

The Treatment of Prisoners Under International Law

NIGEL S. RODLEY

Second Edition

CLARENDON PRESS · OXFORD
1999

Contents

<i>Selected Abbreviations</i>	xix
<i>Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxv
General Introduction	I
The Development of an International Law of Human Rights Applicable to Prisoners	I
The Nature and Scope of the Problem	7
Torture and other ill-treatment	7
Executions	11
Disappearances	13
Prison conditions	13
The Inherent Dignity of the Enemy	14
The Approach	15
I. The Response of the United Nations General Assembly to the Challenge of Torture	18
Introduction	18
Discussion of Torture at the UN General Assembly 1973–1975	20
Resolution 3059 (xxviii) of 2 November 1973	20
Resolution 3218 (xxix) of 6 November 1974	23
The Fifth UN Congress on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders (1975)	28
<i>Changes in definition</i>	29
<i>International prohibition of torture</i>	31
<i>Effective measures by states</i>	32
<i>Implementation</i>	33
Resolution 3452 (xxx) of 9 December 1975—The Declaration against Torture	35
Developments Following the Adoption of the Declaration against Torture	37
Resolution 3453 (xxx) of 9 December 1975	37
<i>Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment</i>	37
<i>Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials</i>	38
<i>Principles of Medical Ethics</i>	38
<i>Implementation</i>	39
Resolutions 32/62, 32/63, and 32/64 of 8 December 1977	40
<i>A convention against torture</i>	41
<i>Questionnaire on the Declaration against Torture</i>	42
<i>Unilateral declarations against torture</i>	42
Summary	43

2. The Legal Prohibition of Torture and Other Ill-treatment	46
Introduction	46
Treaties Prohibiting Torture and Other Ill-treatment	47
The UN Convention against Torture	48
The OAS Convention against Torture	51
The human rights treaties	53
<i>The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i>	53
<i>Specific human rights treaties of universal applicability</i>	55
<i>Regional human rights treaties</i>	56
The humanitarian law treaties	57
<i>Common article 3 and Protocol II</i>	57
<i>The Geneva Conventions and Protocol I</i>	60
Unilateral declarations against torture	61
General International Law and Torture	62
The Charter of the United Nations	63
Customary international law	65
General principles of law	67
Judicial decisions	68
Teachings of publicists	73
Summary	73
3. What Constitutes Torture and Other Ill-treatment?	75
Introduction	75
Defining Torture	77
Justifiability?	78
Purpose	84
Degree of pain or suffering/aggravation	85
<i>The Northern Ireland case</i>	90
<i>Other cases</i>	95
Who commits torture?	100
What is 'Other Prohibited Ill-treatment'?	101
4. The Legal Consequences of Torture and Other Ill-treatment	107
The Legal Consequences of Torture	107
State responsibility for torture	107
<i>Investigation</i>	110
<i>Bringing to justice</i>	111
<i>Compensation</i>	114
<i>Measures against recurrence</i>	115
<i>Non-expulsion</i>	116
Individual responsibility for torture	120
The Legal Consequences of Other Prohibited Ill-treatment	130
Summary	132

5. International Remedies for Torture and Other Ill-treatment	134
Introduction	134
General Assembly Questionnaire on Torture	137
Sub-commission Annual Review of Prisoners' Rights	140
Special Rapporteur on Torture	145
Nature and function of the Special Rapporteur	147
UN Convention against Torture	150
Committee against Torture	152
<i>Review of periodic reports</i>	152
<i>Interstate complaints</i>	155
<i>Individual complaints</i>	155
<i>Inquiry into systematic practices of torture</i>	157
<i>Preventive visits?</i>	160
European Convention for the Prevention of Torture	161
History	161
The Committee	163
Visits	163
Publication	164
Voluntary Fund for Victims of Torture	166
Origins of the fund	166
Beneficiaries of the fund	170
Intermediaries	171
Country priorities	172
Nature of aid	173
Summary	175
6. Extra-legal Executions	177
General Prohibition of Murder by Government	177
Racially motivated killing and genocide	181
Extra-legal Executions as Arbitrary Deprivations of Life	182
Killings as necessary measures of law enforcement	182
Killings in non-international armed conflict	188
Killings in international armed conflicts	190
Legal Consequences of Extra-legal Executions	191
State responsibility	192
Individual responsibility	195
International Remedies	199
Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions	199
Summary	202
7. The Death Penalty	204
Introduction: The Objective of Abolition	204
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	207
Other UN initiatives	208
<i>Developments in political bodies</i>	208
<i>Optional Protocol to the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</i>	210
<i>Statutes of international criminal tribunals</i>	212

European Regional Developments	213
Inter-American developments	217
Limits to Capitally Punishable Offences	218
Lawful sanction	218
Only the 'most serious crimes'	219
No other human rights violations should be involved	220
Non-retroactivity	221
Political offences	222
Offences committed by persons under military occupation	223
Non-reintroduction	223
Procedural Restrictions on the Imposition of the Death Penalty	225
Fair trial	225
<i>Degree of proof</i>	229
Appeals	229
Clemency	231
Non-execution pending appeal and clemency procedures	232
Humane treatment	233
Persons Who May Not be Executed	236
Persons under 18 years old	236
Pregnant women and mothers	238
Persons over 70 years old (Americas region)	239
Insane persons	239
International Remedies	239
Secretary-General's 'best endeavours'	239
Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions	240
Summary	241
8. 'Disappeared' Prisoners: Unacknowledged Detention	243
'Disappearance'	243
The problem of defining 'disappearances'	245
The UN Response to 'Disappearances'	249
The International Law Prohibition of 'Disappearances'	254
The right to liberty and security of person	255
The right to humane conditions of detention and freedom from torture and ill-treatment	257
The right to life	261
Legal Consequences of 'Disappearances'	264
State responsibility	264
Individual responsibility	266
International Remedies	269
Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances	270
<i>The scope of the Working Group's concern</i>	270
<i>General approach</i>	271
<i>Countries considered</i>	272
<i>Sources of information</i>	272
<i>Screening of information received/admissibility</i>	273
<i>Transmittal of information</i>	274

<i>Country visits</i>	274
<i>Immediate action</i>	275
<i>Annual report</i>	276
9. Conditions of Imprisonment or Detention	277
The Legal Rules	277
Institutional Ill-treatment	279
Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners	279
Prison conditions in the <i>Greek</i> case	281
<i>Duration of conditions</i>	284
Practice of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture	285
Practice of the Human Rights Committee	286
<i>Prison conditions which violate human dignity</i>	289
Practice of the Special Rapporteur on Torture	292
Solitary Confinement	294
Medical or Scientific Experimentation on Human Beings	297
Other Areas of Possible Abuse of Prisoners	300
Persons detained on mental health grounds	300
Forcible feeding	303
Separation of categories of prisoner	303
Legal Consequences of Unlawful Treatment	304
International Remedies	305
Summary	306
10. Corporal Punishment	309
The Geography of Corporal Punishment	309
United Nations Activities Concerning Corporal Punishment	311
International Humanitarian Law	314
International Human Rights Law	316
Summary	323
11. Guarantees Against Abuses of the Human Person: Arbitrary Arrest and Detention	325
United Nations Body of Principles	326
Legal assistance	328
Communication with families	329
Length of interrogation	330
Pre- and post-interrogation medical examinations	330
Records of details of interrogations, medical examinations, and so on	331
Appearance before a judge and judicial supervision	331
Interrogation by the judiciary	332
Challenging the legality of detention and treatment	332
Incommunicado Detention and Habeas Corpus under Existing Law and Legal Instruments	334
Incommunicado detention under the Covenant	335
Habeas Corpus under the Covenant	337

Incommunicado detention and Habeas Corpus under the regional conventions	339
General International Law	340
States of Emergency	342
International monitoring of states of emergency	351
Summary	352
12. International Codes of Ethics for Professionals	354
Introduction	354
UN Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials	355
Background	355
Addressees of the Code	358
The scope of the Code	358
Expected response to non-compliance with the Code	362
Implementation	365
Training and dissemination	367
Council of Europe Declaration on the Police	368
Code(s) of Military Ethics?	370
UN Principles of Medical Ethics	371
Background	371
Addressees of the Principles	372
The scope of the Principles	373
Expected response to non-compliance with the Principles	377
Implementation	379
Training and dissemination	380
Ethical Principles for Lawyers?	381
General Conclusion—An Agenda	385
Proposals	385
General	385
✓ Torture and other ill-treatment	386
Extra-legal executions and the death penalty	387
‘Disappearances’	387
✓ Prison conditions	387
Professional ethics	388
Human rights awareness	388
<i>Annex 1.</i> Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Being Subjected to Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	389
<i>Annex 2a.</i> Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	391
<i>Annex 2b.</i> Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture	402
<i>Annex 2c.</i> European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	407
<i>Annex 3.</i> Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners	413

<i>Annex 4.</i> Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment	428
<i>Annex 5a.</i> Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials	436
<i>Annex 5b.</i> Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials	440
<i>Annex 5c.</i> Declaration on the Police—Part A	445
<i>Annex 6.</i> Principles of Medical Ethics relevant to the Role of Health Personnel, particularly Physicians, in the Protection of Prisoners and Detainees against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	447
<i>Annex 7.</i> Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-legal, Arbitrary, and Summary Executions	449
<i>Annex 8a.</i> Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance	453
<i>Annex 8b.</i> Inter-American Convention on the Forced Disappearance of Persons	459
<i>Annex 9a.</i> Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949— <i>Common Article 3</i>	465
<i>Annex 9b.</i> International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights— <i>Articles 6, 7, 9, and 10</i>	466
<i>Annex 9c.</i> European Convention on Human Rights— <i>Articles 2, 3, and 5</i>	468
<i>Annex 9d.</i> American Convention on Human Rights— <i>Articles 4, 5, and 7</i>	470
<i>Annex 9e.</i> African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights— <i>Articles 4–7</i>	472
Index	473