Human Dignity and the Foundations of International Law

Patrick Capps
Contents

Acknowledgements vii
Introduction 1

1 Philosophical Problems for International Lawyers 9
   Conceptions of International Law in Space and Time 11
   Scepticism in the Philosophy of International Law 16
   Theory and Practice 18
   Conclusion 20

2 The Methodological Problem 23
   The Methodological Problem in Legal Science 25
      The Methodological Problem 25
      Is International Law Racist? 27
      The Ontological Problem 33
   Conceptual Analysis and Focal Analysis 39
      Conceptual Analysis 40
      Focal Analysis 43
      Conceptual Analysis, Focal Analysis and the Raw Data 45
      The Legal Scientist 47
   Conclusion 49

3 The Conceptual Analysis of International Law 51
   Hart's *The Concept of Law* as a Form of Conceptual Analysis 52
      Legal Positivism 53
      Hart's Concept of Law 56
      Hart's Non-ambitious Concept of Law 57
      Hart's Ambitious Concept of Law 59
   International Law as an Indeterminate Form of Law 61
   Usages and Conventions 65
      The Legal Scientist, the Ordinary Language User and the Legal Official 65
      Law as a Social Practice 68
      Theoretical Values 69
      Law as a Conventional Practice 70
      Paradigm Cases and the Internal Point of View 74
   Conclusion 75
4 Focal Analysis and Ideal-Types
   Purposivity and International Law 80
   Human Dignity and the Purpose of International Law 80
   Normative Positivism and International Law 83
Focal Analysis and Ideal-Types 84
   Action and Axiology 85
   Ideal-Types 86
   The Ideal-Type and Collective and Institutionalised Social Practices 88
   General Concepts 91
   Weber on International Law 93
Ideal-Types and Practical Reasonableness 93
   The Concept of International Law Relies upon the General Concept of Law 94
   Purpose and Meaning 98
   Practical Reasonableness and Ideal-Types 101
Components of the Concept of International Law 102

5 Practical Reasonableness and Human Dignity
   The Idea of Human Dignity 106
   Human Dignity as Empowerment 108
   The Substantive Question 109
   Generic Features of Agency 112
   Distributive and Authoritative Questions 114
   The Authoritative Question 115
   Action and the Generic Features of Agency 117
   The Universalisation of Generic Rights 119
   The Distributive Question 121
   The Concept of International Law 122
   Dignity in the Kingdom of Ends 122
   From the Kingdom of Ends to Positive Law 123
   Conclusion

6 The Logic of the Autonomy Thesis
   The Autonomy Thesis 130
   Structure of the Autonomy Thesis 131
   Hobbes' Version of the Autonomy Thesis 132
   Kant's Version of the Autonomy Thesis 136
   Oppenheim's Version of the Autonomy Thesis 139
   Weil's Version of the Autonomy Thesis 141
Contents

Failure of the Autonomy Thesis 142
Adjudication and Function 143
Legitimacy as a General Condition for the Success of the Autonomy Thesis 145
The Autonomy Thesis and International Law 146
Public Practical Reasons 149
Practical Reasonableness and the Law 151
Conclusion 154

7 Law as a General Concept 157
The Bare-Autonomy Thesis and the Integrated-Autonomy Thesis 159
Moral Reasoning and Law 161
Ideal and Non-ideal Theory 162
Justification of the Autonomy Thesis 164
Immorality of the State of Nature 164
Law as a Community Governed by an Omnilateral Will 168
Kant’s Justification for Law 169
Enforcement 173
Justification of the Integrated-Autonomy Thesis 175
Law Constitutes our Freedom from Dependency 177
Rousseau’s Concept of Law 182
The General Concept of Law 183
Conclusion 185

8 The Foundations of the International Legal Order 187
A Justification for International Law 188
Civil Incorporation and the Sovereign State 190
The State and Civil Incorporation 191
Sovereignty and Collateral Moral Rights 193
The State and Agency 195
International Legal Order 197
Kant’s ‘State of War’ 197
Why is the State of War Not-rightful? 199
The Integrated-Autonomy Thesis and the Sovereignty of International Law 201
Institutional Design 203
International Legal Order as a Suprastate System 204
International Legal Order as an Interstate System 205
Interstate or Suprastate Institutional Design? 208
Contents

Conclusion 210
   Lauterpacht and the Progressive Interpretation of International Law 210
   Unanswered Questions 212

9 The Discontinuity Thesis 215
   Alternatives to International Legal Order 218
      Sovereign States are Not Similar, in Relevant Ways, to Human Agents 218
      A Rejection of the Universal State, Not International Legal Order 220
      The Sovereign State Cannot be Considered an Agent 222
      Transgovernmental Law Instead of International Law? 226
   Rejection of International Legal Order 229
      Sovereign States are Not Similar, in Relevant Ways, to Human Beings 229
      Prudence and International Legal Order 230
      The Environment in which Sovereign States Find Themselves is Not Similar in Relevant Ways to the Environment in which Human Beings Find Themselves 232
      Are International Relations Not Unreasonable? 234
   Approximations to International Law 235
      Surrogates, Analogues and Approximations 237
      The Possibility of Perpetual Peace 239
   Conclusion 241

10 International Legal Order in Ideal and Non-ideal Theory 243
   Ideal Theory 245
      Norm-Creation 246
      Custom 248
      Interpretation 250
      Enforcement 255
      Failure of Interstate Design for Ideal Theory 255
   Non-Ideal Theory 257
      Juridical and Moral Concepts of the State 258
      Institutional Architecture and Norm-Creation 265
      Enforcement 268
      Self-Defence 269
   The Concept of International Law and the Role of the International Lawyer 270