

MIGRANT SMUGGLING:
ILLEGAL MIGRATION
AND ORGANISED CRIME IN AUSTRALIA
AND THE ASIA PACIFIC REGION

By

Andreas Schloenhardt

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN / BOSTON

Table of Contents

List of Charts, Maps and Tables	xvii
Abbreviations	xix
Journals, Periodicals and Law Reports	xxi
Acknowledgments	xxv
INTRODUCTION	1
Research Methods and Data Sources	7
CHAPTER ONE: TERMINOLOGY AND SCOPE OF THIS STUDY	
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>12</i>
1.1. Migrant Smuggling	13
1.1.1. The IOM Definition of Migrant Smuggling/Trafficking.....	14
1.1.2. Illegal Migration	15
1.1.2.1. Migrants and migration.....	15
1.1.2.2. Border crossing	16
1.1.2.3. Illegality of the movement.....	16
1.1.2.4. Voluntary nature of migrant smuggling.....	17
1.1.3. Organised Crime	19
1.1.3.1. Smugglers and smuggling organisation	19
1.1.3.2. Profit for the smugglers	20
1.2. The Terminology in International Law	21
1.3. Trafficking in Women and Children	24
CHAPTER TWO: ILLEGAL MIGRATION	
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>26</i>
2.1. Illegal Migration in the Asia Pacific Region	27

2.1.1.	Migration as a Result of Political, Demographic, Socioeconomic and Environmental Factors: The Concept of Push and Pull	27
2.1.1.1.	Political factors.....	28
2.1.1.2.	Demographic push factors	32
2.1.1.3.	Socioeconomic factors	35
2.1.1.3.1.	<i>Survival migration</i>	35
2.1.1.3.2.	<i>Opportunity seeking migration</i>	36
2.1.1.3.3.	<i>Economic developments in the Asia Pacific region, 1980-2000</i>	37
2.1.1.4.	Environmental factors	40
2.1.1.5.	Technological developments.....	41
2.1.2.	Migration and Social Networks: The Migration Systems Approach	42
2.1.2.1.	Social networks.....	43
2.1.2.2.	Overseas communities and family reunification	44
2.1.2.3.	Global economic systems	45
2.1.3.	Summary	46
2.2.	Illegal Migration and Australia's Immigration Policies	51
2.2.1.	Early Immigration Restrictions.....	52
2.2.1.1.	Early developments in Britain.....	52
2.2.1.2.	Australia before Federation	52
2.2.1.3.	The Immigration Restriction Act 1901	54
2.2.2.	Post-War Australia and the Migration Act 1958	56
2.2.2.1.	The World Wars and the refugee crises	56
2.2.2.2.	Populate or perish.....	58
2.2.2.3.	The Migration Act 1958	59
2.2.2.4.	The 1960s and the end of organised labour migration	59
2.2.3.	The Fall of Vietnam and the Boat-People.....	61
2.2.3.1.	The end of the Vietnam War	61
2.2.3.2.	Australia and the boat-people.....	62
2.2.3.3.	The 1985 and 1987 review of migration law	66
2.2.4.	The Events of 1989.....	67
2.2.4.1.	The end of the Cold War	67
2.2.4.2.	The Chinese student revolt	69
2.2.4.3.	Responses by receiving countries.....	70
2.2.4.4.	Australia's responses to the 1989 events.....	71

2.2.4.4.1.	<i>The Chinese students</i>	71
2.2.4.4.2.	<i>The 1989 reform of migration law</i>	72
2.2.5.	Immigration Policies in the 1990s.....	73
2.2.5.1.	The 1991-93 amendments	74
2.2.5.2.	1994-1998	77
2.2.6.	Recent Developments: 1999 and after.....	81
2.2.7.	The Tampa Incident and the Pacific Solution	84
2.3.	Conclusion	89

CHAPTER THREE: ORGANISED CRIME

<i>Introduction</i>	91
3.1. Concepts and Characteristics of Organised Crime	93
3.1.1. Defining Organised Crime	93
3.1.1.1. Concepts of organised crime	93
3.1.1.2. Problems and critique	95
3.1.2. Characteristics of Organised Crime	97
3.2. Economic Analysis of Organised Crime	100
3.2.1. Background.....	100
3.2.1.1. The economics of crime	100
3.2.1.2. Early economic approaches to organised crime	101
3.2.2. Principles and Objectives of Economic Activity.....	102
3.2.2.1. General principles	103
3.2.2.2. Objectives of economic activity.....	104
3.2.3. Positioning Organised Crime.....	104
3.2.4. The Illegal Market	106
3.2.4.1. The emergence of illegal markets	106
3.2.4.2. Special features of the illegal market	109
3.2.5. Customers of the Criminal Enterprise	110
3.2.6. The Market of Migrant Smuggling.....	111

3.2.7.	Summary	112
3.3.	Organisational Features of Migrant Smuggling.....	113
3.3.1.	Structure and Management.....	113
3.3.1.1.	Control and organisation schemes.....	113
3.3.1.2.	Diversification of migrant smuggling organisations.....	117
3.3.1.3.	Criminal organisations in Australia.....	118
3.3.2.	Recruitment and Personnel Management.....	120
3.3.2.1.	Vertical differentiation.....	120
3.3.2.2.	Horizontal differentiation: division of labour	121
3.3.2.3.	Human resources and recruitment.....	124
3.3.3.	Globalisation.....	125
3.4.	Operational Features of Migrant Smuggling	127
3.4.1.	Supply: Mobilisation of Migrants	127
3.4.1.1.	Contacting migrants.....	127
3.4.1.2.	Sending countries.....	129
3.4.1.3.	Profile of the migrants	131
3.4.2.	The Illegal Services	133
3.4.2.1.	Preparation of the migrants.....	133
3.4.2.2.	Travel documents.....	134
3.4.2.2.1.	<i>General observations</i>	<i>134</i>
3.4.2.2.2.	<i>Document fraud and misuse in the Asia Pacific region</i>	<i>135</i>
3.4.2.3.	Transportation and routing	137
3.4.2.3.1.	<i>General patterns</i>	<i>137</i>
3.4.2.3.2.	<i>Modes of transportation.....</i>	<i>137</i>
3.4.2.3.3.	<i>Regional analysis</i>	<i>139</i>
3.4.2.4.	Illegal immigration in Australia	146
3.4.2.4.1.	<i>Boat arrivals</i>	<i>148</i>
3.4.2.4.2.	<i>Air arrivals.....</i>	<i>151</i>
3.4.3.	Distribution: Post-Immigration Activities.....	153
3.4.3.1.	Arriving in the destination country	153
3.4.3.2.	Post-immigration situation.....	153
3.4.4.	Finance	156
3.4.4.1.	Financing organised crime.....	156

3.4.4.2.	Profit estimations	157
3.4.4.3.	Money laundering.....	159
3.5.	Summary and Conclusion	160

CHAPTER FOUR: MIGRANT SMUGGLING IN AUSTRALIAN LAW

<i>Introduction</i>	162
4.1. Migrant Smuggling Offences	164
4.1.1. Sources and General Remarks	164
4.1.1.1 Structure and developments.....	165
4.1.1.2. Geographical application	166
4.1.1.3. Definition of terms	167
4.1.2. Operational Offences	168
4.1.2.1. Mobilisation of illegal migrants	168
4.1.2.2. Organising and facilitating illegal immigration	169
4.1.2.3. Transporting illegal immigrants	171
4.1.2.3.1. <i>Transporting undocumented migrants</i>	171
4.1.2.3.2. <i>Transporting concealed migrants</i>	173
4.1.2.4. Harboursing and concealing illegal migrants	174
4.1.2.5. Making false statements for another person and causing false statements to be made	175
4.1.2.6. Production and provision of false documents	178
4.1.2.6.1. <i>Producing fraudulent documents (forgery)</i>	179
4.1.2.6.2. <i>Transferring identity and immigration documents</i>	181
4.1.2.6.3. <i>Use and possession of fraudulent documents</i>	182
4.1.3. Organisational Offences	183
4.1.3.1. Organised crime and conspiracy	183
4.1.3.2. Financing organised crime.....	184
4.1.3.3. Participation of officials.....	185
4.1.4. Summary Remarks.....	187
4.2. Offences Applying to Illegal Migrants	189
4.2.1. Illegal Departure & Illegal Entry.....	189
4.2.1.1. Emigration offences.....	189
4.2.1.2. Illegal immigration as an offence	189

4.2.2.	False Claims.....	191
4.2.3.	Possession and Use of Fraudulent Documents.....	192
4.3.	Protection of Smuggled Migrants.....	195
4.3.1.	Australia's Refugee and Humanitarian Immigration Program.....	196
4.3.1.1.	Australia's obligations under international refugee law.....	197
4.3.1.2.	Protection of onshore applicants in Australia.....	199
4.3.2.	Government Assistance and Legal Support.....	203
4.3.2.1.	Asylum seekers in immigration detention.....	204
4.3.2.2.	Non-detained immigrants.....	207
4.3.3.	Rights of Appeal and Review.....	209
4.3.3.1.	Refugee Review Tribunal.....	211
4.3.3.2.	Federal Court.....	213
4.3.3.3.	Administrative Appeals Tribunal.....	213
4.3.3.4.	High Court of Australia.....	213
4.3.4.	Detention and Removal.....	214
4.3.4.1.	The Australian practice.....	214
4.3.4.2.	Legitimacy of the current practice.....	215
4.4.	Conclusion.....	219

CHAPTER FIVE: IMMIGRATION AND ORGANISED CRIME LEGISLATION IN THE ASIA PACIFIC REGION

<i>Introduction</i>	221
5.1. Immigration and Asylum Systems in the Asia Pacific.....	225
5.1.1. Pre-Arrival Regulations.....	225
5.1.1.1. Defining foreigners.....	226
5.1.1.2. Entry and visa regulations.....	227
5.1.1.3. Exclusion clauses and prohibitions.....	229

5.1.2.	Arrival Procedures and Border Control	232
5.1.3.	Post-Arrival Measures: Detention and Removal	234
5.1.3.1.	Detention	234
5.1.3.2.	Removal	236
5.1.4.	Refugee and Asylum Systems	236
5.1.4.1.	Signatories of Refugee Convention.....	238
5.1.4.2.	Asylum systems in non-signatory countries	241
5.1.5.	Summary	246
5.2.	Migrant Smuggling Offences in the Asia Pacific Region.....	247
5.2.1.	Operational Offences	247
5.2.1.1.	Mobilising migrants.....	247
5.2.1.2.	Organising illegal migration.....	250
5.2.1.3.	Transporting illegal migrants.....	252
5.2.1.3.1.	<i>Liability of criminal perpetrators.....</i>	<i>252</i>
5.2.1.3.2.	<i>Liability of commercial carriers</i>	<i>254</i>
5.2.1.4.	Harbouring and concealing illegal migrants	256
5.2.1.5.	False statements for another person's immigration.....	258
5.2.1.6.	Production and provision of fraudulent documents.....	259
5.2.1.6.1.	<i>Forgery and falsification of documents</i>	<i>260</i>
5.2.1.6.2.	<i>Transfer of documents to another person including selling</i>	<i>262</i>
5.2.1.7.	Participation of officials in immigration offences	264
5.2.1.8.	Other offences	265
5.2.2.	Organisational Offences	267
5.2.2.1.	Organised crime acts.....	267
5.2.2.2.	Conspiracy and participation in criminal organisations	270
5.2.3.	General Observations	273
5.3.	Offences Applying to Illegal Migrants	276
5.3.1.	Illegal Departure and Illegal Entry.....	276
5.3.1.1.	Illegal departure	276
5.3.1.2.	Illegal entry	278
5.3.2.	False Statements.....	280

5.3.3.	Obtaining, Possessing and Using Fraudulent Documents.....	282
5.3.4.	General Remarks.....	283
5.4.	Conclusion	285

CHAPTER SIX: INTERNATIONAL INITIATIVES TO COMBAT MIGRANT SMUGGLING

<i>Introduction</i>	288
6.1. The Role of International Organisations	290
6.1.1. Carrier and Transportation Organisations.....	290
6.1.1.1. International Maritime Organisation (IMO).....	291
6.1.1.2. International aviation law and the International Civil Aviation Organisation (ICAO) .	294
6.1.1.3. International Air Transport Association (IATA).....	296
6.1.1.4. Carrier regulations and migrant smuggling.....	297
6.1.2. Migration, Refugee and Humanitarian Organisations.....	298
6.1.2.1. United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR).....	299
6.1.2.2. Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (UNHCHR) .	301
6.1.2.3. International Organisation for Migration (IOM)	302
6.1.2.4. General observations.....	304
6.1.3. Law Enforcement.....	305
6.1.3.1. Interpol	305
6.1.3.2. Inter-Governmental Consultations on Asylum, Refugee and Migration Policies in Europe, North America and Australia (IGC).....	308
6.2. The United Nations and Organised Crime	309
6.2.1. UN Commission for Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice.....	309
6.2.2. UN Congresses on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders.....	311
6.2.3. UN Office for Drug Control and Crime Prevention (UNODCCP).....	314
6.2.3.1. UN Drug Control Program (UNDCP)	314
6.2.3.2. UNDCP Regional Centre for East Asia and the Pacific.....	315
6.2.4. UN Centre for International Crime Prevention (CICP).....	316

6.2.5.	Other UN Initiatives and Regional UN Agencies.....	317
6.2.5.1.	UN Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute (UNICRI).....	317
6.2.5.2.	Asia and Far East Institute for the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders (UNAFEI).....	318
6.2.5.3.	UN Crime and Justice Information Network (UNCJIN).....	318
6.3.	United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime.....	320
6.3.1.	Early Developments.....	320
6.3.1.1.	International conventions on the prevention and suppression of crime.....	320
6.3.1.2.	UN World Ministerial Conference on Organised Transnational Crime and the Naples Declaration.....	323
6.3.1.3.	Draft proposals for an organised crime convention.....	326
6.3.1.4.	The work of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of an International Convention against Transnational Organised Crime.....	328
6.3.2.	The Provisions under the Convention.....	330
6.3.2.1.	The concept of organised crime under the Convention.....	331
6.3.2.2.	Criminalisation and prevention of organised crime.....	332
6.3.2.3.	Money laundering.....	336
6.3.2.4.	Corruption.....	338
6.3.2.5.	Legal and judicial cooperation and extradition.....	338
6.3.2.6.	Law enforcement and technical cooperation.....	340
6.3.2.7.	Confiscation and seizure of assets.....	341
6.3.2.8.	Protection of witnesses and victims.....	342
6.3.2.9.	Application and implementation provisions.....	343
6.3.3.	Evaluation.....	344
6.4.	UN Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Air and Sea.....	346
6.4.1	Initiatives for a Convention against Migrant Smuggling.....	346
6.4.1.1.	Italy's proposal to the International Maritime Organisation.....	347
6.4.1.2.	Austria's proposal to the UN General Assembly.....	349
6.4.2.	The Provisions under the Protocol.....	351
6.4.2.1.	Migrant smuggling offences.....	351
6.4.2.1.1.	<i>Smuggling of migrants</i>	351
6.4.2.1.2.	<i>Harbouring and concealing illegal migrants</i>	352

6.4.2.1.3.	<i>Producing and transferring fraudulent documents</i>	353
6.4.2.1.4.	<i>Scope and application of offences</i>	354
6.4.2.2.	Cooperative and preventive measures.....	355
6.4.2.3.	Special measures against migrant smuggling by sea.....	357
6.4.2.4.	The position of illegal migrants under the Protocol.....	358
6.4.2.5.	Application and implementation of the Protocol.....	360
6.4.3.	General Comments	360
6.5.	Regional Initiatives against Illegal Migration and Organised Crime	363
6.5.1.	Regional Seminar on Irregular Migration and Migrant Trafficking in East and South East Asia: the Manila Process	363
6.5.2.	Asia Pacific Consultations (APC).....	365
6.5.3.	Asian African Legal Consultative Committee (AALCC).....	366
6.5.4.	Regional Ministerial Conference on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime	368
6.5.5.	Association of South East Asian Nations (ASEAN).....	368
6.5.5.1.	ASEAN Plan of Action in Combating Transnational Crime	369
6.5.5.2.	ASEAN Cooperation on Immigration Matters.....	371
6.5.5.3.	ASEAN Chiefs of National Police (ASEANAPOL).....	372
6.5.6.	Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC).....	372
6.5.7.	Pacific Islands Forum.....	373
6.5.8.	Council for Security Cooperation in the Asia Pacific (CSCAP).....	374
6.5.9.	Other Regional Organisations.....	376
6.5.9.1.	Association of Asia Pacific Airlines (AAPA).....	376
6.5.9.2.	Pacific Rim Immigration Intelligence Officers' Conference (PACRIM).....	377
6.5.9.3.	South Pacific Islands Criminal Intelligence Network (SPICIN).....	377
6.5.10.	Summary	378

CHAPTER SEVEN: THE WAY AHEAD

<i>Introduction</i>	381
7.1. Proposals for Change	383
7.1.1. General Objectives	383
7.1.1.1 Criminal law and criminal justice systems.....	384
7.1.1.2. Migration law and policy.....	386
7.1.1.3. Human rights and refugee law.....	387
7.1.1.4. Structural change	389
7.1.2. Specific Proposals.....	390
7.1.2.1. Migrant smuggling offences.....	390
7.1.2.2. Offences applying to illegal migrants	393
7.1.2.3. Organised crime legislation	394
7.1.2.4. Law enforcement and judicial cooperation.....	395
7.1.2.5. Immigration law.....	396
7.1.2.6. Refugee law.....	400
7.1.3. Other Recommendations	402
7.2. Conclusion	405
Appendix A: Legislation — Country Profiles	408
A.1. Migrant Smuggling Offences.....	408
A.1.1. Operational Offences	408
A.1.2. Organisational Offences	411
A.2. Offences Applying to Illegal Migrants.....	412
A.3. Immigration Regulations	414
A.4. Refugee and Asylum Systems	416
Appendix B: Signatures to International Conventions and Membership in International and Regional Organisations	418
Appendix C: Additional Statistical Data	420

Bibliography 424

Index 451