Colm Peter McGrath

The Development of Medical Liability in Germany, 1800–1945

Vittorio Klostermann
Frankfurt am Main
2019
Contents

Preface ........................................ IX
Introduction .................................... 1
   1. The subject at hand ...................... 1
   2. Why study this at all? .................. 6
   3. A brief map of what follows .......... 7

Chapter 1: Medical Organisation, Regulation and Discipline in Germany: 1800–1945 ........................................ 11
   1. Introduction ................................ 11
   2. The organisation of care .............. 11
      (A) Accessing healthcare ................ 12
      (B) German medicine and medical practitioners .......... 14
         (i) Medical training in the German-speaking world .......... 14
         (ii) The persistence of unorthodox practice .............. 16
         (iii) Nazi medicine and medical practice .............. 18
   3. Internal regulation and conceptions of error ............ 19
      (A) Regulation and the Honour Courts ............ 19
         (i) The regulatory background of the nineteenth century ......... 19
         (ii) Medical Chambers, Honour Courts and standardisation .......... 22
         (iii) The Reichsärzteordnung 1935 ......................... 29
         (iv) The Heilpraktikergesetz 1939 ......................... 31
      (B) Medical conceptions of error: The Kunstfehler .......... 32
         (i) The Fall Horn ......................... 32
         (ii) The struggle for clarity ...................... 33
         (iii) Virchow’s resolution ...................... 35
   4. Medicine and the legal system ............ 39
      (A) The procedural and cultural-historical role of expert evidence .......... 39
      (B) Medicalising law: Kunstfehlergutachten ........ ...... 46
   5. Conclusions: ................................... 53
Chapter 2: Medical Error and the Criminal Law

1. The Carolina 1532
   (A) Medical error in the Carolina
   (B) Fault in the Carolina

2. Medical error before 1871
   (A) Criminal codification before 1871
   (B) Criminal fault before 1871
      (i) Early codifications and occupational duties
      (ii) The Fall Horn
      (iii) Medical error and early criminal scholarship
      (iv) Mid-century codifications and scholarship
      (v) A retreat from indulgence

3. The Reichsstrafgesetzbuch 1871
   (A) The triumph of general rules
   (B) Compensation and the Reichsstrafgesetzbuch
   (C) Medical error in the Reichsstrafgesetzbuch
      (i) An objective standard
      (ii) The impact of the Gewerbeordnung 1869
      (iii) Antisepsis as a recognised rule

4. Conclusions

Chapter 3: Medical Error and Contract Law

1. The Roman inheritance
   (A) Roman medicine and medical provision
   (B) Roman medicine and the law
      (i) The Roman contractual schema
      (ii) Fault and scope of recovery

2. Nineteenth-century Germany
   (A) Legislation and academic commentary
      (i) Legislation
      (ii) Pandectist scholarship
         (a) Distinguishing forms of labour
         (b) The emerging consensus
      (iii) Germanist scholarship
   (B) Zimmermann and Hefke's exchange
      (i) Zimmermann's rejection of Roman orthodoxy
      (ii) Hefke's defence of contract
      (iii) Court practice

3. Contractual standards of fault
   (A) Mandate

VI Contents
Dienstmiete and analogous contracts 104
(i) Academic and judicial opinion 105
(ii) Codifications 107
4. Conclusions 108

Chapter 4: Medical Error and the Law of Delict 111
1. The Roman delictual inheritance 111
2. Nineteenth-century Germany 113
(A) The crumbling mask of the Lex Aquilia 114
(B) Legislation 115
(C) Gemeines Recht 116
(i) Germanist views of delict 117
(ii) Pandectist views of delict 117
(D) Zimmermann's sui generis approach 121
3. Delictual standards of fault 125
(A) Academic writing 125
(B) Codifications 128
(C) Fault and the actio contra mensorem 129
4. Unorthodox practice 134
5. Conclusions 137

Chapter 5: Medical Error and the BGB 139
1. Introduction 139
2. Categorising medical error in the BGB 143
(A) Arbeitsverträge in the BGB 144
(i) Settling the contractual debate 147
(ii) The patient as a third party 149
(iii) The scope of the 'Arztvertrag' 152
(B) The role of delict 154
(i) Private patients and wrongfulness 155
(ii) University and municipal hospitals 158
(C) Concurrency and recoverable damages 162
3. Fault and medical error in the BGB 166
(A) § 276 BGB 166
(B) The Kunstfehler and 'erforderliche Sorgfalt' 169
(i) The changing interpretation of the Kunstfehler 171
(ii) Scope of application 180
(iii) Therapeutic freedom and the problem of pluralism 184
(iv) Unorthodox Practitioners 193
4. The Kunstfehler, medical advances and patient safety 197
(A) X-Rays and diathermy 198
5. The impact of the Nazi Era ........................................... 209
6. Conclusions ............................................................. 216

Conclusion .................................................................. 221

1. Developmental themes ............................................ 221
2. Drivers of development ............................................ 225
3. Change and continuity after 1945 ............................... 228
4. A wider lesson ......................................................... 236

List of Abbreviations ................................................... 239
Bibliography ................................................................ 241
Index of terms ........................................................... 259