

Stacia L. Haynie

Judging IN Black & White

Decision Making
in the South African
Appellate Division,
1950–1990



PETER LANG

New York • Washington, D.C./Baltimore • Bern
Frankfurt am Main • Berlin • Brussels • Vienna • Oxford

Contents



List of Tables xi

List of Figures xiii

Preface xv

CHAPTER I

Judging in Black and White 1

Courts, Judges and Judging 6

Developmental Approaches to Understanding Legal Systems 11

The Formal Law, Repressive Law and Judicial Discretion 15

CHAPTER 2

A Brief History of the South African Legal System 24

Arrival of the Dutch 25

Arrival of the British 26

The *Voortrekkers* 27

The Emerging Republics 27

Union 29

The Legal System 31

The Foundations of Apartheid 32

The National Party and the Constitutional Crisis 33

Implementing the Grand Scheme 36

Opposition 37

The Constitution Act of 1961 38

Increasing Tension—Soweto and Biko 39

The Beginning of the End—the Constitution Act of 1983 40

Courts and Repressive Regimes 42

CHAPTER 3

Winners and Losers in Cases Before the Appellate Division, 1950–1990	44
Facts, Law, Politics and Outcomes	50
A Deferential Division?	51
Analysis	56
Conclusion	60

CHAPTER 4

Individual Voting Behaviors of the Appellate Division Judges, 1950–1990	62
Analysis	72
Conclusion	85

CHAPTER 5

Longitudinal Analysis of the Outcomes Before the Appellate Division, 1950–1990	87
Assessing the Interventions	95
Discussion	101
Conclusion	102

CHAPTER 6

Judicial Decision Making in Repressive Legal Systems	104
Judging in Black and White	105
Winners, Losers and Discretion in South Africa	109
Alternative Explanations	111
Discretion, Outcomes and Politics	114
The Consequences and Possibilities for Courts in Repressive Systems	116
Conclusion	118

APPENDIX A

Logistic Regression Analysis of Outcomes Before the Appellate Division, 1950–1990	121
--	-----

APPENDIX B

Codebook for the South African Data Set	123
---	-----

APPENDIX C

Reliability Estimates for the South African Data Set	135
--	-----

APPENDIX D

Measurement of Judicial Ideology	139
----------------------------------	-----

Notes 143

Bibliography 155

Index 161

Index of Statutes 167

Index of Cases 169