Perpetrators of International Crimes

Theories, Methods, and Evidence

Edited by

ALETTE SMEULERS
MAARTJE WEERDESTIJN
BARBORA HOLÁ

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Table of Contents

Table of Cases xvii
List of Abbreviations xix
Note from the Editors xxi
List of Contributors xxiii

Introduction 1

Alette Smeulers, Barbora Hold, and Maartje Weerdesteijn

1. The Field: Perpetrator Studies 1
2. The Topic: Perpetrators of International Crimes 2
3. The Book: Theories, Methods, and Evidence 4

I. PERPETRATOR STUDIES

1. Historical Overview of Perpetrator Studies 11

Alette Smeulers

1. Introduction 11
2. Nuremberg and the Face of Evil: Mentally Disturbed Criminals or Ordinary Men? 12
3. The Autobiography of Hoess and the World through the Eyes of the Perpetrators 15
4. The Trial of Adolf Eichmann and Hannah Arendt's Banality of Evil Thesis 16
5. Psychological Experiments and the Social-Psychological Approach 18
6. The Browning-Goldhagen Debate: Situational or Dispositional 19
7. Biographies and Case Studies 21
8. Towards a Broader Perspective 22
   8.1 Case studies 22
   8.2 New disciplinary and methodological approaches 24
   8.3 Terrorism research 26
9. Conclusion 27

2. Theories, Methods, and Evidence 29

Alette Smeulers, Barbora Hold, and Maartje Weerdesteijn

1. Introduction 29
2. Theories and Evidence: What Do We Assume and What Do We Know? 30
   2.1 Individual level: perpetrator’s personality, character traits, and disorders 31
   2.2 Situational level: perpetrator in his immediate surroundings 34
   2.3 Societal level: broader political, ideological, societal, and cultural context 42
   2.4 Processes of violence: from radicalization to violence 43
## Table of Contents

### 3. Methods: How Do We Know What We Know? 46

#### 3.1 Qualitative studies 47

#### 3.2 Quantitative and mixed-method studies 48

#### 3.3 Experiments 50

### 4. Reflecting on the Theories, Methods, and Evidence: How Much Do We Know? 51

## II. REFLECTING ON METHODS AND SOURCES

### 3. Perpetrators, Fieldwork, and Ethical Concerns 57

*Chandra Lekha Sriram*

1. Introduction 57

2. Field Research and Methodology 59

3. Field Research and Alleged or Potential Perpetrators 60

#### 3.1 El Salvador 1997–1998 61


#### 3.3 Colombia 2005–2006 63

#### 3.4 Sudan 2005–2006 64

#### 3.5 Sierra Leone 2004–2014 65

4. Why Should We Worry? 66

5. Deficits for the Defence/Inequality of Arms 67

#### 5.1 What happens to the acquitted? 68

#### 5.2 ‘Double prosecutor’ effect of having victim participation/common legal representatives 68

#### 5.3 Concerns about evidence, witnesses, and intermediaries: from Lubanga to Kenya 69

6. Fieldwork and Power-Relations 70

7. Manipulation or Narrative Promotion? 70

8. Concluding Thoughts 71

### 4. Interviewing Perpetrators against the Backdrop of Ethical Concerns and Reflexivity 72

*Mina Rauschenbach*

1. Introduction 72

2. Researching Presumed Perpetrators: The Significance of Ethics and Reflexivity 73

#### 2.1 The significance of ethics and reflexivity in relation to identity management and power concerns 74

#### 2.2 The research project 76

3. The Age of Accountability and the Social Construction of the Figure of the Perpetrator 77

4. Reflexivity and Ethical Concerns throughout the Research Process 79

#### 4.1 The preparation stage 79

#### 4.2 The interview process 80

#### 4.3 Interview outcomes and outputs: analysis, interpretation, and dissemination 84

5. Conclusions 85
# Table of Contents

5. Studying ‘Perpetrators’ through the Lens of the Criminal Trial  89  
*Thijs B. Bouwknegt and Adina-Loredana Nistor*

1. Introduction  89
2. Knowing the Unknowable  92
3. Observing the Invisible  95
4. Comparing the Incomparable  101
5. Ordinary Eichmanns?  104
   5.1 Kaing Guek Eav (Duch)  104
   5.2 Charles Taylor  106
   5.3 Laurent Gbagbo  108
   5.4 Studying perpetrators on trial  110
6. Conclusion  112

III. STUDYING PERPETRATION

*Uğur Ümit Üngör*

1. Introduction: Building a Dynamic Model  117
2. The Macro Context: Orchestrating  120
3. The Meso Context: Organizing  123
4. The Micro Context: Killing  128
5. Discussion  130

7. The Margins of Perpetration: Role-Shifting in Genocide  132  
*Kjell Anderson*

1. Introduction: Individual Roles in Genocide  132
2. Roles in Genocide  133
   2.1 Hilberg’s atrocity triangle  133
   2.2 Beyond Hilberg: accounting for the complexity of perpetration  134
3. Perpetration and Victimization  137
   3.1 Perpetration-victimization  137
   3.2 Victimization-perpetration  138
4. Bystanding and Perpetration  140
   4.1 Perpetration-bystanding  140
   4.2 Bystanding-perpetration  142
5. Perpetration and Rescuing  142
   5.1 Perpetration-rescuing  142
   5.2 Rescuing-perpetration  143
6. Navigating Genocide  144
   6.1 Constrained agency: the social role and immediate margin of discretion  144
   6.2 Genocidal serendipity  146
   6.3 The dynamics of role shifting  147
7. Roles and Identity After Genocide  149
8. Conclusion: Do Categories Matter?  151
## Table of Contents

8. **Beyond Perpetrators: Complex Political Actors Surrounding the 1994 Genocide in Rwanda**  
   **Erin Jessee**  
   1. Introduction  
   2. The Official History of the 1994 Genocide against the Tutsi  
   3. Approaching Rwanda’s Génocidaires  
   4. The Politics of Perpetration in Rwanda’s Post-Genocide Period: Three Case Studies  
      4.1 A typical génocidaire? Michel  
      4.2 A ‘true monster’: Devora  
      4.3 A Tutsi génocidaire? Elliot’s story  
   5. From Génocidaires to Complex Political Actors  
   6. Conclusion  

   **IV. STUDYING PERPETRATORS: CASE STUDIES**

9. **Studying Perpetrator Ideologies in Atrocity Crimes**  
   **Jonathan Leader Maynard**  
   1. Introduction  
   2. Moving Beyond Existing Perspectives  
   3. A Neo-Ideological Approach  
   4. Illustration: Stalin’s Great Terror  
   5. Conclusion  

10. **Religion and International Crimes: The Case of the Islamic State**  
    **Pieter Nanninga**  
    1. Introduction  
    2. Religion and Violence  
    3. ‘A Religious War’  
    4. Enslaving Yazidis: A Case of ‘Religious Genocide’?  
    5. Attacking the West: A Case of ‘Religious Terrorism’?  
    6. Conclusion  

11. **The Female Tigers of Sri Lanka: The Legitimation of Recruitment and Fight**  
    **Georg Frerks**  
    1. Introduction  
    2. The Role of Women in War: Women as Fighters  
    3. The Sri Lankan Conflict  
    4. The Rise of Tamil Militancy and the LTTE  
    5. Female LTTE Fighters  
       5.1 Reasons to join the LTTE  
       5.2 Fighting with ‘the boys’  
       5.3 Heroism and martyrdom  
       5.4 Victim versus agent? Feminist empowerment or nationalist subjugation?  
    6. Conclusion


## Table of Contents

### 12. The Rationality and Reign of Paul Kagame
   *Maartje Weerdesteijn*

1. Introduction 224
2. Rwanda under Kagame's Rule 226
3. Dictatorial Rule and the Role of Rationality 227
4. The Life and Reign of Paul Kagame: A More Nuanced Perspective on Rationality 230
   4.1 Early life 230
   4.2 Fighting with the RPF 232
   4.3 Ruling Rwanda 233
5. The Rationality and Reign of Paul Kagame 235
6. Conclusion 236

### V. STUDYING PERPETRATORS ON TRIAL: CASE STUDIES

#### 13. Nothing Must Remain: The (In)visibility of Atrocity Crimes and the Perpetrators' Strategies using the Corpses of their Victims
   *Caroline Fournet*

1. Introduction 241
2. Displaying Cadavers, Instilling Fear, and Affirming Power over Life and Death: Perpetrators' Perverse Game of (In)visibility of Violence 243
3. Hiding Cadavers to Conceal the Crimes: An Attempt at Evading Justice by Hampering Investigations and Evidence-Gathering? 246
4. Disposing of Cadavers to Disguise the Crimes: An Attempt at Re-Writing History 249
5. The Treatment of Cadavers and Genocidal Intent: Annihilating Identities to Destroy the Group 250
   5.1 Mutilating cadavers and robbing their graves to destroy the group 251
   5.2 Destroying corpses to kill the dead 252
6. Conclusion 254

#### 14. Plausible Deniability: The Challenges in Prosecuting Paramilitary Violence in the Former Yugoslavia
   *Iva Vukušić*

1. Introduction 256
2. Paramilitaries and Plausible Deniability 259
   3.1 Ambiguity and control 263
   3.2 Importance of borders for plausible deniability 264
   3.3 Loyalty and autonomy 265
4. Criminal Prosecutions for Paramilitary Violence 266
5. Some Challenges to Prosecution of Paramilitary Violence 268
   5.1 Types of evidence in prosecuting paramilitary violence 269
6. Conclusion 271
## Table of Contents

15. Perpetrators on Trial: Characteristics of War Crimes Perpetrators Tried by Courts in Bosnia and Herzegovina and ICTY
   *Mirza Buljubasić and Barbora Holá*

   1. Introduction 273
   2. Conflict in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Perpetrators of International Crimes, and Criminal Justice 275
      2.1 Criminal justice response after the conflict in Bosnia and Herzegovina 277
   3. Methodology 278
   4. Results
      4.1 Socio-demographic characteristics 282
      4.2 Crime-related characteristics 289
   5. Conclusion 294

16. 'Like Mirrors of Morality': Social Support for Nazi War Criminals in Post-War Germany
   *Susanne Karstedt*

   1. Introduction: Support for Prisoners in Contemporary Criminal Justice 296
   2. Framing Solidarity and Social Support for Perpetrators of Mass Atrocities
      2.1 Conceptualizing solidarity and support 299
      2.2 Contextualizing social support for perpetrators in transitional and post-conflict societies 300
   3. Supporting Nazi War Criminals in Post-War Germany
      3.1 Setting the scene 302
      3.2 Networks of support 304
      3.3 Organizing support: associations, charities, and the churches 306
   4. Celebrity, Lifelines, Organizations: Case Studies of Support
      4.1 A fund for Albert Speer 309
      4.2 Lifelines and lies: evading justice 309
      4.3 Association for Mutual Aid (HIAG): strategizing for comrades in arms 311
   5. Conclusion: From the Past to the Present 313

Concluding Thoughts
   *Alette Smeulers*

Bibliography 323
Index 367