

Contents

The Search for Philosophic Understanding of Scientific Theories

FREDERICK SUPPE

Introduction 3

I. Historical Background to the Received View 6

II. Development of the Received View 16

- A. Correspondence Rules and Cognitive Significance 17
- B. Interpretation of Theories: The Status of Theoretical Terms 27
- C. Logic of the Conditional 36
- D. Observational-Theoretical Distinction 45
- E. Final Version of the Received View 50
- F. Development of Science on the Received View:
Theory Reduction 53

III. Status of the Received View 57

IV. Criticism of the Received View 62

- A. How Adequate Is the Received View as a General Analysis of
Scientific Theories? 62
- B. Observational-Theoretical Distinction 66
 - 1. Analytic-Synthetic Distinction 67
 - 2. Observational-Theoretical Term Distinction 80
- C. Partial Interpretation 86
- D. Models 95
- E. Correspondence Rules 102
- F. Formalization Issues 110
- G. Conclusions on the Adequacy of the Received View 115

V. Alternatives to the Received View and Their Critics 119

- A. Skeptical Descriptive Analyses 120
- B. *Weltanschauungen* Analyses 125
 - 1. The Positions and Criticisms Specific to Them 127
 - (a) Toulmin 127
 - (b) Kuhn 135
 - (c) Hanson 151

- (d) Feyerabend's and Popper's Realisms 166
 - (i) *Popper* 166
 - (ii) *Feyerabend* 170
- (e) Bohm 180
- 2. General Criticisms of *Weltanschauungen* Analyses 191
 - (a) Observation 192
 - (b) Meaning Change 199
 - (c) Objectivity of Science 208
 - (d) General Conclusions on the Adequacy of the *Weltanschauungen* Approach 217
- C. Semantic Approaches 221
- D. Explanation and Theories 230
- VI. The Symposium: Current Issues Concerning the Structure of Theories 233**

Proceedings of the Symposium

SESSION I

Formulation and Formalization of Scientific Theories:

- A Summary-Abstract, Carl G. Hempel 244
- Discussion 255

SESSION II

The Structure of Theories and the Analysis of Data, Patrick Suppes 266

- 1. Deterministic Theories with Incorrigeable Data 266
- 2. Deterministic Theories with Corrigeable Data 271
- 3. Probabilistic Theories with Incorrigeable Data 273
- 4. Probabilistic Theories with Corrigeable Data 278
- 5. Some Philosophical Conclusions 281

Commentary on Suppes's "The Structure of Theories and the Analysis of Data" 284

- Discussion 289

SESSION III

History and the Philosopher of Science, I. Bernard Cohen 308

- 1. Introduction 308
- 2. Galileo and the Science of Motion 315
- 3. 'Transformations' in the Development of Science: The Concepts of 'Inertia' and 'State of Motion' 321
- 4. Newtonian Dynamics: The Second Law of Motion 327

5. Ambiguous History: Texts and References	335
6. Conclusion: The Philosopher <i>vs.</i> the Historian	344
History and Philosophy of Science: A Reply to Cohen, Peter Achinstein	350
Discussion	361

SESSION IV

Science as Perception-Communication, David Bohm	374
Professor Bohm's View of the Structure and Development of Theories, Robert L. Causey	392
Reply to Professor Causey, Jeffrey Bub	402
Discussion	409
Reply to Discussion, David Bohm	420

SESSION V

Hilary Putnam's 'Scientific Explanation'. An Editorial Summary-Abstract	424
Putnam on the Corroboration of Theories, Bas C. van Fraassen	434
Discussion	437

SESSION VI

Second Thoughts on Paradigms, Thomas S. Kuhn	459
Exemplars, Theories, and Disciplinary Matrixes, Frederick Suppe	483
Discussion	500

SESSION VII

Scientific Theories and Their Domains, Dudley Shapere	518
I. Framework of the Present Analysis	518
II. Aspects of the Concept of a Domain	525
III. Theoretical Problems, Lines of Research, and Scientific Theories	533
1. The Periodic Table of Chemical Elements	534
2. Spectroscopy	542
3. Stellar Spectral Classification and Stellar Evolution	549
IV. Theoretical Inadequacies and Their Treatment	557
1. Inadequacies of the Bohr Theory	558
A. Incompleteness	558
B. Simplification	560
C. Structure	562
2. Treatment of Inadequacies in the Bohr Theory	562
Editorial Interpolation: Shapere on the Instrumentalistic <i>vs.</i> Realistic Conceptions of Theories	566

Heuristics and Justification in Scientific Research: Comments on Shapere, Thomas Nickles 571

1. The Standard Account of Theories 572
2. The Rationality of Scientific Decisions 574
3. Domains and Intertheoretical Reduction 582

Discussion 590

POSTSCRIPT

The Structure of Scientific Theories, Stephen Toulmin 600

Bibliography, compiled by Rew A. Godow, Jr. 615

Notes on Contributors 647

Index 651