The Protection of the Underwater Cultural Heritage: An Emerging Objective of the Contemporary Law of the Sea

ANASTASIA STRATI

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON
CONTENTS

Foreword xv
Acknowledgements xix
Abbreviations xxi

Introduction 1

PART ONE 5

Chapter 1 - The Notion of the Underwater Cultural Heritage 7

DEFINITION 7
The concept of cultural heritage 7
National heritage versus common heritage? 8
The concept of the underwater cultural heritage 10
The underwater cultural heritage as a common heritage of mankind 11
CLASSIFICATION OF UNDERWATER REMAINS 12
Shipwrecks and isolated objects 12
Submerged sites 13
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE UNDERWATER CULTURAL HERITAGE 14
Archaeological and historical value 14
Artistic value 15
Specific cultural value 16
Educational benefits 16
Commercial value 16
THE UNDERWATER CULTURAL HERITAGE AS A CULTURAL RESOURCE OF THE OCEANS 17
CONFLICTING INTERESTS IN THE PROTECTION OF THE UNDERWATER CULTURAL HERITAGE 18
# Chapter 2 - Underwater Archaeology

**NATURE AND HISTORY OF THE DISCIPLINE**
- Use of the terms "underwater" and "marine" 35
- Evolution of underwater archaeology 36

**The operation of an underwater archaeological project**
- Search for and location of underwater sites 37
- Pre-disturbance survey 38
- Excavation and recovery techniques 38
- Finds drawing and photography 39
- Documentation and publication 39
- Conservation, restoration and display 39

**MARINE ARCHAEOLOGY AS A NEW USE OF THE OCEANS** 40

**MARINE ARCHAEOLOGY AS DISTINCT FROM MARINE SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH AND SALVAGE OPERATIONS** 42
- Exclusion of marine archaeology from the notion of marine scientific research 42
- Marine archaeology and the law of salvage 43
- The concept of salvage 43
- Application of the law of finds in salvage cases 45
- Evaluation of the law of salvage in terms of protecting the underwater cultural heritage 45

# Chapter 3 - International and Regional Instruments

**Protecting the Cultural Heritage**

**INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL INSTRUMENTS PROTECTING CULTURAL PROPERTY IN GENERAL**
- International protection of cultural property in time of war 69
- International protection of cultural property in time of peace 70
- Cultural Conventions 70
- Resolutions and Recommendations 73

**Regional protection of cultural property**
- The Council of Europe 76
- The European Union 82
- The Organisation of American States 84

**INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL INSTRUMENTS PROTECTING THE UNDERWATER CULTURAL HERITAGE**
- Regional protection 85
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bilateral agreements</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVALUATION OF THE PROTECTION ACCORDED TO UNDERWATER CULTURAL PROPERTY UNDER THE CULTURAL CONVENTIONS</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**PART TWO**

**Introduction: The Law of the Sea**

**Chapter 4 - Marine Spaces under the Sovereignty of the Coastal State**

**INTERNAL WATERS**

**THE GENEVA CONVENTION ON THE TERRITORIAL SEA AND THE CONTIGUOUS ZONE**

**THE UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA**

**CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW**

**THE TERRITORIAL SEA**

**THE GENEVA CONVENTION ON THE TERRITORIAL SEA AND THE CONTIGUOUS ZONE**

Coastal jurisdiction over foreign vessels 117

**Archaeological surveys as an exercise of the right of innocent passage**

**Operation of national heritage laws**

**THE UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA**

**Marine archaeology and the right of innocent passage**

- The notion of innocent passage 121
- Exercise of coastal jurisdiction during innocent passage 122
- Conflict between marine archaeology and the right of innocent passage 123

**Effect of article 303 on cultural property found within the territorial sea**

- Duty to protect objects of an archaeological and historical nature 124
- Reservation of the rights of the identifiable owners, the law of salvage and other rules of admiralty 125

**CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW**

126
Chapter 5 - The Contiguous Zone

THE GENEVA CONVENTION ON THE TERRITORIAL SEA AND THE CONTIGUOUS ZONE
Legal status
  Coastal powers in the contiguous zone
  Effect of article 24 on cultural property found on the bed of the contiguous zone
THE UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA
Genesis and development of article 303
Analysis of article 303(2)
  Presumption or legal fiction?
  Scope of coastal rights over archaeological objects in the 24-mile zone
  Comparison of article 303(2) with article 2 of the Draft European Convention
Effect of article 303(3) and (4) on coastal rights over the 24-mile zone
  Reservation of the law of salvage and other rules of admiralty
  Reservation of the rights of the identifiable owners
  Reservation of laws and practices with respect to cultural exchanges
Reservation of other international agreements and rules of international law regarding the protection of objects of an archaeological and historical nature 175
Interpretation of the term “objects of an archaeological and historical nature” 176
The notion of “archaeological” and “historical” 177
Interpretation of the term “object” 182
Delimitation of the contiguous/archaeological zone 183
CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW 185

Chapter 6 - The High Seas 215

THE GENEVA CONVENTION ON THE HIGH SEAS 215
The principle of the freedom of the high seas 215
Criteria for the legitimate exercise of a freedom of the high seas 216
Jurisdictional powers on the high seas 216
Marine archaeology as an exercise of a freedom of the high seas 217
Degree of exclusivity of underwater archaeological activities 217
Legitimacy of the designation of marine archaeological reserves 217
Sanctions against illegal interference 219
Conflict between marine archaeology and other sea-uses 219
Flag State jurisdiction and the removal of historic shipwrecks 220
Conclusion 222
THE UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA 223
Legal status 223
Effect of article 303 on archaeological and historical objects found on the high seas 224
Duty to protect objects of an archaeological and historical nature and to co-operate therefor 224
Reservation of the rights of the identifiable owners, the law of salvage and laws and practices with respect to cultural exchanges 225
Reservation of international agreements and other rules of international law regarding the protection of archaeological and historical objects 228
Conclusion 229
CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW 229
Chapter 7 - The Continental Shelf and the Exclusive Economic Zone

THE GENEVA CONVENTION ON THE CONTINENTAL SHELF
The right to conduct archaeological research over the continental shelf

Exclusion of underwater cultural property from the notion of "natural resources" and the sovereign rights of the coastal State

Exclusion of archaeological research from the sovereign right to explore the continental shelf

Denial of the consent regime of the coastal State

Unilateral extension of coastal jurisdiction over underwater cultural property on the continental shelf

Legitimacy of claims

International and national implications

Obligation to report the accidental recovery of cultural property during mineral exploration and exploitation activities

THE UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA

The Continental Shelf

Legal status

Duty of States to protect archaeological and historical objects found on the continental shelf

The Exclusive Economic Zone

Legal status

Right to conduct archaeological research in the EEZ

The effect of articles 60 and 80 upon the conduct of archaeological research in the EEZ/continental shelf

Conflict between marine archaeology and other sea uses in the EEZ

Conclusion

CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW

Chapter 8 - The International Deep Seabed

THE GENEVA CONVENTION ON THE HIGH SEAS

THE UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA

Genesis and development of article 149

Analysis of article 149
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>xiii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Failure to designate an appropriate body to implement article 149</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substantive meaning of article 149</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction between article 149 and article 303(3)</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duty of the Authority to protect archaeological and historical objects</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflicting uses in the Area</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict between marine archaeology and &quot;activities in the Area&quot;</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict between marine archaeology and &quot;other activities in the marine environment&quot;</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 9 - Conclusion**

THE GENEVA CONVENTIONS                                              327
THE UN CONVENTION ON THE LAW OF THE SEA                                328
Negative factors                                                   330
Positive factors                                                   332
CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW                                         334

**PART THREE**

**Chapter 10 - Future developments**

NEED TO PROTECT CULTURAL PROPERTY FOUND IN MARINE SPACES BEYOND THE 24-MILE LIMIT 339
EXTENTION OF COASTAL JURISDICTION OVER THE CONTINENTAL SHELF          340
Adequacy of the existing legal definition of the continental shelf     340
Archaeological potential of the continental shelf                     343
Technological capabilities for undertaking archaeological operations on the continental shelf 345
Funding of archaeological projects and enforcement of national heritage laws 346
Justification of coastal claims over cultural property on the continental shelf 347
Coastal interest in the protection of underwater cultural property situated on the continental shelf 347
Effectiveness of claims 349

RECOGNITION OF THE INTERESTS OF THE STATE(S) OF ORIGIN IN THE DISCOVERED CULTURAL PROPERTY 350
The present state of the law 350
Need to attribute specific rights 352
Legal nature of claims by the State(s) of origin 353
  Restitution or return of cultural property to the country of origin 354
  Right to development and to self-determination 355
  Cultural rights of peoples 357
Conclusion 358

THE ILA DRAFT CONVENTION ON THE PROTECTION OF THE UNDERWATER CULTURAL HERITAGE 358

Bibliography 375

Annex: The ILA Draft Convention on the Protection of the Underwater Cultural Heritage 437

Table of Cases 445

Table of Treaties 449

Table of National Legislation 459

Index 475