

CRIMINAL EVIDENCE

PAUL ROBERTS

Professor of Criminal Jurisprudence, University of Nottingham

ADRIAN ZUCKERMAN

Fellow of University College, Oxford

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxx
<i>Table of International Instruments and Comparative Legislation</i>	xxxvi
1 PRINCIPLES OF CRIMINAL EVIDENCE	1
1.1 Criminal Evidence	1
1.2 Criminal Procedure and Criminal Justice	9
1.3 Five Foundational Principles of Criminal Evidence	18
1.4 Principles, Rules, and Discretion	25
1.5 The Human Rights Act, Constitutional Criminal Procedure, and Beyond	32
2 THE PROCEDURAL FRAMEWORK OF ADVERSARIAL JURY TRIAL	38
2.1 Criminal Evidence in Procedural Context	38
2.2 Adversary Proceedings	42
2.3 Scope and Function of the English Jury	59
2.4 Procedural Mechanisms Facilitating Judicial Control over Jury Decision-Making	67
2.5 The Future of Adversarial Jury Trial	88
3 RELEVANCE, ADMISSIBILITY, AND FACT-FINDING	95
3.1 Basic Concepts	95
3.2 Admissibility	96
3.3 Relevance	98
3.4 Taking Facts Seriously	109
3.5 Fact, Law, and Opinion	132
4 FAIR TRIAL	147
4.1 Sources of Procedural Fairness	147
4.2 The Pre-History of Section 78	148
4.3 Rationales for Exclusion	150
4.4 The Jurisprudence of Section 78	160
4.5 Constitutional Fairness under the Human Rights Act	175

5 SOURCES OF INFORMATION IN CRIMINAL LITIGATION	182
5.1 Categories of Evidence	182
5.2 Subsidiary Sources of Information in Criminal Litigation	188
5.3 Judicial Notice	199
5.4 Managing Inferences of Fact	205
5.5 Conclusion: Inference and Notice	211
6 ORAL WITNESS TESTIMONY	212
6.1 The Oral Tradition and its Modern Discontents	212
6.2 Competence	222
6.3 Compellability and Privilege	226
6.4 Procedural Course of the Trial: Examination-in-Chief	244
6.5 Cross-Examination and Witness Credibility	254
6.6 Vulnerable Witnesses	269
6.7 Conclusion: The Demise of Orality?	287
7 EXPERT EVIDENCE	290
7.1 The Significance of Expert Evidence	290
7.2 Beyond Expert 'Opinion': Education or Deference?	292
7.3 Qualified Expertise and the Problem of Bias	296
7.4 Rules of Admissibility	305
7.5 The Future of Expert Evidence	321
8 THE PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE AND BURDENS OF PROOF	327
8.1 A Constitutional Presumption	327
8.2 Burdens and Presumptions as Techniques of Risk Allocation	329
8.3 Philosophical Foundations of the Presumption of Innocence	344
8.4 The <i>Woolmington</i> Principle in English Criminal Jurisprudence	348
8.5 Proof Beyond Reasonable Doubt in Practice	360
8.6 Three Exceptions to <i>Woolmington</i>	373
8.7 The Future Scope and Limits of the Presumption of Innocence	384
9 THE PRIVILEGE AGAINST SELF-INCRIMINATION AND EVIDENCE OF CONFESSIONS	392
9.1 Introduction: Silence and Self-Incrimination	392
9.2 A Privilege Against Self-Incrimination Retrospective	398

9.3	Rationales Re-Examined	408
9.4	The Modern Privilege Against Self-Incrimination in Procedural Context	426
9.5	The Statutory Confessions Rules: PACE 1984 ss. 76–78	449
9.6	Conclusions	461
10	BEYOND QUANTITATIVE STANDARDS: THE NEW FORENSIC REASONING RULES	465
10.1	Introduction: Beyond Corroboration	465
10.2	Statutory Corroboration Requirements	469
10.3	The Evolution of Corroboration Warnings	472
10.4	Eyewitness Identification Evidence	490
10.5	Post-Quantitative Standards and Fair Trials	496
11	EVIDENCE OF CHARACTER	500
11.1	Antecedents of the Criminal Justice Act 2003	500
11.2	Character, Proof, and Prejudice	503
11.3	Bad Character After the Criminal Justice Act 2003	511
11.4	Bad Character Evidence Relevant to the Issue: From ‘Similar Facts’ to Fair Relevance and Explanatory Evidence	515
11.5	Prosecution Evidence of the Accused’s Bad Character to Correct a False Impression or to Retaliate in Kind	542
11.6	Bad Character in Issue Between Accused and Co-Accused	573
12	HEARSAY	580
12.1	Hearsay Before and After the Criminal Justice Act 2003	580
12.2	Definition and Scope of the Rule Against Hearsay	585
12.3	Rationales for Exclusion: What’s Wrong with Hearsay?	596
12.4	Critique of the Common Law Rule Against Hearsay	602
12.5	Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay (1): Sections 116 and 117 of the Criminal Justice Act 2003	623
12.6	Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay (2): Common Law Exceptions Preserved by Section 118 of the Criminal Justice Act 2003	642
12.7	The Future of Hearsay	656
	<i>Bibliography</i>	671
	<i>Index</i>	703