International Organizations and the Fight for Accountability

The Remedies and Reparations Gap

CARLA FERSTMAN
## Contents

**List of Abbreviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.1</td>
<td>The Problem to Be Addressed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.2</td>
<td>The Approach Taken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.3</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.4</td>
<td>The Structure of the Arguments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.5</td>
<td>Particular Issues and Tensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.6</td>
<td>What is Concluded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>International Organizations' Obligations under Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.2</td>
<td>The Ability of International Organizations to Bear International Obligations and Liability for Breaches of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.3</td>
<td>Consequences of International Legal Personality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.3.1</td>
<td>Inherent consequences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.3.2</td>
<td>Consequences that are implied because they are necessary to fulfil international organizations' purposes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.4</td>
<td>Treaties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.4.1</td>
<td>Treaties and related texts which establish or recognize the human rights and international humanitarian law obligations of international organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.4.2</td>
<td>Accession to treaties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.4.3</td>
<td>Treaty obligations that may bind international organizations regardless of accession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.5</td>
<td>Customary International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.5.1</td>
<td>Are customary international law obligations binding on states directly transferrable to international organizations?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.5.2</td>
<td>Practice and <em>opinio juris</em> providing specific evidence of international organization obligations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1)</td>
<td><em>State practice and opinio juris</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2)</td>
<td><em>International organization practice and opinio juris</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>Economic, social, and cultural rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii)</td>
<td>Refugee law and migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii)</td>
<td>Human rights and international humanitarian law in the context of peace operations and related political missions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.6</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
III Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law Breaches Attributable to International Organizations 43
   III.1 Introduction 43
   III.2 Attribution of Conduct to an International Organization 45
      III.2.1 Conduct carried out by the international organization or one of its organs or agents 46
         (1) Ultra vires conduct may be attributable to the international organization 46
         (2) The requirement that acts are 'official' 51
      III.2.2 When an organ or agent is placed at the disposal of an international organization 54
      III.2.3 Conduct acknowledged and adopted by an international organization as its own 57
   III.3 Responsibility of an International Organization in Connection with the Act of a State or Another International Organization 61
   III.4 Failure to Prevent and/or Respond to Violations 62
   III.5 Conclusion 66

IV The Obligation to Afford Reparation to Injured Individuals 67
   IV.1 Introduction 67
   IV.2 The Origin and Development of the Concept of Reparation 68
      IV.2.1 Multidisciplinary origins 68
      IV.2.2 Legal origins 69
   IV.3 Victims' Right to a Remedy and Reparation for Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law Violations 71
      IV.3.1 General obligations 71
      IV.3.2 Procedural aspects: the right to an effective remedy 74
         (1) Human rights law 74
         (2) State human rights obligations extrapolated to frame international organization obligations 76
         (3) International humanitarian law obligations 79
         (4) International humanitarian law obligations extrapolated to international organizations 83
      IV.3.3 Forms of reparation 84
      IV.3.4 The impact of patchy enforcement 88
   IV.4 Conclusions 91

PART II: THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE REGIME OF RESPONSIBILITY

V Internal Adjudication by International Organizations 95
   V.1 Introduction 95
   V.2 The Rationale for Creating Internal Adjudicative Mechanisms 95
   V.3 International Organizations' Understanding of their Obligations—a Lex Specialis? 96
   V.4 An Assessment of Internal Mechanisms 99
      V.4.1 Employment disputes 100
      V.4.2 Finance and development 101
Contents

V.4.3 Peacekeeping and territorial administrations 103
   (1) Inquiries 103
   (2) Local claims review boards 104
   (3) Arbitration 107
   (4) Assistance policies and trust funds 108
   (5) Territorial administrations 109
   (6) The characterization of claims: private disputes vs. claims involving public policy 112
   (7) The characterization of conduct 117
V.4.4 Asylum and migration 118
V.4.5 Policing, criminal record keeping, and transfer of data 121
   (1) Policing 122
   (2) Listing procedures 123
V.5 Conclusions 125

VI Challenging the Conduct of International Organizations before Domestic Courts 128
VI.1 Introduction 128
VI.2 The Ability of Domestic Courts to Adjudicate Claims Involving International Organizations 129
   VI.2.1 Extraterritorial jurisdiction and principles of restraint 130
      (1) Forum non conveniens and lis pendens 131
      (2) Political questions and act of State doctrines 132
   VI.2.2 A procedural bar par excellence: immunities of international organizations before domestic courts 137
      (1) The history, rationales, and scope of the immunities of international organizations 139
      (2) The differing rationales for the immunity of international organizations 140
      (3) The articulation of international organization immunities 142
      (4) The impact of immunities on claimants' ability to access justice 146
      (5) Waivers of immunity 152
VI.3 Conclusions 155

VII Adjudication before Regional and International Courts 156
VII.1 Introduction 156
VII.2 Subject Matter Jurisdiction—Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law 157
   VII.2.1 International courts 157
   VII.2.2 Regional courts 159
VII.3 Personal Jurisdiction—Claims Concerning International Organizations 163
   VII.3.1 International courts 163
   VII.3.2 Regional courts 165
   VII.3.3 Limited indirect review by regional courts? 167
      (1) The primacy of Article 103 of the UN Charter 168
      (2) A presumption of harmony 169
      (3) Limited review or presumption of validity 170
      (4) The presumption of 'equivalent protection' 170
Contents

VII.4 Locus Standi of Individuals before International and Regional Courts 175
    VII.4.1 Regional human rights courts 176
    VII.4.2 RIO courts—individuals' standing to pursue claims 179
        (1) The Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU) 179
        (2) RIO courts in the Americas 181
        (3) RIO courts in Africa 182
VII.5 Conclusions 183

VIII The Direct Responsibility of Organization Employees, Contractors, and Troop Contingents 186
    VIII.1 Introduction 186
    VIII.2 Individual Criminal Responsibility 187
        VIII.2.1 Immunities applicable to the alleged criminal acts 189
            of organization employees, contractors, and military contingents
                (1) The nature of immunities recognized for different categories of personnel (host state and troop contributing country jurisdiction) 190
                    (i) Military contingents 190
                    (ii) Employees and experts on mission 194
                (2) The role of other states and/or international tribunals to help address justice gaps 197
    VIII.3 Civil Responsibility 199
    VIII.4 Administrative or Disciplinary Sanctions 202
    VIII.5 Conclusions 203

IX Some Concluding Thoughts—Where the Solutions Lie 205
    IX.1 Strengthening Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law Standards from the Inside 206
    IX.2 Independent Oversight 207
    IX.3 Transforming Internal Adjudicative Mechanisms 208
    IX.4 Standing of Injured Individuals to Bring Claims before International Courts 210
    IX.5 Full and Effective Reparations 213

Index 217