THE COMPETING JURISDICTIONS OF INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

YUVAL SHANY

THE PROJECT ON INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

This series has been developed in cooperation with the Project on International Courts and Tribunals

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Abbreviations xvii
Table of Cases xxv
Table of Treaties xlix
Table of International Instruments lxi
Tables of Domestic Laws lxv

Introduction 1
1. International Law at a Time of Transformation:
The Proliferation of International Courts and Tribunals 1
2. Methodology 11
3. Scope of Research 12
4. Focal Questions 17

Part I Overlaps between the Jurisdictions of International Courts and Tribunals 19
1. What Constitutes Competing Proceedings? 21
   1. The Traditional Jurisdiction-Regulating Rules 22
   2. The Conditions for Application of the Traditional Rules 23
2. Delineation of Jurisdictional Overlaps: Theory and Practice 29
   1. Conflicts between Different Courts and Tribunals of
      General Personal and Subject-Matter Jurisdiction 29
   2. Conflicts between Courts and Tribunals of General Personal
      and Subject-Matter Jurisdiction and Universal Courts and
      Tribunals of Specialized Competence 32
      A. Differences in the scope of jurisdiction ratione personae
         over states 34
      B. Differences in the legal standing of individuals 34
      C. Differences in the legal standing of international organizations 37
      D. Related proceedings 39
      E. Competition involving arbitral tribunals 40
   3. Conflicts between Courts and Tribunals of General Personal
      and Subject-Matter Jurisdiction and Regional Courts
      and Tribunals with Unlimited Jurisdiction Ratione Materiae 42
## Contents

4. Conflicts between Courts and Tribunals of General Personal and Subject-Matter Jurisdiction and Regional Courts and Tribunals of Specialized Competence

5. Conflicts between Different Universal Courts and Tribunals of Specialized Competence

6. Conflicts between Regional Courts and Tribunals with Unlimited Jurisdiction *Ratione Materiae* and Courts and Tribunals of Specialized Competence

7. Conflicts between Universal and Regional Courts and Tribunals of Specialized Competence

   A. Trade-related jurisdictional conflicts
   
   B. Jurisdictional conflicts between human rights bodies
   
   C. Other areas of overlapping jurisdiction

8. Conflicts between Different Regional Tribunals of Specialized Competence

9. Multi-Faceted Disputes

10. Interim Conclusions

### Part II  Legal and Policy Issues Concerning the Competition between the Jurisdictions of International Courts and Tribunals


   1. The Jurisdictional Implications of the Proliferation of International Courts and Tribunals

   2. Influence of the Structural Relations between Competing Fora on the Selection of a Jurisdiction-Regulating Regime

   3. Is There a System of International Courts and Tribunals?

      A. *International law as a system of law*

         I. Definition of a ‘legal system’

         II. Is international law a legal system?

         III. Differences between the international legal system and domestic legal systems

         IV. The relations between the various branches of international law

      B. *Is there a system of international courts and tribunals?*

         I. The dichotomy between the normative and institutional components of a legal system
II. Do international courts and tribunals meet the definition of a system? 106
III. The practice of different international courts and tribunals as indicative of their level of systemization 110
IV. Which jurisdiction-regulating regime should govern international courts and tribunals? 115

4. Should International Law Encourage the Regulation of Jurisdictional Competition? 117
   A. The importance of systematic coherence 117
   B. Jurisdiction-regulating rules as a method of increasing systematic coherence 120
   C. An alternative approach: inconsistencies as a catalyst for legal development 122

5. Interim Conclusions 126

4. Jurisdiction-Regulating Norms Governing Competition Involving Domestic Courts: Should They be Introduced into International law? 128

1. Regulation of Jurisdictional Problems Associated with Forum Selection 129
   A. Unilateral forum selection 129
      I. Forum shopping in private law 130
      II. Policy arguments for and against forum shopping 131
   III. Cross-boundary forum shopping 134
      IV. A race to the courthouse 138
      V. Forum selection involving international and national courts or tribunals 139
   B. Observations on the introduction of international anti-forum shopping rules 143
   C. Forum selection agreements 149
   D. Observations on the effects to be given to forum selection agreements under international law 153

2. Regulation of Jurisdictional Problems Associated with Multiple Proceedings 154
   A. Parallel proceedings 156
      Parallel proceedings under domestic law 157
   B. Observations on the introduction of international rules regulating parallel proceedings 161
   C. Finality of proceedings 164
Finality under domestic law 165

D. Observations on finality in international law 170
The finality principle in human rights proceedings 171

3. Interim Conclusions 173

Part III The Law Governing Competition between the Jurisdictions of International Courts and Tribunals: \textit{lex lata} and \textit{lex ferenda} 177

5. Competition-Regulating Norms found in Instruments Governing the Jurisdiction of International Courts and Tribunals 179

1. Forum Selection Provisions 180

\textbf{A. Exclusive jurisdiction provisions} 180

I. Inflexible provisions 180
- Regional economic integration regimes 180
- The WTO 183
- The European Social Charter 186

II. Flexible provisions 188
- The European Convention on Human Rights 188
- ICSID 192

\textbf{B. Non-exclusive jurisdiction provisions} 195

I. Parallel jurisdictions 195
- The ICJ 195
- UN human rights bodies 197
- Non-compliance procedures 199
- Other non-exclusive jurisdictions 200

II. Residual jurisdiction 201
- Jurisdiction under UNCLOS 201
- Other residual arrangements 207

\textbf{C. Middle ground approaches: Limited choice of forum} 208

- \textit{NAFTA} 208
- Other limited choice arrangements 209

\textbf{D. Implied division of jurisdictions} 211

2. Multiple Proceedings 212

\textbf{A. Electa una via} 213

- The European Convention on Human Rights and other human rights regimes 213
- Electa una via clauses in areas of international law other than human rights 215
- Electa una via reservations 215
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Lis alibi pendens</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The Optional Protocol to the ICCPR</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Other lis alibi pendens provisions in human rights instruments</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lis alibi pendens clauses outside the human rights area</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C. The principle of finality</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Regional human rights arrangements</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Other finality clauses</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Interim Conclusions</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. Jurisdiction-Regulating Norms, Derived from Sources Other than Treaties, as Applied by International Courts and Tribunals</strong></td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Application of traditional Jurisdiction-Regulating Rules</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Forum selection principles</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. The PCIJ precedents</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Klöckner case</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The law of the sea cases</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Parallel proceedings</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. The PCIJ cases</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Jurisprudence of other international courts and tribunals</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The Pyramids case</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C. Res judicata</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. The legal status of the rule</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Exceptions to the principle of finality</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Case-law of the PCIJ and the ICJ</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Case-law of other international courts and tribunals</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Other Potential Rules and Principles Governing Jurisdictional Competition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. The theory of abuse of rights</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of the abuse of rights theory to forum selection and multiple proceedings</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Comity</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Application of comity to jurisdictional conflicts</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Pyramids case</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Exercise of comity by other international courts and tribunals</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C. Conflicting treaty obligations</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Interim Conclusions</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Possibilities for Future Improvement 272

1. Structural Reform 272
   A. Jurisdictional reorganization 272
   B. Expansion of the advisory jurisdiction of the ICJ 275
   C. The desirability of creating new courts and tribunals 277

2. Increased Judicial Co-operation 278
   A. Exercise of comity 278
   B. Exchange of information 280

3. Better Strategic Planning on the Part of States 281

4. Interim Conclusions 281

Conclusions 283

Table of Authorities 289

Index 332