Errors of Justice

Nature, Sources, and Remedies

Brian Forst

American University



Contents

	Preface	page xiii
	Acknowledgments	xv
1	The Problem	1
	Introduction	1
	What Is an Error of Justice?	3
	Aim and Overview of the Book	7
2	Errors of Due Process	10
	Introduction	10
	What Is Due Process?	11
	Landmark Due Process Cases	13
	The Sources of Due Process Errors and Their Social	
	Significance	16
	Managing Due Process Errors	19
	Conclusion	21
3	Errors of Impunity	22
	Introduction	22
	What Is an Error of Impunity?	23
	The Sources and Consequences of Errors of Impunity	23
	Managing Errors of Impunity	27
	Conclusion	
4	Frameworks for Analyzing the Incidence of Justice	
	Errors	31
	Introduction	31

ix

	Managing Errors of Statistical Inference: The Problem	
	of Reliability	32
	Managing Errors of Statistical Inference: The Problem	
	of Validity	36
	Parallels between Errors of Statistical Inference and Errors	
	of Justice	40
	Managing Errors in Production and Service Delivery	
	Processes	41
	Conclusion	43
5	Assessing the Cost of Justice Errors	45
	Introduction	45
	What Are the Social Costs of Crime and Justice?	46
	Difficulties in Assessing the Social Costs of Crime	
	and Justice	48
	Optimal Levels of Interventions Against Crime	52
	Initial Estimates	54
	Conclusion	55
6	Standards of Evidence	57
	Introduction	57
	Varying the Parameters	58
	Conclusion	64
7	Police-Induced Errors	66
	Introduction	66
	Making Sense of Policing Errors	67
	Nature and Sources of Justice Errors Associated with the Police	69
	Managing Justice Errors Attributable to the Police	92
	Balancing Error Management with Other Policing Goals	106
	Conclusion	109
8	Prosecution Policy and Justice Errors	112
	Introduction	112
	Prosecutorial Discretion and Errors of Justice	114
	Improved Coordination with Police	116

CONTENTS xi

	Errors of Fact, Questions of Culpability, and Tactical Errors	118
	Should the Prosecutor Emphasize Conviction Quality	
	or Quantity?	120
	Analyzing Data on Prosecution under a Range of Assumptions	
	about Factual Guilt	122
	Analysis by Crime Category	127
	Conclusion	131
9	The Jury	134
	Introduction	134
	Jury Policy, Representativeness, and Justice Errors	136
	How Many Jurors? Must Their Decision be Unanimous?	140
	Jury Dynamics	145
	Conclusion	149
10	Sentencing and Corrections	150
	Introduction	150
	Optimum Sanctions under Alternative Frameworks	152
	Sources of Excessive Social Costs in Sentencing	172
	Who Might Cause Sentences to be Outside the Norm?	173
	Should Sanctions be Based on Predictions?	176
	Errors in Corrections	178
	The Critical Role of Incentives and Systems of	
	Accountability	180
	Conclusion	182
11	Homicide	184
	Introduction	184
	Basics about Homicide: Opportunities for Error	
	in Classification	185
	Failures to Bring Homicide Offenders to Justice	190
	Excessive Intrusions in Homicide Cases	197
	The Death Penalty	199
	Remedies and Impediments to the Management	
	of Errors in Homicide Cases	203
	Conclusion	210

xii	CONTENTS
-----	----------

12	A Matter of Legitimacy	212
	Introduction	212
	What Is Legitimacy?	213
	Operationalizing the Notion of Legitimacy	215
	Conclusion	217
	Bibliography	221
	Index	243