

The Construction of Fatherhood

THE JURISPRUDENCE OF THE EUROPEAN
COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

ALICE MARGARIA

Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology
Department of Law and Anthropology



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	page xi
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
Introduction	1
1 Fatherhood and the Law in Europe	4
1 Ideology versus Reality: Changing Families and Changing Fatherhood	4
2 The Law's Reaction: New and Old Ways of Connecting Fathers to Children	9
3 Introducing the Key Concepts 'Conventional Fatherhood' 'Fragmenting Fatherhood' 'New Fatherhood'	13 13 14 15
4 The Aim and Structure of the Analysis	17
2 The ECtHR and Fatherhood: Limits and Potential	19
Introduction	19
1 Family Relationships: Between Restraint and Innovation	20
2 Core Provisions	24
2.1 Article 8 and Fatherhood Two Stages of Review Positive Obligations	25 25 29
2.2 Article 14 and Fatherhood	32
3 Doctrines and Decision Making	35
3.1 The Doctrine of the Margin and Strictness of Review	36
3.2 The Variable Use of Doctrines and the Court's Moral Views	40
4 Case-Law Selection	45

3	Fatherhood and Assisted Reproduction	48
1	The Impact of ARTs on Conventional Fatherhood	48
2	The ECtHR and ARTs: An Ambivalent Reaction	52
2.1	Transsexuality and Fatherhood	54
2.2	Not-Yet Conceived Children and the Ideal Father	58
2.3	Surrogacy and Intended Fatherhood	63
3	Conclusions	68
4	Post-Separation and Unmarried Fatherhood	72
1	Fatherhood and the 'Crisis' of Marriage	72
2	The ECtHR, the 'Crisis' of Marriage and Fatherhood	75
2.1	Parental Rights after Family Breakdown	78
2.2	Non-Consensual Adoption	85
2.3	Paternity Proceedings	91
	Fathers Contesting Paternity	93
	Fathers Claiming Paternity	98
3	Conclusions	106
5	Fatherhood and Family-Work Reconciliation	109
1	Women in the Workplace and Conventional Fatherhood	109
2	Childcare-Related Entitlements for Fathers and the ECtHR: One Step at a Time	114
2.1	Restating Conventional Fatherhood	116
2.2	Contemplating 'New Fatherhood'	119
2.3	Pushing for 'New Fatherhood'	121
3	Conclusions	125
6	Fatherhood and Homosexuality	128
1	Homosexual Families and Conventional Parenthood: Points of Disjuncture	128
2	The ECtHR and Homosexual Relationships: A Two-Stage Development	131
2.1	Homosexual Fathers and Their Biological Children	135
2.2	Single-Parent Adoption: Gays versus Lesbians	139
2.3	Second-Parent Adoption and the 'Special Status' of Marriage	144
3	Conclusions	151

7	Fatherhood at the ECtHR	155
	Introduction	155
1	The Construction of Fatherhood in the ECtHR	
	Jurisprudence	156
	Towards 'New Fatherhood'	156
	The Relationship between Change and Continuity	159
2	The Role(s) of Doctrines	161
	European Consensus	162
	Positive Obligations	164
3	Final Thoughts	166
	<i>Bibliography</i>	169
	<i>Index</i>	186