NIELS BOHR AND CONTEMPORARY PHILOSOPHY

Edited by
JAN FAYE

Carlsberg Foundation, Copenhagen, Denmark

and

HENRY J. FOLSE
Department of Philosophy, Loyola University,
New Orleans, U. S. A.

KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS
DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON
| Preface | xi |
| Introduction | xiii |
| MARA BELLER & ARTHUR FINE / Bohr's Response to EPR | 1 |
| 1. EPR and Bohr’s EPR | 2 |
| 2. Incompleteness and Inconsistency | 3 |
| 3. Simultaneous Position and Momentum in EPR | 6 |
| 4. Bohr’s Concept of Disturbance: EPR and Before | 10 |
| 5. Ambiguity and Definition | 16 |
| 6. Positivism and Its Puzzles | 18 |
| 7. Locality and Separability | 23 |
| 8. Concluding Remarks | 27 |
| CATHERINE CHEVALLEY / Niels Bohr’s Words and the Atlantis of Kantianism | 33 |
| 1. Introduction | 33 |
| 2. Anschauung and Symbol – In Bohr’s Interpretation of Quantum Mechanics | 35 |
| 3. Anschauung and Symbol – The Philosophical Background | 43 |
| 4. Conclusions | 50 |
| 4.1. Original Interpretations of Quantum Mechanics | 50 |
| 4.2. Bohr’s Conception of Language | 51 |
| 4.3. Changing Perspectives | 53 |
| JAMES T. CUSHING / A Bohmian Response to Bohr’s Complementarity | 57 |
| 1. Introduction | 57 |
| 2. The Project of “Clarifying” Bohr’s Views | 58 |
| 3. Bohr’s Complementarity | 61 |
| 4. Bohmian Mechanics | 63 |
| 4.1. Bohm’s (1952) Theory | 64 |
| 4.2. Recent Developments | 70 |
| 5. Conclusions | 72 |
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DAVID FAVRHOLDT / Niels Bohr and Realism 77
1. Classical Concepts and Ordinary Language 77
2. What We Can Say About Reality 82
3. Subjective Idealism and Phenomenalism 84
4. A ‘God’s Eye View’ of the World 86
5. Conclusion 94

JAN FAYE / Non-Locality or Non-Separability? A Defense of Bohr’s Anti-Realist Approach to Quantum Mechanics 97
1. The Bohr-Einstein Debate in Retrospect 97
2. Non-Separability Anti-Realism 103
3. Non-Separability Realism 108
4. Non-Locality Realism 110
5. Non-Locality Anti-Realism 114

HENRY FOLSE / Bohr’s Framework of Complementarity and the Realism Debate 119
1. Drawing the Battlelines: Bohr and Kant 120
2. Realism and the Atomic Description of Nature 123
3. Realism and Truth 127
4. Complementarity and the Realist Ideal of Understanding 134
5. Conclusion 137

JOHN HONNER / Description and Deconstruction: Niels Bohr and Modern Philosophy 141
1. Preamble 141
2. Bohr and the Philosophers 144
3. Derrida and Deconstruction 148
4. Bohr and the Description of Nature 151

CLIFFORD A. HOOKER / Bohr and the Crisis of Empirical Intelligibility: An Essay on the Depth of Bohr’s Thought and Our Philosophical Ignorance 155
Part I. Bohr and the Kantian Legacy 155
1. Introduction 155
2. Reichenbach on Kant and Relativity Theory 158
Part II. Uniqueness and Rational Methodology: Newton and Kant 163
3. Kant, Newton and Rational Science 163
Part III. Bohr on Quantum Theory and Epistemology 174
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4. Bohr’s Philosophical Lesson of Quantum Mechanics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Reichenbach and Bohr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Bohr’s Conception of Intelligibility, Objectivity and Completeness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Einstein against Bohr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Bohr and Einstein versus Nature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Principled Ignorance, Adventures of Ideas and the Open Future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I. Butts and Friedman on Kant’s General Epistemological Framework</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DON HOWARD / What Makes a Classical Concept Classical? Toward a Reconstruction of Niels Bohr’s Philosophy of Physics

1. Introduction
2. Objectivity and Unambiguous Description. Why Are Classical Concepts Important?
3. Instruments and Objects of Investigation. Where and How Are Classical Concepts to be Employed?
4. Of Mixtures and Pure Cases. What Makes a Classical Description Classical?
5. Does the Reconstruction Work?

PAUL HOYNINGEN-HUENE / Niels Bohr’s Argument for the Irreducibility of Biology to Physics

1. Introduction
2. The Anti-Reductionist Claim
   2.1. Explication of Concepts
   2.2. The Relation of Bohr’s Claim to Other Forms of Anti-Reductionism
3. The Argument for the Anti-Reductionist Claim
   3.1. Bohr’s Argument: An Analogical Inference
   3.2. First Premise: Complementarity in Physics
   3.3. Second Premise: Complementarity of Physics and Biology
   3.4. Formal Reconstruction of Bohr’s Argument
4. Critique of Bohr’s Anti-Reductionist Argument
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DAVID KAISER / Niels Bohr's Conceptual Legacy in Contemporary Particle Physics  
1. Introduction 257  
2. Bohr and Particle Physics: A Brief History 258  
3. The Compound Nucleus and Particle Physics Phenomenology 259  
4. Questions of Ontology and Particle Physics Phenomenology 262  
5. Bohr's Realism and Particle Physics 264  
6. Conclusions 266  

HENRY KRIPS / A Critique Of Bohr's Local Realism 269  
1. Introduction 269  
2. Instrumentalism 269  
3. Bohr's Philosophy 270  
4. Bohr and Local Realism 271  
5. Critique of Local Realism 273  

EDWARD MACKINNON / Bohr and the Realism Debates 279  
1. Perspectives and Presuppositions 280  
2. Coping with A Linguistic Crisis 282  
3. Interpreting Quantum Mechanics 286  
4. Realism in Perspective 290  
  4.1. Einsteinian Realism 291  
  4.2. Scientific Realism 293  
5. Realism and Analysis 297  

DUGALD MURDOCH / The Bohr-Einstein Dispute 303  
1. Einstein's Opposition to the Copenhagen Interpretation 303  
2. The EPR Argument 305  
3. Bohr's Reply to the EPR Paper 306  
4. Einstein's Argument 308  
5. Bohr's Response to Einstein's Argument 311  
6. The Philosophical Background to Einstein's Argument 315  
7. The Dispute in 1935, and Thirty Years On 318  
8. The Physical Dispute Reconsidered 322  

ULRICH RÖSEBERG / Hidden Historicity: The Challenge of Bohr's Philosophical Thought 325  
1. The Problem 325  
2. Reichenbach's Rational Reconstruction of the Development of Quantum Mechanics 327
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

3. A Rational Reconstruction of the Development of Quantum Mechanics in the Dialectic Tradition 329
   3.1. Bohr’s Research Program 329
   3.2. A Physicist Becomes a Philosopher 332
4. Hidden Historicity in Bohr’s Epistemological Reflections 337
5. Concluding Remarks 340

HENRY P. STAPP / Quantum Theory and the Place of Mind in Nature 345
   1. Mind in the Physical Sciences 345
   2. The Objective Wave-Function 346
   3. Integrating Consciousness into Physical Science 347
   4. Future Prospects for the Copenhagen Interpretation 349

References 353

Name Index 373