NEW CHALLENGES FOR THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS MACHINERY

What Future for the UN Treaty Body System and the Human Rights Council Procedures?

M. Cherif Bassiouni
William A. Schabas
(eds.)
CONTENTS

Foreword
Navanethem PILLAY ................................................................. v

From the Editors
William A. SCHABAS ................................................................. vii

A Critical Introduction Assessment of the UN Human Rights Mechanisms
M. Cherif BASSIOUNI ................................................................. 1

PART I.
UN TREATY BODIES – WHAT FUTURE?

Section I. The Place and Role of Human Rights Treaty Bodies in the UN
Institutional System of Protection of Human Rights .................. 15

Chapter 1. It’s Time for a World Court of Human Rights
Manfred NOWAK ................................................................. 17

I. Introduction ................................................................. 17
II. Human Rights Achievements by the United Nations during the
Cold War ................................................................. 18
III. Developments after the End of the Cold War ............ 20
IV. The “Arab Spring” as a New Window of Opportunities... 25
V. The Need for a World Court of Human Rights .............. 26
VI. The Swiss Initiative for a UN Agenda for Human Rights .. 28
VII. The Main Features of the Consolidated Draft Statute for a World
Court of Human Rights ................................................. 29
VIII. Conclusions ............................................................ 32

Section II. Strengthening the UN Treaty Bodies Reporting Process ........ 35

Chapter 2. Periodic Reporting: The Backbone of the UN Treaty Body Review
Procedures
Michael O’FLAHERTY and Pei-Lun TSAI ........................................... 37

I. Introduction ................................................................. 37
II. The UN Treaty Bodies Reporting Procedure: An Overview .... 38
III. The Impact of the Reporting Procedure ........................................... 44
IV. Challenges for the Reporting Procedure ........................................... 45
V. UPR and the Treaty Body Reporting Procedure ................................... 47
VI. Strengthening the Reporting Procedure ........................................... 49
   A. Preparation of States Parties' Reports .......................................... 50
   B. Interaction of Treaty Bodies with State Parties and Other Stakeholders ........................................... 50
   C. Implementation of Recommendations on the Ground and Follow-Up ........................................... 52
VII. Perspectives for the Future ......................................................... 53
VIII. Conclusion ................................................................................. 56

Section III. Harmonizing the Working Procedures of the UN Treaty Bodies .... 57

Chapter 3. Streamlining the Constructive Dialogue: Efficiency from States' Perspectives
   Rachael Lorna Johnstone ................................................................. 59

I. Introduction .................................................................................. 59
II. A Proposal for the Operation of a Single Periodic Report and Meeting .... 63
   A. Overlap and Repetition ............................................................... 63
   B. Some Remarks on the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances (ICPPED) ........................................... 65
   C. Reporting to a Single Periodic Meeting ....................................... 70
   D. Managing a Single Periodic Meeting .......................................... 79
   E. Consolidated Concluding Observations ....................................... 84
   F. Staffing ..................................................................................... 86
III. An Itinerant Treaty Body ............................................................. 86
   A. Organization of Regular Regional Meetings ............................... 87
   B. Advantages of Regional Meetings ............................................. 88
   C. Difficulties of Regional Meetings .............................................. 89
IV. Distance Meetings ....................................................................... 90
V. Concluding Comments .................................................................. 92

Section IV. Enhancing the Implementation of UN Treaty Bodies' Recommendations and Views ........................................... 95

Chapter 4. On the Binding Nature of the Findings of the Treaty Bodies
   William A. Schabas ........................................................................ 97

Felice D. GAER ................................................................. 107

I. Treaty Body Powers: From Receiving Reports to Active Implementation? ................................................ 107
II. Treaty Reform: Procedure or Substance? ......................... 108
   A. UN Criticisms .................................................................. 108
   B. Criticisms of Effectiveness of Treaty Bodies .................. 109
   C. Authoritativeness of Treaty Body Oversight .................. 111
III. Follow-Up Procedures .................................................. 114
    A. What the Follow-Up Achieves ....................................... 117
    B. Follow-Up Should Identify and Follow Essential Issues ...... 118

Chapter 6. Accessing Justice by All Means: Individual Communications before UN Treaty Bodies – A Case Study of CERD

Chris Maina PETER .............................................................. 123

I. Introduction ..................................................................... 123
II. Combating Racism Seriously .......................................... 124
III. Committee on Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD) ................................................. 125
    A. Establishment and Mandate ............................................. 125
    B. State Reports before CERD ............................................. 126
    C. Individual Complaints Procedure .................................. 128
    D. Other Activities of CERD ................................................. 129
IV. Lack of Awareness on the Existence of ICERD and CERD .............................................................. 130
V. Possible Contribution to the Work of CERD by Other Institutions ............................................................. 130
    A. The Civil Society Actors at International and National Levels ...................................................... 131
    B. Academic and Higher Education Institutions ................. 132
VI. Conclusion ..................................................................... 133
VII. Selected References .................................................... 134

Chapter 7. The Complementary Role of General Comments in Enhancing the Implementation of Treaty Bodies’ Recommendations and Views (the Example of CESCR)

Aslan ABASHIDZE ............................................................ 137

I. The sui generis Nature of CESCR .................................... 137
II. Increasing the Use of General Comments as a Tool for Enhancing the Implementation of Treaty Bodies’ Recommendations and Views ........................................... 139
   A. Objectives of the Reporting Process ............................... 140
   B. Nature of the Legal Obligations Undertaken by States Parties ........................................................ 142
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section V. Strengthening the Representativeness of Treaty Body Membership</th>
<th>149</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Chapter 8. Universal Suffrage and the International Human Rights Treaty Bodies: Where are the Women?
Alice Edwards

I. Introduction 151

II. Where are the Women? The Treaty Body Record on Women's Representation and Participation 152

III. Why the Absence of Women? Feminist Explanations for the Absence of Women in Decision-Making Roles and Why Their Representation and Participation is Crucial 154
   A. Equal Representation as a Human Right 156
   B. Equal Representation, Democracy and Universality 158
   C. Feminist 'Dissent' and Women's Impact on Decision-Making 158
   D. Female Decision-Makers as Role Models 163

IV. How Can More Women Be Elected to the Treaty Bodies? How Can We Achieve Parity in Committee Membership? 164
   A. The International Criminal Court 164
   B. The European Court of Human Rights 165
   C. Lessons for the Treaty Bodies and Ways Forward 167

V. Conclusion 170

Section VI. Strengthening the Role of Stakeholders (Civil Society) 171

Chapter 9. Taking Human Rights from the Grassroots to Geneva... and Back: Strengthening the Relationship between UN Treaty Bodies and NGOs
Philip Lynch and Ben Schokman

I. Introduction 173

II. Some Principles to Guide Treaty Body Strengthening from an NGO Perspective 177

III. Cross-Cutting Recommendations and Reforms 180
   A. Awareness and Visibility 180
   B. Accessibility 182
C. Protection of Human Rights Defenders and Prevention of Reprisals .............................................. 184
D. Impact and Utility of Recommendations and Remedies ....................................................... 185
E. Implementation and Follow-Up ................................................................. 186
   1. Domestic Implementation and Follow-Up ........................................... 186
   2. International Follow-Up ................................................................. 187
IV. Recommendations on General Comments and Individual Communications ...................................... 189
   A. General Comments ................................................................. 189
   B. Individual Communications ................................................................. 190
V. Conclusion ................................................................. 192

Chapter 10. Strengthening of the UN Treaty Bodies' Complaint Procedures: Elements for a Reform Agenda from an NGO Perspective
Gabriela KLETZEL, Camila BARRETTO MAIA and Mónica ZWAIG ....................................................... 193

I. Foreword ................................................................. 193
II. Towards a Victim-Centered Approach ................................................................. 197
   A. Ensuring Full Accessibility ................................................................. 199
   B. The Need to Clarify the Admissibility Criteria ........................................... 202
   C. Enhancing Interaction ................................................................. 205
III. Ensuring Effective Redress ................................................................. 209
   A. Improve the Quality of the Decisions: Identify Specific and Comprehensive Remedies ................................................................. 210
   B. The Utmost Relevance of Devising Remedies Meant as Guarantees of Non-Recurrence ................................................................. 213
   C. Friendly Settlements ................................................................. 220
IV. The Need for a Comprehensive and Effective Follow-Up System ....................................................... 223
   A. Current Features ................................................................. 225
   B. Enhancing the Effectiveness of Follow-Up Procedures ................................................................. 228
      1. Institutionalize a Comprehensive Involvement of the Victim and the Participation of Civil Society at the Follow-Up Stage ................................................................. 228
      2. Develop a Comprehensive Database on Follow-Up to Views – Carry out Periodic Assessments ................................................................. 230
      3. Develop Reporting Guidelines for Follow-Up ................................................................. 231
   C. The Development of Adequate Enforcement Mechanisms at the National Level ................................................................. 232
      1. Intergovernmental Coordination ................................................................. 234
      2. National Focal Point ................................................................. 234
      3. A Roadmap for Implementation ................................................................. 234
V. Final Remarks ................................................................. 235

Intersentia

xv
PART II.
The UN HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL AT A TURNING POINT

Section I. Strengthening Working Procedures of the UN Human Rights Council

Olivier de Frouville

I. Change or Continuity: Has the Establishment of the Council Really Changed Anything in the Universal System of Human Rights Protection?
A. Negative Elements
B. Positive Elements
C. Developing Trends

II. Is the UPR of Real Added Value to the System?

III. Why the Council does not Represent a Real Progress for the Universal Human Rights Protection System


Chapter 2. Making the Connection: Security and Human Rights
Elvira Domínguez-Redondo

I. Introduction

II. Using International Humanitarian Law to Monitor States

III. Subsidiary Bodies’ and Armed Conflict Scenarios

IV. Bridging the Gap Between the UN Commission on Human Rights and the Security Council
A. Carlsson, the Fall of Srebrenica and Brahimi Reports
B. Mainstreaming Human Rights – 1997 UN Reform
C. Engaging the Security Council with the Commission on Human Rights

V. The Human Rights Council’s New Tools to Address Armed Conflict and Insecurity
A. Proliferation of Special Sessions
B. Universal Periodic Review
C. Responsibility to Protect and Reforming the Security Council
D. Peacebuilding Commission

VI. Conclusions and Some Reflections on the Way Forward
Section II. The Work of the UN Human Rights Council Through International Commissions of Investigation of Violations of International Human Rights Law...

Chapter 3. The Work of the International Commission of Inquiry for Libya
Philippe KIRSCH

I. Events in Libya
   A. Demonstrations and Repression
   B. Armed Conflict

II. The Commission's Approach

III. First Phase (April–June 2011)
   A. The First Field Mission
   B. Challenges
   C. Legal Framework
   D. Findings
      1. Violations of Human Rights Law
      2. Violations of International Humanitarian Law
      3. Outstanding Issues
   E. End of the First Phase

IV. Second Phase (from June 2011 on)
   A. Changing Circumstances
   B. Challenges and Prospects

Chapter 4. What Should Be the UN Human Rights Council's Role in Investigating Genocide, War Crimes and Crimes Against Humanity?
Lyal S. SUNGA

I. Aim of the Present Inquiry

II. How the International Community's Responses to the Crises in the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda have Reoriented UN Human Rights Investigations
   A. UN Human Rights Investigations Prior to the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda Situations
   B. Investigations in the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda

III. Post-Yugoslavia and Rwanda UN Human Rights Investigations into Situations Possibly Involving Genocide, War Crimes or Crimes Against Humanity
   A. Darfur
   B. Israeli Occupied Palestinian Territories
   C. Côte d'Ivoire
   D. Libya
   E. Syria
### Contents

| IV. The Complementary Roles of UN Human Rights Investigation and International Criminal Investigation | 342 |
| V. Practical Recommendations | 346 |
| A. Prevention and Early Warning | 347 |
| B. Appropriate Channels for Investigative Response | 347 |
| C. Tightening Up of Inquiry Procedures | 348 |
| D. Training in Fact-Finding and Investigations | 348 |
| E. Training of Criminal Prosecutors and Investigators | 349 |
| F. Training of Peacekeepers | 349 |
| G. Lessons Learned and Best Practices | 349 |

Section III. The Added Value of the Mechanism of the Universal Periodic Review of the Human Rights Council | 351

Chapter 5. Peer Review in the Mix: How the UPR Transforms Human Rights Discourse

Constance de la Vega and Tamara N. Lewis | 353

| I. A New Instrument for the New Millennium | 353 |
| A. Introduction | 353 |
| B. Chapter Outline | 357 |

| II. The Mission of the UPR | 357 |
| A. Founding Resolutions | 357 |
| B. Standards for the Review | 359 |
| C. Periodicity and Phases of the Review | 359 |
| 1. Pre-Review | 360 |
| 2. Review and Interactive Dialogue | 360 |
| 3. Adoption of the Final Outcome | 361 |
| D. Implementation | 362 |

| III. Peer Review: Accountability in Governance Through Multilateral Surveillance and Peer Pressure | 363 |
| A. Peer Review's Role in National Policy-Making | 364 |
| 1. OECD and EU: Examples of Peer Review Used for Policy Diffusion/Convergence | 364 |
| 2. UPR Success Measured Through its Influence on National Human Rights Policy | 366 |

| IV. The First Cycle of the UPR: Accountability for Human Rights Obligations | 367 |
| A. Data Gathering | 368 |
| B. National Consultations | 369 |
| C. Constructive Final Recommendations | 371 |
1. Wording of Recommendations has Become More Specific 371
2. The Recommendations Reinforce Treaty Body and Special Procedures 372
3. Wide Breadth of the Subject Matter Covered by Recommendations 374
D. Transparency 376
V. Improving the Universal Periodic Review 377
A. Three Recommendations for Improving the UPR 377
1. Reconsider the Roles of the Secretariat and the Troika 378
   a. OHCHR Secretariat as Theme and Agenda Setter 378
   b. The Troika as the Review Facilitators 379
2. Theme-Related, Time-Specific Recommendations 380
   a. Limiting the Number of Recommendations 380
   b. Time-Specificity 383
3. Establish the Modalities for a Formal Follow-Up Procedure 383
VI. Conclusion 384

Section IV. Enhancing the Work of the Special Procedures of the Human Rights Council 387

Chapter 6. The System of the UN Special Procedures: Some Proposals for Change
Ingrid Nifosi-Sutton 389

I. Introduction 389
II. The UN SPs: Main Characteristics 390
III. The Subject Matter of Thematic Mandates 390
   A. Thematic Mandates and Implementation 391
IV. The Subject Matter of Country Mandates 397
   A. Implementation of Country Mandates 397
V. The SPs and the Universal Periodic Review 399
VI. The Review of the Human Rights Council 400
VII. Coordination Among the SPs 402
VIII. The SPs and Treaty Bodies 405
IX. The Strengths and Flaws of the SPs 406
X. Conclusions and Recommendations 413
   A. The Conceptual Framework of the SPs 413
   B. The Structure of the System of the SPs 414
   C. The Effectiveness of the SPs 415
   D. Management 417
   E. Contribution to the Work of Treaty Bodies 417