Culture in the State Reporting Procedure of the UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies

How the HRC, the CESCR and the CEDAW use human rights as a sword to protect and promote culture, and as a shield to protect against harmful culture

Vincent Willem Vleugel
## CONTENTS

*Acknowledgements* .................................................. v

*Abbreviations* ......................................................... xiii

*Note on Citation Formats* ........................................... xiv

*Note on Grammar* ...................................................... xiv

Chapter 1
Introduction .......................................................... 1

1  Introduction ....................................................... 1
2  Purpose and Significance of the Study .......................... 5
3  Research Objective and Questions ............................... 9
4  Scope of the Research ........................................... 10
5  Structure and Methodology of the Research .................. 12

Chapter 2
Human Rights and Cultural Diversity. Between and Beyond Universalism and Cultural Relativism ...................... 17

1  Introduction ....................................................... 17
2  Culture, Cultural Diversity, and Cultural Arguments ........ 18
3  Cultural Values and Perspectives ................................ 22
   3.1 'Western bias' ............................................... 23
   3.2 Arab/Islamic perspective ..................................... 24
   3.3 Asian perspective ........................................... 26
   3.4 African perspective .......................................... 29
4  Universalism and Cultural Relativism: the Dichotomy and Beyond .................................................. 31
5  Concluding Remarks .............................................. 40

Chapter 3
UN Treaty Bodies. Treaties, Committees, Working Methods .................................................. 43

1  Introduction ....................................................... 43
2  The Treaties ....................................................... 43
   2.1 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) .................................................. 44
   2.2 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) ............................... 45
2.3 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) ........................................ 46
2.4 Reservations ................................................................. 47
3 The Committees ................................................................. 53
3.1 Human Rights Committee (HRC) ...................................... 53
3.2 Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) .... 54
3.3 Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAWCee) ........................................ 55
4 Working Methods ............................................................... 56
4.1 State reporting procedure .................................................. 57
4.2 General comments and recommendations ................................ 66
4.3 Strengthening and enhancing the effective functioning of the treaty body system .......................................... 68
5 Legal Status Treaty Body Output ............................................ 69
6 Legitimacy Challenges .......................................................... 71
7 Treaty Bodies' Roles in Reconciling Universality and Diversity .......... 74
8 Concluding Remarks ............................................................. 76

Chapter 4
Human Rights as a Sword. To Protect and Promote Cultural Diversity ........ 79

1 Introduction ........................................................................ 79
2 Cultural Exclusivity: Protecting and Promoting Cultural Distinctiveness and Exclusivity .................................................. 81
2.1 HRC .............................................................................. 82
2.1.1 Right to self-determination ............................................. 82
2.1.2 Right of members of minorities to enjoy their own culture .......... 84
2.1.3 Right to freedom of religion ............................................ 90
2.2 CESCR ........................................................................... 91
2.2.1 Right to self-determination ............................................. 91
2.2.2 Right to take part in cultural life ...................................... 95
2.3 CEDAWCee ................................................................. 105
3 Cultural Inclusivity: Protecting Cultural Diversity through Non-Discrimination and Equality Provisions ................................. 107
3.1 Non-discrimination and the enjoyment of equality: some preliminary notions .................................................. 107
3.2 Right to be different: permanent measures to ensure equality by accommodating differences in treatment .......................... 112
3.2.1 HRC ................................................................. 112
3.2.1.1 Freedom of religion .................................................... 113
3.2.1.2 Fair trial ................................................................. 113
3.2.2 CESCR ................................................................. 114
3.2.2.1 Education ............................................................... 114
# Chapter 6

Cultural Argumentation. The State Reporting Procedure as a Platform for Cross-Cultural Dialogue

## 1 Introduction

## 2 Cultural Arguments in the Discourse between States Parties and Committees

### 2.1 State party accepts need to change culture

#### 2.1.1 HRC

##### 2.1.1.1 Culture as 'explanation' for lack of progress

##### 2.1.1.2 Culture as 'excuse' for lack of compliance

#### 2.1.2 CESCR

##### 2.1.2.1 Culture as 'explanation' for lack of progress

##### 2.1.2.2 Culture as 'excuse' for lack of compliance

#### 2.1.3 CEDAWCee

##### 2.1.3.1 Culture as 'explanation' for lack of progress

##### 2.1.3.2 Culture as 'excuse' for lack of compliance

#### 2.1.4 Concluding Remarks

### 2.2 State party defends the room for culture

#### 2.2.1 HRC

#### 2.2.2 CESCR

#### 2.2.3 CEDAWCee

#### 2.2.4 Concluding Remarks

### 2.3 State party defends the culture

#### 2.3.1 HRC

##### 2.3.1.1 Culture is defended categorically

##### 2.3.1.2 Balancing of interests

#### 2.3.2 CESCR

##### 2.3.2.1 Culture is defended categorically

##### 2.3.2.2 Balancing of interests

#### 2.3.3 CEDAWCee

##### 2.3.3.1 Culture is defended categorically

##### 2.3.3.2 Balancing of interests

#### 2.3.4 Concluding Remarks

## 3 'Constructive Dialogue' or 'Destructive Contestation'?

### 3.1 Illustrative cases

#### 3.1.1 Dowry

#### 3.1.2 FGM/C

#### 3.1.3 Polygamy

### 3.2 Lack of explanation and due consideration

## 4 Concluding Remarks
Chapter 7  
Conclusions. How the Treaty Bodies Universalise Human Rights  

1 Introduction .................................................. 337  
2 UN Treaty Bodies' Role in Protecting and Promoting Positive Aspects of Cultural Diversity ........................................ 338  
3 UN Treaty Bodies' Role in Changing, Challenging and Eradicating Negative Aspects of Cultural Diversity .............................. 340  
4 Cultural Arguments in the Dialogue ................................ 341  
5 UN Treaty Bodies' Role in Enhancing Universal Legitimacy of Human Rights .......................................................... 344  
6 Overall Conclusions and Recommendations ......................... 346  

Bibliography ............................................................ 349  
Summary ................................................................. 361  
Samenvatting ......................................................... 369