

The Torture Papers

THE ROAD TO ABU GHRAIB

Edited by

Karen J. Greenberg

Joshua L. Dratel

Introduction by Anthony Lewis

Contents

| | |
|---|---------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | page xi |
| <i>Introduction: Anthony Lewis</i> | xiii |
| <i>From Fear to Torture: Karen J. Greenberg</i> | xvii |
| <i>The Legal Narrative: Joshua L. Dratel</i> | xxi |
| <i>Timeline</i> | xxv |
| <i>Missing Documents</i> | xxix |
| <i>Biographical Sketches</i> | xxxii |

Memoranda

Memo 1. September 25, 2001

| | |
|--|---|
| To: Timothy Flanigan, Deputy Counsel to the President | |
| From: John Yoo, Deputy Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Legal Counsel | |
| Re: Memorandum Opinion for the Deputy Counsel to the President | 3 |

Memo 2. November 13, 2001

| | |
|--|----|
| Military Order of November 13, 2001 issued by President George W. Bush | 25 |
|--|----|

Memo 3. December 28, 2001

| | |
|--|----|
| To: William J. Haynes II, General Counsel, Department of Defense | |
| From: Patrick F. Philbin, Deputy Assistant Attorney General and John Yoo, Deputy Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Legal Counsel | |
| Re: Possible Habeas Jurisdiction over Aliens Held in Guantánamo Bay, Cuba | 29 |

Memo 4. January 9, 2002

| | |
|---|----|
| To: William J. Haynes II, General Counsel, Department of Defense | |
| From: John Yoo, Deputy Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Legal Counsel and Robert J. Delahunty, Special Counsel, U.S. Department of Justice | |
| Re: Application of Treaties and Laws to al Qaeda and Taliban Detainees | 38 |

Memo 5. January 19, 2002

| | |
|---|----|
| To: Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff | |
| From: Donald Rumsfeld, Secretary of Defense | |
| Re: Status of Taliban and al Qaeda | 80 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Memo 6. January 22, 2002 | |
| To: Alberto R. Gonzales, Counsel to the President, and William J. Haynes, General Counsel, Department of Defense | |
| From: Jay S. Bybee, Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice | |
| Re: Application of Treaties and Laws to al Qaeda and Taliban Detainees | 81 |
| Memo 7. January 25, 2002 | |
| To: President Bush | |
| From: Alberto R. Gonzales, Counsel to the President | |
| Re: Decision Re Application of the Geneva Convention on Prisoners of War to the Conflict with al Qaeda and the Taliban | 118 |
| Memo 8. January 26, 2002 | |
| To: Counsel to the President, Assistant to the President for National Security Affairs | |
| From: Colin L. Powell, U.S. Department of State | |
| Re: Draft Decision Memorandum for the President on the Applicability of the Geneva Convention to the Conflict in Afghanistan | 122 |
| Memo 9. February 1, 2002 | |
| To: President Bush | |
| From: John Ashcroft, Attorney General | |
| Re: Justice Department's position on why the Geneva Convention did not apply to al Qaeda and Taliban detainees | 126 |
| Memo 10. February 2, 2002 | |
| To: Counsel to the President | |
| From: William H. Taft IV Legal Advisor, U.S. Department of State | |
| Re: Comments on Your Paper on the Geneva Convention | 129 |
| Memo 11. February 7, 2002 | |
| To: The Vice President, The Secretary of State, The Secretary of Defense, The Attorney General, Chief of Staff to the President, Director of CIA, Assistant to the President for National Security Affairs, Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff | |
| From: George W. Bush | |
| Re: Humane Treatment of al Qaeda and Taliban Detainees | 134 |
| Memo 12. February 7, 2002 | |
| To: Alberto R. Gonzales, Counsel to the President | |
| From: Jay B. Bybee, Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice | |
| Re: Status of Taliban Forces Under Article 4 of the Third Geneva Convention of 1949 | 136 |
| Memo 13. February 26, 2002 | |
| To: William J. Haynes II, General Counsel, Department of Defense | |
| From: Jay S. Bybee, Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice | |
| Re: Potential Legal Constraints Applicable to Interrogations of Persons Captured by U.S. Armed Forces in Afghanistan | 144 |
| Memo 14. August 1, 2002 | |
| To: Alberto R. Gonzales, Counsel to the President | |
| From: Jay S. Bybee, Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice | |
| Re: Standards of Conduct for Interrogation under 18 U.S.C. §§ 2340-2340A | 172 |

Memo 15. August 1, 2002

To: Alberto R. Gonzales, Counsel to the President
From: John Yoo, Deputy Assistant Attorney General, U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Legal Counsel
Re: Letter regarding “the views of our Office concerning the legality, under international law, of interrogation methods to be used on captured al Qaeda operatives”

218

(The following three memos (#s 16, 17, 18) are cover letters to the requests for approval of Counter-Resistance Strategies, which follow #s 19, 20.)

Memo 16. October 25, 2002

To: Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff, Washington D.C.
From: General James T. Hill, Department of Defense, U.S. Southern Command, Miami, FL
Re: Counter-Resistance Techniques

223

Memo 17. October 11, 2002

To: General James T. Hill, Commander, U.S. Southern Command, Miami, FL
From: Maj. Gen. Michael Dunlavey, Department of Defense, JTF 170, Guantánamo Bay, Cuba
Re: Counter-Resistance Strategies

225

Memo 18. October 11, 2002

To: General James T. Hill, Commander, Joint Task Force 170
From: Diane Beaver, Staff Judge Advocate, Department of Defense, JTF 170, Guantánamo Bay, Cuba
Re: Legal Review of Aggressive Interrogation Techniques

226

Memo 19. October 11, 2002

To: General James T. Hill, Commander, Joint Task Force 170
From: Jerald Phifer, Director, J2, Department of Defense, JTF 170, Guantánamo Bay, Cuba
Re: Request for Approval of Counter-Resistance Strategies

227

Memo 20. October 11, 2002

To: General James T. Hill, Commander, Joint Task Force 170
From: Diane Beaver, Staff Judge Advocate, Department of Defense, JTF 170, Guantánamo Bay, Cuba
Re: Legal Brief on Proposed Counter-Resistance Strategies

229

Memo 21. November 27, 2002 (approved by Rumsfeld December 2, 2002)

To: Donald Rumsfeld, Secretary of Defense
From: William J. Haynes II, General Counsel, Department of Defense
Re: Counter-Resistance Techniques

237

Memo 22. January 15, 2003

To: General Counsel of the Department of Defense
From: Donald Rumsfeld, Secretary of Defense
Re: Detainee Interrogations

238

Memo 23. January 15, 2003

To: Commander U.S. Southern Command
From: Donald Rumsfeld, Secretary of Defense
Re: Counter-Resistance Techniques

239

| | |
|---|-----|
| Memo 24. January 17, 2003 | |
| To: General Counsel of the Department of the Air Force | |
| From: William J. Haynes II, General Counsel, Department of Defense | |
| Re: Working Group to Assess (Interrogation issues) | 240 |
| | |
| Memo 25. March 6, 2003 | |
| Classified by: Donald Rumsfeld, Secretary of Defense | |
| <i>DRAFT:</i> Working Group Report on Detainee Interrogations in the Global War on Terrorism: Assessment of Legal, Historical, Policy, and Operational Considerations | 241 |
| | |
| Memo 26. April 4, 2003 | |
| Classified by: Donald Rumsfeld, Secretary of Defense | |
| Working Group Report on Detainee Interrogations in the Global War on Terrorism: Assessment of Legal, Historical, Policy, and Operational Considerations | 286 |
| | |
| Memo 27. April 16, 2003 | |
| To: James T. Hill, Commander, U.S. Southern Command | |
| From: Donald Rumsfeld, Secretary of Defense | |
| Re: Counter-Resistance Techniques in the War on Terrorism | 360 |
| | |
| Memo 28. March 19, 2004 | |
| To: William H. Taft IV, General Counsel, Department of State, William J. Haynes II, General Counsel, Department of Defense, John Bellinger, Legal Adviser for National Security, Scott Muller, General Counsel, Central Intelligence Agency | |
| Distributed to Alberto R. Gonzales, Counsel to the President | |
| From: Jack Goldsmith III, Assistant Attorney General, Office of Legal Counsel | |
| Re: Draft of an opinion concerning the meaning of Article 49 of the Fourth Geneva Convention as it applies in occupied Iraq. | 366 |
| | |
| Reports | |
| February 2004 (The ICRC Report) | 383 |
| Report of the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) on the Treatment by the Coalition Forces of Prisoners of War and Other Protected Persons by the Geneva Conventions in Iraq During Arrest, Internment and Interrogation | |
| | |
| March 2004 (The Taguba Report) | 405 |
| Article 15-6 Investigation of the 800 th Military Police Brigade | |
| | |
| Annexes to the Taguba Report | |
| Undated Psychological Assessment of Allegations of Detainee Abuse at Abu Ghraib by Col. Henry Nelson, USAF Psychiatrist | |
| September 2003 Maj. Gen. Geoffrey Miller's assessment regarding interrogation and intelligence operations in Iraq | |
| Memo 12 October 2003 | |
| To: Combined Joint Task Force Seven, Baghdad, Iraq | |
| From: Ricardo S. Sanchez, Lieutenant General, USA Commanding | |
| Re: Interrogation and Counter-Resistance Policy | |

| | |
|---|------|
| Memo 30 November 2003 | |
| To: Lt. Gen. Ricardo Sanchez, Commander CJTF-7 | |
| From: Thomas M. Pappas, Col., MI Commanding | |
| Re: Request for Exception to CJTF-7 Interrogation and Counter-Resistance Policy | |
| Memo 19 January 2004 | |
| To: Commander, U.S. Central Command | |
| From: Ricardo S. Sanchez, Lt. Gen., USA Commanding | |
| Re: Request for Investigating Officer | |
| 28 January 2004 Army's Criminal Investigation Division report on allegations of prisoner abuse at Abu Ghraib | |
| CV for Brig. Gen. Janis Karpinski, Commander 800 th Military Police Brigade | |
| 15 February 2004 selected portions of Brig. Gen. Janis Karpinski's testimony | |
| | |
| April 2004 | 557 |
| The Association of the Bar of the City of New York Committee on International Human Rights, and Committee on Military Affairs and Justice's Report | |
| Re: Human Rights Standards Applicable to the U.S.'s Interrogation of Detainees | |
| July 2004 (The Mikolashek Report) | 630 |
| Department of the Army, The Inspector General – Detainee Operations Inspection | |
| August 2004 (The Schlesinger Report) | 908 |
| Final Report of the Independent Panel to Review DoD Detention Operations | |
| May 12, 2004 (Vice Admiral Church's Brief) | 976 |
| Vice Admiral Albert T. Church III's briefing on his investigation into allegations of abuse of prisoners at Guantánamo Bay, Cuba | |
| October 2004 (Department of Defense Response to the Associated Press) | 985 |
| The Department of Defense's response to the allegations of abuse of prisoners at Guantánamo Bay and Abu Ghraib which were noted both in the Schlesinger report and in Vice Admiral Church's press briefing | |
| August 2004 (The Fay-Jones Report) | 987 |
| Investigation of Intelligence Activities at Abu Ghraib/Investigation of the Abu Ghraib Prison and 205th Military Intelligence Brigade, LTG Anthony R. Jones/Investigation of the Abu Ghraib Detention Facility and 205th Military Intelligence Brigade, MG George R. Fay | |
| August 9, 2004 | 1132 |
| American Bar Association Report to the House of Delegates | |
| Re: Uses of torture | |
| Afterword | 1165 |
| Appendices | |
| Appendix A: GTMO Interrogation Techniques (a one-page summary issued to reporters by Bush aides on June 22, 2004, listing which specific techniques were approved and/or used) | |
| | 1239 |

| | |
|---|------|
| Appendix B: Recommended readings on torture | 1240 |
| Appendix C: Torture-related laws and conventions | 1241 |
| Appendix D: Legal cases relevant to the incidences of torture | 1242 |
| <i>Index</i> | 1243 |