

Judging Evil

*Rethinking the Law of Murder
and Manslaughter*

Samuel H. Pillsbury



NEW YORK UNIVERSITY PRESS

New York and London

Contents

	<i>Preface: The Challenge of Criminal Responsibility</i>	<i>vii</i>
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xiii</i>
I	Deserved Punishment	
1	A Question of Value	3
	A discussion of the two main philosophical approaches to criminal justice: justice determined according to moral value of the person versus justice determined by the consequences of punishment.	
2	The Value of Choice	18
	An argument for the moral importance of choice; why choice has meaning even if it comes from the unchosen influences of genetics and environment.	
3	Punishment as Defense of Value	32
	A theory of deserved punishment; how punishment is deserved according to the offender's choice to disregard another's human worth.	
4	Just Punishment in an Unjust Society	47
	How individuals may deserve punishment even in an unjust society; an exploration of the need for strong but independent systems of individual and social responsibility for violent crime.	
5	Moralizing the Passions of Punishment	62
	A defense of deserved punishment against the charge of cruelty and an exploration of the hazards of emotive influence on criminal decision making.	

II		Defining Murder and Manslaughter	
6	From Principles to Rules: An Introduction to Mens Rea	An introduction to the most basic forms of culpability analysis in criminal law and an argument for mens rea as analysis of the reasons for conduct.	79
7	The Worst Crime of All	From serial killers to hate crimes, a look at the most aggravated forms of murder; why first-degree murder should depend on motive and not premeditation or the commission of a felony.	98
8	Crimes of Passion	Sex, race, class, and crimes of passion—a critical look at the law of voluntary manslaughter.	125
9	Crimes of Indifference	Depraved heart murder and involuntary manslaughter; an exploration of the evils of moral indifference.	161
	<i>Appendix: Proposed Jury Instructions</i>	Proposed jury instructions for proof of mens rea, murder, and manslaughter.	189
	<i>Notes</i>		197
	<i>Index</i>		261
	<i>About the Author</i>		264