The functional field of food law
Reconciling the market and human rights

Liber Amicorum Bernd van der Meulen

edited by:
Altinay Urazbaeva
Anna Szajkowska
Bart Wernaart
Nikolaas Tilkin Franssens
Rozita Spirovska Vaskoska

European Institute for Food Law series no. 11
# Table of contents

**Introduction** 17  
References 23  

**Part 1 – Human rights dimensions in food law**

1. **The silence of the rights holders**  27  
*George Kent*

1.1 Human rights and other rights 27  
1.2 Rights-based social systems 28  
1.3 Invisibility 30  
1.4 Dignity 33  
1.5 Professionalization of human rights work 37  
References 38  

2. **Enforcing the right to food: how rights-based are the best practices?** 41  
*Bart Wernaart*

2.1 Rejecting a rights-based approach towards ECOSOC rights 41  
2.2 What we can learn from the domestic legal context of the best practices 44  
2.3 Concluding remarks 52  
References 53  

3. **India's Right To Food Act: human rights for tribal communities' forest food** 55  
*Purabi Bose*

3.1 Introduction 55  
3.2 Right to food governance, rights-based approach to food security 56  
3.3 Indigenous forest food cultures: empirical evidence, study area and population 60  
3.4 Forests for food and nutrition security: findings 62  
3.5 Analysis and discussions 66  
3.6 Conclusions 70  
References 71  

---

*The functional field of food law* 7
# Table of contents

## 4. The right to food and trias politica: a Dutch reflection

*Marca van Dijk and Bart Wernaart*

4.1 Introduction 73  
4.2 The enforceability of the right to food in Dutch case law 74  
4.3 Qualified monism 76  
4.4 The Dutch Legislature on the enforceability of ECOSOC rights 79  
4.5 The law-making function of the Judiciary in the Netherlands 81  
4.6 Concluding remarks 84  
References 85

## Part 2 – International dimensions in food law

### 5. Food safety and plant breeding – why are there no problems in practice?

*Niels Louwaars*

5.1 Plants and food 89  
5.2 Evolving plant breeding methods 91  
5.3 Plant breeding and risk 93  
5.4 Future needs 97  
5.5 Conclusion 98  
References 99

### 6. Thought for food – chemicals, health, and the law

*Jaap C. Hanekamp*

6.1 Ruinous reality? 103  
6.2 Horrible halogens? 105  
6.3 Halting assessments of hazard 106  
6.4 Restraining the risk regulation reflex 107  
6.5 Epidemiological evasion 108  
6.6 The future of food law – costs and benefits 110  
References 112

### 7. Access to information versus protection of the deliberative process

*André Hofman*

7.1 Introduction 113  
7.2 Open government, freedom of information and access to information 114  
7.3 The ratio of protecting the deliberative process 115  
7.4 Protection of the deliberative process in some legal systems 116  
7.5 Conclusion 126  
References 128
### Table of contents

8. Putting the ‘private’ into the ‘private and non-commercial use’ exception in patent law: what does it really mean?  
*Bernard H. Maister*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Introduction</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 The ‘Private and Non-commercial Use’ exception</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 Definitions</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 The ‘3-step’ test</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 Applying the 3-step test to the ‘private’ criterion</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6 Conclusion</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. Shaping solutions to climate change and food (in)security by integrating peoples’ environmental knowledge in the Arctic regions  
*Margherita Paola Poto*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Introduction</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Vulnerability of the Arctic environment and of the Arctic peoples</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Co-governance of the marine environment</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Steps towards a cooperative system of marine conservation in northern Norway: integrated protection of the marine areas</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Conclusions</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. The regulatory framework for the use of probiotics claims in food and food supplements around the world: a comparative analysis  
*Sebastián Romero Melchor, Lara Skoblikov and Béatrice Schütte*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Introduction</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Probiotics and prebiotics in the EU</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Probiotics and prebiotics in the USA</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 Probiotics and prebiotics in Russia</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5 Probiotics and prebiotics in China</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6 Probiotics and prebiotics in Japan</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7 Probiotics and prebiotics in Brazil</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8 Probiotics and prebiotics in Mexico</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.9 Probiotics and prebiotics in Argentina</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.10 Probiotics and prebiotics in Colombia</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.11 Conclusion</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table of contents

#### 11. The breeder’s right treaties and laws

*Jaap Kras*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.1 The Association of Agricultural Law (VAR: <em>Vereniging Agrarisch Recht</em>)</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2 Is the breeder’s right strengthening?</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 Essentially derived variety</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4 The goal of intellectual property rights</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5 The character of an intellectual property right</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6 Important breeder’s right treaties</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.7 Distinctiveness</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.8 Conclusions</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Part 3 – European dimensions in food law

#### 12. Has EU Food Law reached its best before date?

*Martin Holle*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.1 Introduction</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2 The re-nationalisation trend</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3 Distortion of EU food law on national level</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4 National challenges of EU risk assessment</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.5 Consequences for a future EU regulatory framework</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 13. Italian style in law making: the breakout fashion years for food origin and the compliance with EU law

*Valeria Paganizza*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.1 Introduction</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2 Regulation 1169/2011 and the gaps to fill in</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3 Commission Implementing Regulation 2018/775</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4 The four Decrees on the origin of food</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5 The Italian Legislative Decree on production or packaging facility</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6 Critical points</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7 Conclusion: what can we learn from the Italian case?</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of contents

## 14. How to improve consumer information
*Theo Appelhof*

14.1 Introduction 203
14.2 Unfair commercial practices 204
14.3 General Food Law 205
14.4 The Food Information to Consumers Regulation 206
14.5 Conclusion 213
14.6 Recommendations 213
References 215

## 15. Control of online food
*Antonia Corini*

15.1 Introduction 217
15.2 The new Official Controls Regulation 218
15.3 Selling online – EU digital market 221
15.4 Official controls on products sold online 222
15.5 Conclusions 225
References 226

## 16. New breeding techniques in the light of European GMO regulations
*Gema Fernández Albiójar*

16.1 Introduction 229
16.2 Breeding techniques 230
16.3 Different new plant breeding techniques 231
16.4 The European legal definition for GMOs 236
16.5 Analysis of the definition 237
16.6 The case of mutagenesis technique at the European Court of Justice 240
16.7 The European Court of Justice preliminary ruling 241
References 243

## 17. Transparency and consumer trust in scientific assessments under European food law
*Alie de Boer*

17.1 Introduction 246
17.2 European Food Law 247
17.3 The consumer's need for transparency in food safety 250
17.4 Potential effects of the adjusted transparency 252
17.5 Concluding remarks and future perspectives 253
References 254

---

*The functional field of food law* 11
Table of contents

18. Rules, tools, and trends of the EGFL Laboratory  257
Ferdinando Albisinni

18.1 Premise  257
18.2 Technological and legal innovation  259
18.3 Reactive and proactive innovation in European Food Law  265
18.4 The extension to other areas of regulation of the legal tools elaborated in Food Law  269
18.5 A polycentric regulatory system – globalisation and new sources in the EU Law making process  270
18.6 Conclusion: from Food Legislation to European and Global Food Law  273
References  274

19. Food alerts and RASFF  277
Vicente Rodríguez Fuentes

19.1 Introduction  277
19.2 Legal principles applicable to the use of RASFF  282
19.3 Several legal questions arising from the current regulation of RASFF  287
19.4 Conclusion  294
References  294

20. Food import into the EU: in regulatory transition  295
Martha Cecilia Kühn

20.1 Introduction  295
20.2 Compliance with EU food law: initial considerations, global differences  296
20.3 Responsibility for food imports  297
20.4 Requirements on food imports  299
20.5 Official controls  308
20.6 Outcome  310
20.7 Developments: ‘OCR’, the new Official Controls Regulation  312
20.8 Summary and conclusions  315
References  315
Table of contents

   Rob J.G.M. Widdershoven

21.1 Introduction 317
21.2 Europeanisation of enforcement actions before 2000 319
21.3 Centralisation of enforcement actions at EU level 320
21.4 Increasing criminalisation of violations of EU law 322
21.5 Development of transnational enforcement tools 324
21.6 More focus on individuals’ procedural guarantees and fundamental rights 326
21.7 Conclusion 327
References 327

22. Nutritional information for consumers – is it really useful? Limits and future prospects 331
   Luis González Vaqué

22.1 Introduction 331
22.3 Directive 2000/13/EC relating to the labelling, presentation and advertising of foodstuffs 334
22.4 Regulation (EU) No 1169/2011 on the provision of food information to consumers 334
22.5 Conclusions 342
References 344

Part 4 – Non-European dimensions in food law

23. The structure of Chinese food law 347
   Jasmin Buijs

23.1 Introduction 347
23.2 The development of food law in the PRC 349
23.3 China’s food legislative-regulatory framework 351
23.4 Framework of systemisation 352
23.5 Aim and scope 354
23.6 General principles 355
23.7 Actors involved 357
23.8 From factory to fork: responsibilities of food producers and distributors 359
23.9 Discussion and conclusion 361
References 362
# Table of contents

24. The flaws of food labels and the application of the punitive damages principle 365  
   Zheng Yu, Xiao Pinghui, Yang He  

24.1 Introduction 365  
24.2 'Punitive damages' and exceptions under the 2015 FSL Amendment 367  
24.3 Analysis of cases in relation to the defects of food labelling 369  
24.4 Issues regarding flaws of imported pre-packaged food labels 376  
24.5 Discussion on food labels and value to consumers 378  
References 380  

25. Safety regulation from pig production to pork supply: the case of China 381  
   Juanjuan Sun  

25.1 Introduction 381  
25.2 An overview of legislative intervention 383  
25.3 Challenges in the compliance and enforcement 388  
25.4 Suggestions for better regulation in pig sector 392  
References 395  

26. New plant breeding technologies: US Department of Agriculture policy 397  
   Margaret Rosso Grossman  

26.1 Introduction 397  
26.2 US regulation of GM crops: a brief review 398  
26.3 US Regulation of new breeding technologies 404  
26.4 European Court of Justice: Confédération paysanne 408  
26.5 Conclusion 410  
References 413  

27. From public to private: food regulation's movement to the private realm 417  
   A. Bryan Endres  

27.1 Introduction 417  
27.2 Regulatory structure 418  
27.3 Biotechnology 420  
27.4 Sustainable and local 421  
27.5 Natural 423  
27.6 Other misleading claims 423  
27.7 Biotechnology revisited 425  
27.8 Conclusion 426  
References 427  

The functional field of food law
# Table of contents

28. Mechanisms for additional protection of rights of plant breeders: seed certification and anti-counterfeit regulations  
*Peter Munyi*  

28.1 Introduction  
28.2 The situation of PBRs in Kenya  
28.3 The seed certification requirement  
28.4 Anti-counterfeiting regulation in relation to PBRs  
28.5 Discussion  
28.6 Conclusion  
References  

29. Korean food law administration and governance in food certification system  
*Seunghye Wang*  

29.1 Introduction  
29.2 The legal framework and requirements for food certification systems  
29.3 Current certification system in Korean Food Law  
29.4 Role and relationship between food companies and food sanitary administrative authority  
29.5 Conclusion  
References  

Epilogue  
*Rozita Spirovskas Vaskoska and Martha Cecilia Kühn*  

About the editors