Tax and the Digital Economy
Challenges and Proposals for Reform

Edited by
Werner Haslehner
Georg Kofler
Katerina Pantazatou
Alexander Rust

ATOZ Foundation
under the aegis of Fondation de Luxembourg

Wolters Kluwer
# Table of Contents

Editors v

Contributors vii

Preface and Acknowledgements xxiii

## CHAPTER 1
The 2018 OECD Interim Report

*Eric Robert*

§1.01 Introduction 1

§1.02 The OECD/G20 BEPS Project and the 2015 OECD BEPS Action 1 Report 2

§1.03 Renewed G20 Interest and the 2018 OECD Interim Report 4

[A] Value Creation and Business Models 4

[B] Positive Impacts of BEPS Implementation 5

[C] Towards a Global Consensus-Based Reform of the International Income Tax System 6

[D] Interim Measures 7

[E] Beyond International Income Tax Rules 8

§1.04 The Road Ahead 8

## CHAPTER 2
The ‘Genuine Link’ Requirement for Source Taxation in Public International Law

*Juliane Kokott*

§2.01 Introduction 9

§2.02 Definitions 10

[A] The Genuine Link under Public International Law 10

[1] The *Lotus Case* and the Principle of Territoriality 10
Table of Contents

[B] Links/Nexus in Tax Law 15
[1] Residence Taxation 15
[2] Source Taxation 16
§2.03 The Genuine Link Requirement for Source Taxation 16
[A] Lack of Adequate Rules 16
[B] Virtual Establishments, Place of Consumption, and the Destination Principle 17
[1] Redefining Territoriality 17
§2.04 The Future: Apportionment or Move Towards Indirect Taxation? 21
[A] Apportionment 21
[B] Move Towards Indirect Taxation 22
§2.05 Conclusions 23

CHAPTER 3
EU and WTO Law Limits on Digital Business Taxation
Werner Haslehner 25

§3.01 Introduction 25
§3.02 Digital Business Taxation Reform: Background 26
[A] Tax Policy Challenges Arising from Digitalization 26
§3.03 EU Law Limits 29
[A] Limits on EU Member States 29
[1] Member States Legislative Competence 29
[2] Internal Market Rules 30
[B] Limits on the EU Legislature 36
[1] EU Legislative Competence 36
[2] Internal Market Rules 40
[3] Public International Law 41
§3.04 WTO Law Limits 43
[A] The WTO Legal Framework: Application to Tax Law 43
[B] Potential Application to Digital Tax Proposals 45
§3.05 Conclusion 47

CHAPTER 4
Fairness of the Taxation of the Digital Economy
Gianluigi Bizioli 49

§4.01 Introduction 49
§4.02 The (Slippery) Meanings of Tax Fairness 50
[A] Tax Fairness in the Economic and Legal Literature: A Review


[B] The International Scenario 57

§4.03 Tax Fairness and the Proposals for the Taxation of the Digital Economy

[A] The Meaning of Tax Fairness Raised by the OECD and EU Documents on Digital Economy Taxation 59

§4.04 Do the Proposed Solutions Comply with Traditional Concepts of Tax Fairness?

[A] Introduction: A Brief Summary of the Proposed Solutions 61

§4.05 Are the Solutions and the Proposals for Digital Economy Taxation Fair? A Preliminary Conclusion 63

§4.06 Conclusions 65

CHAPTER 5
Tax Policy for the Digitalized Economy under Benjamin Franklin’s Rule for Decision-Making

Andrés Báez Moreno & Yariv Brauner 67

§5.01 Introduction and Scope 67

§5.02 Describing the Proposed Tax Policy Options 71


[B] A WHT on Certain Types of (Digital) Transactions 74

[C] A Digital Equalization Levy 75

§5.03 Our Proposal to Establish a Stand-Alone Gross-Basis Final WHT on (Cross-Border) Services in B2B Contexts 76

[A] A Stand-Alone Final WHT 77

[B] A WHT on (Cross-Border) B2B Services 77

[1] The Exclusion of Goods 77

[2] A Mere Reference to Services 79

[3] Cross-Border (or Also Domestic) Services 79


§5.04 A WHT Solution Vis-à-Vis Other Policy Alternatives 82

[A] Design and Implementation Issues 83

[1] Definition and Control of Thresholds 83

[2] Profit Attribution 85


[a] Digital and Non-digital Transactions 87


[c] Domestic and Cross-Border Transactions 89
Table of Contents

[d] Method of Taxation (Net Versus Gross Taxation) 90
[e] Compliance and Enforcement 92

[B] Legal Consistency Issues 93
[1] Double Taxation Conventions (DTCs) 93
[3] EU Law 97

§5.05 Conclusions 98

CHAPTER 6
Equalization Taxes and the EU’s ‘Digital Services Tax’

Georg Kofler & Julia Sinnig 101

§6.01 Introduction and Background 101
[B] Potential Approaches: OECD and EU 106
[C] EU Directive Proposals: SDP and DST 110

§6.02 The Idea of Equalization Taxes: Assessment and Criticism 114
[A] Equalization Taxes in OECD BEPS Action 1 114
[B] Policy and Technical Challenges of Equalization Levies 117
[a] Compliance with International Obligations (Tax Treaties, EU Law, and WTO Law) 119
[b] Temporary Nature of an Equalization Tax as an Interim Measure 122
[c] Targeted Scope of an Equalization Tax 122
[d] Minimizing Overtaxation 123
[e] Minimizing Impact on Start-Ups, Business Creation, and Small Businesses 124
[f] Minimizing Cost and Complexity 125

§6.03 The EU’s DST 126
[A] Policy Objectives 126
[B] Legal Basis 127
[C] The DST’s Characteristics 128
[1] Tax Rate, Taxable Persons, and the Tax Base 128
[2] Taxable Transactions and Place of Taxation 129
[D] DST Challenges and Practical Issues 133
[1] Incompatibility and Lack of Coordination with Existing Legal Frameworks 134
[a] Relationship with Double Tax Conventions: Double Taxation 134
CHAPTER 7
Peter Bräumann

§7.01 Introduction
§7.02 The Questionable Rationale Behind ‘Digital PEs’
[A] The Changed Stance Towards ‘Physical Presence’: Still Physical after All
[B] Shifting Income Taxation to the Demand Side of Business Operations?
[C] ‘Value Creation’ as Substantial Counterargument to Demand Orientation?
[D] The True Background: Tax Policy and the Sentiment of Revenue Lost by ‘Importers’ of Digital Services

§7.03 SDP: The ‘Digital PE’ as Concretely Proposed by the European Commission
[A] Legal Framework
[B] Territorial Scope
[D] Thresholds for Establishing a SDP
[E] Profit Attribution to an Established SDP

§7.04 Résumé

CHAPTER 8
Tax Treatment of Digital Currencies
Michael Tumpel & Johannes Kofler

§8.01 What Are Digital Currencies?
§8.02 The Blockchain Technology Behind Cryptocurrencies
§8.03 Questions Related to the Tax Treatment of Digital Currencies
§8.04 Digital Currencies as a Means of Payment
§8.05 Private Investments in Digital Currencies
§8.06 Verification of Transactions of Digital Currencies
§8.07 Mining of Digital Currencies
§8.08 Income Tax Questions
§8.09 Conclusion
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 9

**Taxing Remote Digital Supplies**

*Marie Lamensch*

- §9.01 ‘Digital Supplies’: A Conceptual Challenge for the VAT System 189
- §9.02 Electronically Supplied Services: EU VAT Directive Place of Supply and Related Collection Rules 193
  - [A] B2B Electronically Supplied Services 193
    - [1] Destination-Based Taxation and Reverse Charge 193
    - [2] Customer Identification 194
    - [3] Customer Location 196
    - [4] Changes to Come with the Adoption of the E-Commerce Package? 198
  - [B] B2C Electronically Supplied Services 199
    - [1] Destination-Based Taxation and the MOSS System 199
    - [2] Customer Location 201
    - [3] A Deeming Provision for Platforms 203
    - [4] Changes to Come with the Adoption of the E-Commerce Package? 206
    - [a] An ‘E-Commerce Package for All B2C E-Commerce Transactions’ 206
    - [b] Availability of the Non-union Scheme for Non-EU Suppliers with an EU VAT Number 207
    - [c] A First Threshold of EUR 10,000 (as of 2019) 207
    - [d] Home Country Rules for Invoicing and Record-Keeping 208
    - [e] Relaxed Customer Identification Requirement below a Second Threshold of EUR 100,000 208
    - [f] Longer Deadlines to Submit MOSS Returns and Easier Procedure to Correct VAT Returns 209
    - [g] Final Comments on the E-commerce Package 209
- §9.03 Electronically Supplied Services: EU VAT Directive Provisions on Reduced Rates and Recent EC Proposal 209
  - [A] Current Rules 209
  - [B] EC Proposal: Possibility to Apply Reduced Rates in the Future? 212
- §9.04 Conclusions and Final Comments 213

## Chapter 10

**The Taxation of the Sharing Economy**

*Katerina Pantazatou*

- §10.01 Introduction 215
- §10.02 What Is the Sharing Economy? 216
- §10.03 Taxing the Platform and the Service Providers: Recurring Issues 218
Table of Contents

[A] As a Fiscal Substitute for Wage and Payroll Taxes 267
[1]  ... Justified as a Tax on Imputed Income? 268
[2]  ... Justified as an Equalization Levy? 269
[3]  Restraints Imposed by International Tax Competition 271


[C] As a Pigouvian Tax 274

§12.04 A Common Challenge: Defining the Scope of a 'Robot Tax' 277
§12.05 Other Tax Implications of the Increasing Use of Intelligent Robots 278
§12.06 Conclusions 279

CHAPTER 13
Big Data in Tax Collection and Enforcement
Tina Ehrke-Rabel 283

§13.01 Introduction 283
§13.02 Tax Collection and Enforcement
[A] Information Asymmetry and Personal Autonomy 286
[B] Traditional Tax Collection and Enforcement 288
[D] Legal Constraints of Tax Collection and Enforcement 294
[1] Rule of Law 294
[2] Right to Respect for Private and Family Life and Correspondence 295
[3] Right to Protection of Personal Data 297

[E] Conclusion 299

§13.03 Big Data Analytics in Tax Matters 300
[A] Definition of Big Data 300
[B] Purpose, Use and Benefits of Big Data 301
[1] Purpose 301
[2] Use of Big Data 302

[C] Big Data in Tax Matters: Really in Use? 303

§13.04 Legal Concerns 305
[A] Introduction 305
[B] The OECD's Vision of Big Data Benefits in Tax Matters 305
[C] Position 1: Big Data Analytics Do Not Raise Any Legal Concerns 307
[D] Position 2: Big Data Analytics Raise Legal Concerns 309
[a] Preliminary Remarks 309
[b] Technical Specificities of Big Data Algorithms 309
[c] Prediction 310
[d] Opacity 311
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[e]</td>
<td>Algorithms Magnify Programmed Biases</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Input Data-Related Concerns</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[a]</td>
<td>Origin of the Data</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[b]</td>
<td>Accuracy of the Data</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[c]</td>
<td>Cross-Checking of Data</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Concerns Related to the Psychological Impact of Big Data Algorithms</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

§13.05 Legal Actions To Take

[A] Introduction                                             315


[1] Basic Requirements on Big Data Analytics                  315


[C] Privacy                                                   319

[1] Preliminary Remarks                                        319

[2] Taxpayer Monitoring                                        320

[a] Justifying Interferences with the Right to Privacy in General 320

[b] Legitimacy of Taxpayer Monitoring                          320


[d] Conclusion                                                325

[3] Taxpayer Profiling and GDPR                                 325

[a] Big Data Analytics as Taxpayer Profiling                   325

[b] Rights and Obligations with Regard to Profiling             325

[c] Limitations                                               326

[d] Conclusion                                                327

[D] Conclusion                                                328

§13.06 Use and Purpose of Tax Big Data Analytics                328

[A] Data Storage                                              328

[B] Real-Time Monitoring Through IoT                           328

[C] Audit Selection                                           329

[D] ‘Targeted Advertising’ of Taxpayers                         331

[1] By Nudges                                                 331

[2] By Legal Statutes                                          332

§13.07 Final Conclusions                                      333

Index                                                         335