

Change, Choice and Inference:

A Study of Belief Revision and Nonmonotonic Reasoning

HANS ROTT

CLARENDON PRESS • OXFORD

2001

CONTENTS

0	Overview	1
1	Doxastic states and their representation	9
1.1	The menagerie of doxastic states	9
1.2	Representing doxastic states	22
1.2.1	Belief bases: Independent items of information	22
1.2.2	Belief sets: Coherent theories	23
1.2.3	Acceptance: Beliefs and expectations	25
1.2.4	Logics I: Consequence operations	30
1.2.5	Logics II: Inference operations	31
1.2.6	Orderings of beliefs	34
1.2.7	More on nonmonotonic and paraconsistent inference operations	38
1.2.8	Belief revision strategies	43
2	Epistemology and belief change	46
2.1	Epistemology, knowledge representation and revision	47
2.2	Lehrer's theory of knowledge: Central definitions	49
2.2.1	Personal justification and the comparative reasonableness of acceptance	51
2.2.2	Varying imperatives for coherence	54
2.2.3	Undefeated justification and justification games	55
2.3	Lehrer's logical constraints for eliminations and replacements, and how to improve them	58
2.4	Epistemology and belief change – a symbiotic relationship	62
3	Changing doxastic states: Two complementary perspectives	65
3.1	Two dimensions of belief change	66
3.2	Three types of maxims of coherence for belief representation and revision	67
3.2.1	Inferential coherence, static constraints	68
3.2.2	An example: The Polish swan	71

3.2.3	Diachronic coherence, economic constraints	72
3.2.4	Coherence of choice, dynamic constraints	75
3.3	The vertical and the horizontal perspective: Direct and coherence-constrained belief change	75
3.4	Foundationalist and coherentist belief change	76
3.4.1	Two variants of foundationalist belief change	81
3.4.2	Coherentist belief change: The logic-constrained mode of revising theories	87
3.5	Relating belief change and nonmonotonic reasoning	91
3.6	The dialectics of the statics and the dynamics of doxastic states	93
3.7	Justifications in models of belief change	97
4	Concepts of theoretical rationality: Postulates for belief change and nonmonotonic reasoning	100
4.1	Black boxes, structures and rules of application	100
4.2	Postulates for rational contractions	102
4.3	Postulates for rational revisions	107
4.4	Postulates for rational nonmonotonic reasoning	111
5	Foundational belief change using nonmonotonic inference	120
5.1	Modelling the direct mode: Drawing inferences from information bases	121
5.1.1	Infallible foundations	122
5.1.2	Fallible foundations: Straight clearing of information conflicts	124
5.1.3	Modelling the direct mode by expectation revision	126
5.2	Modelling the direct mode: Combining information and expectation	127
5.2.1	Information bases without priorities	127
5.2.2	Prioritized information bases	130
5.2.3	Iterated belief change in the direct mode	133
5.3	Logical properties of revision functions generated by the direct mode	136
5.3.1	The case of infallible information	137
5.3.2	The case of cleared information	137
5.3.3	The case of integrated prioritized information: Non-preservative belief change	138
6	A general concept of practical rationality: Constraints for coherent choice	141
6.1	General choice functions	144
6.1.1	A limiting choice: Not having to choose	147

6.1.2	Another limiting case: Refusing to choose	149
6.2	The classical theory of rational choice	153
6.3	Rationalizable choice	154
6.4	Two kinds of revealed preferences	158
6.5	More conditions on choice functions	163
6.6	Remainder functions	164
7	Coherentist belief change as a problem of rational choice	167
7.1	How to give it up: Choices between models	172
7.2	Partial meet contraction	175
7.3	How to give up: Choosing worst sentences	177
7.4	Logical constraints for choice functions over sentences	182
7.5	Revision	185
7.6	Nonmonotonic inference	187
7.6.1	An example: Composers and compatriots	188
7.7	Representation theorems for semantically and syntactically choice-based contraction functions: A remarkable confluence of results	190
7.7.1	Representation theorems for contractions	192
7.7.2	Representation theorems for revisions	196
7.7.3	Representation theorems for nonmonotonic inferences	200
7.7.4	The quest for explanation	205
7.8	Linking choices between models and choices between sentences	208
7.9	What have we achieved?	213
7.10	Iterated belief change in the coherence-constrained mode	217
8	Revealed preferences: Understanding the theory of epistemic entrenchment	223
8.1	Basic principles	225
8.2	Entrenchments as revealed preferences: Translations	229
8.2.1	The essential connection	229
8.2.2	From entrenchments to choices	230
8.2.3	From choices to entrenchments	231
8.2.4	Admissible relations	233
8.2.5	Refusing to choose	235
8.2.6	Not having to choose	235
8.3	Postulates for epistemic entrenchment	236
8.4	The postulates translated	241
8.4.1	From coherent choice to epistemic entrenchment	241
8.4.2	Logical constraints for entrenchments	244
8.4.3	From epistemic entrenchment to coherent choice	245
8.5	Implications	246

8.5.1	Implications between choice postulates	246
8.5.2	Implications between entrenchment postulates	247
8.6	The semantics of epistemic entrenchment	249
8.7	Applying epistemic entrenchment in coherentist belief change: Two construction recipes	253
8.8	Functional and relational belief change	264
Appendix A: Proofs for Chapter 4		268
Appendix B: Proofs for Chapter 5		274
Appendix C: Proofs for Chapter 6		284
Appendix D: Proofs for Chapter 7		292
Appendix E: Proofs for Chapter 8		320
References		353
Index of Symbols		369
Index of Names		371
Subject Index		374