

CAN SOCIETY ESCAPE THE NOOSE...?

The Death Penalty in India

CASES, MATERIALS AND OPINION

By

Arunjeev Singh Walia B.A., LLB, Advocate

Colin Gonsalves B.Eng., LLB, Senior Advocate of the Supreme Court of India

&

Vinay Naidoo B.Sc. (Hons.), G.R.S.C., Cert. (Sorbonne), M.Sc., C.P.E., M.A., B.V.C.

Barrister-at-Law (Gray's Inn)

The Human Rights Law Network, India

JUNE, 2005

CONTENTS

CONTENTS IN BRIEF	viii
PREFACES	
K. G. Kannabiran	x
Justice Z. M. Yacoob	xiii
FOREWORD	
Colin Gonsalves	xvi
About the Book	xx
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	xxii
Contributors	xxv
About the editors & principal contributors	xxv
Editorial and written contributions	xxvii
TABLE OF CASES	11
By Subject	11
By Alphabetical Listing	18
<u>CHAPTER I</u>	23
<u>FIRST WORDS...</u>	
By Vinay Naidoo	
<u>A CRIMINAL SYSTEM OF INJUSTICE</u>	26
<u>RELIGIOUS VIEWS ON THE DEATH PENALTY</u>	29
BUDDHISM	32
ISLAM	33
CHRISTIANITY	34
HINDUISM	35
SIKHISM	36
JUDAISM	37
<u>EVOLVING STANDARDS OF DECENCY</u>	38
<u>THE THEORIES OF PUNISHMENT AND DETERRENCE</u>	43
<u>A ROUTE TO THE ABOLITION OF THE DEATH PENALTY IN INDIA</u>	46

<u>CHAPTER II</u>	49
<u>THE LAWS, THE PROCEDURE & PURPOSE OF SENTENCING</u>	
I. PROVISIONS OF DIFFERENT INDIAN LAWS IN WHICH THE DEATH SENTENCE MAY BE AWARDED	50
AIR FORCE ACT, 1950	50
ARMY ACT, 1950	51
COMMISSION OF SATI (PREVENTION) ACT, 1987	52
INDIAN PENAL CODE	53
NARCOTIC DRUGS AND PSYCHOTROPIC SUBSTANCES ACT, 1985	54
<u>COMMENT:</u>	54
THE PREVENTION OF TERRORISM ACT (POTA) AND THE DEATH PENALTY	54
II: THE PROCEDURE & PURPOSE OF SENTENCING	56
A. THE PROCEDURE OF SENTENCING	56
PRE-SENTENCING HEARING: SECTION 235 OF CrPC	56
NON-COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 235(2), CR.P.C	56
B. THE PURPOSE OF SENTENCING	58
CASE LAW	59
COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 433A	70
CONSTITUTIONALITY OF SECTION 433-A, IPC	70
<u>OPINION:</u> 'Proportionality: Does The Penalty Fit The Offence?'	71
<u>CHAPTER III</u>	75
<u>ARTICLES</u>	
<u>TREND TOWARDS WORLDWIDE ABOLITION OF THE DEATH PENALTY</u>	76
By Richard C. Dieter	

<u>TREADING THE PATH TOWARDS ABOLITION OF THE DEATH PENALTY</u> By Arunjeev Singh Walia	90
<u>PUBLIC OPINION AND THE DEATH PENALTY: THE ROUTE TO ABOLITION, WHEN THE ROAD IS BLOCKED</u> By Vinay Naidoo & Lauren Morris	110
<u>JOURNEY TOWARDS HUMANITY</u> By Asim Sarode	150
<u>Illustrative Table:</u> Persons Executed from 1950 to 1996	
<u>WHEN THE RIGHT TO LIFE IS NOT FULLY PROTECTED, WHAT OTHER RIGHTS SUFFER THE DEATH PENALTY?</u> By Daniel Annenberg	153
<u>FOUR MYTHS ON THE DEATH PENALTY</u> By Kimmo Suominen	159
<u>OPINION:</u> 'Being "Tough on Crime": It's Not Working'	162
<u>Illustrative Tables:</u> Sample 'Incidence and Rates' of Serious Offences, by Country	
<u>OPINION:</u> 'The Death Penalty for Rape: A Populist Slogan'	163
 <u>CHAPTER IV</u>	 165
<u>CONSTITUTIONALITY OF THE DEATH SENTENCE</u>	
CONSTITUTIONALITY OF THE DEATH SENTENCE: CASE-LAW	166
CONSTITUTIONAL POWERS OF SUPREME COURT OF INDIA	181
CONSTITUTIONAL POWER OF PRESIDENT AND GOVERNOR	182
CONSTITUTIONAL POWERS OF PRESIDENT AND GOVERNOR IN MATTERS RELATING TO THE DEATH SENTENCE	182
POWERS OF THE PRESIDENT	183
POWERS OF THE GOVERNOR	183
CASE LAW	184

CONSTITUTIONALITY OF SECTION 433-A IPC 186

CONSTITUTIONALITY OF SECTION 303 IPC 186

CHAPTER V 187

GUIDELINES FOR AWARDING THE DEATH SENTENCE

SURVEY DATA OF THE PRINCIPLE REASONS FOR IMPOSITION/CONFIRMATION AND
FOR COMMUTATION OF DEATH SENTENCES 188

GUIDELINES FOR AWARDING DEATH SENTENCE: CASE LAW 189

CHAPTER VI 239

THE 'RAREST OF RARE' DOCTRINE

THE 'RAREST OF RARE' 240

EDITED JUDGMENTS ON THE 'RAREST OF RARE' 240

CHAPTER VII 329

THE MEANING OF LIFE IMPRISONMENT

THE MEANING OF LIFE 330

THE MEANING OF LIFE IMPRISONMENT: CASE LAW 330

EDITED JUDGMENTS ON LIFE IMPRISONMENT 336

CHAPTER VIII 509

APPEALS AND REVIEW POWERS OF THE SUPREME COURT

I: APPEALS 510

RIGHT OF APPEAL TO THE APEX COURT IN CASES WHERE DEATH SENTENCE HAS
BEEN AFFIRMED BY THE HIGH COURTS AND THE PROCESS IN THE APEX COURT
RELATING TO PASSING OF THE DEATH SENTENCE

<u>II: REVIEWS</u>	518
THE SUPREME COURT: REVIEWING ITS OWN JUDGMENT	518
REVIEW POWERS OF THE SUPREME COURT: CASE LAW	518
REVIEW POWERS OF THE SUPREME COURT: DECISIONS OF THE GOVERNORS AND THE PRESIDENT	535
REVIEW POWERS OF THE SUPREME COURT: LIMITS OF DISCRETION TO ACQUIT/PARDON	536
<u>CHAPTER IX</u>	545
<u>DIFFERENCE OF JUDICIAL OPINION: SPLIT BENCHES</u>	
DIFFERENCE OF JUDICIAL OPINION: SPLIT BENCHES	546
A WRIT PETITION SEEKING GUIDELINES	546
DIFFERENCE OF JUDICIAL OPINION: SPLIT BENCHES: CASE-LAW	560
<u>OPINION: ‘The Vice of Arbitrariness.’</u>	565
<u>CHAPTER X</u>	569
<u>RIGHTS OF PRISONER ON DEATH ROW</u>	
RIGHTS OF PRISONER ON DEATH ROW	570
CASE LAW	570
<u>CHAPTER XI</u>	597
<u>DELAY IN EXECUTION OF THE DEATH SENTENCE</u>	
DELAY IN EXECUTION OF THE DEATH SENTENCE	598
CASE LAW	598

<u>CHAPTER XII</u>	643
<u>METHODS OF EXECUTION</u>	
METHODS OF EXECUTION	644
CASE-LAW	645
THE LAW COMMISSION	664
METHODS OF EXECUTION: INTERNATIONAL USAGE BY RETENTIONIST COUNTRIES	679
<u>OPINION</u> : 'The Troubling Paradox Behind the Use of Electrocution and Lethal Injection.'	681
<u>CHAPTER XIII</u>	685
<u>JUVENILES AND THE DEATH PENALTY</u>	
I: THE INDIAN POSITION	686
II: THE INTERNATIONAL POSITION	710
INTERNATIONAL TREATIES EXCLUDING JUVENILES OFFENDERS FROM THE DEATH SENTENCE	712
INTERGOVERNMENTAL BODIES, INTERNATIONAL OPINION AND JUDGMENTS	713
<u>CHAPTER XIV</u>	725
<u>THE MENTALLY CHALLENGED AND THE DEATH PENALTY</u>	
I: THE INTERNATIONAL POSITION	726
II: THE INDIAN POSITION	729
<u>CHAPTER XV</u>	737
<u>INTERNATIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL LAW ON THE DEATH PENALTY, THE INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND THEIR JUDGMENTS</u>	
I: INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS ON THE DEATH PENALTY	738
II: CONSTITUTIONAL LAW ON THE DEATH PENALTY: THE JUDGMENTS OF FOREIGN NATIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL COURTS	745

CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF SOUTH AFRICA	746
CONSTITUTIONAL COURT OF TANZANIA	756
SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	757
SUPREME COURT OF BELIZE	761
SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA: Legal Aid	772
Further U.S. Supreme Court Judgments on Ineffective Legal Aid in Death Penalty Matters	790
III: THE INTERNATIONAL COURTS	794
THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE	794
THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS	796
THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM AND THE ORGANISATION OF AMERICAN STATES	798
THE AFRICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES' RIGHTS	802
THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE	807
THE PRIVY COUCIL	808
IV: THE JUDGMENTS OF THE INTERNATIONAL COURTS	809
THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE	815
THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS	822
THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM AND THE ORGANISATION OF AMERICAN STATES	847
THE AFRICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN AND PEOPLES' RIGHTS	863
THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE	865
THE PRIVY COUCIL	868

CHAPTER XVI

935

**THE END OF THE 7 YEAR *DE FACTO* MORATORIUM:
THE DHANANJOY CHATTERJEE EXECUTION, & BEYOND...**

By Vinay Naidoo

ARTICLE:**“DHANANJOY & THE DEATH PENALTY: CAN SOCIETY ESCAPE THE NOOSE...?”** 937

THE LAST WEEK IN A LIFE: THE FINAL DHANANJOY CASE 944

THE GROUNDS 947

THE ORDER 958

EQUALITY BEFORE THE LAW: ARTICLE 14 962

A DRAFT GROUND 964

LAST WORDS... 966

APPENDICES 971**APPENDIX I** 973

BIBLIOGRAPHY & RESOURCES

APPENDIX II 981EXTRACTS FROM INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS PERTAINING TO THE
DEATH PENALTY**APPENDIX III** 1003COUNTRIES THAT HAVE ABOLISHED THE DEATH PENALTY IN LAW
(FOR ALL CRIMES)COUNTRIES THAT HAVE ABOLISHED THE DEATH PENALTY IN LAW
(FOR ORDINARY CRIMES)

COUNTRIES THAT ARE ABOLISHIONIST IN PRACTICE.

COUNTRIES THAT RETAIN USAGE OF THE DEATH PENALTY, IN LAW & PRACTICE.

APPENDIX IV 1009

USEFUL WEBSITES ON THE DEATH PENALTY

APPENDIX V 1113

QUOTATIONS ON THE DEATH PENALTY