

The **ABORTION RIGHTS**
Controversy in America
A LEGAL READER

• • •

Edited by **N. E. H. HULL, WILLIAMJAMES HOFFER,**
and **PETER CHARLES HOFFER**

The University of North Carolina Press

Chapel Hill and London

CONTENTS

. . .

Introduction 1

1. Abortion Becomes a Crime 10

- Elizabeth Cady Stanton, "Address to the Seneca Falls Convention" (1848) 14
- Horace Mann, *Tenth Annual Report of the Board of Education Together with the Tenth Annual Report of the Secretary of the Board* (1847) 15
- "French Lunar Pills" advertisement, *Boston Daily Times* (1845) 17
- Connecticut General Statutes*, Title 22 (1821) 17
- Commonwealth v. Parker* (1845) 18
- Horatio Storer, *Why Not?: A Book for Every Woman* (1868) 20
- People v. Van Zile* (1894) 25
- Tonahill v. State* (1919) 27
- An Act for the Suppression of Trade in, and Circulation of, Obscene Literature and Articles of Immoral Use* (1873) 29
- Bates v. U.S.* (1881) 31
- Bours v. U.S.* (1915) 34

2. Birth Control and the Abortion Law Reform Movement 39

- Theodore Roosevelt, "On American Motherhood" (1905) 41
- Lydia Kingsmill Commander, "Has the Small Family Become an American Ideal?" (1904) 42
- Roswell H. Johnson, "The Birth Rate of College Women" (1917) 45
- Dorothy Dunbar Bromley, "This Question of Birth Control" (1929) 47
- Margaret Sanger, *Autobiography* (1938) 50
- Norman Thomas, "Some Objections to Birth Control Considered" (1926) 59
- "Up to the Doctors" (1925) 62
- Mary Ware Dennett, *Birth Control Laws* (1926) 63
- "Abortions in the U.S.A." (1936) 66
- U.S. v. One Package* (1936) 68
- Rigine K. Stix and Dorothy G. Wiehl, "Abortion and the Public Health" (1938) 69

American Law Institute, *Model Penal Code*, section 230.3, Abortion
(1962) 73

Georgia Sessions Laws, no. 130 (1876) 75

Revised Criminal Code of Georgia, chapter 26-12, Abortion (1968) 75

William O. Douglas, opinion in *Griswold v. Connecticut* (1965) 78

Arthur Goldberg, opinion in *Griswold* 80

3. The "Right" to an Abortion 85

NOW, "Statement of Purpose" (1966) 87

Betty Friedan, *The Feminine Mystique* (1962) 88

Shirley Chisholm, *Unbought and Unbossed* (1970) 89

Texas Penal Code, Title 15, chapter 9 (1970) 90

Redman v. State (1955) 91

Roy Lucas, "Federal Constitutional Limitations on the Enforcement and
Administration of State Abortion Statutes" (1968) 94

Roe v. Wade (1970) 101

Appellants' brief in *Roe* (1971) 105

Appellees' brief in *Roe* 112

California Committee to Legalize Abortion et al. brief in *Roe* 117

Americans United for Life brief in *Roe* 121

4. *Roe v. Wade* before the High Court 124

Sarah Weddington, oral argument in *Roe v. Wade* (1971) 125

Jay Floyd, oral argument on behalf of appellee in *Roe* 133

Sarah Weddington, *A Question of Choice* (1992) 137

Sarah Weddington and Robert Flowers, oral argument in *Roe*
(1972) 138

The Supreme Court in Conference, 1940–1985 (2001), December 16, 1971,
and October 13, 1972, conferences 145

AMA House of Delegates, *Proceedings* (1970) 150

Harry Blackmun, opinion in *Roe* (1973) 151

William Rehnquist, opinion in *Roe* 157

Harry Blackmun, opinion in *Doe v. Bolton* (1973) 159

Byron White, opinion in *Doe* 163

5. Regulating and Funding Abortions 165

John Hart Ely, "The Wages of Crying Wolf: A Comment on *Roe v. Wade*"
(1973) 167

Ruth Bader Ginsberg, "Some Thoughts on Autonomy and Equality in
Relation to *Roe v. Wade*" (1985) 171

- “An Act relating to Abortion with Penalty Provisions and Emergency Clause” (1974) 174
- Harry Blackmun, opinion in *Planned Parenthood of Central Missouri v. Danforth* (1976) 177
- Byron White, opinion in *Danforth* 180
- “The Hyde Amendment” (1976) 182
- Potter Stewart, opinion in *Harris v. McRae* (1980) 187
- William Brennan, Thurgood Marshall, and John Paul Stevens, opinions in *Harris* 190
- Akron (Ohio) Ordinance no. 160-1978 193
- Lewis Powell, opinion in *Akron v. Reproductive Health* (1983) 194
- Sandra Day O’Connor, opinion in *Akron* 198
- Harry Blackmun, opinion in *Thornburgh v. College of Obstetricians* (1986) 200
- Byron White, opinion in *Thornburgh* 202

6. Nineteen Eighty-Nine: A Year of Decision 206

- Brief of Catholics for a Free Choice et al. in *Webster v. Reproductive Health Services* (1989) 210
- Brief of Feminists for Life of America et al. in *Webster* 212
- Brief of members of Congress in support of appellees in *Webster* 216
- Brief of members of Congress in support of appellants in *Webster* 217
- William Rehnquist, opinion in *Webster* 220
- Sandra Day O’Connor, opinion in *Webster* 223
- Antonin Scalia, opinion in *Webster* 224
- Harry Blackmun, opinion in *Webster* 226
- John Paul Stevens, opinion in *Webster* 228
- Tom Wicker, “Abortion and the G.O.P.” (1989) 230
- Elaine Ciulla Kamarck, “The Abortion Dilemma: The Pols Shift with the Wind as the Abortion Fight Evolves” (1989) 232
- Barbara Brotman, “Voters Firmly in Middle on Key Abortion Issues” (1989) 234
- Eileen McNamara, “Taking Stock of the Struggle: Abortion—An American Divide” (1989) 237

7. Regulation and Controversy in the Post-Webster Era 247

- Anthony Kennedy, opinion in *Planned Parenthood v. Casey* (1992) 250
- David Souter, opinion in *Casey* 253
- Sandra Day O’Connor, opinion in *Casey* 256
- Harry Blackmun, opinion in *Casey* 259

William Rehnquist, opinion in *Casey* 261
Antonin Scalia, opinion in *Casey* 262
Cass Sunstein, "Neutrality in Constitutional Law" (1992) 265
Kristina M. Mentone, "When Equal Protection Fails: How the Equal Protection Justification for Abortion Undercuts the Struggle for Equality in the Workplace" (2002) 269
Neal Devins, "Through the Looking Glass: What Abortion Teaches Us about American Politics" (1994) 272
Stephen Breyer, opinion in *Stenberg v. Carhart* (2000) 276
Sandra Day O'Connor, opinion in *Stenberg* 281
Ruth Bader Ginsburg, opinion in *Stenberg* 282
Antonin Scalia, opinion in *Stenberg* 283
Anthony Kennedy, opinion in *Stenberg* 286

8. Freedom of Speech versus Free Access to Clinics 291

Antonin Scalia, opinion in *Bray v. Alexandria Women's Health Clinic* (1993) 295
David Souter, opinion in *Bray* 297
John Paul Stevens, opinion in *Bray* 298
William Rehnquist, opinion in *NOW v. Scheidler* (1994) 301
Opening statements, *Hearings before the Subcommittee on Crime and Criminal Justice of the Committee on the Judiciary, House of Representatives, April 1, 1993* (1994) 303
Freedom of Access to Clinic Entrances Act (1994) 320
William Rehnquist, opinion in *Madsen v. Women's Health Center* (1994) 323
Antonin Scalia, opinion in *Madsen* 328

Conclusion 332

Recommended Reading 341