The Protection of Foreign Investment in Times of Armed Conflict

JURE ZRILIČ
# Table of Contents

Table of Cases .................................................. xiii
Table of Instruments and Legislation ......................... xxvii
Select List of Abbreviations ................................. xli

1. Introduction .................................................. 1
   A. The Problem and the Questions .......................... 1
   B. The Concept of Armed Conflict ......................... 7
      1. Approaches to Conceptualizing Armed Conflict ... 7
      2. Typology of Conflicts ................................... 11
   C. Methodology, Limitations, and Plan of Discussion ... 12

2. Legal Frameworks for the Protection of Foreign Investment in Times of Armed Conflict .................. 17
   A. Introduction .................................................. 17
   B. State Responsibility for Injuries to Foreigners under Customary International Law .................... 18
      1. State Responsibility ......................................... 20
      2. State Non-Responsibility ................................... 23
      3. The Exception to State Non-Responsibility ........... 25
      4. From Mob Violence to Civil War ......................... 29
   C. Protections in International Humanitarian Law ...... 34
      1. Contemporary International Humanitarian Law ..... 38
         (a) International armed conflict ...................... 40
         (b) Non-international armed conflict .................. 47
   D. Protections in International Human Rights Law ...... 49
      1. Violations of Private Property in Times of Armed Conflict ........................................... 53
         (a) Violations of a negative obligation to refrain ... 53
         (b) Violations of a positive obligation to protect ... 54
   E. Preliminary Conclusions .................................. 56

3. The Effects of Armed Conflicts on Investment Treaties .................................................. 57
   A. Introduction .................................................. 57
   B. Applicability of the EACT Doctrine .................. 58
      1. Draft Articles on the Effects of Armed Conflicts on Treaties ........................................... 60
      2. The Application of EACT to Investment Treaties ................................................................. 62
      3. Analogies with FCN Treaties and Agreements Concerning Private Rights ................................... 65
         (a) Border-crossing provisions .......................... 67
         (b) Protection and security provisions .................. 68
(c) Procedural provisions 69

C. Applicability of the VCLT Doctrines 72
   1. Supervening Impossibility to Perform 74
   2. Fundamental Change of Circumstances 79

D. The Relationship between the EACT and VCLT Doctrines 83

E. Preliminary Conclusions 86

4. Investment Treaty Protections against Conflict-Related Injuries 88
   A. Introduction 88
   B. Full Protection and Security 89
      1. Scope of the Protection 91
         (a) Physical v legal protection 91
         (b) Protection against interference of state organs 95
      2. The Standard of Due Diligence 102
   C. Armed Conflict Clause 106
      1. Scope of the Clause 107
      2. Basic Armed Conflict Clause 109
      3. Advanced Armed Conflict Clause 112
         (a) Combat action 115
         (b) Necessity of the situation 119
      4. The Relationship between the Armed Conflict Clause and FPS 120
         (a) Basic armed conflict clause v FPS 121
         (b) Advanced armed conflict clause v FPS 122
   D. Other Relevant Protections 124
      1. Expropriation 124
      2. Fair and Equitable Treatment 130
   E. Preliminary Conclusions 132

5. Host State's Defences against Conflict-Related Investment Claims 133
   A. Introduction 133
   B. Security Exceptions 133
      1. Scope of Security Exceptions 137
         (a) Protection of a host state's essential security interests 138
         (b) Maintenance of a host state's public order 139
         (c) Maintenance or restoration of international peace and security 140
      2. Degree of State Autonomy in Reacting to a Threat 143
         (a) Self-judging exceptions 143
         (b) Non-self-judging exceptions 144
      3. The Relationship between Security Exceptions and other Investment
         Treaty Provisions 146
   C. General Defences in the Law of State Responsibility 149
      1. Necessity 150
      2. Force majeure 153
      3. Countermeasures 157
   D. Preliminary Conclusions 161
6. The Interplay of Investment Law and International Humanitarian Law 162
   A. Introduction 162
   B. Normative Conflicts 163
   C. AAPL v Sri Lanka: A Case against Fragmentation 166
      1. The Tribunal’s Analysis 167
      2. Precautions in Attack 169
      3. Proportionality 174
      4. Towards Convergence 178
   D. Methodology for Addressing Normative Tensions 181
      1. Political Hurdle 182
      2. Jurisdictional Hurdle 182
      3. Ex Ante Methods 184
      4. Ex Post Methods 185
         (a) Lex specialis 185
         (b) Jus in bello normative elements as a factual circumstance 188
         (c) Rules and principles of general international law 189
         (d) Principle of systemic integration 192
   E. Preliminary Conclusions 194

7. Investment Treaty Claims and Post-Conflict Justice 195
   A. Introduction 195
   B. Investment Treaties in the Post-Conflict Framework 196
      1. Macroeconomic Effect: Investment as a Condition for Peace 196
      2. Microeconomic Effect: Reparations 200
         (a) Interstate arbitrations and diplomatic protection 201
         (b) Lump sum settlements 203
         (c) Special tribunals 204
         (d) Direct access to justice 206
   C. Determining Post-Conflict Compensation 207
      1. Reasonable Standard of Compensation 209
      2. Valuation of Damages 210
      3. Principle of Equity 211
      4. Deferred Payment 214
   D. Reflections on Post-Conflict Dispute Resolution 215
      1. Oscillating between State and Investor Control 217
      2. Reclaiming State Control in Investment Treaties 220
   E. Preliminary Conclusions 223

8. Conclusion 225
   A. Conflicting Interests 225
   B. Types/Conditions of Conflict 226
   C. Dominant Paradigms 229
      1. The Investment Paradigm 230
TABLE OF CONTENTS

2. The Security Paradigm 231
3. Shifting the Paradigms 234
D. Concluding Remarks 237

Bibliography 239
Index 255