the context of international crimes .....	395
5.1. Trauma .....	396
5.2. Quantative answers .....	397

5.3. Misunderstandings.....	398
5.4. Language challenges.....	399
5.4.1. Rare languages .....	400
5.4.2. Translation errors.....	400
5.4.3. Lack of vocabulary.....	401
5.5. Cultural differences .....	402
5.5.1. Education and personal identities .....	402
5.5.2. Behavior of witnesses.....	403
5.5.3. Misinterpretation .....	404
5.5.4. Witness's reluctance.....	404
5.5.5. Oral culture and lack of sourcing .....	405
6. After the witnesses the professionals take over .....	406
6.1. Role of investigators .....	406
6.2. Role of the prosecutor or trial attorney.....	407
6.3. Role of the judges .....	408
6.4. Dilemmas and possible changes.....	409
7. The final stage – The judge's chambers.....	411
References .....	411

Chapter 17. Preserving the overview of law and facts: the Case Matrix

Morten BERGSMO, Olympia BEKOU and Annika JONES .....	413
1. Introduction .....	413
2. Some difficulties faced in relating law to facts in core international crimes cases .....	416
2.1. Understanding the legal requirements for the prosecution of core international crimes.....	416
2.2. Applying the legal requirements to large quantities of evidence ....	419
3. The significance of an informed, efficient and precise approach to the application of law to facts in core international crimes cases .....	420
3.1. The ability to pursue justice and the quality of the process.....	421
3.2. The efficiency of the criminal justice process and the fight against impunity.....	422
3.3. Promotion of the rights of the accused .....	423
3.4. Summary .....	424
4. The Case Matrix and the facilitation of the application of law to facts....	425
4.1. The Case Matrix .....	425
4.2. The facilitation of the application of law to facts through use of the Case Matrix.....	428
5. The ICC and the Case Matrix .....	429
5.1. Adoption of the Case Matrix logic.....	429
5.2. Justifications for the approach of the Chambers .....	431

5.2.1. Expediency of the criminal process .....	431
5.2.2. Protection of the rights of the accused .....	432
6. Conclusion .....	433
References .....	433

EPILOGUE

Chapter 18. Future perspectives on collective violence and international criminal justice

Stephan PARMENTIER and Estelle ZINSSTAG .....	439
1. Introduction .....	439
2. Types of violence: collective, international and political .....	439
3. Types of responses: criminal prosecutions and beyond .....	442
4. The need for an interdisciplinary approach .....	445
References .....	445
<i>Contributors</i> .....	447