THE TRANSNATIONAL ILLEGAL ADOPTION MARKET

A CRIMINOLOGICAL STUDY OF THE GERMAN AND DUTCH INTERCOUNTRY ADOPTION SYSTEMS

ELVIRA LOIBL

International publishing
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements xvi

## I Introduction 1

1 Central Focus and Scope 1

2 Methodological Framework 8

2.1 Interdisciplinary Approach 8

2.2 Comparative Approach 9

2.3 Case Study Approach 12

2.4 Data Sources and Analysis 13

2.4.1 Legal sources 13

2.4.2 Policy, academic and media sources 14

2.4.3 Semi-structured interviews 15

2.4.4 Adopters’ autobiographic stories 18

2.5 Ethical Considerations 19

3 Structure of the Book 20

4 Terminology 22

## II Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes – A Criminological Analysis of the Illegal Adoption Market 25

1 Introduction 25

2 The Structural Components of the Transnational Illegal Adoption Market 27

2.1 The Basic Logic of Routine Activity Theory 27

2.2 Demand Component 28

2.2.1 From a humanitarian deed to a remedy for involuntary childlessness 28

2.2.2 The role of adoption agencies 32

2.3 Supply Component 33

2.3.1 Source countries 33

2.3.2 Illegal practices to secure adoptable children 38

2.4 Social Control Component 41

2.4.1 Child laundering – connecting demand and illegal supply 41

2.4.2 Adoption agencies’ representatives and cooperation partners in the sending countries 45
## Table of Contents

2.5 Criminogenic Asymmetries between Demand and Source Countries

2.6 Displacements Effects of Supply Reduction and 'Cycles of Abuse'

3 The International Legal Framework on Child Trafficking

4 The Prism of Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes
   4.1 The Crime Prism
   4.2 The Prismatic Analysis of Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes
      4.2.1 Individual and social harm
      4.2.2 Invisibility
      4.2.3 Extent of victimization
      4.2.4 Lack of public agreement on seriousness
      4.2.5 Low probability of severe social response

5 Conclusion and Discussion

### III The Rights of the Child and the 'Best Interests' Principle in Intercountry Adoption

1 Introduction

2 Positions on the Legitimacy of Intercountry Adoption
   2.1 Abolitionists
   2.2 Promoters
   2.3 Regulationists

3 Background and Development of the UNCRC

4 Family and the Rights of the Child
   4.1 The Definition of the Family
   4.2 The Child's Right to be Cared for by His or Her Parents
   4.3 The Primacy of the Child’s Family and Parents
   4.4 The State’s Responsibility to Support the Child’s Family and Parents
   4.5 The Child’s Right to Privacy and Family Life
   4.6 Separation of the Child from His or Her Parents
   4.7 The Child’s Right to know His or Her Origin and Identity

5 Children Deprived of Their Family Environment
   5.1 Alternative Child Care Solutions
   5.2 Adoption
   5.3 The Myth of a Global 'Orphan Crisis'

6 The Best Interests of the Child
   6.1 Meaning and Historical Background of the Concept
# Table of Contents

## V The German Intercountry Adoption System

1. Introduction .................................................. 179
2. History, Development and Current Trends .................. 183
3. The German Legal Framework of Intercountry Adoption .. 186
   3.1 Stakeholders in the German Adoption System ........ 187
   3.2 International Adoption Placement Procedure .......... 188
   3.3 Judicial Adoption Procedure .......................... 190
   3.4 Adoption Recognition and Conversion Procedure ...... 193
   3.5 The Child’s Entry into Germany ....................... 195
4. Tolerance towards Private Adoptions ...................... 196
   4.1 International Adoptions in Germany – Often a ‘Private Affair’ ........................................ 196
   4.2 Adopters’ Motivation to Pursue a Do-It-Yourself Adoption ............................................. 199
   4.3 No Ban, No Negative Consequences ................. 200
5. German Adoption Agencies Caught in a Tension between Integrity and Money ....................................... 211
   5.1 Accreditation and Authorization Requirements ... 211
   5.2 Financial Strain ....................................... 213
   5.3 Competition among Helpers ............................ 218
6. Cooperation with the Sending Countries – A Matter of Trust ........................................................ 220
   6.1 Foreign Partners, the Cogs in the Adoption System ......................................................... 220
   6.2 Adoption Costs – Don’t Ask, Don’t Tell ..................... 220
   6.3 Incentive Fees and Donations ......................... 224
   6.4 Supervision of Representatives and Cooperation Partners ............................................... 226
7. The Ethiopian Child Trafficking Incidents .................. 230
   7.1 Systemic Abuses in the Ethiopian Adoption System ...................................................... 230
   7.2 The German Agency’s Ideological and Financial Motivation to Place Children from Ethiopia .... 235
   7.3 Hear No Evil, See No Evil – Techniques of Rationalization .............................................. 237
8. The Role of the German Authorities in the Adoption System .................................................... 243
   8.1 Accrediting, Authorizing and Controlling German Adoption Agencies ...................................... 243
   8.2 Reviewing Individual Adoptions (Control on Micro Level) ................................................... 245
   8.3 Authorizing, Monitoring and Suspending Adoptions from Sending Countries (Control on Macro Level) .................................................. 251
   8.4 Central Adoption Offices as Adoption Placement Offices ..................................................... 259

---

6 Conclusion ..................................................... 176
### Table of Contents

#### 9 Criminal Liability of German Actors
- 9.1 Child Trafficking (§ 236 StGB)
  - 9.1.1 Adopters
  - 9.1.2 Staff members of an adoption agency
- 9.2 Other Relevant Criminal Provisions

#### 10 Conclusion and Discussion

#### VI The Dutch Intercountry Adoption System

1. **Introduction**
2. **History, Developments and Current Trends**
3. **The Dutch Legal Framework of Intercountry Adoption**
   - 3.1 Stakeholders in the Dutch Adoption System
   - 3.2 International Adoption Placement Procedure
   - 3.3 Judicial Adoption Procedure
   - 3.4 Adoption Recognition and Conversion Procedure
   - 3.5 The Child’s Entry into the Netherlands
4. **Independent Adoptions**
   - 4.1 Partial Do-It-Yourself Adoptions (deelbemiddelingen)
   - 4.2 Risks and Limitations of Partial Do-It-Yourself Adoptions
   - 4.3 Private (Illegal) Adoptions – Prohibited but Not Properly Sanctioned
5. **Dutch Adoption Agencies**
   - 5.1 Accreditation and Authorization Requirements
   - 5.2 Financial Strain
6. **Cooperation with the Sending Countries**
   - 6.1 Dutch Adoption Agencies’ Partners and Their Tasks in the Sending Countries
   - 6.2 Adoption Costs, Donations and ‘Facilitation Payments’
   - 6.3 Supervision of Foreign Representatives and Cooperation Partners
7. **The Role of the Dutch Authorities in the Adoption System**
   - 7.1 Accrediting and Controlling Dutch Adoption Agencies
   - 7.2 Reviewing and Approving Individual Adoptions (Control on Micro Level)
   - 7.3 Authorizing, Monitoring and Suspending Adoptions from Sending Countries (Control on Macro Level)
   - 7.4 The Dutch Ministry’s Deference to China
     - 7.4.1 The Chinese child trafficking incidents
# Table of Contents

7.4.2 Trust in the authorities of Hague sending countries 339

7.4.3 Diplomatic and other interests in intercountry adoptions 343

8 Criminal Liability of Dutch Actors 347

8.1 Adopters 347

8.2 Staff Members of an Adoption Agency 351

9 Discussion and Conclusion 352

VII Parenthood, Consumption and Narratives of Rescue and Love in Intercountry Adoption 357

1 Introduction 357

2 The Tension between Consumption and Parenthood in Intercountry Adoption 358

3 Methodology and Theoretical Background 361

4 The Desire to Achieve Parenthood 367

4.1 Involuntary Childlessness and the Powerful Wish to Have a Child 367

4.2 Saving a Child 374

4.3 Choosing the 'Right' Child 379

4.4 Paying for an Adoption 386

5 Becoming Parents 390

5.1 Finding the 'Meant-To-Be'-Child 390

5.2 Exhibiting Ownership 395

5.3 'Bringing Home My Child' 397

6 Discussion and Conclusion 402

VIII Comparative Analysis, General Conclusions, and Recommendations 407

1 Introduction 407

2 The Transnational Illegal Adoption Market 407

2.1 Demand and Supply 407

2.2 The Laundering Process 408

2.3 Criminogenic Asymmetries 410

2.4 The Dimensions of Child Trafficking for Adoption Purposes 411

3 The Criminogenic Conditions in the German and Dutch Adoption Systems 413

3.1 The Principle of the Child's Best Interests 413

3.2 Private Adoptions in Germany and the Netherlands 416
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.3</th>
<th>Institutional Pressure of German and Dutch Adoption Agencies</th>
<th>418</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>The Flow of Money into the Sending Countries</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>The Monitoring and Control System in Germany and the</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Trust in the Hague Sending Countries</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Adopters' Denying the Role of Money in Intercountry Adop-</td>
<td>430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>tions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Banning Intercountry Adoptions?</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Intercountry Adoptions carried out by the State?</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Accountability of Adoption Agencies</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Regulating the Flow of Money into the Sending Countries</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Strengthening the Role of the German and the Dutch Central</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Authority</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Designating the German and Dutch Immigration Authorities</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>as Gatekeepers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Criminalizing the Purchase of Children for Adoption</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Reconsidering the Way We Think about Intercountry Adop-</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>tion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References 443