The Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Case Law and Commentary

LAURENCE BURGORGUE-LARSEN
and
AMAYA ÚBEDA DE TORRES

Translated by
ROSALIND GREENSTEIN

Foreword by
SERGIO GARCÍA RAMÍREZ

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Detailed Contents

Foreword xvii
Introduction xxix
Table of Cases xxxv
List of Abbreviations lviii

PART I PROCEDURAL GUARANTEES 1

Chapter 1 The optional contentious jurisdiction of the Court 3
Introduction 7
I. The limits of the optional clause 9
   A. Common characteristics 9
   B. Exclusive characteristics 10
II. The limits of the right of withdrawal 13
   A. What the Convention says 13
   B. What the Convention does not say 14
III. Court control 15
   A. The compétence de la compétence 16
   B. The impossibility of a ‘partial’ withdrawal 16
   C. Control over the duration of the effect of the Convention 18
      1. ‘Continuing’ offences 18
      2. ‘Instantaneous’ offences 21
Bibliography 21
A.U.-T.

Chapter 2 The indirect contentious jurisdiction of the Court 25
Introduction 28
I. The beginnings of the case referral system 30
   A. The uncertainty of time limits 30
   B. The uncertainty of criteria 34
II. The evolution of the case referral system 36
   A. Defining the criteria 36
   B. Increase in the number of cases 37
III. The individual as a party to the proceedings 40
   A. Indirect participation 41
   B. Autonomous participation 42
   C. The essential role of NGOs 47
Bibliography 49
L.B.-L.
### Detailed Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Time limits to file a request</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>Subject of the request</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td></td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.B.-L.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Chapter 8  The powers of the Court to monitor compliance with its judgments

**Introduction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Competence to monitor compliance</th>
<th>178</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. In theory</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. In practice</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Effective monitoring procedures</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Execution of compensatory damages</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Execution of general measures</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bibliography**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>L.B.-L.</th>
<th>191</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### Chapter 9  The right to order provisional measures

**Introduction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Shared competence</th>
<th>198</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. The competence of the Commission</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The competence of the Court</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The legal scope of the measures</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The urgency of the measures</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The degree of gravity</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Irreparable damage</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Temporary measures</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bibliography**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A.U.-T.</th>
<th>213</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### Chapter 10  The right to determine reparations

**Introduction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Multiple beneficiaries</th>
<th>225</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Individual beneficiaries</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Collective beneficiaries?</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. New categories of damage</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Classical categories of damage</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Damage to the 'life project’</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Specific reparations</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Reparation through pecuniary compensation</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Reparation through reconstruction</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bibliography**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>L.B.-L.</th>
<th>239</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### Chapter 11  The right to ad intra enforcement of the Convention

**Introduction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. The meaning of Article 2</th>
<th>252</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. The original meaning</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The present meaning</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| L.B.-L. | |
PART II SUBSTANTIVE GUARANTEES 269

Chapter 12 The right to life and the death penalty 271
Introduction 274
I. The death penalty, an exceptional regime 275
II. From an exception to abolition 278
III. Restrictions to the death penalty 281
A. Restrictions deriving from the American Convention 281
B. Restrictions deriving from IACHR case law 282
C. Restrictions deriving from the prohibition of discriminatory treatment 284
D. Restrictions deriving from the prohibition of torture 285
Bibliography 287

Chapter 13 Forced disappearance 291
Introduction 299
I. The complex and multi-faceted nature of the crime 300
II. Monitoring of compliance with the Convention 306
III. A continuing crime 309
IV. Proof of the crime 312
A. Presumption of death 313
B. Acknowledgement of responsibility 315
Bibliography 320

Chapter 14 Extrajudicial executions 325
Introduction 332
I. Applicable law when lethal State force is used 333
A. Situations of armed conflict 335
B. Situations of no armed conflicts 340
II. Obligations incumbent on the States 342
A. Substantive obligations 343
B. Procedural obligations 345
III. Obstacles to the responsibility of the State 347
A. Obstacles related to attribution of illegal acts 347
B. Obstacles related to defence strategies 352
C. Obstacles related to the fight against impunity 355
Bibliography 357
**Chapter 15  Right to personal integrity**

Introduction 369

I. The peremptory prohibition of torture 371

II. The conceptual distinction between torture and other 'punishments' 374
   A. Conceptual duality 375
   B. Conceptual homogeneity 380

III. The procedural aspect of the prohibition of torture and other 'punishments' 383

Bibliography 388

L.B.-L.

**Chapter 16  The rights of the child**

Introduction 395

I. The child as a subject of law 397
   A. The meaning of 'child' 397
   B. The rights of the child 398

II. The child as an object of protection 402
   A. The protection of a 'child at risk' 405
   B. The protection of a 'delinquent child' 406

Bibliography 407

L.B.-L.

**Chapter 17  Women's rights**

Introduction 433

I. Law applicable to women 435
   A. The contribution of the Convention of Belém do Pará 435
   B. The application of the Convention of Belém do Pará 438

II. Towards women's rights? 440
   A. The rights of women 440
   B. Duties of the States 445

Bibliography 448

L.B.-L. and A.U.-T.

**Chapter 18  Workers' rights**

Introduction 459

I. A general definition of workers 461
   A. National workers 461
   B. Migrant workers 462

II. A general protection of workers 464
   A. A multitude of applicable texts 465
   B. A multitude of State obligations 466

Bibliography 467

A.U.-T.

**Chapter 19  The rights of detainees**

Introduction 476

I. The lawfulness of the detention 478
   A. Respecting domestic law 478
   B. Prohibition of arbitrary decisions 480
II. Guarantees during detention
   A. Right to be informed
   B. Right to judicial protection
III. The dignity of the detainee in detention
IV. The obligations of the State during detention
   A. Negative obligations
   B. Positive obligations

Bibliography

Chapter 20 The rights of indigenous peoples
Introduction
I. The recognition of indigenous rights
   A. The recognition of procedural rights
   B. The recognition of substantive rights
II. The construction of specific indigenous rights
   A. Non-discrimination as a guiding principle
   B. The role and importance of cultural particularism

Bibliography

Chapter 21 The right to the freedom of thought and expression
Introduction
I. The right to disseminate information
   A. The scope of the right for individuals
   B. The scope of the right for the media
II. The right to receive information
   A. Access to public information
   B. Access to personal data
III. Restrictions to this right
   A. Technical restrictions
   B. Justification for these restrictions
   C. Interpretation of these restrictions

Bibliography

Chapter 22 The right to nationality
Introduction
I. Acquisition of nationality
   A. The notions of nationality and naturalization
   B. Conditions of acquisition
II. Deprivation of nationality
   A. The prohibition of arbitrary decisions
   B. Authorization of deprivation of nationality
III. An explicit right
   A. An enshrined right
   B. An autonomous right