

Transforming International Criminal Justice

**Retributive and restorative justice
in the trial process**

Mark Findlay and Ralph Henham



**WILLAN
PUBLISHING**

Contents

<i>List of figures and tables</i>	ix
<i>Table of cases</i>	x
<i>Table of legislation</i>	xi
<i>Introduction</i>	xiii

PART I

1 Theorizing the contextual analysis of trial process	3
Introduction	3
Levels of analysis	5
Comparison	8
Challenges for theory	10
Developing structuration theory in a comparative context	13
Operationalizing the conceptual framework	17
Linking theory and method	27
Developing theory and methodology	30
Conclusion	35
2 Criminal justice modelling and trial process	38
Introduction	38
Levels of modelling	39
Developing the contextual model (1)	43
Developing the contextual model (2)	55
Summary	63

3	Methods for analysing trials comparatively	65
	Introduction	65
	The essence of comparison	69
	Context and comparativism	74
	Trial process – context and object for analysis	84
	Trial data	89
	Procedural traditions	95
	Narrative analysis	96
	Observation	99
	Questionnaires	103
	Developing the methodological approach	105
	Grounding a model of trial decision-making	106
	Conclusion – applying the methodology	108
	Italian and English transcript analysis	110
 PART II		
4	Trials in transition	117
	Introduction	117
	Italian transcripts	120
	The importance of pre-existing written evidence (records of interview)	128
	Language and tone of transcript – what does it say about the nature of professional interaction?	129
	The application of rules such as the rules of evidence	129
	The role of the judge (lay and professional)	130
	The nature of professional interaction – examination of witnesses	131
	What other narrative forms are suggested and available?	132
	Sites for decision-making	132
	Issues for methodology	140
	Themes for methodology regarding sites for decision- making	142
	Refining the research methodology	144
5	Another trial style?	147
	Introduction	147
	Common law transcript	148
	Context analysis	155
	Comparative contextual analysis of trial data	158
	Narrative analysis	159
	Verdict delivery	161

Sentencing narrative as it reveals verdict delivery decision-making	163
Sentencing	183
CCA of sentencing narrative: England and Italy	201
Issues about trial decision-making emerging from CCA	214
6 Sentencing for what?	222
Introduction	222
Pathways to sentencing	223
The domestic context	229
The international context	255
Conceptualizing access to justice and victims' rights	264
Conclusion	267
PART III	
7 Restorative international criminal justice and the place of the trial	273
Introduction	273
New notions of justice	275
A case for synthesis?	277
Common themes for restorative and retributive justice	279
Requirements of RJ in international trials	282
Institutional manifestations of restorative ICJ	286
RJ internationally	291
Alternative governance processes?	292
The case for the international trial as a place for RJ	294
Reconfiguring victim community interests	297
Trial transformation in ICJ – foundations for change	299
Prospects for global communitarianism	301
Restorative pathways of decision-making and influence	309
Restorative outcomes for ICJ	311
Just deserts in a victim-focused ICJ?	312
New aims for ICJ	313
8 Transformed trials and new ICJ paradigms	314
Introduction	314
The essence of the trial: essentialism and context	317
Deconstructing trial decision-making	319
Reconstructing international criminal trial process	321
The essence of change	324
Purpose for change	333

Transforming International Criminal Justice

Challenges for change	338
Dimensions of change	341
Themes for the transformation trial practice	346
Realizing new justice expectations	351
Policy of ICJ transformation and potential for global governance	354
<i>References</i>	357
<i>Index</i>	391